CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Patronal Politics

This book proposes a new way of understanding events throughout the world that are usually interpreted as democratization, rising authoritarianism, or revolution. Where the rule of law is weak and corruption pervasive, what may appear to be democratic or authoritarian breakthroughs are often just regular, predictable phases in longer-term cyclic dynamics – typical patronal politics. This is shown through in-depth narratives of the post-1991 political history of all post-Soviet polities that are not in the European Union. This book also includes chapters on tsarist and Soviet history and on global patterns.

Henry E. Hale is Associate Professor of Political Science and International Affairs at George Washington University, having earned his PhD at Harvard University, been a Fulbright Scholar, and held a Title VIII post-doctoral fellowship at the Kennan Institute of the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars. His previous work has won two awards from the American Political Science Association, the Leon D. Epstein Outstanding Book Award for *Why Not Parties in Russia* (Cambridge, 2006) and the Alexander L. George Article Award for "Divided We Stand" (*World Politics*, 2005). His other publications include *Foundations of Ethnic Politics* (Cambridge, 2008), two edited volumes, and numerous articles. His research has been funded by the National Science Foundation, the Carnegie Corporation of New York, and (through a Title VIII program) the National Council for East European and Eurasian Research. In 2009–12, he served as director of the Institute for European, Russian, and Eurasian Studies (IERES) at George Washington University's Elliott School of International Affairs. He is currently editorial board chair of *Demokratizatsiya: The Journal of Post-Soviet Democratization*.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

PROBLEMS OF INTERNATIONAL POLITICS

Series Editors
Keith Darden, *American University*
Ian Shapiro, *Yale University*

The series seeks manuscripts central to the understanding of international politics that will be empirically rich and conceptually innovative. It is interested in works that illuminate the evolving character of nation-states within the international system. It sets out three broad areas for investigation: (1) identity, security, and conflict; (2) democracy; and (3) justice and distribution.

Titles in the Series

Şener Aktürk, *Regimes of Ethnicity and Nationhood in Germany, Russia, and Turkey*
Séverine Autesserre, *Peaceland: Conflict Resolution and the Everyday Politics of International Intervention*
Lisa Baldez, *Defying Convention: U.S. Resistance to the UN Treaty on Women's Rights*
Henry E. Hale, *Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective*
Donald Horowitz, *Constitutional Change and Democracy in Indonesia*
Adria K. Lawrence, *Imperial Rule and the Politics of Nationalism: Anti-Colonial Protest in the French Empire*
Steven Levitsky and Lucan A. Way, *Competitive Authoritarianism: Hybrid Regimes after the Cold War*
Tarek Masoud, *Counting Islam: Religion, Class, and Elections in Egypt*
Shaul Mishal and Ori Goldberg, *Understanding Shiite Leadership: The Art of the Middle Ground in Iran and Lebanon*
Harris Mylonas, *The Politics of Nation-Building: Making Co-Nationals, Refugees, and Minorities*

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Patronal Politics

Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective

HENRY E. HALE
The George Washington University

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107423138

© Henry E. Hale 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data
Hale, Henry E., 1966–
Patronal politics : Eurasian regime dynamics in comparative perspective / Henry E. Hale, George Washington University.
pages cm. – (Problems of international politics)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-07351-7 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-42313-8 (paperback)
1. Patronage, Political – Former Soviet Republics. 2. Political culture – Former Soviet republics. 3. Former Soviet republics – Politics and government. I. Title.
JN6581.H35 2015
324.2′04–dc23 2014016288

ISBN 978-1-107-07351-7 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-107-42313-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Contents

List of Figures *page* x
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii
Note on Transliteration xvii

1. Introduction 1
2. Patronal Politics and the Great Power of Expectations 19
   Why "Patronalism" and Not a Preexisting Concept? 22
   Patronalism in World Historical Context 28
   The Sinews of Patronal Power 29
   What Binds Patronalistic Networks Together? 31
   The Great Power of Expectations 34
   Conclusion 38
3. Eurasian History as Patronal Politics 39
   Patronalism in Eurasia: From Prehistory to 1917 40
   The Failed Antipatronalist Revolution 47
   Communist in Form, Patronal in Content 52
   System Breakup 54
   Conclusion 57
4. Constitutions, Elections, and Regime Dynamics 61
   The Origins of Contested Elections and Constitutions in Patronalistic Polities 66
   Contested Nationwide Elections 71
   Constitutions 76
   Nonlinear Regime Dynamics 82
   Conclusion 93

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

5. The Emergence of Networks and Constitutions 95
The Formation of Corporate Conglomerates (Oligarchs) 98
Regional Networks 110
Two Crucial Caveats on the Nature of Post-Soviet Networks 115
The Prevalence of Presidentialist Constitutions 118
Conclusion 122

6. The Building of Eurasia's Great Power Pyramids 123
The Short-Term Importance of Leadership Will and Skill 127
The Near-Universal Eurasian Tendency to Single-Pyramid Politics in the 1990s 133
Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan: The Implications of Lesser Transitional Disruption 162
The Lone Eurasian Nonpresidentialist Patronal State: Moldova 165
Conclusion 174

7. Revolutions and Other Presidential Ousters 178
The Orange Revolution in Ukraine (2004) 182
The Rose Revolution in Georgia (2003) 190
The Tulip Revolution in Kyrgyzstan (2005) 194
Abkhazia's "Uncolored Revolution" (2004–2005) 199
Saakashvili's Downfall in Georgia (2012–2013) 205
South Ossetia's Revolution of 2011–2012 212
Transnistria's 2011 "Stunning Election" 220
Armenia's Palace Coup (1998) 228
A Blood-Red Revolution in Kyrgyzstan (2010) 230
Ukraine's Euromaidan Revolution (2014) 234
Conclusion 238

8. Nonrevolution in Post-Soviet Presidential Systems 241
Full-On Dictatorships: Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan 242
Patronal Presidencies without Lame Ducks: Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, Belarus 248
Surviving Lame-Duck Syndromes: Russia, Azerbaijan, Nagorno-Karabakh 266
Conclusion 304

9. After Revolution 307
A Pair of Paired Comparisons: Ukraine and Kyrgyzstan 2005–2010 and 2010–2014 311
Regime Cycles in Abkhazia and Armenia 350
Georgia after Shevardnadze and after Saakashvili 364
Conclusion 370

10. Patronal Parliamentarism 372
Moldova's 2000 Constitution 375
The Rise of Moldova's Communist Machine under Parliamentarism 377

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Parliamentarism's Moderate Moderating Effect on the Communist Machine 383
Impending Presidential Succession and Cracks in the Communist Pyramid 389
Moldova's 2009 "Twitter Revolution That Wasn't" 398
Denouement: The Democratic Upside of Moldova's Parliamentarism 409
Conclusion 417

11. Explaining Post-Soviet Regime Dynamics 422
A Patronal Politics Perspective on Regime Dynamics 423
Public Opinion and Other Key Subjects Left for Future Research 432
Factors That Matter Far Less than Commonly Believed 439
Conclusion: Are the Post-Soviet Hybrid Regimes "Regimes"? 453

12. Patronal Politics in Global Comparative Perspective 455
What Distinguishes Eurasia as a Region: High Patronalism, Low Linkage/Leverage 456
Eastern Europe (Also Known as Central, Southern, and Eastern Europe) 458
Africa, Asia, the Middle East (Arab Spring), and Latin America 466
Are Eurasia's Regime Cycles Ultimately Leading to Sweden, Somalia, or Something Else? 472
Some Implications for Policy Makers and International Democracy Promotion 484

References 489
Index 523

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Figures

2.1. Example of a patronal network *page* 21
3.1. Levels of perceived corruption by country 2013 40
4.1. Example of an ideal-type single-pyramid system 65
4.2. Example of an ideal-type competing-pyramid system 65
5.1. Stylized example of a patronal network: Luzhkov's network 1998–1999 97
6.1. Levels of political closure in post-Soviet polities during emergence of initial single-pyramid systems 176
8.1. Late 1999 dynamics in electoral support (percentage of likely voters) for major presidential candidates in Russia 269
11.1. Levels of political closure in post-Soviet polities after the emergence of initial single-pyramid systems to 2012 429

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Tables

3.1. Legacies of patronalism at the end of Communist rule *page* 60
7.1. Patronal presidential network ousters occurring after the initial single-pyramid systems described in Chapter 6 were in place through mid-2014 181
12.1. Formal constitutions and patronalism in postcommunist countries since the mid-1990s 459

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Acknowledgments

While readers will ultimately be the judge of its quality, this book is far better than it otherwise would have been thanks to a large number of others who devoted great amounts of time and effort to helping me along over the years. Most of all, I thank my wife, Isabelle Kaplan, without whose support, insights, and editorial excellence I would not have been able to write this book.

I am also very grateful to those who provided research assistance at various points in time, including Wilder Bullard, Cristian Ciobanu, Marketa Janesova, Sergiu Manic, Justin Schoville, Jeremy Streatfield, Huan-Kai Tseng, and Paul Zachary. This research assistance was made possible by support from the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars' Kennan Institute and George Washington University's (GW's) Institute for European, Russian, and Eurasian Studies (IERES) at the Elliott School of International Affairs, in particular IERES's Maria H. Davis European Studies Endowment. I am also deeply grateful to the dozens of individuals – far too many to name – who helped facilitate my field research in post-Soviet countries, sharing their own insights, recommending materials, and assisting me in finding the people with whom I wanted to meet.

GW's Political Science Department and IERES, where I am especially grateful to Directors Hope Harrison and Peter Rollberg, provided outstanding intellectual environments in which to develop these ideas, as did the Kennan Institute, where thanks to Director Blair Ruble and his outstanding associates I spent eight months during 2009 on a Title VIII Research Scholarship. I also benefited from time spent in residence at the Harvard Ukrainian Research Institute on a Fellowship in Ukrainian Studies (2004) and at the Carnegie Moscow Center (2007–8 and again 2012). Funding for other aspects of my research, including the extensive fieldwork across the region that the project involved, came from the Fulbright Scholar program (which supported research based in Moscow

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

during 2007–8) and the Elliott School's Strategic Opportunities for Academic Reach (SOAR) initiative launched by Dean Michael Brown.

I owe a special debt to all who took whole days out of their busy schedules to read all or parts of the book as it was in progress and to provide me with invaluable feedback, including through two amazingly helpful workshops organized for the manuscript. The first was a Johan Skytte Manuscript Workshop held by the Johan Skytte Foundation at Uppsala University in Uppsala, Sweden, during May 27–8, 2011. This event featured extensive comments from Li Bennich-Bjorkman, Georgi Derluguian, Joakim Ekman, Johan Engvall, Oleksandr Fisun, Sverker Gustavsson, Gretchen Helmke, Kimitaka Matsuzato, Sven Oskarsson, William Reno, Graeme Robertson, Mattias Sigfridsson, Inge Snip, Alexei Trochev, and Sten Widmalm. The second was a "book incubator" workshop organized at IERES through the Program on New Approaches to Research and Security in Eurasia (PONARS Eurasia), funded by Carnegie Corporation of New York. Participants generously giving of their time included Nathan Brown, Wilder Bullard, Paul D'Anieri, Jeffrey Goldstein, Lisel Hintz, Cynthia McClintock, Eric McGlinchey, Kimberly Morgan, Nancy Myers, Robert Orttung, Margaret Paxson, Albert Schmidt, Alexander Sokolowski, Brian Taylor, Joshua Tucker, and Cory Welt (who organized the session). Timothy Colton and Alexandra Vacroux gave the manuscript a spin in their graduate class on post-Soviet politics at Harvard University, for which I thank them and their students. Rebecca Chamberlain-Creanga and Andrei Rogachevskii also provided very helpful detailed comments on earlier drafts. I am also grateful to Eric Lawrence and students in his Visualizing and Modeling Politics class at GW for their assistance in designing Figure 3.1.

Far more people than I can mention commented on pieces of this project that were presented at dozens of conferences and university lecture series over the years, including several PONARS Eurasia workshops and invited appearances at the Brookings Institution, Columbia University, George Mason University, Georgetown University, the European University at St. Petersburg (Russia), Indiana University, the Kennan Institute, the I. F. Kuras Institute of Political and Ethnic Studies of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, the Kuras National University of Kharkiv (Ukraine), Lviv Polytechnic National University (Ukraine), Lviv State Agrarian University (Ukraine), Miami University, the Noravank Foundation (Armenia), Queen's University (Canada), the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences, the University of Tokyo, Stanford University, Uppsala University, the University of Chicago, the University of Michigan, the University of Pittsburgh, and the University of Washington.

I am also very grateful to Lewis Bateman and his colleagues at Cambridge University Press for their consistent support and guidance in developing this book. Finally, I wish to thank the publishers of the following articles for

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

permission to include some of the material that originally came out there in the book:

Henry E. Hale, "Did the Internet Break the Political Machine? Moldova's 2009 'Twitter Revolution That Wasn't,'" *Demokratizatsiya: The Journal of Post-Soviet Democratization*, v. 21, no. 3, Fall 2013, pp. 481–505

Henry E. Hale, "Eurasian Polities as Hybrid Regimes: The Case of Putin's Russia," *Journal of Eurasian Studies*, v. 1, no. 1, 2010, pp. 33–41

Henry E. Hale, "Formal Constitutions in Informal Politics: Institutions and Democratization in Eurasia," *World Politics*, v. 63, no. 4, October 2011, pp. 581–617

Henry E. Hale, "Prezidentskii rezhim, revoliutsiia, i demokratiia: Sravnitel'nyi analiz Gruzii, Kyrgyzii, Rossii, i Ukrainy," *Pro et Contra*, no. 1, January–February 2008, pp. 6–21

Henry E. Hale, "The Putin Machine Sputters: First Impressions of Russia's 2011 Duma Election," *Russian Analytical Digest*, no. 106, December 21, 2011, pp. 2–5

Henry E. Hale, "Regime Cycles: Democracy, Autocracy, and Revolution in Post-Soviet Eurasia," *World Politics*, v. 58, no. 1, October 2005, pp. 133–65

Henry E. Hale, "Two Decades of Post-Soviet Regime Dynamics," *Demokratizatsiya: The Journal of Post-Soviet Democratization*, v. 20, no. 2, Spring 2012, pp. 71–7

Henry E. Hale, "The Uses of Divided Power," *Journal of Democracy*, v. 21, no. 3, July 2010, pp. 84–98

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07351-7 - Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective
Henry E. Hale
Frontmatter
More information

Note on Transliteration

Cyrillic (in this volume, Russian, Ukrainian, and Uzbek languages) source material is transliterated here using the Library of Congress system with the following exceptions:

General exceptions:

- Y is used at the beginning of soft vowels (ya, ye, yu) that are the first letters in words
- Soft signs are omitted at the end of proper names
- Common spellings are employed for words or names that widely appear in English-language media (e.g., Klitschko not Klychko)

Exceptions made for people's names:

- Soft signs are omitted from people's names (e.g., Yeltsin not Yel'tsin)
- The letter y is used at the end of names that would otherwise end in ii, yi, yy, or iy
- The letters ie are substituted for 'e (e.g., Glaziev not Glaz'ev or Glazev)
- The spellings people themselves use as authors of English-language publications are generally used here regardless of the above (e.g., Vladimir Gel'man, Serhiy Kudelia)

For Azerbaijani language sources that use the Latin alphabet, letters that do not appear in English are transliterated phonetically or by the English letter that best approximates the sound. Specifically, the following conversions are used:

ü	u
ö	o
ğ	gh
ı	i
ə	a
ç	ch
ş	sh

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org