CONTENTS

List of Contributors  page xvii
Preface  xxi
Foreword  xxv
Table of Cases  xxix
Table of TEU, TFEU and CFR Provisions  lli
Table of the Provisions of Regulations 1612/68 and 492/2011 and Directive 2004/38  lvii
List of Abbreviations  lix

Introduction  1

1 On Tiles and Pillars: EU Citizenship as a Federal Denominator  3
DIMITRY KOCHENOV

   I Decommodication of Personhood in the European Union?  3
   II The ‘Federal Association of States and Citizens’  16
   III Market Citizenship: A Logical Impossibility  35
   IV Reintroducing Dignity into the Structural Fabric of the Legal System  44
   V Extending the Analysis: The Chapters That Follow  52
   VI On Tiles and Pillars: Predicting the Future  78

PART I Citizenship within the EU Federal Context  83

2 The Origins and the Potential Federalising Effects of the Substance of Rights Test  85
MARTIJN VAN DEN BRINK

   I Introduction  85
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II The Protection of the Substance of Rights in the Case Law of the ECJ</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III The substance of EU Citizenship Rights</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Reinforcing the Vertical Dimension of EU Citizenship</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V The Substance of Which Rights?</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI Conclusion</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 3 Some Reflections on Member State Nationality: A Prerequisite of EU Citizenship and an Obstacle to Its Enjoyment

**Maciej Szpunar and María Esther Blas López**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Introduction</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Globalisation, Europeanisation and Member State Nationality</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Some Reflections Concerning Nationality as an Obstacle to the Enjoyment of EU Citizenship</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Conclusion</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 4 The European Federalisation Process and the Dynamics of Fundamental Rights

**José Luis da Cruz Vilaca and Alessandra Silveira**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Introduction</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Waiting for a Federal Big Bang? Revisiting the Federalising Process Theory</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Delimitation of Competences and Federative Balance</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Fundamental Rights and Sense of Community</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Conflicts of Competence and System Survival</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI Conclusion</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 5 Recasting EU Citizenship as Federal Citizenship: What Are the Implications for the Citizen When the Polity Bargain Is Privileged?

**Niamh Nic Shuibhne**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Introduction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II The EU as a Federal Polity</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### CONTENTS

| III | Recasting EU Citizenship Case Law as Federal Citizenship Case Law | 160 |
| IV | EU Citizenship as Federal Citizenship: The Value Added – and the Value Lost | 168 |
| V  | Conclusion | 176 |

### 6 Transfiguring European Citizenship: From Member State Territory to Union Territory

**Loïc Azoulai**

| I  | From Metonymy to Metaphor | 178 |
| II | From European Territory to Social Integration | 182 |
| III | From Social Integration to the Territory of the Union | 193 |
| IV | Conclusion | 202 |

### 7 Earned Citizenship – Understanding Union Citizenship through Its Scope

**Eleanor Spaventa**

| I  | Introduction | 204 |
| II | From the Market to the Market: The (Ir)Relevance of the Inactive Citizen | 206 |
| III | *Ruiz Zambrano* and the Substance of the Rights Test – A Hasty Retreat and a Problematic Doctrine | 209 |
| IV | Earned Citizenship | 219 |
| V  | Normative Justifications and Moral Imperatives | 221 |
| VI | Conclusions | 223 |

### 8 European Citizenship and Its New Union: Time to Move On?

**Daniel Sarmiento and Eleanor Sharpston**

| I  | Introduction | 226 |
| II | Free Movement and Its Limits: When the Court Said ‘Enough’ | 228 |
| III | Citizenship and Rights | 231 |
| IV | Citizenship and Democracy | 235 |
| V  | Citizenship and the Rule of Law | 238 |
| VI | Conclusion: From a Market–Based Citizenship to Constitutional Citizenship: A Task for Citizens, Not Only Courts | 241 |
Table of Contents

9 Going Home? ‘European’ Citizenship Practice Twenty Years After 243
ANTJE WIENER
I Introduction 243
II Citizenship Practice Theory – A Heuristic Device 249
III Renegotiating Normativity: Who Has Access to Contestation? 259
IV Conclusion 267

PART II EU Citizenship Rights and the Vertical Division of Powers in the EU 269

10 The Political Side of EU Citizenship in the Context of EU Federalism 271
FEDERICO FABBRI
I Introduction 271
II EU Citizenship and Political Rights 273
III Extending EU Citizens’ Electoral Rights: Promises and Pitfalls 277
IV Federalism, Citizenship and Democracy 281
V The Case Law of the ECJ and the Development of EU Citizens’ Political Rights 285
VI Treaty Reform: Between States’ Consent and Popular Will 289
VII Conclusion 292

11 Reframing Public Health Governance: From Risk to Citizenship and Participation 294
MARK L. FLEAR
I Introduction 294
II Framing EU Public Health Governance as a Matter of Risk 297
III Reframing EU Public Health Governance as a Matter of EU Citizenship 308
IV Conclusion 315
# CONTENTS

12 The Federal Implications of the Transformation of the Market Freedoms into Sources of Fundamental Rights for the Union Citizen 316

**Alina Tryfonidou**

I Introduction 316
II Morality Issues 319
III Direct Taxation Cases 325
IV Right to Receive Healthcare Services and Goods in the Territory of Another Member State 329
V Immigration Control and Family Reunification Rights of Migrant Union Citizens 333
VI Analysis 337
VII Conclusion 340

13 Perspectives on Social Citizenship in the EU: From Status Positivus to Status Socialis Activus via Two Forms of Transnational Solidarity 341

**Dagmar Schiek**

I Introduction 341
II Towards Transnational Social Citizenship 343
III The EU as a Case Study for Transnational Social Citizenship 354
IV Conclusion 368

14 A Citizenship Right to Stay? The Right Not to Move in a Union Based on Free Movement 371

**Sara Iglesias Sánchez**

I Introduction 371
II Territorial Rights: Right to Stay, Right to Remain, Right Not to be Displaced 373
III The Citizenship of the Union and the Transformation of the Right to Stay 377
IV The Right to Stay in One’s Own Country: An EU Citizenship Right or a Fundamental Right? 387
V Concluding Remarks 392
# Table of Contents

## 15 ‘Scelestus Europeus Sum’: What Protection against Expulsion Does EU Citizenship Offer to European Offenders? 394

**Michał Meduna**

- I EU Citizenship and Public Order – Introduction 394
- II A Tale of Four Institutions 397
- III Federalising Potential of EU Citizenship 407
- IV Future of the public Policy / Security Derogation – Conclusion 413

## 16 EU Sexual Citizenship: Sex Beyond the Internal Market 417

**Uladzislau Belavusau**

- I Introduction 417
- II Sexual Citizenship: Normative Investigation 419
- III EU Sexual Rights: Three Bricks at the Foundation of Sex in the Union 427
- IV Conclusions: Mobile Citizenship and Sex Mobilisation via EU Law 441

## 17 EU Citizenship and the European Federal Challenge through the Prism of Family Reunification 443

**Stanislas Adam and Peter van Elsuwege**

- I Introduction 443
- II A Fragmented Legal Landscape 446
- III The Undesirable Effects of Fragmented Legal Regimes 452
- IV Tackling Reverse Discrimination? 456
- V Rights’ Protection from the Perspective of Comparative Federalism 462
- VI Conclusion 466

## 18 The Right to Stay at Home: A Basis for Expanding European Family Rights 468

**Gareth Davies**

- I Introduction 468
- II The Right to Stay at Home 469
- III Life without Family 474
- IV Difficult Family Members 481
- V Conclusion 487
# Table of Contents

19 EU Citizenship and the Right to Care  
**Nathan Cambien**

- I Introduction  489
- II The Right to Care as a Trigger for More Extensive Protection in ECJ Case Law  490
- III The Legal Foundations of the Right to Care in EU Law  491
- IV Defining the Limits of the Right to Care  498
- V Concluding remarks  506

20 Union Citizenship and Disability: Restricted Access to Equality Rights and the Attitudinal Model of Disability  
**Charlotte O’Brien**

- I Introduction  509
- II The EU as Driver for Member States’ Attitudinal Model  512
- III The EU as Cheerleader for Member States’ Attitudinal Model  528
- IV Altering the Federal Dynamic and the Functional Direction: The EU as Potential Protector  535
- V Conclusion  536

21 Data Privacy Rights and Citizenship: Notes on Federalism All the Way Up  
**Bilyana Petkova**

- I Introduction  540
- II The Importance of Privacy in the European Legal Order  542
- III National Institutions’ Impact on EU Data Privacy: Toward Privacy Federalism All the Way Up?  545
- IV The Intersection of Data Privacy and Citizenship Rights  556
- V Conclusion  559

22 The Federal Entrenchment of Citizens in the European Union Member States’ Criminal Laws: Or How EU Citizenship Is Shaping Criminal Law  
**Hanneke Van Eijken and Tony P. Marguery**

- I Introduction  561
- II The Need to Protect a Federal Citizenship beyond the Cross-Border Logic as a Rationale for the AFSJ  564
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART</th>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>To What Extent Does EU Criminal Law Affect EU Citizens? 568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>The Impact of EU Citizens’ Rights on Criminal Law 573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Conclusion 582</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

23 The Right of EU Citizens to Diplomatic and Consular Protection: A Step Towards Recognition of EU Citizenship in Third Countries? 584

**P A T R I Z I A  V I G N I**

I Introduction 584
II The Right to Diplomatic and Consular Protection 586
III The EU as International Defender of EU Citizens 604
IV Conclusion 610

PART III  Broader Implications and Limitations 613

24 Individual Rights, Interstate Equality, State Autonomy: European Horizontal Citizenship and Its (Lonely) Playground from a Trans-Atlantic Perspective 615

**F R A N C E S C A  S T R U M I A**

I Introduction 615
II Federalism and the Discourse of Citizenship in the US and the EU – Act I 617
III Federalism and the Discourse of Citizenship in the US and the EU – Act II 625
IV EU Horizontal Citizenship 631
V Post-National Citizenship and Political Citizenship in the EU: A Horizontal Perspective 636
VI Conclusion 641

25 EU Citizenship and Fundamental Rights: Contradictory, Converging or Complementary? 642

**D O M I N I K  D Ü S T E R H A U S**

I Introduction 642
II A Contradiction? Citizenship and Fundamental Rights 643
III Fundamental Rights and Member State Action 647
IV On the Protective Potential of Citizenship Rights 650
V Links to the Rights: Triggering Rules in the Field of Citizenship 656
CONTENTS

VI Protecting the Citizens: The Limits of Interpretation 661
VII Conclusion 664

26 Reverse Solange: Union Citizenship as a Detour on the Route to European Rights Protection against National Infringements 665
JOHANNA CROON-GESTEFELD
I Introduction 665
II EU Fundamental Rights Protection against Member State Violations – Current Proposals 667
III Union Citizenship as a Door-Opener for Rights Protection? 671
IV The Reversibility of the Solange Approach 676
V The Danger of Reverse Results 680
VI Conclusion 683

27 Union Citizenship Re-Imagined: The Scope of Intervention of EU Institutions 685
JOŽE ŠTRUS
I Introduction 686
II Circumstances Establishing the Link with EU Law 687
III Negative Effect on the exercise of Union Citizenship Rights: A Central Connecting Factor with EU Law? 693
IV The Right Institutions for the Job: The Role of EU and National Institutions in Ensuring the Effectiveness of Union Citizenship Rights 700
V Conclusion 704

28 Frontiers of EU Citizenship: Three Trajectories and Their Methodological Limitations 705
DANIEL THYM
I Introduction 705
II Frontiers of Union Citizenship 706
III Methodological Background 707
IV Aspirational Citizenship 710
V Citizenship as a Legal Creation 717
VI Citizenship as a Social Fact 724
VII Conclusion 728
CONTENTS

29 EU Citizenship and Its Relevance for EU Exit and Secession 731
Phoebus L. Athanassiou and Stéphanie Laulhé Shaelou

I Introduction 731
II Withdrawal in Toto of a Member State from the EU – Concept and Consequences 733
III Secession of Part of the Territory of an EU Member State – Concept and Relevance of Public International Law in an EU Context 735
IV The Concept of EU Citizenship and Its Relevance in EU Exit or Secession Scenarios 740
V EU Citizenship as a Non-Legal Consideration in EU Exit or Secession Scenarios 747
VI Concluding Remarks 749

30 Epilogue on EU Citizenship: Hopes and Fears 751
Koen Lenaerts and José A. Gutiérrez-Fons

I Introduction 751
II The Idea of ‘Democracy’ 753
III The Right to Move as an EU Citizen in the Light of Demiocracy 757
IV Ruiz Zambrano, Delvigne and the EU Constitutional Balance 762
V Concluding Remarks 779

Index 782