

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ADJUDICATING REFUGEE AND ASYLUM STATUS

In this book, an array of legal, biomedical, psychosocial, and social science scholars and practitioners offer the first comparative account of the increasing dependence on expertise in the asylum and refugee status determination process. This volume presents a comprehensive study of the relevance of experts, as mediators of culture, who are called on to corroborate, substantiate credibility, and serve as translators in the face of confusing legal standards that require proof of new forms and reasons for persecution around the globe. The authors draw on their interactions with expertise and the immigration process to provide insights into the evidentiary burdens on asylum seekers and the expanding role of expertise in the forms of country-conditions reports, biomedical and psychiatric evaluations, and the emerging field of forensic linguistic analysis in response to emerging forms of persecution, such as gender-based or sexuality-based persecution. This book is essential reading for both scholars interested in the production of knowledge and clinicians considering the role of experts as mediators of asylum claims.

Benjamin N. Lawrance is the Hon. Barber B. Conable, Jr., Endowed Chair in International Studies in the department of sociology and anthropology at the Rochester Institute of Technology. He has published ten books, most notably *Amistad's Orphans* (2015) and *Trafficking in Slavery's Wake* (2012). Lawrance is a legal consultant and has served as an expert witness for more than 250 West African asylum claims in fifteen countries. His research is situated at the dynamic interdisciplinary intersection of history, anthropology, and sociology and is focused on international mobilities, including migration, smuggling, trafficking, forced marriage, and refugee movements.

Galya Ruffer is Director of International Studies and the founding director of the Center for Forced Migration Studies housed at the Buffett Center for International and Comparative Studies at Northwestern University. Her work centers on refugee rights and protection, regional understandings of the root causes of conflict and refugee crises, and the rule of law and the process of international justice, with a particular focus on the Great Lakes region of Africa. She serves on the executive committee for the International Association for the Study of Forced Migration and is a vice chair of the American Bar Association International Refugee Law Committee. Aside from her academic work, she has worked as an immigration attorney representing political asylum claimants both as a solo practitioner and as a pro bono attorney.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise,
and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise,
and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status

THE ROLE OF WITNESS, EXPERTISE,
AND TESTIMONY

Edited by

BENJAMIN N. LAWRENCE

Rochester Institute of Technology

GALYA RUFFER

Northwestern University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107069060

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Adjudicating refugee and asylum status : the role of witness, expertise, and testimony / edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance, Galya Ruffer.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-06906-0 (hardback)

1. Asylum, Right of. 2. Political refugees – Legal status, laws, etc. 3. Refugees – Legal status, laws, etc. 4. Evidence, Expert – European Union countries. 5. Asylum, Right of – Great Britain. I. Lawrance, Benjamin N. (Benjamin Nicholas) II. Ruffer, Galya.

K3268.3.A93 2014

261.8–dc20 2014027872

ISBN 978-1-107-06906-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise,
and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>About the Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>Foreword: Jeffrey Herbst</i>	xv
Introduction: Witness to the Persecution? Expertise, Testimony, and Consistency in Asylum Adjudication	1
Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer	
PART I: SOCIO-CULTURAL INCONSISTENCY AND THE CONTOURS OF EXPERTISE	
1 Reconstructing Babel: Bridging Cultural Dissonance between Asylum Seekers and Adjudicators	27
Bruce J. Einhorn and S. Megan Berthold	
2 Recovering the Sociological Identity of Asylum Seekers: Language Analysis for Determining National Origin in the European Union	54
Noé Mahop Kam	
3 Research and Testimony in the “Rape Capital of the World”: Experts and Evidence in Congolese Asylum Claims	84
Galya Ruffer	
4 Beyond Expert Witnessing: Interdisciplinary Practice in Representing Rape Survivors in Asylum Cases	102
Miriam H. Marton	

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

- 5 **Anthropological Evidence and Country of Origin Information in British Asylum Courts** 122
Anthony Good
- PART II: PRACTICES AND TECHNOLOGIES
FOR MEDICO-PSYCHO EXPERTISE
- 6 **Expert as Aid and Impediment: Navigating Barriers to Effective Asylum Representation** 147
Sabrineh Ardalan
- 7 **Documenting Torture *Sequelae*: The Weill Cornell Model for Forensic Evaluation, Capacity Building, and Medical Education** 166
Khatiya Chelidze, Nicole Sirotin, Margaret Fabiszak, Terri Gallen Edersheim, Taryn Clark, Luis Villegas, Patriss Wais Moradi, and Joanne Ahola
- 8 **Incredible Until Proven Credible: Mental Health Expert Testimony and the Systemic and Cultural Challenges Facing Asylum Applicants** 180
Hawthorne Emery Smith, Stuart Lorin Lustig, and David Gangsei
- 9 **Importing Forensic Biomedicine into Asylum Adjudication: Genetic Ancestry and Isotope Testing in the United Kingdom** 202
Richard Tutton, Christine Hauskeller, and Steven Sturdy
- 10 **“Health Tourism” or “Atrocious Barbarism”? Contextualizing Migrant Agency, Expertise, and Medical Humanitarian Practice** 221
Benjamin N. Lawrance
- Afterword: Lisa Dornell* 245
- Index* 253

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

About the Contributors

Joanne Ahola, MD, is board certified in psychiatry and on the voluntary faculty of the Weill Cornell Medical College. She maintains a private practice in general and psychodynamic psychiatry. She is Medical Director of the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights. She has been a member of the volunteer Asylum Network of Physicians for Human Rights (PHR) since 2000. With PHR, she has trained health professionals around the country in evaluating and documenting the psychological effects of torture and other forms of persecution. She has particular expertise in LGBT asylum, the one-year filing deadline, and testifying in court asylum hearings.

Sabrineh Ardalan, JD, is Assistant Director and Lecturer on Law at the Harvard Immigration and Refugee Clinical Program. She previously served as the Equal Justice America Fellow at The Opportunity Agenda and as a litigation associate at Dewey Ballantine LLP. She also clerked for the Hon. Michael A. Chagares of the Third Circuit Court of Appeals and the Hon. Raymond J. Dearie, Chief District Judge for the Eastern District of New York. She holds a JD from Harvard Law School and a BA in History and International Studies from Yale College.

S. Megan Berthold, LCSW, PhD, is Assistant Professor at the University of Connecticut's School of Social Work. A graduate of Harvard, University of Utah, and UCLA, she teaches casework and human rights. Since the mid-1980s she has served as a clinician, forensic evaluator, and researcher with diverse refugees and asylum seekers in the United States and Asia, including with the Program for Torture Victims in Los Angeles. She frequently testifies as an expert witness in U.S. Immigration Court. Her areas of specialization include torture and other traumas, mental health, and human rights. In 2009 the National Association of Social Workers named her Social Worker of the Year.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

About the Contributors

Khatiya Chelidze is an MD student at Weill Cornell Medical College. She is Publications Coordinator of the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights. She graduated from Hunter College with a BA in Comparative Literature.

Taryn Clark was an MD student at the Weill Cornell Medical College and one of the cofounders of the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights.

Lisa Dornell, JD, is a graduate of the University of Texas at Austin School of Law. She currently sits as an Administrative Judge with the Executive Office for Immigration Review and presides over cases at the Immigration Court in Baltimore, Maryland.

Terri Gallen Edersheim, MD, is Clinical Associate Professor of Obstetrics and Gynecology and Maternal Fetal Medicine at the Weill Cornell Medical College, where she serves as Medical Director of the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights. She is an AOA graduate of the Albert Einstein College of Medicine, and she completed her residency training in Obstetrics and Gynecology at The New York Hospital. She completed fellowship training in Maternal-Fetal Medicine before joining the faculty in 1986, where she has practiced both on the full-time and voluntary faculties. She has participated in the evaluation of torture victims seeking asylum with HealthRight International and Physicians for Human Rights.

Bruce J. Einhorn, JD, is Executive Director and CEO of the Asylum Project, Of Counsel at Wolfsdorf Immigration Law Group, and Adjunct Professor of Law at Pepperdine University. He was formerly Director of the Asylum and Refugee Law Clinic. Einhorn served as a Federal Immigration Judge for seventeen years until 2007. Previously, he served as a special prosecutor and as Chief of Litigation for the U.S. Department of Justice's Office of Special Investigations prosecuting fugitive Nazi war criminals. Einhorn received his JD degree in 1978 from New York University Law School and his BA degree, magna cum laude, from Columbia University in 1975, where he was selected for Phi Beta Kappa.

Margaret Fabiszak is an MD/PhD candidate at the Weill Cornell/Rockefeller/Sloan Kettering Tri-Institutional MD/PhD Program and serves as the Research Coordinator at the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights.

David Gangsei, PhD, is a clinical psychology graduate of Columbia University and licensed psychologist in California, specializing in providing

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

psychological services to refugees, asylum seekers, and torture survivors. He served as Clinical Director of Survivors of Torture International, San Diego, where he oversaw the development of a program serving health, mental health, case management, and asylum support services. He is a consultant developing programs and training for organizations serving trauma victims and survivors. Gangsei is an expert on forensic documentation of the psychological effects of torture and on recognition and management of vicarious trauma for professionals and support personnel.

Anthony Good, PhD, is Professor Emeritus in Social Anthropology at the University of Edinburgh. His principal overseas field research sites are Tamil Nadu, South India, and Sri Lanka. He has served as an expert witness in more than 600 asylum claims, mainly involving Sri Lankan Tamils. He conducted fact-finding visits to assess the human rights situation in Sri Lanka, producing reports for use as evidence in asylum appeal cases. He has conducted research on expert evidence in British asylum courts. He has published numerous books and articles, including *Anthropology and Expertise in the Asylum Courts* (2007).

Christine Hauskeller, PhD, is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Sociology and Philosophy at the University of Exeter. Her work combines critical theory and empirical, hermeneutic research in studies on the interrelation between social institutions, individuals, knowledge formation, and the role of biomedicine in social practices. The combination of conceptual and empirical work characterizes her approach and she has published widely on Foucault and Butler, on torture, on stem cell ethics, and on genetics and identity. She was Director of the U.K. Economics and Social Research Council-funded Centre for Genetics in Society in Exeter.

Jeffrey Herbst is President of Colgate University.

Noé Mahop Kam is a PhD candidate in the Department of Political Science, Social and Communication Sciences at the Catholic University of Louvain-la Neuve and Managing Director of Makano International, an African-language analysis agency based in the Netherlands.

Benjamin N. Lawrance, PhD, is the Hon. Barber B. Conable, Jr., Endowed Professor of International Studies at Rochester Institute of Technology. He has published ten books, notably *African Asylum at a Crossroads* (2015), *Amistad's Orphans* (2015), and *Trafficking in Slavery's Wake* (2012). Lawrance is a legal

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

consultant and has served as an expert witness on more than 250 occasions. Lawrance is the recipient of several national and international awards, including a fellowship from the National Endowment for the Humanities and fellowships at Yale, Harvard, and the University of California.

Stuart Lorin Lustig, MD, MPH, is a child and adolescent psychiatrist currently working for Cigna as a Lead Medical Director. He is Associate Clinical Professor of Psychiatry at the University of California San Francisco School of Medicine and has extensive experience in forensic psychiatry pertaining to the political asylum process. He has collaborated with numerous human rights organizations on clinical and academic endeavors.

Miriam H. Marton, JD, MSW, is Director of the Tulsa Immigrant Resource Network, a post-graduate fellowship program at the University of Tulsa Law School, and assistant visiting clinical professor. Formerly she was the William R. Davis Clinical Teaching Fellow in the Asylum and Human Rights Clinic at the University of Connecticut School of Law. A practicing attorney since 2001, Marton worked for Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP as lead attorney in the representation of asylum applicants as part of Skadden's pro bono program. She holds a JD from Michigan State University College of Law and an MSW from the University of Michigan School of Social Work. Marton had a fourteen-year career as a clinical social worker before pursuing her interest in the law.

Galya Ruffer, JD, PhD, is Director of International Studies and the founding Director of the Center for Forced Migration Studies housed at the Buffett Center for International and Comparative Studies at Northwestern University. Her work centers on refugee rights and protection, regional understandings of the root causes of conflict and refugee crises, rule of law, and the process of international justice. She serves on the Executive Committee for the International Association for the Study of Forced Migration and is Vice Chair of the American Bar Association International Refugee Law Committee.

Nicole Sirotin, MD, is a general internist and served as Assistant Professor in the Department of Medicine at the Weill Cornell Medical College and a medical director of the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights. She has been conducting medical evaluations for asylum seekers since 2008. She has a particular interest in education and in teaching medical trainees about the health issues of survivors of torture and in the health issues of recently arrived female immigrants. She serves as a volunteer for both Physicians

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

for Human Rights Asylum Network and the HealthRight International volunteer network.

Hawthorne Emery Smith, PhD, is a licensed psychologist and the Clinical Director of the Bellevue/NYU Program for Survivors of Torture. He is also an Assistant Clinical Professor at the NYU School of Medicine. Smith received his doctorate in Counseling Psychology (with distinction) from Teachers College, Columbia University. Smith has also earned a Bachelor of Science in Foreign Service from the Georgetown University School of Foreign Service; an advanced certificate in African Studies from Cheikh Anta Diop University in Dakar, Senegal; and a Master's in International Affairs from the Columbia University School of International and Public Affairs.

Steven Sturdy, PhD, is Professor of the Sociology of Medical Knowledge; Head of Science, Technology and Innovation Studies; and Wellcome Trust Senior Investigator in Medical Humanities at the School of Social and Political Sciences, University of Edinburgh. He has published numerous articles about how developments in medical science have informed and been informed by wider changes in medical practice and medical policy. His current research examines the scientific, technological, social, and political processes that have led, over the past forty years or so, to the current ferment of activity around “genomic medicine.”

Richard Tutton, PhD, is Senior Lecturer in the Department of Sociology at Lancaster University. His work examines the social implications of human genetics research, in areas ranging from health and citizenship, biobanking and human tissue collection, enhancement and biomedicalization, and identity formation in the context of genetic knowledge.

Luis Villegas is an MD student at Weill Cornell Medical College.

Patriss Wais Moradi is Clinical Researcher, Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights at Weill Cornell Medical College, and a graduate of the University of California, Davis.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise,
and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

As is always the case, an edited volume is much more than the sum of its parts. The editors and authors whose chapters appear in this volume are indebted to the colleagues who shared thoughts and ideas during the Second Conable Conference in International Studies, entitled “Refugees, Asylum Law, and Expert Testimony: The Construction of Africa and the Global South in Comparative Perspective,” in Rochester, New York, in April 2011. The authors would also like to thank the reviewers whose insights, we hope, strengthened the text. Thanks also go to John Berger and David Jou at Cambridge; Devasena Vedamurthi at Integra Software Services, who so smoothly guided this project toward completion; and Meridith Murray for the index.

Galya Ruffer appreciates the research support of the Dispute Resolution Research Center at Northwestern University and owes much thanks to her family, Jim, Ari, Jonah, Eli and Sheli, who wait endlessly for her to have a work-free weekend.

Benjamin N. Lawrance would like to thank the several organizations and entities that made the conference possible, namely, the Conable Endowment for International Studies, the Starr Foundation, the Program in International and Global Studies in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology in the College of Liberal Arts at Rochester Institute of Technology, the Weill Cornell Center for Human Rights, and the Department of History at Cornell University. He would also like to thank his family, especially Wilson Silva.

We both thank the various individuals whose contributions ultimately all feature in this final product, including Peter Agree, Penny Andrews, Iris Berger, Judi Byfield, Taryn Clark, Evan Criddle, Susan Dicklitch, Tasha Fain, Paul Finkelman, Barbara Harrell-Bond, Jeffrey Herbst, Tobias Kelly, Christine Kray, Sue Long, Katherine Luongo, Mary Meg McCarthy, Andrea McIntosh, Karen Musalo, Juan Osuna, Tricia Redeker Hepner, Cassandra

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Shellman, Meredith Terretta, Robert Ulin, James Winebrake, and the more than 100 participants in the conference.

When we first began serving as expert witnesses for asylum claims, we had no sense of the unspeakable ordeals people are prepared to endure to survive. Jean-Francois Lyotard described the burden-facing asylum seekers as an “ethical tort,” an extreme form of injustice insofar as the victim is deprived of means to speak about or prove their persecution. With this book, we are a little closer to some sense of understanding, but there is still much work to be done. We hope this book fosters conversations, activism, and critical scholarship. We offer this book as a vehicle to encourage others to embrace what may be an unrecognized capacity and share their expertise. We are in awe of each and every one of the hundreds of lives we have encountered during our expert witnessing.

We dedicate this book to the refugees and asylum seekers who routinely display profound and unfathomable courage as they are asked by adjudicators to present their case and recount the brutalities and torture they have suffered, even as they are judged in languages and idioms they do not understand.

NOTE

All possible effort has been made to protect the identity and confidentiality of the individuals whose life stories form part of this book. The authors of chapters employ anonymous or pseudonymous monikers consistent with their respective discipline(s) where appropriate. Details, including but not limited to race, ethnicity, and national origin, have been changed where necessary and appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Foreword

Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status is an important collection of essays examining how Western countries have come to use experts while evaluating refugee claims. This book, based on work by an enviable array of scholars and practitioners, provides information on both the mechanics of refugee adjudication and how courts and legal forums have moved in a variety of perhaps unpredictable ways to use the work of experts in deciding whether to grant sanctuary to those with refugee claims. Accordingly, it is also an explicit and extended meditation on how knowledge developed and deployed by Western experts is used to evaluate the particular circumstances of people from poor regions of the world whose lives will be fundamentally altered depending on the ultimate decision about their refugee status. In the settings examined by the authors, knowledge is not retained for contemplation by those in the “ivory tower” but is used to make what may often literally be life-or-death decisions.

The essays also hint at some of the paradoxes of globalization. In the twenty-first-century world, knowledge, as well as data, money, and media, flow across national boundaries with unprecedented ease. However, the flow of people across boundaries has perhaps never been more regulated. In sub-Saharan Africa, the continental home of many refugee crises over the centuries, a common response to unhappiness or crises was for individuals or whole communities to move. It was only in the twentieth century – with the creation of national boundaries developed by the colonialists and subsequently ratified by independence leaders and the ensuing development of notions of citizenship tied to politically defined boundaries – that the concept of “refugee” was even possible. There seems to be every indication that the movement of people will continue to be closely regulated by all nations and those, especially in the West, who have some ability to police their borders will continue to try to control population movements through administrative mechanisms.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-06906-0 - Adjudicating Refugee and Asylum Status: The Role of Witness, Expertise, and Testimony

Edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance and Galya Ruffer

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

At the same time, because knowledge generally flows irrespective of borders, we know, or think that we know, more about the world than ever before. Partially as a result, refugee adjudication relies increasingly on the knowledge that in many cases we have or think that we possess. Yet, reflection, as found in this volume, suggests that the knowledge that we think we have is inevitably complex and sometimes problematic, especially given what is at stake for individuals.

It is likely that the tension between ever-greater regulation of population movements and the desire to adjudicate individual cases through expert knowledge will only increase in the future. There are, as this book makes clear, no easy answers, although there are many important proposals in the individual chapters that should be considered. More generally, a profound understanding of how countries have arrived at their particular reliance on expert knowledge will hopefully allow us to develop in the future systems that are fairer, more transparent, and appropriate, given the consequences of particular decisions. The individual contributions in this book and the intellectual project that the authors collectively contribute to are therefore important and timely and should be appreciated by both other scholars and those practicing in this very difficult area.

Jeffrey Herbst
President, Colgate University