

PERFORMING CITIZENSHIP IN PLATO'S LAWS

In the *Laws*, Plato theorizes citizenship as simultaneously a political, ethical and aesthetic practice. His reflection on citizenship finds its roots in a descriptive psychology of human experience, with sentience and, above all, volition seen as the primary targets of a lifelong training in the values of citizenship. In the city of Magnesia described in the *Laws*, *erōs* for civic virtue is presented as a motivational resource not only within the reach of the 'ordinary' citizen but also factored in by default in its educational system. Supporting a vision of 'perfect citizenship' based on an internalized obedience to the laws and persuading the entire polity to consent willingly to it requires an ideology that must be rhetorically all-inclusive. In this city, 'ordinary' citizenship itself will be troped as a performative action: Magnesia's choral performances become a fundamental channel for shaping, feeling and communicating a strong sense of civic identity and unity.

LUCIA PRAUSCELLO is University Senior Lecturer in Classics at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Trinity Hall. She has published on Greek philology, literature and music. Her monograph *Singing Alexandria: Music between Practice and Textual Transmission* was published in 2006.



CAMBRIDGE CLASSICAL STUDIES

General editors

R.L. HUNTER, R.G. OSBORNE, M. MILLETT, D.N. SEDLEY, G.C. HORROCKS, S.P. OAKLEY, W.M. BEARD



PERFORMING CITIZENSHIP IN PLATO'S LAWS

LUCIA PRAUSCELLO





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107072886

© Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-07288-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

	reface and acknowledgements	page vi
No	ote to the reader	ix
	Introduction	I
	Preliminaries P.1 Terminology: the language of desire and Plato's	8
	moral psychology	13
Pa	art I Performing ordinary virtue in Plato's utopias: citizenship, desire and intention	
I	Citizenship in Callipolis	21
	I.I Utopian citizenships: Republic and Laws	21
	1.2 Degrees of virtue in the <i>Republic</i>	24
	1.3 Sōphrosynē as civic philia in Callipolis	27
	I.4 Musical education and the erotics of beauty: from <i>philia</i> to <i>erōs</i> ?	20
	1.5 <i>Philia</i> and the language of care: Callipolis and models	35
	of citizenship	46
	1.6 Degrees of 'friendship' in Callipolis	52
_		
2	Citizenship in Magnesia	57
	2.1 Degrees of virtue in Magnesia	57
	 2.2 Anagkaiotatē sōphrosynē in Magnesia: slaves and metics 2.3 'Ordinary virtue' and 'perfect citizenship' in Magnesia 2.4 'Perfect citizenship' and the language of erotic desire 	59 68
	in the Laws	73
Pa	art II Citizenship and performance in the Laws	
3	Choral performances, persuasion and pleasure	104
5	3.1 The erotics of citizenship and its context: between	
	symposium and chorus	109
	3.2 Dramatic and non-dramatic mimesis in Magnesia	118



CONTENTS

	3.3 The origin of <i>choreia</i> : <i>charā</i> , <i>charis</i> and <i>peithō</i>	128
	3.4 Divine and human <i>choreia</i>	135
	3.5 Rhythm, order, pleasure and belief	137
4	Patterns of chorality in Magnesia	152
	4.1 The three choruses of Magnesia	152
	4.2 Dionysiac music: the third chorus	160
	4.3 Magnesia's emmeleia(i)	173
	4.4 Euphēmia versus thrēnos	182
5	Comedy and comic discourse in Magnesia	192
	5.1 Comedy and the law in Magnesia	193
	5.2 The psychology of comic laughter in the <i>Republic</i> and the	, ,
	Philebus	197
	5.3 Comedy at Magnesia: the spectacle of otherness	201
	5.4 Comedy at Magnesia: comic <i>mania</i> and bad speech	2 I I
6	Epilogue: On law, agency and motivation	223
	6.1 Law and human nature	225
	6.2 Rewriting citizenship in Plato's Laws	230
Ri	bliography	236
Index		261
		270
In	Index of subjects	

vi



PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

By education neither an ancient philosopher nor a cultural historian, I have come to Plato's Laws from the perspective of someone interested in literary criticism and its history. I soon became fascinated by the inexhaustible richness and complexity of a text that requires a constant process of unpacking and unravelling from its reader. Above all, I was struck by the way in which the *Laws* pervasively engages with the discursive practices of the contemporary polis and in particular with polis religion. The result is an attempt at narrowing the gap between philosophy and literature in our appreciation of Plato's Laws. I am conscious that such a hybrid approach will probably disappoint both the analytical expectations of the philosopher proper and the sophistication of the literary critic. Yet if the book as it is offers some new insights on the strategies of persuasion woven by Plato in the Laws and on the resonances that these strategies may have evoked in a contemporary audience, then, with Plato, I can say that καλός ὁ κίνδυνος.

The debt of gratitude that I have contracted over the years with colleagues and friends who have patiently read and commented, at some stage or other, on versions of individual chapters or of the whole work is a very large one: I would like in particular to thank Albio Cesare Cassio, Franco Ferrari, Richard Hunter, Leslie Kurke, Salvatore Lavecchia, Geoffrey Lloyd, Donald Mastronarde, Robin Osborne, Anastasia-Erasmia Peponi, Richard Rawles, Ian Rutherford, Frisbee Sheffield, David Sedley, Mario Telò, Olga Tribulato and James Warren. A major debt of gratitude is owed to two persons without whose constant support and guidance this book could not have been written and, in all likelihood, not even conceived: Giovan Battista D'Alessio and Malcom Schofield. They both believed, in different ways, that I had, after all, something to say about

vii



PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Plato's *Laws*. How much I owe to their unbounded intellectual and human generosity cannot be adequately put into words. It goes without saying that I alone am responsible for any infelicity, misunderstanding or mistake present in the book.

The bulk of this book was written between 2009 and the early months of 2013. The important volume by A.-E. Peponi (ed.), Performance and Culture in Plato's Laws, Cambridge and New York 2013 came out too late (June 2013) for me to engage with it with the thoroughness and detail that it deserves. I have nevertheless tried to incorporate it in my discussion, highlighting both convergences and divergences. I am particularly grateful to B. Kowalzig, L. Kurke, K. Morgan and A.-E. Peponi for allowing me to read the proofs of their contributions ahead of publication. Chapters 3 and 4 include (but are not limited to) a substantially revised and expanded form of some of the material previously published as 'Patterns of chorality in Plato's Laws' in D. Yatromanolakis (ed.) Music and Cultural Politics in Greek and Chinese Societies, vol. I: Greek Antiquity (Cambridge, MA 2011 [but 2012]: 168–93) and as 'Choral persuasions in Plato's Laws' in R. Gagné and M. Govers Hopman (eds.), Choral Mediations in Greek Tragedy (Cambridge 2013: 257–77). Chapter 5 is a slightly revised and amplified version of 'Comedy and comic discourse in Plato's Laws' in E. Bakola, L. Prauscello and M. Telò (eds.), Greek Comedy and the Discourse of Genres (Cambridge 2013: 317-42).

This book is dedicated to my father, in his last illness.

viii



NOTE TO THE READER

The text of the *Laws* is that of J. Burnet, *OCT* vol. V; the *Republic* is quoted after S.R. Slings' 2003 *OCT*. Translations, unless otherwise stated, are my own. The abbreviations of the names of ancient authors and their works follow those in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary* (4th edition) when available, otherwise those of Liddell, Scott and Jones, *A Greek-English Lexicon* (9th edition). Abbreviations of journals are cited after *L'Année philologique*.