

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Post-Soviet Power

Post-Soviet Power tells the story of the Russian electricity system and examines the politics of its transformation from a ministry to a market. Susanne A. Wengle shifts our focus away from what has been at the center of post-Soviet political economy – corruption and the lack of structural reforms – to draw attention to political struggles to establish a state with the ability to govern the economy. She highlights the importance of hands-on economic planning by authorities – post-Soviet developmentalism – and details the market mechanisms that have been created. This book argues that these observations urge us to think of economies and political authority as mutually constitutive, in Russia and beyond. Whereas the political arena often thinks of market arrangements resulting from political institutions, Russia's marketization demonstrates that the political arena is also produced by the market arrangements that actors create. Taking this reflexivity seriously suggests a view of economies and markets as constructed and contingent entities.

Susanne A. Wengle is a Research Fellow and lecturer in the political science department at the University of Chicago. Her research has appeared in *Studies in Comparative International Development*, *Economy and Society*, *Europe-Asia Studies*, *Russian Analytical Digest*, and *Chicago Policy Review* and is forthcoming in *Regulation & Governance*. She is currently working on a project on the political economy of agriculture and food systems in Russia and the United States.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Post-Soviet Power

State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

SUSANNE A. WENGLE

University of Chicago



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107072480

© Susanne A. Wengle 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Wengle, Susanne A., 1977–

Post-Soviet power: state-led development and Russia's marketization /

Susanne A. Wengle, University of Chicago Lecturer

Department of Political Science, University of Chicago.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-07248-0 (hardback)

1. Russia (Federation) – Economic policy – 1991– 2. Post-communism – Russia (Federation) I. Title.

HC340.I2.W46 2014

337.47–dc23 2014020954

ISBN 978-1-107-07248-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For Jay, Oren, Artur, Aino, and Alex, the light of my day.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Note on Transliteration and Translation</i>	xiii
Introduction: Russia’s Political Marketization	I
PART I	
1 From Ministry to Market	23
2 Power Politics	58
3 Regionally Patterned Pacts and the Political Life of Things	99
PART II	
4 Privatization – Competing Claims and New Owners	137
5 Liberalization – the Price of Power	183
6 Expertise – Engineers versus Managers	220
Conclusion: Development as Contingent Transformations	247
<i>Appendixes</i>	261
<i>Bibliography</i>	273
<i>Index</i>	289

Tables

1.1	Ownership and subsidy regimes	<i>page</i> 26
2.1	Evolving bargains that shape electricity sector outcomes	69
4.1	Case studies of three energos	143
4.2	New owners in European Russia's power sector, 2008	166
4.3	New owners of Siberia's power sector, 2008	170
5.1	Household and industrial tariffs: Regional differences over time	186
5.2	Summary of cross-regional difference in subsidy regimes (2003–2008)	208
5.3	Regional differences in cross-subsidies persist	209
5.4	List of regions receiving direct budget transfers in 2004	216
A.3.1	European power plants and new owners (2008)	265
A.3.2	Siberian power plants and new owners (2008)	267
A.4.1	Price increases between 2000 and 2005	268
A.4.2	Cross-subsidies as percentage of industrial tariffs between 2000 and 2005	269
A.4.3	Industrial subsidies, 2005	270
A.4.4	Levels and differentials for regulated prices, 2005	271
A.4.5	Price differentials in the liberalized segment of the wholesale market, 2009	271

Figures

1.1. Political economy of Russia's electricity sector liberalization	<i>page 25</i>
3.1. Regional distribution of Gazprom's Russian domestic gas sales, 2008	113

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

I incurred many debts while researching and writing this book; the following is a partial accounting that can hardly do justice to the support I feel so privileged to have received.

First I would like to thank my dissertation committee at UC Berkeley, Steven Vogel, Kiren Chaudhry, Jason Wittenberg, and Yuri Slezkine, who taught me to value history but to keep looking for lessons beyond a particular time and place. I am grateful for the many conversations that molded and enriched my understanding of political economy and Russia, and for advice in matters ranging from academic to practical. My dissertation would not have shape-shifted into this book at the University of Chicago without the critical support by Gary Herrigel. His intellectual energy and generosity are unparalleled, and I am truly fortunate to have been able to benefit from them. Wendy Brown, Ruth Collier, Stephen Collier, Julie Cooper, Andrew Janos, Stan Markus, Bob Orttung, Douglas Rogers, Peter Rutland, Alberto Simpers, Dan Slater, Edward Walker, Yves Winter, David Woodruff, and Alexei Yurchak also provided thoughtful input, invaluable support, and criticism at different stages of the project. Ivan Ascher, Jennifer Brass, Jennifer Dixon, Jonathan Hassid, Elif Kale, Jody LaPorte, Jay Rehm, Regine Spector, Rachel Stern, and Zhivka Valiavicharska read many early drafts of this work. I owe them a great deal for their friendship and for countless comments on my work. I also would like to thank the anonymous reviewers enlisted by Cambridge University Press for close readings of the manuscript when it was in a much rougher shape and for their suggestions how to improve it. I want to acknowledge the generous financial support by the Swiss National

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Science Foundation, IREX, the William Davidson Institute, the Janggen Poehn Stiftung, and – at UC Berkeley – the Institute for East European and Eurasian Studies, the Institute for International Studies, and the Department of Political Science. I thank Robert Dreesen for shepherding my work through the publication process with great care and professionalism, and Kostya Dyakonov and Natalia Forrat for expert research assistance. All remaining errors are entirely my own.

In Russia, I have benefited greatly from critical support of friends, colleagues, and strangers, who volunteered their time and shared their experience of a difficult period in Russian history. I am truly grateful for the people who agreed to be interviewed for this project. Often on weekends and in their spare time, and usually over tea, they shared their views and experiences and told me about their role in the transformation of the electricity system. With every detail they added an invaluable puzzle piece to my understanding of the matter. I am particularly indebted to Margarita Mezonshnik and Alexey Klaptsov, who opened countless doors, behind which I learned more about the electricity sector's transformation than anywhere else. I also thank the people who have generously opened their personal archives, that is, their collection of newspaper articles that seemed particularly important to them, often stretching back years. In three different cities, three such personal archives produced gems that I would not have been able to locate by myself.

Select elements of the book were originally published as “Post-Soviet Developmentalism and the Political Economy of Russia's Electricity Sector Liberalization” in *Studies in Comparative International Development* 47, no. 1 (2012); they are reprinted here with the permission of Springer Science and Business Media. Taylor and Francis agreed to the reproduction of Chapter 6, an earlier version of which appeared as “Engineers versus Managers: Experts, Market-Making and State-Building in Putin's Russia” in *Economy and Society* 41, no. 3 (2012).

Last but not least, I would like to thank my parents, who have always supported me and my travels, no matter how outlandish the project or how far-flung the destination. The book is dedicated to Jay, Oren, Artur, Aino, and Alexandra Rehm. Their contributions defy words on paper for they are the light of my day.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-07248-0 - Post-Soviet Power: State-Led Development and Russia's Marketization

Susanne A. Wengle

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Note on Transliteration and Translation

I preserved the original Russian Cyrillic for important concepts and for Russian-language sources. I transliterated Russian words that are frequently used in English-speaking media and academic discourse (such as *perestroika* and *siloviki*). For these transliterations I used the ALA transliteration schemes. Following established conventions, I departed from the ALA transliterations for a few names and words that are well known in English (Anatoly rather than Anatolii, and Yeltsin rather than El'tsin). All translations from Russian are my own.