Machiavelli and the Modern State

This book offers a significant reinterpretation of the history of republican political thought and of Niccolò Machiavelli’s place in it. It locates Machiavelli’s political thought within enduring debates about the proper size of republics. From the sixteenth century onward, as states grew larger, it was believed that only monarchies could govern large territories effectively. Republicanism was a form of government relegated to urban city-states, anachronisms in the new age of the territorial state. For centuries, history and theory were in agreement: constructing an extended republic was as futile as trying to square a circle, but then James Madison devised a compound representative republic that enabled popular government to take on renewed life in the modern era. This work argues that Machiavelli had his own Madisonian impulse and deserves to be recognized as the first modern political theorist to envision the possibility of a republic with a large population extending over a broad territory.

Alissa M. Ardito is a Lecturer and Visiting Fellow in the Department of Political Science at Yale University. She holds a PhD from Yale University and a JD from the University of Virginia School of Law. She has previously served as a Visiting Professor in the Department of Political Science at Duke University and has been a Visiting Scholar at the American Academy in Rome and a Fellow at Monticello’s International Center for Jefferson Studies.
Machiavelli and the Modern State

The Prince, the Discourses on Livy, and the Extended Territorial Republic

ALISSA M. ARDITO

Yale University
To My Mother and Father

and to the Memory of My Grandmother
Contents

List of Figures ix
Acknowledgments xi

Introduction 1
1 The Prince 12
The Dedication 28
Enter the Work 39
Cesare Borgia: Architect of the State 50
Found a Composite State on the People 56
The Final Three 65
2 The Spaces of Fortune 68
The Three Problems of an Extended Republic 76
The Search for Answers 77
Political Space in Early Modern Europe 82
The City of Rome 86
Venice, Sparta, Rome 89
Territorial Expansion: Books I and II 95
The City-State or the Territorial State – Florence or Tuscany 95
The Expansion of the Florentine Republic 100
City and Countryside 101
Book II 105
Incorporation Under One Rule 108
Dueling Models: Rome and Tuscany 118
Tuscany 122
3 Necessity: The Survival of the Republic 129
The Second Challenge 131
Enter Book II: Power Politics 136
Problems with Republican Foreign Policy 138
Reason of State 141
Figures

1. Italy about 1494. Insets: The Milanese under the Visconti, 1339–1402; the Republic of Florence, 1300–1494. page 38

2. “Estates of the Church, Grand Duchy of Tuscany, Republic of Lucca & c.” from A General Atlas, Being a Collection of Maps of the World and Quarters, the Principal Empires, Kingdoms &c. with Their Several Provinces & Other Subdivisions, Correctly Delineated. 83
Acknowledgments

I am delighted to be able to thank the many people and institutions that supported this at times quixotic enterprise. This book began as a dissertation in the Yale Department of Political Science. From the dissertation’s earliest incarnation, my dissertation advisors astutely advised and encouraged me on an odyssey that included exploring the Vatican Archives, directed me to sources, and gave me the freedom to grow as a scholar. When I was a graduate student, Norma Thompson, Frank M. Turner, and Vincent Scully provided me with intellectual inspiration, and they remain exemplars.

Most of all, I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to Ian Shapiro whose enduring faith in this project made it possible. For his commitment and scholarly ideals, and for being an inspiring person and mentor, I am forever grateful. Much appreciation is owed to the McMillan Center at Yale University for providing financial support and assistance as I completed work on the manuscript. The Yale Political Science Department once more opened its doors to me and became a much loved home, and for that I will always be thankful. I am also deeply grateful to Steven Smith and Frances Rosenbluth for their continued generosity and willingness to share astute insights, guidance, and encouragement. Steven Smith has always suggested the most illuminating sources, a rare gift, which has benefited my interpretation of Machiavelli in myriad ways.

Quentin Skinner generously took the time to discuss the project with me and provided encouragement, a privilege for which I am truly grateful. I only regret that time did not permit me to incorporate his numerous insights.

Words of appreciation are due to Ryan Greenwood for taking the time to provide valuable comments on the second chapter. I happily acknowledge the incredible and indefatigable research assistance of Amy Rabinowitz and Dimitiros Halikias. In addition, I would like to thank Brad Smith for his enthusiasm for the project and wise counsel, as well as Barry McMillion for his generous help in pursuing maps and illustrations. I must also thank Curtis
Acknowledgments

Perrin for offering astute comments on my introduction and providing camaraderie and encouragement during a critical time.

I would also like to express my gratitude to the American Academy in Rome, in my mind the most civilized place on earth, for twice granting me the opportunity to reside at the academy as a visiting scholar. It has been my great good fortune to have had the opportunity to take advantage of the brilliant conversation and cultural legacy the academy preserves.

I must also thank Lew Bateman at Cambridge University Press for his support of this project and his patience. I also thank Jeanie Lee, Devasena Vedamurthi, and Suzette Andre Costello, for efficient and meticulous copyediting and proofreading.

My parents, Andrew and Mary Ann Ardito, and my sister Adria have lived with this obsession for many years and have never ceased to offer unconditional love, patience, and good humor.

I dedicate this book to my grandmother and to my father and mother. From my earliest years, my grandmother, Eneria Di Lauro, inspired me with a devotion to learning. At the age of ninety-two she remained eager to discuss my dissertation and provided thoughtful insights and comments. Above all, my grandmother showed me that a questioning intellect and a strong moral character could be united in a loving heart. Throughout my life, my father and mother have remained a constant source of loving support. My father, especially, taught me to appreciate all that is beautiful in the world – in nature, in buildings, in history, and in people. Whatever imagination animates this book and gives it life comes from him. To all of them, then, I dedicate this book with love and gratitude.