THE GOVERNANCE
OF EU FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

In spite of a continued increase in the substantive scope and reach of EU fundamental rights, little attention has been paid to their practical enforcement. In this book, Mark Dawson looks at the mechanisms through which EU fundamental rights are protected and enforced, closely examining the interrelation between the EU’s pertinent legal and political bodies. He argues that in order to understand EU fundamental rights we must also understand the institutional, political and normative constraints that shape the Union’s policies. The book examines the performance of different EU institutions in relation to rights, and studies two important policy fields – social rights and rule of law protection – in depth.

MARK DAWSON has been Professor of European Law and Governance at the Hertie School of Governance in Berlin since 2012. He received his PhD from the European University Institute in Florence in 2009 and has been a visiting scholar at the London School of Economics and the Harvard Kennedy School. His recent publications include New Governance and the Transformation of European Law and Beyond the Crisis with H. Enderlein and C. Joerges. He has written peer-reviewed articles for both law and political science journals, including the European Law Journal, Common Market Law Review, European Law Review and Journal of Common Market Studies.
This series aims to produce original works which contain a critical analysis of the state of the law in particular areas of European law and set out different perspectives and suggestions for its future development. It also aims to encourage a range of work on law, legal institutions and legal phenomena in Europe, including 'law in context' approaches. The titles in the series will be of interest to academics; policy makers; policy formers who are interested in European legal, commercial and political affairs; practising lawyers, including the judiciary; and advanced law students and researchers.

Joint Editors
Professor Dr Laurence Gormley, University of Groningen
Professor Jo Shaw, University of Edinburgh

Editorial Advisory Board
Professor Kenneth Armstrong, University of Cambridge
Professor Catherine Barnard, University of Cambridge
Professor Richard Bellamy, University College London
Professor Marise Cremona, European University Institute, Florence
Professor Michael Dougan, University of Liverpool
Professor Dr Jacqueline Dutheil de la Rochère, Université de Paris II
Director of the Centre de Droit Européen, Paris
Professor Daniel Halberstam, University of Michigan
Professor Dora Kostakopoulou, University of Warwick
Professor Dr Ingolf Pernice, Director of the Walter Hallstein Institut, Humboldt University
Judge Sinisa Rodin, Court of Justice of the European Union
Professor Eleanor Spaventa, Durham University
Professor Neil Walker, University of Edinburgh
Professor Stephen Weatherill, University of Oxford
Books in the Series

The Governance of EU Fundamental Rights
Mark Dawson

The International Responsibility of the European Union: From Competence to Normative Control
Andrés Delgado Casteleiro

Frontex and Non-Refoulement: The International Responsibility of the EU
Roberta Mungianu

Gendering European Working Time Regimes: The Working Time Directive and the Case of Poland
Ania Zbyszewska

EU Renewable Electricity Law and Policy: From National Targets to a Common Market
Tim Maxian Rusche

European Constitutionalism
Kaarlo Tuori

Brokering Europe: Euro-Lawyers and the Making of a Transnational Polity
Antoine Vauchez

Services Liberalization in the EU and the WTO: Concepts, Standards and Regulatory Approaches
Marcus Klamert

Referendums and the European Union: A Comparative Enquiry
Fernando Mendez, Mario Mendez and Vasiliki Triga

The Allocation of Regulatory Competence in the EU Emissions Trading Scheme
Jospehine Van Zeben

The Eurozone Crisis
Kaarlo Tuori and Klaus Tuori

International Trade Disputes and EU Liability
Anne Thies

The Limits of Legal Reasoning and the European Court of Justice
Gerard Conway

New Governance and the Transformation of European Law: Coordinating EU Social Law and Policy
Mark Dawson

The Lisbon Treaty: A Legal and Political Analysis
Jean-Claude Piris

The Ethos of Europe: Values, Law and Justice in the EU
Andrew Williams

The European Union’s Fight Against Corruption: The Evolving Policy Towards Member States and Candidate Countries
Patrycja Szarek-Mason
State and Market in European Union Law: The Public and Private Spheres of the Internal Market before the EU Courts
Wolf Sauter and Harm Schepel

The European Civil Code: The Way Forward
Hugh Collins

Ethical Dimensions of the Foreign Policy of the European Union: A Legal Appraisal
Urfan Khaliq

Implementing EU Pollution Control: Law and Integration
Bettina Lange

European Broadcasting Law and Policy
Jackie Harrison and Lorna Woods

The Transformation of Citizenship in the European Union: Electoral Rights and the Restructuring of Political Space
Jo Shaw

The Constitution for Europe: A Legal Analysis
Jean-Claude Piris

The European Convention on Human Rights: Achievements, Problems and Prospects
Steven Greer

Stefano Giubboni

EU Enlargement and the Constitutions of Central and Eastern Europe
Anneli Albi
THE GOVERNANCE
OF EU FUNDAMENTAL
RIGHTS

MARK DAWSON

Hertie School of Governance, Berlin
CONTENTS

List of Tables page xi
Series Editors’ Preface xiii
Acknowledgements xv

Introduction 1
1 Still an Ever Closer Union in Need of a Fundamental Rights Policy 1
2 Governance in the European Union 2
3 Governance as a Fundamental Rights Concept 4
4 What Are EU Fundamental Rights for? 7
5 Which Institutions? 9
6 Two Case Studies 11
7 The Book’s Approach 15

1 Critiquing and Theorising the Governance of EU Fundamental Rights 18
1.1 Conceptualising and Justifying EU Fundamental Rights 18
1.2 EU Human Rights Scepticism 21
1.2.1 The Counter-Majoritarian Difficulty 21
1.2.2 The Communitarian Critique – Individualising EU Citizenship 22
1.2.3 The Empirical Critique – What Do EU Rights Add? 25
1.3 A Procedural Approach to Transnational Human Rights Protection 26
1.3.1 Ely: Democracy and Distrust 27
1.3.2 Habermas: The ‘Internal Relation’ between the Rule of Law and Democracy 29
1.3.3 Proceduralism in European Human Rights Law 31
1.4 Fundamental Rights and Political Disagreement 36
   1.4.1 The Normative Value of Disagreement 36
   1.4.2 The Collective Enforcement of Fundamental Rights 39
1.5 Conclusion 44

2 The Court of Justice in the Governance of EU Fundamental Rights 47
   2.1 Introduction 47
   2.2 The Margin of Appreciation under the ECHR 49
   2.3 Does the Court of Justice Exercise a Margin of Appreciation?
      The Vertical Dimension 53
      2.3.1 The Scope of EU Fundamental Rights 53
      2.3.2 Limitations on Charter Rights and the Diversity Variable 58
      2.3.3 The Nature of Rights Variable 62
      2.3.4 The Procedural Variable 65
      2.3.5 Level(s) of Protection 67
   2.4 Does the Court of Justice Exercise a Margin of Appreciation?
      The Horizontal Dimension 71
      2.4.1 The Nature of Rights Variable 71
      2.4.2 The Procedural Variable 73
   2.5 Balancing Different Margins of Appreciation in EU Fundamental Rights 77
      2.5.1 Scope: From a Binary Distinction to a ‘Sliding Scale’? 77
      2.5.2 The Standard of Review: Towards a Real ‘Process-Oriented’ Approach? 80
   2.6 Conclusion 82

3 Fundamental Rights and the Political Institutions 84
   3.1 Dividing Labour in EU Fundamental Rights 84
   3.2 The European Commission 87
      3.2.1 Impact Assessment and Establishing a ‘Fundamental Rights Culture’ 89
      3.2.2 Fundamental Rights in Decision-Making 95
      3.2.3 The Guardian of the Treaties (and the Charter Too?) 95
      3.2.4 Post-Legislative Action and Awareness Raising 97
   3.3 The European Parliament 100
      3.3.1 Politicising EU Fundamental Rights 100
      3.3.2 Rights Reporting and the Role of the LIBE Committee 102
      3.3.3 Fundamental Rights in the Ordinary Legislative Procedure 104
CONTENTS

3.4 The Council 107
  3.4.1 Making Council Proposals ‘Fundamental Rights Proof’ 107
  3.4.2 Peer Review and the Scope of EU Fundamental Rights 110
  3.4.3 Frontex and Agency Governance 111

3.5 Watchdog Institutions 114
  3.5.1 The European Ombudsman as a Fundamental Rights Actor 114
  3.5.2 The CJEU and the Ombudsman: Working Together to Police Executive Authority? 116
  3.5.3 Fundamental Rights in the Political Process 119

3.6 Implementing Institutions 121
  3.6.1 Implementing ‘Dynamic’ Rights: The Article 29 Working Party 121
  3.6.2 The EU’s Fundamental Rights Agency: The Road Not Taken? 126

3.7 The EU Institutions and the Standard of FR Protection: Tracing Two Legislative Proposals 133
  3.7.1 Data Protection and PNR: The Legislative Context 133
  3.7.2 Improving the Standard? Legislative Interaction on Fundamental Rights 135

3.8 Conclusion 141

4 Governing Justice and the Rule of Law 144
  4.1 Justifying EU Rule of Law Oversight 144
  4.2 The European Rule of Law in Crisis – Early Warnings 149
  4.3 The European Rule of Law in Crisis – Hungary 151
    4.3.1 Autonomy 152
    4.3.2 Electoral Competition 156
    4.3.3 Freedom of Expression and the Media 159
  4.4 The European Rule of Law in Crisis – Romania 161
  4.5 The Future of EU Intervention on Democracy and the Rule of Law 167
    4.5.1 ‘New’ Governance and the Quantification of Democracy and the Rule of Law 167
    4.5.2 Command and Control Revisited: The Idea of a ‘Copenhagen Commission’ 170
    4.5.3 ‘Reverse Solange’ and the Judicialisation of an EU Rule of Law 173
  4.6 The Rule of Law from a Governance Perspective 175
    4.6.1 Differentiation 176
4.6.2 Multilevel Action 176
4.6.3 Governing between Law and Politics 177
4.6.4 Governing Not Government: The Dispersal of Normative Authority 178
4.7 Conclusion – Poland and Beyond 179

5 Governing Fundamental Social Rights 185
5.1 What Are EU Social Rights and Why Might We Need Them? 185
5.2 Social Rights in the Age of Austerity 189
5.2.1 Greece 190
5.2.2 Portugal 195
5.2.3 Ireland 198
5.2.4 Common Elements 201
5.3 The Role of the EU Institutions: How Responsible and How Accountable? 203
5.3.1 Allocating Responsibility 203
5.3.2 The European Committee on Social Rights: Evaluating Conditionality’s Social Effects 206
5.4 Four Duties in the Governance of EU Social Rights 212
5.4.1 Assessing Social Impacts 212
5.4.2 Politicising Europe’s Economic and Monetary Union 214
5.4.3 Dividing Social Rights Responsibilities 217
5.4.4 Empowering the Vulnerable 221
5.5 Conclusion 224

Epilogue: Accession, Asylum and the Politics of Human Rights 226

Index 231
TABLES

3.1 Fundamental Rights in the PNR Directive  page 137
3.2 Fundamental Rights in the General Data Protection Regulation  138
EU fundamental rights stand at the heart of what the European Union stands for. Yet the relationship between the protection of fundamental rights through the EU Charter and the protection of fundamental rights through the European Convention is still fraught with difficulty, not least because the European Court of Justice torpedoed – unsurprisingly, it must be said – the political approach to accession of the EU to the European Convention, and because of the politicisation of the role of the EU as a fundamental rights actor. In this fraught situation, examination of the question of the governance of EU fundamental rights could not be more timely. Mark Dawson’s second contribution to Cambridge Studies in European Law and Policy takes a close look at the governance architecture for EU fundamental rights. Dawson sees fundamental rights in the EU as a shared constitutional responsibility between, on the one hand, the national and EU legislatures and, on the other hand, the EU judiciary and other fundamental rights bodies. The latter, Dawson points out, may have to address imbalances and exclusions without the political process or act where the constitutional and democratic character of national political orders is fundamentally eroded.

This work uses various techniques to analyse the various aspects of EU fundamental rights, ranging from a close doctrinal analysis of the case law of the Court of Justice to process tracing in order to examine the interaction of the EU’s main political institutions to lower or strengthen the level of fundamental rights protection established through two legislative proposals, also looking at external evaluation of the EU Fundamental Rights Agency and Frontex to assess the effectiveness of the principal procedures used by the EU institutions to monitor fundamental rights. The activities of the European Committee on Social Rights and of the Venice Commission are examined in two case studies, using doctrinal and empirical research. The great merit of Dawson’s work is that it takes the normative content of EU fundamental rights seriously while recognizing that such rights must be understood within the context
of EU politics as objects of political contestation: on the one hand between different legal orders and on the other hand between EU institutions having distinct mandates for advancing and instrumentalising fundamental rights.

Dawson’s book sends out challenges; it is enormously readable – the work is gripping, scholarly and compelling in its analysis. It deserves to be read by a wide audience and will challenge many preconceptions. It is indeed a major contribution to the literature on European Union law and fundamental rights, and it is with very great pleasure that we welcome its publication in Cambridge Studies in European Law and Policy.

Laurence Gormley
Jo Shaw
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have given me help and inspiration on the way to completing this book. I am particularly grateful to Elise Muir, who first encouraged me to think about EU fundamental rights, and with whom I have worked closely for many years. Much of the writing took place during a sabbatical term at the LSE in autumn 2015. I am particularly grateful to Floris de Witte and the Governance and Law in the European Market group for hosting me for a few months and letting me be a part of such a rich and thought-provoking group, including through feedback to a chapter presented there that term. At the Hertie School, I have been lucky to have a number of colleagues, particularly Daniel Augenstein and Dilek Kurban, who have kept me attuned to the wider world of human rights, as well as being wonderful friends. At Cambridge, Sinead Moloney and Elizabeth Spicer have been invaluable in supporting this book from a rough first idea to the finished item. Finally, I would like to thank Pierre, who is my companion in all things. MD