Studies in Forensic Biohistory

Anthropological Perspectives

The lives of kings, poets, authors, criminals, and celebrities are a perpetual fascination in the media and popular culture, and for decades anthropologists and other scientists have participated in “postmortem dissections” of the lives of historical figures.

In this field of biohistory, researchers have identified and analyzed these figures’ bodies using technologies such as DNA fingerprinting, biochemical assays, and skeletal biology. This book brings together biohistorical case studies for the first time, and considers the role of the anthropologist in writing the historical narratives surrounding the deceased. Contributors theorize biohistory with respect to the sociology of the body, examining the ethical implications of biohistorical work and the diversity of social theoretical perspectives that researchers’ work may relate to.

The volume defines scales of biohistorical engagement, providing readers with a critical sense of scale and the different paths to “historical notoriety” that can emerge with respect to human remains.

Christopher M. Stojanowski is Professor of Anthropology at Arizona State University. His bioarchaeological work focuses on dental anthropology, the colonial southeastern USA and early and middle Holocene North Africa and North America.

William N. Duncan is Associate Professor of Anthropology at East Tennessee State University. His research focuses on Mesoamerican cultures and dental anthropology.
68. **The Foragers of Point Hope: The Biology and Archaeology of Humans on the Edge of the Alaskan Arctic** Charles E. Hilton, Benjamin M. Auerbach & Libby W. Cowgill (eds.) 978 1 107 02250 8

69. **Bioarchaeology: Interpreting Behavior from the Human Skeleton**, 2nd edn. Clark Spencer Larsen 978 0 521 83869 6 & 978 0 521 54748 2

70. **Fossil Primates** Susan Cachel 978 1 107 00530 3

71. **Demography and Evolutionary Ecology of Hadza Hunter-Gatherers** Nicholas Blurton Jones 978 1 107 06982 4

72. **Skeletal Biology of the Ancient Rapanui (Easter Islanders)** Vincent H. Stefan & George W. Gill 978 1 107 02366 6

73. **The Dwarf and Mouse Lemurs of Madagascar: Biology, Behavior and Conservation Biogeography of the Cheirogaleidae** Shawn M. Lehman, Ute Radespiel & Elke Zimmermann 978 1 107 07559 7

74. **The Missing Lemur Link: An Ancestral Step in the Evolution of Human Behaviour** Ivan Norscia & Elisabetta Palagi 978 1 107 016088
Studies in Forensic Biohistory

Anthropological Perspectives

Edited by

CHRISTOPHER M. STOJANOWSKI
Professor
Arizona State University, USA

WILLIAM N. DUNCAN
Associate Professor
East Tennessee State University, USA
Contents

List of Contributors page x
Acknowledgments xii

1 Defining an Anthropological Biohistorical Research Agenda: The History, Scale, and Scope of an Emerging Discipline 1
Christopher M. Stojanowski and William N. Duncan
1.1 Defining and Delineating a Biohistorical Research Agenda 2
1.2 The Scope of Biohistory 6
1.3 Volume Rationale, Goals, and Organization 11
1.4 Conclusion 18

Philippe Charlier
2.1 First Patient: Richard I the Lionheart 29
2.2 Second Patient: Henri IV of France 32
2.3 Third Patient: Maximilien de Robespierre 38
2.4 Conclusion 40

3 Game of Thrones: Richard III and the Creation of Cultural Heritage 43
Richard Toon and Laurie Stone
3.1 A Game of Thrones 43
3.2 Epilogue (April 2015) 62

4 The Search for Don Francisco de Paula Marin: Servant, Friend, and Advisor to King Kamehameha I, Kingdom of Hawai‘i 67
Michael Pietrusewsky, Michele Toomay Douglas, Rona M. Ikehara-Quebral, and Conrad Mac Goodwin
4.1 Marin Tower Housing Project 71
4.2 Marin’s Health and Physical Features 75
4.3 Objectives of Study 77
4.4 Methods (Sex, Age, Stature, Ancestry) 77
4.5 Results 79
4.6 Conclusion 88

5 Unearthing Robert Kennicott: Naturalist, Explorer, Smithsonian Scientist 92
5.1 Robert Kennicott 93
5.2 The Opening and Postmortem Examination 96
5.3 Discussion 112
5.4 Conclusion 117

6 The Influence of the Law on the Postmortem Narratives of Unknown Human Remains 124
Ryan M. Seidemann
6.1 A Review of Louisiana’s Legal Limitations on Trafficking in Human Remains 124
6.2 Case Examples of Human Remains Trafficking from Louisiana 128
6.3 Groping for Theory in the World of Human Remains Sales 135
6.4 Conclusion 139

7 The Biohistory of Prehistory: Mummies and the Forensic Creation of Identity 143
Kenneth C. Nystrom
7.1 Biohistory of Historic Mummies 144
7.2 Biohistory of Prehistoric Mummies 149
7.3 Conclusion 159

8 Talking Heads and Other Specters of the Mountain Meadows Massacre 167
Shannon A. Novak
8.1 Facts of the Matter 170
8.2 Talking Heads 172
8.3 Naming and Knowing 178
8.4 Conclusion 185

9 Facial Reconstruction of Famous Historical Figures: Between Science and Art 191
Laura Buti, Giorgio Gruppioni, and Stefano Benazzi
9.1 Development of Principal Scientific Protocols and Their Reliability 193
9.2 Reliability: Artistic Component and Anatomical Prediction 196
9.3 Review of Some Published Examples of Historical Personages 199
9.4 Why do Scientists and Artists Endorse Facial Reconstructions? 201
9.5 The Humanistic and Conceptual Aspects Behind Reconstruction: Public Interest and Education 205
9.6 Conclusion 208

10 The Probabilistic Basis for Identifying Individuals in Biohistorical Research 213
Lyle W. Konigsberg and Lee Meadows Jantz
10.1 Standing Height and Likelihood 213
10.2 Likelihood Ratio from Standing Height 215
10.3 Likelihood Ratio from Femoral Length 216
10.4 Likelihood Ratio from One Present/Absent Trait 219
10.5 Likelihood Ratios from Dental Pathology 219
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.6 Combining Likelihood Ratios</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7 What is a Reasonable Likelihood Ratio Threshold for Making the Identification?</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8 Cases</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.9 Conclusion</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Known Unknowns: Forensic Science, the Nation-State, and the Iconic Dead</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Wagner and Adam Rosenblatt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1 Post-Conflict Knowledge Production</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 An Unknown Soldier Named: First Lieutenant Michael J. Blassie</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 The Famous and the Mistaken: Exhumations and Identification in Chile</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 The Biohistory of Atrocity and the Social Life of Human Remains</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claire Moon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1 Defining a Practice</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2 Histories of a Practice</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3 The Social Life of Human Remains</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Ethical Issues in Biohistory: No Easy Answers!</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane E. Buikstra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.1 Why Do Biohistory? When is it Justified?</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2 Permeability of the Boundaries: Personhood, Agency, and Embodiment</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3 Can the Dead be Harmed or Wronged? Do They Have Rights After Rites?</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4 Legal and Ethical Perspectives: Global, National, and Museological</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.5 Ethics: This Volume</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6 Conclusion</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Theoretical Facets of Biohistorical Research</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William N. Duncan and Christopher M. Stojanowski</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.1 Engagement and Enchainment</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2 Bodies, Objects, Personhood, Embodiment</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3 Historicism, Race, Gender, and the State</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4 Reflexivity and the Medical Gaze</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.5 Conclusion: Ethics and Public Engagement</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Arthur C. Aufderheide
Posthumous contribution

Stefano Benazzi
Department of Cultural Heritage, University of Bologna, Ravenna, Italy

Karin S. Bruwelheide
Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

Jane E. Buikstra
School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA

Laura Buti
Department of Cultural Heritage, University of Bologna, Ravenna, Italy

Larry W. Cartmell
Pathology Department, Valley View Regional Hospital, Ada, OK, USA

Philippe Charlier
Equipe d’anthropologie médicale et médico-légale, UFR des sciences de la santé (UVSQ / AP-HP), Montigny-le-Bretonneux, France

Michele Toomay Douglas
Department of Anthropology, University of Hawai’i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI, USA

William N. Duncan
Department of Sociology and Anthropology, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, TN, USA

Rona M. Ikehara-Quebral
International Archaeological Research Institute, Inc., Honolulu, HI, USA

Conrad Mac Goodwin
4801 Westover Terrace, Knoxville, TN, USA

Giorgio Gruppioni
Department of Cultural Heritage, University of Bologna, Ravenna, Italy

Lyle W. Konigsberg
Department of Anthropology, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL, USA

Lee Meadows Jantz
Department of Anthropology, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN, USA
List of Contributors

Claire Moon
Department of Sociology, Centre for the Study of Human Rights, London School of Economics, London, UK

Shannon A. Novak
Department of Anthropology, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY, USA

Kenneth C. Nystrom
Department of Anthropology, State University of New York at New Paltz, New Paltz, NY, USA

Douglas W. Owsley
Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

Michael Pietrusewsky
Department of Anthropology, University of Hawai‘i at Manoa, Honolulu, HI, USA

Adam Rosenblatt
Peace, Justice and Human Rights, Haverford College, Haverford, PA, USA

Sandra S. Schlachtmeyer
Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

Ryan M. Seidemann
Lands and Natural Resources Section, Louisiana Department of Justice, Baton Rouge, LA, USA

Vicki E. Simon
Department of Anthropology, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA

Christopher M. Stojanowski
School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA

Laurie Stone
8402 E Welsh Trail, Scottsdale, AZ, USA

Stephan J. Swanson
The Grove, 1421 Milwaukee Avenue, Glenview, IL, USA

Richard Toon
School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA

Sarah Wagner
Department of Anthropology, George Washington University, Washington, DC, USA
Acknowledgments

This book ultimately began with the initiation of the Pedro de Corpa consultation at the request of Father Conrad Harkins. We would like to thank Father Harkins for involving us and setting us on this path. We would also like to thank the staff of the Fort King George Museum, Debbie Wallsmith, and Linda Bitley for helping coordinate our visits to the site and arranging the temporary loan of the Fort King George skull. David Crass, Georgia State archaeologist, also supported this work. We would like to thank St. John Fisher College for an internal research grant that supported isotopic work and radiocarbon dates on the Fort King George skull. Research support was also provided by Southern Illinois University College of Liberal Arts. WND would like to thank his colleagues and friends in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at East Tennessee State University, particularly Melissa Schrift, Tony Cavender, Lindsey King, Joseph Baker, and David and Cara Harker for always having their doors open. They, along with their families, make coming to work seem not at all like work. Most importantly, WND would like to thank Margaret and Neill Duncan, and Carmen and Felix, to whom he dedicates this book. They have been a constant fount of support, love and grace and I could not be more grateful.