

## CONTENTS

<i>List of figures</i>	page xvii
<i>Preface</i>	xix
<i>GATT/WTO dispute settlement reports</i>	xxi

<b>PART I</b>	<b>Foundation of the safeguard mechanism</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>History of the safeguard mechanism</b>	<b>3</b>
1	Introduction of the safeguard mechanism	3
1.1	General context	3
1.2	The Atlantic Charter	4
1.3	The new economic order after the Second World War	5
1.4	Negotiating history of the safeguard clause	5
1.4.1	US proposals of 1945	5
1.4.2	The Suggested Charter	7
1.4.3	Preparatory Committee negotiations	9
1.4.4	London discussions	9
1.4.5	The initiative of the GATT	16
1.4.6	New York redrafting	17
1.4.7	Geneva discussions: the GATT safeguard clause	18
1.4.8	The Havana Conference	22
1.5	ITO failure and the 'provisional' application of the GATT over forty-seven years	23
2	The GATT: objectives, disciplines, exceptions	25
2.1	Object and purpose	25
2.2	Basic obligations	25
2.3	Exceptions	27
2.4	Dispute settlement	29
3	Article XIX: the safeguard clause	29
3.1	Article XIX:1(a) – the clause	31
3.2	Article XIX:1(b) – safeguard for tariff preferences	31
3.3	Article XIX:2 – transparency	32

3.4	Article XIX:3 – retaliation	32
3.5	Summary of overall structure	33
4	From the GATT up to the Uruguay Round	34
4.1	Post-GATT refinements and application	34
4.2	Operation of Article XIX during the GATT 1947 period	36
4.3	Disputes on safeguards during the GATT 1947 period	40
4.3.1	<i>United States – Fur Felt Hats</i> (complaint by Czechoslovakia)	42
4.3.2	<i>United States – Dried Figs</i> (complaints by Greece and Turkey)	47
4.3.3	<i>United States – Spring Clothespins</i> (complaint by Denmark and Sweden)	48
4.3.4	<i>Norway – Textile Products</i> (complaint by the United Kingdom (for Hong Kong))	48
4.3.5	<i>Switzerland – Table Grapes</i> (complaint by the EEC)	50
4.4	Concerns raised during the GATT 1947 period	50
4.4.1	Discriminatory application of safeguards	50
4.4.2	Market disruption	52
4.4.3	Grey-area measures	54
4.4.4	Clarification of requirements and establishment of procedural rules	55
4.5	Attempts to establish new rules on safeguards	56
5	Negotiating history of the WTO Agreement on Safeguards	57
5.1	Punta del Este Mandate	57
5.2	Negotiation process: structure and initial steps	60
5.3	The First Draft Agreement (June 1989)	61
5.3.1	Content	61
5.3.2	Follow-ups	65
5.4	The Second Draft Agreement (January 1990)	65
5.4.1	Content	65
5.4.2	Follow-ups	66
5.5	The Third Draft Agreement (July 1990)	67
5.5.1	Content	67
5.5.2	Follow-ups	70
5.6	The Fourth Draft Agreement (October 1990)	70
5.6.1	Content	70
5.6.2	Follow-ups	72
5.7	The Fifth Draft Agreement (June 1991)	72
5.7.1	Content	72

## CONTENTS

ix

5.7.2 Follow-ups	73
5.8 The Sixth Draft Agreement (December 1991)	73
5.9 The Secretariat's suggested corrections	74
6 Conclusion on the negotiating history of the safeguard mechanism	75
7 Operation of the safeguard mechanism during the WTO period (1995–2013)	76
<b>2 The rationale of the safeguard mechanism</b>	<b>83</b>
1 Flexibility	83
1.1 Expectations and transaction costs	84
1.2 <i>Rebus sic stantibus</i>	86
1.3 Practical problems and usefulness of the safeguard mechanism	88
2 Compensation and adjustment	89
2.1 Efficiency counter-argument	89
2.2 Compensation	91
2.3 Industrial adjustment	93
3 Political valve and institutional channel	95
4 Conclusion on the rationale for the safeguard mechanism	97
<b>PART II Right to apply a safeguard</b>	<b>99</b>
<b>3 Period of investigation and products at issue</b>	<b>101</b>
1 Period of investigation	101
1.1 Significance	101
1.2 Legal guidance	103
1.2.1 POI focused on the most recent past	103
1.2.2 POI long enough to suit the facts	105
1.2.3 POI should include most recent data available	107
1.2.4 POI segments should be free of manipulation or bias	108
1.2.5 POI should not be based on fragmented periods	108
1.2.6 Could guidance be drawn from the recommendations of the WTO Committee on Anti-Dumping Practices?	108
1.3 Practical remarks	110
2 Products at issue	111
2.1 The investigated product	111
2.1.1 Significance	111
2.1.1.1 Legal implications	111
2.1.1.2 Business considerations	113

2.1.1.2.1	Horizontal coverage	114
2.1.1.2.2	Vertical coverage	115
2.1.2	The question of the legal standard	116
2.2	The domestic like or directly competitive products	120
2.2.1	Like products	123
2.2.1.1	Criteria for the determination of likeness	125
2.2.1.1.1	Properties, quality, nature and physical characteristics of the products	126
2.2.1.1.2	Consumers' tastes and habits	127
2.2.1.1.3	End uses	129
2.2.1.1.4	Tariff classification	129
2.2.1.2	Evaluation of likeness	130
2.2.2	Direct competitiveness	131
2.2.3	The burden of establishing likeness or direct competitiveness	134
2.3	The order of analysis: investigated product or like or directly competitive product?	135
<b>4</b>	<b>Unforeseen developments and the effect of GATT obligations</b>	<b>136</b>
1	Relationship between unforeseen developments and the effect of GATT obligations and the other requirements for the imposition of a safeguard	136
1.1	Coexistence of Article XIX:1(a) with the AS	136
1.2	Unforeseen developments and effect of GATT obligations as circumstances and not as conditions for the imposition of a safeguard	140
1.3	Logical connection and the question of causation	140
1.4	Reasoned and adequate conclusions on unforeseen developments and the effect of GATT obligations	142
2	Unforeseen developments	143
2.1	Meaning	143
2.2	Function	146
2.3	Operative aspects of unforeseen developments	147
2.4	Types of developments that have been discussed in case law	152
3	Effect of GATT obligations incurred, including concessions	157
3.1	Rationale	157
3.2	Scope	159

## CONTENTS

xi

3.3	Could the effect of the obligations include the MFN obligations?	161
3.4	Discussion of the requirement in WTO disputes	162
<b>5</b>	<b>Increase in imports</b>	<b>163</b>
1	Definition of ‘imports’, data gathering and the measurement of imports	163
1.1	Relevant imports	164
1.1.1	Entries into export-processing zones	164
1.1.2	Exclusion of imports made by domestic producers	165
1.1.3	Exclusion of imports because of their negligibility	166
1.1.4	Exclusion of imports unrelated to the unforeseen developments or the effect of GATT obligations?	166
1.2	Challenges in gathering import data	168
1.3	Measurement in terms of volume vs. value	170
1.4	Challenges in measuring volumes	171
1.5	Increase in imports	171
1.6	Absolute increase in imports	172
1.6.1	Recent, sudden, sharp and significant increases, and Article 4.2(a) of the AS	172
1.6.2	Assessment of trends	173
1.6.3	Baseline	174
1.6.4	Recent past against overall POI	176
1.6.5	Comparisons of segments	178
1.6.6	The measurement of the ‘increase’	178
1.7	Relative increase in imports	179
2	Increase in imports and retaliation	180
3	Increase in imports and evolution of prices	181
<b>6</b>	<b>Serious injury</b>	<b>183</b>
1	Domestic industry	183
1.1	Strategic incentives shaped by the definition of domestic industry	184
1.1.1	Definition	185
1.1.1.1	Relevant producers	188
1.1.1.1.1	Minimum production threshold	189
1.1.1.1.2	Geographical location of producers	190

	1.1.1.1.3 Domestic producers at the supranational level	191
	1.1.1.2 Number of producers: 'all' or a 'major proportion'	193
	1.1.1.3 Lack of standing rules for the initiation of a safeguard investigation	195
	1.1.1.4 The domestic industry as the basis for the injury analysis	196
2	Serious injury	197
2.1	Meaning of serious injury	197
2.2	Considerations for the evaluation of serious injury	198
2.2.1	Factors having a bearing on the state of the industry	199
2.2.2	Selection of factors of an objective and quantifiable nature and data collection	201
2.2.3	Evaluation of the specific injury indicators listed in Article 4.2(a)	203
2.2.3.1	Rate and amount of the increase in imports in absolute and relative terms	207
2.2.3.2	The share of the domestic market taken by increased imports	207
2.2.3.3	Changes in the level of sales	208
2.2.3.4	Changes in the level of production	210
2.2.3.5	Changes in the level of productivity	212
2.2.3.6	Changes in the level of capacity utilization	213
2.2.3.7	Changes in profits and losses	214
2.2.3.8	Changes in the level of employment	218
2.3	Evaluation of the significant overall impairment	219
3	Threat of serious injury	220
3.1	Meaning of threat of serious injury	220
3.2	Evidentiary requirements	220
3.3	Methodological considerations	222
3.4	Relationship between the threat of serious injury and serious injury	224
7	<b>Causal link</b>	226
1	Appropriateness of the causal link between increased imports and serious injury	226
2	Demonstration of causation as a multilayered process	228

## CONTENTS

xiii

2.1	Evaluation of causation based on objective evidence	229
2.1.1	The analysis of coincidence in time	232
2.1.2	Analysis of conditions of competition	236
2.2	The non-attribution analysis	240
2.2.1	Appropriateness of non-attribution	241
2.2.1.1	Functioning	242
2.2.2	Examples of other sources	247
2.2.2.1	Other imports contributing to the serious injury	247
2.2.2.1.1	Foreseen increased imports	248
2.2.2.1.2	Imports that cause injury but were made by the domestic industry itself	248
2.2.2.1.3	Could <i>de minimis</i> imports be excluded from the investigation?	248
2.2.2.1.4	Imports from regional trading partners	249
2.2.2.1.5	Imports from developing countries excluded under Article 9.1?	250
2.2.2.2	Demand-related changes contributing to the serious injury	250
2.2.2.2.1	Contraction in demand	251
2.2.2.2.2	Changes in consumption patterns that may modify demand	253
2.2.2.3	Trade-restrictive practices and competition	254
2.2.2.4	Developments in technology	255
2.2.2.5	Export performance and productivity	255
2.2.2.6	Capacity increases	256
2.2.2.7	Inefficiency in domestic production	258
2.2.2.8	Change in input costs	259
2.2.2.9	Purchaser consolidation	259
2.2.2.10	Increases in energy costs	260
2.2.2.11	Cessation of subsidies payments	261
2.2.2.12	Lack of effective marketing policies	261
2.2.2.13	Other factors	262

	<b>PART III Application of a safeguard</b>	<b>263</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>Scope of a safeguard</b>	<b>265</b>
1	Product scope	265
1.1	Lack of symmetry between the scope of the investigated product and the scope of the like or directly competitive product	267
1.2	Lack of symmetry between the scope of the products at issue and the scope of the safeguard	268
1.2.1	Expansion of a safeguard beyond the scope of the products at issue	269
1.2.1.1	Products with differentiated features or ‘new’ products	269
1.2.1.2	Parts and components, raw material, inputs	270
1.2.2	Contraction of the product scope of a safeguard	271
2	Geographical scope: non-discrimination, MFN application and exceptions	272
2.1	Non-discrimination in the application of safeguards	272
2.1.1	Does Article 2.2 incorporate the MFN clause?	273
2.1.2	MFN application of safeguards	274
2.2	Exceptions to non-discrimination	276
2.2.1	Regional imports and parallelism	277
2.2.1.1	Parallelism	277
2.2.1.2	Exclusion of imports from regional trading partners	284
2.2.2	Exclusion of developing country imports under Article 9.1 of the AS	287
<b>9</b>	<b>The extent of the safeguard</b>	<b>291</b>
1	Necessity of the safeguard	291
2	Prevention or remedy of the serious injury	293
3	Facilitation of the adjustment	294
4	The establishment of the extent	297
<b>10</b>	<b>The form of a safeguard measure</b>	<b>302</b>
1	Nature of a safeguard	302
1.1	Safeguards in the nature of the suspension of GATT concessions and other obligations	302
1.2	Safeguards that do not involve the suspension of GATT concessions or other obligations	304



## CONTENTS

xv

2	The selection of the appropriate trade policy instrument	307
2.1	Safeguards in the form of duties	308
2.2	Safeguard measures in the form of TRQs	309
2.3	Safeguard measures in the form of quotas	311
2.4	Trade policy devices that are not allowed as safeguards	313
<b>11</b>	<b>Temporal application and provisional safeguards</b>	<b>315</b>
1	Duration of safeguards	315
2	Progressive liberalization of safeguards	316
3	Review and renewal and prohibition to reinstate applied safeguards	318
4	Provisional safeguards	319
	<b>PART IV Procedures for the application of safeguard measures</b>	<b>323</b>
<b>12</b>	<b>Domestic investigation</b>	<b>325</b>
1	General considerations	325
2	Obligation to establish competent authorities and procedures	327
2.1	Competent authorities	327
2.2	Procedures	328
3	Public notice of investigation	329
4	Right of defence	330
5	Reasoned and adequate findings, conclusions, explanations and analyses	332
5.1	Content of Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c)	333
5.2	Importance of reasoned and adequate determinations	335
5.3	Types of failures to provide 'reasoned and adequate' findings and conclusions	337
6	Confidential information	338
<b>13</b>	<b>Multilateral proceedings</b>	<b>341</b>
1	General considerations	341
2	Notifications to the WTO	342
2.1	Notification of the initiation of investigation	344
2.2	Notification of a finding of serious injury or threat thereof	345
2.3	Notification of the decision to apply or extend a safeguard	346

2.4	Notification of the decision to apply a provisional safeguard	347
2.5	Notification of the exclusion of imports from developing countries under Article 9.1	348
2.6	Notification of results of consultations, mid-term reviews, and of 'any form of compensation' and 'proposed' retaliation	349
2.7	Notification of the cessation of a safeguard	349
3	Consultations	350
3.1	Consultations with respect to a definitive safeguard	352
3.2	Consultations with respect to a provisional safeguard	354
4	Compensation	354
4.1	Maintenance of a substantially equivalent level of concessions and other GATT obligations	355
4.2	Trade compensation	355
5	Retaliation or suspension of concessions or other obligations	358
	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	364
	<i>Bibliography</i>	369
	<i>Index</i>	383