THE APSE MOSAIC IN EARLY MEDIEVAL ROME

This book focuses on apse mosaics in Rome, which were commissioned by a series of popes between the sixth and ninth centuries CE. Through a synchronic approach that challenges current conceptions about how works of art interact with historical time, Erik Thunø proposes that the apse mosaics produce an inter-visual network that collapses their successive placement in time into a continuous present in which the faithful join the saints in the one living body of the Church of Rome. Throughout, this book situates the apse mosaics within the broader context of viewership, the cult of relics, epigraphic tradition, and church ritual while engaging topics concerned with intercession, materiality, repetition, and vision.

Erik Thunø is Associate Professor of Medieval Art at Rutgers University. He is the author of numerous articles on medieval art, and his book Image and Relic: Mediating the Sacred in Early Medieval Rome was published in 2002. He has been awarded fellowships by the Clark Art Institute, the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, and the Bibliotheca Hertziana (Max Planck Institute for Art History) in Rome.
For my parents

*Actuality is when the light house is dark between flashes.*

George Kubler, *The Shape of Time*
CONTENTS

Illustrations ........................................ viii
Acknowledgments ................................ xiii
List of Abbreviations .............................. xv

INTRODUCTION ........................................ 1

CHAPTER ONE
REPETITION: SAINTS, POPES, AND GOLDEN TEXTS 13
1.1. Figures and Inscriptions ..................... 13
   A Repetitive Formula .......................... 13
   Earlier Apse Mosaics ......................... 29
   Later Apse Mosaics .......................... 34
   Outside Rome ................................ 38
1.2. Apse Mosaics and Relics ..................... 40
   Building for Saints ......................... 40
   Golden Letters and Dazzling Interiors .... 47
   Other Early Medieval Apse Mosaics ....... 52
   Multiplying the Saints ...................... 58
Conclusion: Beyond Time? ....................... 61

CHAPTER TWO
TRANSFORMATION: FROM MATERIAL CHURCH TO
SPIRITUAL BODY ................................. 63
2.1. “Citizens with the Saints” ................. 63
   Paradise in Mosaic .......................... 63
   Gazing at the Saints ....................... 65
   A Heavenly Society ......................... 66
   Ecclesia Romana and Christ the Cornerstone 69
2.2. Between Present and Future ............... 72
   Elders and Creatures ....................... 72
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Apocalyptic Ecclesiology</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narrative and Iconic</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Visualizing Christ:</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifting Guises</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornerstone in Text and Building</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christ in the Clouds: A Second Coming?</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Light and Resurrection</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Church Clad in a Cloud of Flesh”</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Word Made Present</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apse Mosaics and Theophanies</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pope as Creator of Light</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Script</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER THREE

#### INCORPORATION: BECOMING A LIVING STONE

3.1. Imagery and Ritual:                                               | 119  |
| Heavenly and Earthly Liturgies                                       | 119  |
| Visual Interactions with the Ritual                                   | 121  |
| Christ as Mediator                                                   | 128  |
| 3.2. Prayer and Seeing:                                              | 129  |
| “Towards the East”                                                    | 129  |
| Apse Mosaic as Compass                                                | 131  |
| Vision and Image                                                      | 133  |
| God’s Ocular Embrace                                                  | 134  |
| 3.3. Christ, Saints, and the Altar                                    | 142  |
| Cornerstone and Sacrifice                                             | 142  |
| Intercession                                                          | 145  |
| Pope as Bridge to Salvation                                           | 152  |
| Saints in the Liturgy                                                 | 155  |
| Relics and Altar                                                      | 156  |
| 3.4. House of Living Stones:                                          | 159  |
| Mosaic as Material Metaphor                                           | 159  |
| Excursus: S. Prassede and the Heavenly Jerusalem                     | 164  |
| Conclusion                                                            | 170  |

### CHAPTER FOUR

#### NETWORKING: BUILDING A COMMUNIO SANCTORUM

4.1. Martyrs and Inscriptions under Pope Damasus (366–384)             | 172  |
| The Damasian Epigrams and the Collective Body of Martyrs              | 172  |
| Relics and History                                                    | 181  |
| Letters for the Unlettered                                            | 184  |
| 4.2. Uniting the Living with the Dead                                 | 188  |
| From Cemetery to Church                                               | 188  |
| Diversifying the Body                                                 | 190  |
CONTENTS

4.3. Out of Time 197
   Invasion of God’s Time 197
   Repetition and Copy 198
   Conclusion 205

AFTERWORD: MEANING AND PRESENCE 206

Appendix 209
Notes 217
Bibliography 281
Index 317
ILLUSTRATIONS

Color plates follow page xvi.

I. S. Prassede, Rome, general view, 817–824
II. S. Prassede, Rome, apse vault, 817–824
III. S. Prassede, Rome, apse vault and apsidal arch, 817–824
IV. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, general view, 526–530
V. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, apse vault, 526–530
VI. Sant’Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, apse vault, 625–638
VII. San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, general view, 640–642
VIII. San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, apse vault, 640–642
IX. S. Maria in Domnica, Rome, general view, 817–824
X. S. Maria in Domnica, Rome, apse vault (center), 817–824
XI. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, general view, 817–824
XII. San Marco, Rome, general view, 827–844
XIII. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, apse vault (center), 526–530
XIV. San Lorenzo fuori le Mura, Rome, apsidal arch, 579–590
XV. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, apsidal arch, 526–530
XVI. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault, 817–824
XVII. S. Maria in Domnica, Rome, apsidal arch (center), 817–824
XVIII. San Marco, Rome, apse vault and apsidal arch, 827–844
XIX. San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, apse vault (detail), 640–642
XX. San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, apsidal arch (left side), 640–642
XXI. San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, apsidal arch (right side), 640–642
XXII. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, golden inscription in apse vault (detail), 526–530
XXIII. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, golden inscription in apse vault (detail), 817–824
XXIV. Santa Sabina, Rome, mosaic on entrance wall, 422–432
XXV. Ss. Primus and Feliciano Chapel (S. Stefano Rotondo), Rome, general view, 642–649
Figures

1. S. Prassede, Rome, triumphal arch (center), 817–824 2
2. S. Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, general view, 625–638 4
4. San Paolo fuori le Mura, Rome, apsidal arch, nineteenth-century, reconstruction 16
5. San Paolo fuori le Mura, Rome, apsidal arch, mid-fifth century, after Ciampini, *Vetra Monimenta*, 2: LXV
6. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault, 817–824 18
8. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault and apsidal arch, 817–824 19
9. Basilica Eufrasiana, Poreč, (Croatia) general view, mid-sixth century 21
10. San Marco, Rome, apse vault, 827–844 23
11. S. Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, apse vault, 625–638 25
12. S. Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, apse vault and apsidal arch, author's reconstruction of apsidal arch, 625–638 26
13. S. Pudenziana, Rome, apse vault, 401–417 30
15. Old Saint Peter's, Rome, apse vault, author's mid-fourth-century reconstruction based on Ruyschaert, "L'inscription absidale" 31
16. S. Maria Maggiore, Rome, triumphal arch (apex), 432–440 32
17. San Clemente, Rome, apse vault and apsidal arch, c. 1118 35
18. Old Saint Peter's, Rome, apse vault, 1198–1216, Arch. Cap. S. Pietro, BAV, Cod. A 64 ter, c. 50 36
19. S. Maria in Trastevere, Rome, general view, 1130–1143 37
20. S. Maria Maggiore, Rome, apse vault, 1188–1292 38
21. San Vitale, Ravenna, apse vault, mid-sixth century 39
22. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, exterior 40
23. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, altar (lower church), 526–530? 41
24. Plan of Lateran Baptistery with San Venanzio Chapel (A), Rome 42
25. S. Prassede, Rome, isometric drawing of choir and presbytery, 817–824 44
26. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault (left side), 817–824 45
27. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault (right side), 817–824 46
28. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, isometric drawing of crypt and placement of the sarcophagi under the raised presbytery, 817–824 47
29. San Marco, Rome, plan of annular crypt, 827–844 48
30. Sant'Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, longitudinal elevation of church, 625–638 49
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Sala del Concilio, apse vault within former Lateran Palace, Rome, 795–816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>San Apollinare in Classe, apse vault, Ravenna, mid-sixth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>S. Susanna, apse vault, Rome, 795–815, incorporating drawings by Ciacconio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Ss. Nereo ed Achilleo, Rome, apse vault and apsidal arch, 795–815, after a canvas painting by anonymous, seventeenth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>S. Maria Maggiore at Capua Vetere, apse vault, fifth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>S. Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, apse mosaic, center, 625–638</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>Gold Glass, Vatican Museums, Peter and Paul in concordia, fourth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42.</td>
<td>Catacomb of San Sebastiano, Rome, Peter and Paul in concordia, late fourth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.</td>
<td>San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, upper left corner of apsidal arch, 640–642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44.</td>
<td>San Venanzio Chapel, Rome, upper right corner of apsidal arch, 640–642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.</td>
<td>San Apollinare Nuovo, Ravenna, northeastern nave wall, sixth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46.</td>
<td>S. Prassede, Rome, entrance wall to San Zeno Chapel, 817–824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47.</td>
<td>S. Prassede, Rome, elders on apsidal arch (detail), 817–824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48.</td>
<td>Domitilla Catacomb, Rome, lunette mosaic, late fourth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49.</td>
<td>Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, apsidal arch (center), 526–530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.</td>
<td>S. Prassede, Rome, apsidal arch (center), 817–824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51.</td>
<td>S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault (detail), 817–824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52.</td>
<td>S. Prassede, Rome, apse vault (detail), 817–824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53.</td>
<td>S. Marco, Rome, apse vault (detail), 827–844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54.</td>
<td>San Paolo fuori le Mura, Rome, right and left nave walls, Seroux d’Agincourt, BAV, Cod. lat. 9843, fol. 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55.</td>
<td>Old Saint Peter’s, Rome, right nave wall, BAV, Cod. A 64 ter, fol. 13r</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56.</td>
<td>Old Saint Peter’s, Rome, left nave wall, BAV, Cod. Barb. lat. 2733, pp. 113–114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57.</td>
<td>Codex from St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, Cod. 51, fol. 267, eighth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58.</td>
<td>Stuttgart Psalter, Stuttgart, Württembergische Landesbibliothek, Cod.Bibl, fol. 23, fol. 111r, early ninth century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60.</td>
<td>Bawit, Chapel 27, watercolor reconstruction, sixth–seventh century</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61.</td>
<td>S. Sabina, Rome, doors (detail), 422–432</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ILLUSTRATIONS

62. San Marco, Rome, apse vault (center), 827–844
63. Ss. Cosmas and Damian, Rome, apse vault (detail), 526–530
64. Hosios David, Thessaloniki, apse vault, fifth–sixth century
65. Monastery of S. Catherine, Mount Sinai, apse vault, c. 565/6
66. Arch of Constantine, Rome, dedicatory inscription, 315
67. Lindisfarne Gospels, Gospel of John, British Library, Cotton MS Nero D. IV, fol. 211r, c. 700
68. Godescalc Gospel, John the Evangelist, Paris, BN, MS. nouv. acq. lat. 1203, fol. 2v, 783
69. Godescalc Gospel, Christ in majesty, Paris, BN, MS. nouv. acq. lat. 1203, fol. 3r, 783
70. Soissons Gospels, Paris, BN lat. 8850, fol. 1v, early ninth century
71. Metz Sacramentary, Paris, BN lat. 1141, fol. 3r, c. 870
72. Metz Sacramentary, Paris, BN lat. 1141, fol. 5v, c. 870
73. Metz Sacramentary, Paris, BN lat. 1141, fol. 6r, c. 870
74. San Silvestro, Tivoli, general view toward apse, late twelfth or early thirteenth century
75. Orthodox Baptistery, Ravenna, dome mosaic (detail), mid-fifth century
76. Christ icon, Monastery of S. Catherine, Mt. Sinai, sixth century
77. Golden altar of Sant’Ambrogio, Milan, front and center, 824–859
78. Uta book cover, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Munich, Ms. Clm. 13601 c. 1020
79. Temple for Venus and Rome, Forum Romanum, Rome, view toward apse, second century
80. Constantine the Great, Capitoline Museums, Rome, early fourth century
81. Relief of Atargatis and Hadad, limestone, Yale University Art Gallery, late second to early third century
82. S. Cecilia in Trastevere, Rome, apse vault (left side), 817–824
83. San Marco, Rome, apse vault (left side), 827–844
84. Virgin and Child icon, Monastery of S. Catherine, Mt. Sinai, sixth century
85. Madonna della Clemenza, S. Maria in Trastevere, Rome, seventh-eighth century
86. Fayum mummy portrait of a man, Ny Carlsberg Glyptotek, Copenhagen, first century
87. Palatine Chapel, Aachen, dome mosaic, reconstruction
88. Palatine Chapel, Aachen, dome mosaic (section), ninth century, after Ciampini, Vetera Monimenta, 2: pl. XL1
89. Morgan Beatus, Pierpont Morgan Library, New York, Ms. M. 644, fol. 222v, c. 940–945
90. S. Pietro al Monte in Civate, ceiling fresco, late eleventh century
91. S. Prassede, Rome, triumphal arch (right side), 817–824
92. S. Prassede, Rome, triumphal arch, right spandrel, 817–824
93. Stefansbursa, Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna, ninth century
94. Map of Rome with extra-urban sites marked by Damasian epigrams 174
95. Damasian epigram, S. Agnese fuori le Mura, Rome, 366–384 175
96. Tombs of Ss. Peter and Marcellino (Via Labicana) with Damasian epigram, reconstruction, Rome, 366–384 176
97. Tomb of Ianuarius (Praetextatus Catacomb) with Damasian epigram, reconstruction, Rome, 366–384 177
98. Trajan’s Column, Rome, base with inscription, 113 186
99. Ss. Pietro e Marcellino Catacomb, Rome, ceiling fresco, late fourth century 189
100. Map of Rome with churches 195
101. Anastasis Rotunda, Jerusalem, plan of fourth-century church 200
102. S. Stefano Rotondo, Rome, plan of fifth-century church 200
103. Christ icon, Sancta Sanctorum, Rome, sixth century 201
104. Icon of Christ, Palombara Sabina, early fourteenth century 202
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

After many years of thinking about apse mosaics, not to mention looking at them, my research and writing of this book were initiated thanks to a generous research grant from the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, through which I became affiliated with the Art History Department at the Philipps Universität Marburg and the Bibliotheca Hertziana (Max-Planck-Institut für Kunstgeschichte) in Rome during the 2007–2008 academic year. I am grateful to Ingo Herklotz and Sybille Ebert-Schifferer for their support and hospitality at these two scholarly institutions. Entering the final phase of the project, the Danish Academy in Rome, always supportive, enabled my return to Rome for a semester in optimal surroundings. Needless to say, little of this would have been possible without the continuous support of Rutgers University and of my colleagues in the Art History Department, who with their typical generosity offered valuable input at all stages of this project.

I owe a great debt of gratitude to the following research libraries and their staffs: the Library of the Philipps-Universität Marburg, the Bibliotheca Hertziana, the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, the Library of the American Academy in Rome, the Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte in Munich, the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, the Rutgers University Libraries, and the Marquand and Firestone Libraries of Princeton University.

For shaping my thinking and numerous insightful comments on my manuscript, or parts of it, I am grateful to Peter Brown, Ann van Dijk, Judson Emerick, Susannah Fisher, Jeffrey Hamburger, Ingo Herklotz, Herbert L. Kessler, Marcia Kupfer, Karl F. Morrison, Keith Moxey, and, of course, Nino Zchomelidze.

Over the years, many other friends and colleagues assisted me with information, materials, encouragement, and discussion. In particular, I would like to mention Kristin B. Aavitsland, Marcel Angheben, Rudy Bell, Ruth Bielfeldt, Sible de Blaauw, Beat Brenk, Caroline Bynum, Anthony
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Cutler, Angelika Fricke, Caroline Goodson, Cynthia Hahn, Morten Steen Hansen, Sten Hartung, Claudia Hattendorff, Marius Bratsberg Hauknes, Michael Ann Holly, Colum Hourihane, Bram Kempers, Marcus Kiefer, Michael Koortbojian, Sean Leatherbury, Manfred Luchterhand, Thomas F. X. Noble, Valentino Pace, Mikael Bøgh Rasmussen, Stefano Riccioni, Dietmar Rübel, Gitte Lønstrup Dal Santo, Stefan Schmitt, Carly Steinborn, Jaqueline Sturm, Erik Wegerhof, Angela Windholz, and Gerhard Wolf.

I also owe special thanks to John Lansdowne for his diligent handling of many of the illustrations in this book, and to Ulrike Mills and Julia Triolo for revising my English. Karl F. Morrison and Yelena Baraz, moreover, were constantly ready to offer expert assistance with the Latin texts, especially the convoluted apse inscriptions.

Any errors are, of course, entirely my own responsibility.

Finally, I would like to thank Beatrice Rehl, who was incredibly supportive throughout the entire process, as well as Anastasia Graf and Isabella Vitti – all three of Cambridge University Press – for transforming the manuscript into a book with great skill and professionalism. Because this book essentially is about how visual artifacts can put a hold on time, I hope that it too, or parts of it, will stand the test of time – at least for some time.
ABBREVIATIONS

CCCM      *Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Medievalis*
CCSL     *Corpus Christianorum Series Latina*
CSEL     *Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum*
MGH      *Monumenta Germaniae Historica*
PL       *Patrologia Latina Cursus Completus*