Defying Convention

The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) articulates what has now become a global norm. CEDAW establishes the moral, civic, and political equality of women; women's right to be free from discrimination and violence; and the responsibility of governments to take positive action to achieve these goals. The United States is not among the 187 countries that have ratified the treaty. To explain why the United States has not ratified CEDAW, this book highlights the emergence of the treaty in the context of the Cold War, the deeply partisan nature of women's rights issues in the United States, and basic disagreements about how human rights treaties work.

Lisa Baldez is Professor of Government and Latin American, Latino, and Caribbean Studies at Dartmouth College. She holds a BA from Princeton University and a PhD from the University of California, San Diego. She is the author of *Why Women Protest: Women’s Movements in Chile* (Cambridge University Press, 2002) and the coeditor of *Political Women and American Democracy* (Cambridge University Press, 2008). Her articles have appeared in the *American Journal of Political Science, Latin American Politics and Society, Legislative Studies Quarterly*, and the *Journal of Legal Studies*. She and Karen Beckwith cofounded the journal *Politics & Gender*. 
Problems of International Politics

SERIES EDITORS

Keith Darden, American University
Ian Shapiro, Yale University

The series seeks manuscripts central to the understanding of international politics that will be empirically rich and conceptually innovative. It is interested in works that illuminate the evolving character of nation-states within the international system. It sets out three broad areas for investigation: 1. Identity, security, and conflict; 2. Democracy; and 3. Justice and distribution.

Titles in the Series
Şener Aktürk, Regimes of Ethnicity and Nationhood in Germany, Russia, and Turkey
Donald Horowitz, Constitutional Change and Democracy in Indonesia
Adria K. Lawrence, Imperial Rule and the Politics of Nationalism: Anti-Colonial Protest in the French Empire
Steven Levitsky and Lucan A. Way, Competitive Authoritarianism: Hybrid Regimes After the Cold War
Tarek Masoud, Counting Islam: Religion, Class, and Elections in Egypt
Shaul Mishal and Ori Goldberg, Understanding Shi'ite Leadership: The Art of the Middle Ground in Iran and Lebanon
Harris Mylonas, The Politics of Nation-Building: Making Co-Nationals, Refugees, and Minorities
Defying Convention

U.S. Resistance to the U.N. Treaty on Women’s Rights

LISA BALDEZ

Dartmouth College
For John, again, and always
## Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
1 Introduction 1  
2 A Scaffolding for Global Women’s Rights, 1945–1970 32  
3 Geopolitics and Drafting the UN Treaty on Women’s Rights 63  
4 An Evolving Global Norm of Women’s Rights 100  
5 CEDAW Impact: Process, Not Policy 130  
6 Why the United States Has Not Ratified CEDAW 152  
7 CEDAW and Domestic Violence Law in the United States 183  
8 Conclusion 200  

**Works Cited** 211  

**Index** 229
Acknowledgments

This book is the fruition of years of research, and would not have been possible without the support of countless people who helped me along the way.

First, I would like to thank the students in my Gender and American Politics seminars that played a very special role in the development of this book. I designed the course at the start of the research process and I taught it three times before the book went to press. In 2010, Nina Maja Bergmar, Katie Davis, Kat Eidmann, David Imamura, Gabriel Lopez, Anya Perret, Shannie MacKenzie, and Danielle Sawaya helped me generate a series of insights and research questions that launched me into a productive sabbatical year. In 2012, Damaris Alomerianos, David Becker, Morgan Blackburn, Ally Dutton, Alice Liou, Ariel Murphy, Ellen Perry, Kim Rose, and Ruthie Welch helped me to articulate and clarify my initial ideas. In 2013, Lindsay Brewer, Lulu Chang, Paul Gastello, James Herring, Sam McPherson, Katie Randolph, Jeri Reichel, and Kate Thorstad helped me frame my arguments about CEDAW in a broader context. Every professor should be so lucky to work with such smart and passionate students.

In each of those seminars, we conducted Skype interviews with CEDAW advocates and opponents. I would like to thank all our interviewees for giving us their time and sharing their views: Janet Benshoof, President of the Global Justice Center; Gaynel Curry, Gender and Women’s Rights Advisor at the Office of the High Commissioner for
Human Rights; conservative author Christina Hoff Sommers; Harold Koh, Sterling Professor of International Law at Yale Law School and former Legal Adviser to the Department of State; author and former Ambassador Linda Tarr-Whelan; Shari Rendall, Director of House Legislation and Public Policy at Concerned Women for America; and Phyllis Schlafly, founder of the Eagle Forum. Stephanie Farrior, Professor of Law and Director of International and Comparative Law Programs and the Center for Applied Human Rights at Vermont Law School, visited the class in person and gave us an excellent primer on UN human rights treaties.

During this project, I also conducted a series of interviews with key policy makers, who provided important information about the politics surrounding CEDAW. I am particularly grateful to Betty Athanasakos, former delegate to the UN Commission on the Status of Women; Kathy Bonk, Executive Director of the Communications Consortium Media Center; Arvonne Fraser, founder of International Women’s Rights Action Watch; Marsha Freeman, Director of the International Women’s Rights Action Watch; former congresswoman Constance Morella (R-MD); Eleanor Smeal, President and founder of the Feminist Majority Foundation; and June Zeitlin, Director of the CEDAW Education Project of the Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights.

I interviewed many women’s rights activists in Malaysia who helped me understand how activists use CEDAW as a policy tool. Thanks to Ivy Josiah, Executive Director of Women’s Aid Organisation; Norani Othman, Professor at the Institute of Malaysian and International Studies at the Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia; Zainah Anwar, former Executive Director of Sisters in Islam and current Director of Musawah, A Global Movement for Equality and Justice in the Muslim Family; and Shanthis Dairam, Director of International Women’s Rights Action Watch Asia Pacific and former CEDAW Committee expert. I am grateful to the staff members at Women’s Aid Organization, Sisters in Islam, and IWRAW Asia Pacific for their help in setting up these conversations.

Many colleagues provided helpful advice at the early stages of research, including Susanne Zwingel, Jutta Joachim, Billie Heller, Deborah Liebowitz, Janet Walsh, Jane Jaquette, and Jenny Mansbridge. Elisabeth Friedman, Valerie Sperling, Karen Beckwith, and Margaret
Acknowledgments

Power gave me helpful feedback on the prospectus for the project. Bill Wohlforth very generously read an early draft of the complete manuscript and supplied constructive comments.

I presented drafts to the Second Book Club, and I am grateful for the feedback and encouragement from Leslie Butler, Annelise Orleck, Christopher MacEvitt, Soyica Colbert, Cecilia Gaposchkin, Veronika Fuechtner, and Colleen Boggis. I thank the members of the Upper Valley Women’s Network and the New Hampshire Women’s Caucus for their enthusiastic reception. I presented parts of the book at the annual meetings of the American Political Science Association, the Midwest Political Science Association, the New England Political Science Association, and the International Political Science Association. Colleagues at University Kebangsaan Malaysia, the University of Southern California, Vanderbilt University, Harvard University, and the University of Connecticut offered outstanding feedback as well. My thanks also to the Feminist Inquiry Seminar, the Department of Government, and the “What’s the Big Idea” symposium at Dartmouth College, where I presented chapters.

I am grateful to Dartmouth College for giving me research leave and the resources I needed to write this book. Thanks to Chris Wohlforth for encouraging me to schedule a manuscript review at the Dickey Center for International Understanding at Dartmouth. Thank you to all my colleagues who participated: Mala Htun, Stephanie Farrior, Sonu Bedi, Brian Greenhill, Russ Muirhead, Ben Valentino, Leslie Butler, Annelise Orleck, and John Campbell. The staff at Baker-Berry Library at Dartmouth, the Sophia Smith Collection at Smith College, and the Lamont Library at Harvard University provided indispensable support. The Women and Social Movements collection published by SUNY Binghamton and Alexander Street Press proved invaluable to my research. Thank you to the many Dartmouth students who provided research assistance on this project, especially Kim Rose, Margaret Jessiman, Despoina Sidieri, Damaris Altromerianos, Yang Shanguan, Sanders Davis, Abby Reed, Cathy Lian, Claire Frazer, David Chiang, Becca Heller, Jessie Stefanik, Claire Frazer, and Becca Boswell. Sara Kassir did an excellent job correcting the final proofs. Chelsea Harris and Claire Cravero also pitched in at key moments. The Law and Politics Program at Dartmouth College provided funding for many of my RAs.
Editor Rasna Dhillon helped me see what the book is really about and made incisive suggestions that greatly improved it. Thanks to Lew Bateman, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for his commitment to my work. Shaun Vigil patiently guided the book to publication. I am grateful to Keith Darden and Ian Shapiro for including the book in the Problems of International Politics series. Thanks are also due to two anonymous readers for Cambridge, and to Bindu Vinod and the production staff at Newgen Knowledge Works, who supported this project. I’m grateful to my dear friend Mark Lerner for designing the cover.

The emotional support I received from friends and family has been critical. The Morning Glory group held me aloft during many difficult moments. The Powerbabes kept me fit and laughing. Annual Girls’ Weekends with my college friends have sustained me. Karen Beckwith and Christina Wolbrecht shared advice about writing (and shopping). I am grateful to Anne Tergesen and Jimmy Windels for their hospitality when I did research at UN headquarters in New York. Megan Kiely helped me maintain my sense of humor. I am especially grateful to my soul sisters Aurora Matzkin and Mala Htun.

I owe so much to my family. Joe Baldez insisted on reading the first draft and said the two things that are the only things any writer ever wants to hear: “I love it” and “It’s really good.” Bill and Clare Cumberland resolved a thorny dispute when they came up with the right-hand side of the title. Thanks to my two sons, Joe and Sam Carey, whom I love more than I can say. My husband, John Carey, has supported me lovingly and indefatigably. He read drafts, pushed me, fed me, bought me presents, and reassured me, among many other things. This book is for you, my darling.