CONTENTS

Foreword by the Honourable Paul Finn    page xvii
Preface    xxi
Table of cases    xxiii

PART I   General principles    1

1. Introduction    3
   1.1 An organising principle of accessory liability    3
   1.2 The objectives of the book    4
   1.3 The methodology and general approach of the book    5
   1.4 An analytical framework, not a uniform test or rigid taxonomy    6
   1.5 Terminology    6
   1.6 The structure of the book    8

2. Identifying accessory liability in private law    10
   2.1 Overview    10
   2.2 Identifying accessory liability in private law    10
   2.3 Accessory liability can be ‘secondary’ to the primary wrong or an independent wrong    12
      2.3.1 ‘Secondary’ or independent liability?    12
      2.3.2 Liability as an accessory for the same wrong as that committed by PW    12
      2.3.3 Liability as an accessory for an independent wrong    13
      2.3.4 Doctrines that redress accessorial conduct without constituting accessory liability    14
   2.4 Rationales for accessory liability    14
      2.4.1 Possible rationales    14
      2.4.2 The accessory’s wrongful conduct that is linked to the primary wrong    15

vii
2.4.3 Providing enhanced protection and further vindicating existing rights 16
2.4.4 Deterrence 17
2.4.5 Property protection 19
2.4.6 Countervailing policies that limit accessory liability 19

2.5 Distinguishing accessory liability from primary liability 20
2.5.1 It may be difficult to determine, factually, whether a person has committed a primary wrong 20
2.5.2 Categorising liability rules as accessory or primary: dual categorisation 22

2.6 Accessory liability is derivative, not duplicative 22

2.7 When is accessory liability needed? 25

2.8 Distinguishing accessory liability from related concepts 27
2.8.1 Vicarious liability 27
2.8.2 Property-based liabilities 27
2.8.3 Criminal accessory liability 28

3. An analytical framework for accessory liability 29
3.1 Introduction to the framework and its operation 29

3.2 The primary wrong 33
3.2.1 A primary wrong must have been committed 33
3.2.2 The primary wrong determines the doctrinal content of the accessory liability rules 34
3.2.3 The meaning of primary wrong 34

3.3 A’s involvement in the primary wrong: the conduct element 35
3.3.1 A’s conduct 35
3.3.2 The terminology used to describe accessoril conduct 36
3.3.3 The causal relationship between A’s conduct and the primary wrong 37
3.3.4 The timing of A’s conduct 39
3.3.5 Procuring a wrong 40
3.3.6 Can A’s inaction constitute sufficient involvement? 42

3.4 A’s knowledge: the mental state 43
3.4.1 Overview 43
3.4.2 The content of A’s knowledge 45
3.4.2.1 Overview 45
3.4.2.2 Identifying the facts of which A must know: the ‘essential matters’ 45
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.3</td>
<td>Must A ever know the legal significance of the essential matters?</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.4</td>
<td>Predictions as to future events</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.5</td>
<td>Knowledge of an alleged primary wrong</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>Degrees of knowledge</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.1</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.2</td>
<td>Intention</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.3</td>
<td>Actual knowledge</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.4</td>
<td>Recklessness</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.5</td>
<td>Objective knowledge</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.6</td>
<td>Mental states and procurement</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3.7</td>
<td>The requisite mental state for strict liability primary wrongs</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>The operation of the analytical framework</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1</td>
<td>The interplay of the three elements determines A’s culpability</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2</td>
<td>Should A’s culpability be further defined: ‘dishonesty’ and other labels</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3</td>
<td>Can the framework operate at the level of judicial determination of liability?</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Defences</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Remedies</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Accessories in criminal law | 66 |

4.1 | The relevance of criminal law to private law | 66 |
| 4.2 | Overview of criminal law accessories | 70 |
| 4.3 | Principal offender or accessory? | 72 |
| 4.4 | Elements of accessory liability | 76 |
| 4.4.1 | Conduct | 76 |
| 4.4.2 | Intention | 78 |
| 4.4.3 | Knowledge | 80 |
| 4.5 | The offences for which the accessory may be liable | 84 |
| 4.5.1 | Accessory’s liability for a different offence to the principal offender | 84 |
| 4.5.2 | Extended joint enterprise liability | 87 |
## PART II Accessory liability in private law

5. **Torts** 93

5.1 **Introduction** 93
   - 5.1.1 Overview of chapter 93
   - 5.1.2 Accessory liability is often subsumed under 'joint tortfeasors' label 96
   - 5.1.3 Arguments against accessory liability in tort law 98

5.2 **When is accessory liability needed in tort law?** 101
   - 5.2.1 Limited use and relevance of accessory liability concepts 101
   - 5.2.2 Torts in which there is wide-ranging primary liability 102
   - 5.2.3 Torts in which accessory liability is significant 105

5.3 **Accessory liability compared to other tort concepts** 105
   - 5.3.1 Accessory liability and vicarious liability 105
     - 5.3.1.1 Employer-employee relationship 105
     - 5.3.1.2 'Agents' 107
     - 5.3.1.3 Non-delegable duties 110
   - 5.3.2 Accessory liability and the tort of conspiracy 110

5.4 **Establishing accessory liability** 113
   - 5.4.1 Judicial tests for liability 113
     - 5.4.1.1 Introduction 113
     - 5.4.1.2 Procuring or inducing tortious acts or wrongs 115
     - 5.4.1.3 Common design 116
     - 5.4.1.4 'Aiding and abetting' in United States law 118
   - 5.4.2 Conduct 120
     - 5.4.2.1 Is there a need for a causal link between A’s involvement and PW’s wrongdoing? 120
     - 5.4.2.2 The type of conduct that constitutes involvement 122
     - 5.4.2.3 Assistance does not suffice for liability? 125
   - 5.4.3 Mental element: A’s knowledge 127
     - 5.4.3.1 Overview 127
     - 5.4.3.2 Content of knowledge 128
     - 5.4.3.3 Degrees of knowledge 130
   - 5.4.4 The relationship between the conduct and mental elements 131
6.4 Defences 195
6.5 Remedies 197
6.6 Conclusion 198

7. Infringement of equitable property rights 199
7.1 Introduction 199
7.2 Trustee de son tort 200
7.3 Dealing inconsistently with trust property 202
7.4 The Diplock claim 204
7.5 The persisting property claim 205
7.6 Recipient liability 208
  7.6.1 The dual character of recipient liability 208
  7.6.2 The relationship of recipient liability and accessory liability 209
  7.6.3 Recipient liability as a primary custodial liability 212
  7.6.4 Recipient liability and unjust enrichment liability 213
7.7 Conclusion 216

8. Breach of equitable duties 217
8.1 Introduction 217
  8.1.1 Overview 217
  8.1.2 The primary wrong: equitable wrongs and ‘wrongfulness’ 220
  8.1.3 The rationales for accessory liability and participatory liability 221
  8.1.4 Current frameworks for participatory liability, including accessory liability 223
    8.1.4.1 The traditional framework 223
    8.1.4.2 The reformed framework 226
  8.1.5 Equitable accessory liability is a secondary (‘derivative’) and independent liability 228
  8.1.6 An equitable tort? 229
  8.1.7 The terminology of constructive trusts 230
8.2 The scope of accessory liability 231
8.3 Accessory and recipient liability for breach of trust and fiduciary duties 234
  8.3.1 The primary wrong 234
8.3.1.1 Breach of trust 234
8.3.1.2 Breach of fiduciary duty 235
8.3.1.3 Must there be a misapplication of trust property? 238
8.3.1.4 Must there be a dishonest and fraudulent design? 239

8.3.2 The accessorial involvement or the receipt 240
8.3.2.1 Procurement and inducement 240
8.3.2.2 Assistance 242
8.3.2.3 Beneficial receipt of trust property 244

8.3.3 The causal or other link between A’s conduct and the primary wrong 250

8.3.4 The mental state of the accessory or recipient 252
8.3.4.1 Overview 252
8.3.4.2 The content of A’s knowledge 253
8.3.4.3 The necessary mental state under the traditional framework 257
8.3.4.4 The necessary mental state under the reformed framework 260

8.3.5 Shortcomings of the two frameworks and a preferred approach 266

8.4 Accessory liability for breach of confidence 269
8.4.1 When does accessory liability arise? 269
8.4.1.1 Scenario 1: A, knowing of a breach of confidence by PW, receives the confidential information 269
8.4.1.2 Scenario 2: A innocently receives confidential information from PW 271
8.4.1.3 Scenario 3: A does not receive the confidential information at all 273
8.4.2 The elements of accessory liability for breach of confidence 273

8.5 Undue influence and related doctrines 275
8.5.1 Introduction 275
8.5.2 Undue influence 276
8.5.3 Scenario 1: D is party to the transaction tainted by X’s undue influence 277
8.5.4 Scenario 2: D is not a party to the transaction tainted by X’s undue influence 279

8.6 Defences 280
8.6.1 Introduction 280
8.6.2 Is it a defence that PW is not liable? 281
8.6.3 Statutory limitation periods 284
8.6.4 Statutory indefeasibility of title 286

8.7 Remedies 288
8.7.1 Introduction 288
8.7.2 Loss-based remedies 289
8.7.3 Gain-based remedies 292
8.7.3.1 Introduction 292
8.7.3.2 Account of profits 293
8.7.3.3 Gain-based proprietary remedies 295
8.7.4 Other remedies 298

8.8 Apportioning liability 299
8.8.1 Joint and several liability for losses 299
8.8.2 Joint and several liability for gains 300
8.8.3 Contribution 301

9. Infringement of statutory intellectual property rights 304
9.1 Introduction 304
9.1.1 Overview 304
9.1.2 Competing policies in IP accessory law 305
9.1.3 Statutory accessory liability compared to similar concepts 309

9.2 Authorisation of infringements 310
9.2.1 Statutory sources of liability 310
9.2.2 Is authorisation accessory liability? The need for a primary wrong 311
9.2.3 Definitions of ‘authorise’ 314
9.2.4 Conduct that amounts to authorisation 318
9.2.5 Mental element: the role of knowledge 319
9.2.6 Cases of authorisation 320
9.2.6.1 Express request or direction 320
9.2.6.2 Providing mechanical means of copying 322
9.2.6.3 Live performance on premises 324
9.2.6.4 Internet cases 326
9.2.7 The interaction between A’s conduct and mental state 329
## CONTENTS

9.3 Other accessory liability provisions 335
  9.3.1 Introduction 335
  9.3.2 Permit premises to be used for performance 335
  9.3.3 Trademarks 337

9.4 Non-accessorial 'indirect' infringements 338
  9.4.1 Introduction 338
  9.4.2 'Contributory' infringement of patents 339
  9.4.3 Copyright 344
    9.4.3.1 'Secondary' or 'indirect' infringement liability 344
    9.4.3.2 'Constructive' knowledge: objective knowledge 346

9.5 Remedies 349
  9.5.1 Injunctions 349
  9.5.2 Damages 351

10. Other statutory wrongs 352
  10.1 Introduction 352
  10.2 Legislative frameworks 354
    10.2.1 United Kingdom 354
    10.2.2 Australia 356
  10.3 The meaning of 'knowingly concerned' in the UK 359
  10.4 The meaning of involved in a contravention in Australia 360
    10.4.1 Liability as primary wrongdoer or accessory? 360
    10.4.2 Intentional wrongdoing 363
    10.4.3 Involvement 365
    10.4.4 Knowledge 367
      10.4.4.1 Content of knowledge 367
      10.4.4.2 Degrees of knowledge 370
    10.4.5 Conclusion on Australian statutory accessory liability 372

11. Wrongs involving companies 373
  11.1 Introduction 373
    11.1.1 Overview 373
    11.1.2 The general law tools of attribution and vicarious liability 374
  11.2 Company liability 376
## CONTENTS

11.2.1 Distinguishing accessory from primary liability 376
11.2.2 Companies as accessories 378
  11.2.2.1 Attribution of conduct and mental states for the purposes of accessory liability 378
  11.2.2.2 General rules of attribution 378
  11.2.2.3 The company’s directing mind and will 379
  11.2.2.4 The ‘fraud’ exception to attribution 380
  11.2.2.5 Aggregation of conduct and mental states for the purposes of attribution 382

11.3 Directors as accessories 383
  11.3.1 Distinguishing accessory liability from primary liability 383
  11.3.2 General principles of accessory liability 387
  11.3.3 D’s liability for PW Co’s torts and statutory IP infringements 387
    11.3.3.1 Overview 387
    11.3.3.2 Direct or procure 391
    11.3.3.3 ‘Makes the wrong his own’ test 393
  11.3.4 Liability for strict liability common law wrongs 394
  11.3.5 Liability of D for PW Co’s breach of contract 398
  11.3.6 Liability of directors acting in their constitutional role 399
  11.3.7 Accessory liability of directors of company trustees 401

11.4 Conclusion 403

PART III 405

12. Conclusion 407

Index 409