Status in World Politics

Rising powers such as Brazil, China, India, Russia, and Turkey are increasingly claiming heightened profiles in international politics. Although differing in other respects, rising states have a strong desire for recognition and respect. This pioneering volume on status features contributions that develop propositions on status concerns and illustrate them with case studies and aggregate data analysis. Four cases are examined in depth: the United States (how it accommodates rising powers through hierarchy), Russia (the influence of status concerns on its foreign policy), China (how Beijing signals its status aspirations), and India (which has long sought major power status). The authors analyze status from a variety of theoretical perspectives and tackle questions such as: How do states signal their status claims? How are such signals perceived by the leading states? Will these status concerns lead to conflict, or is peaceful adjustment possible?

T. V. Paul is James McGill Professor of International Relations in the Department of Political Science at McGill University, Montréal.

Deborah Welch Larson is Professor of Political Science in the Department of Political Science at the University of California, Los Angeles.

William C. Wohlforth is the Daniel Webster Professor in the Department of Government at Dartmouth College, New Hampshire.
Status in World Politics

Edited by
T.V. Paul
McGill University, Montréal

Deborah Welch Larson
University of California, Los Angeles

William C. Wohlforth
Dartmouth College, New Hampshire
Contents

Figures page vii
Tables viii
Contributors ix
Acknowledgments xv

Part I Introduction

1 Status and World Order 3
DEBORAH WELCH LARSON, T. V. PAUL, AND WILLIAM C. WOHLFORTH

Part II Admission into the Great-Power Club

2 Managing Rising Powers: The Role of Status Concerns 33
DEBORAH WELCH LARSON AND ALEXEI SHEVCHENKO

3 Status Considerations in International Politics and the Rise of Regional Powers 58
THOMAS J. VOLGY, RENATO CORBETTA, J. PATRICK RHAMEY, JR., RYAN G. BAIRD, AND KEITH A. GRANT

4 Status Is Cultural: Durkheimian Poles and Weberian Russians Seek Great-Power Status 85
IVER B. NEUMANN

Part III Status Signaling

5 Status Dilemmas and Interstate Conflict 115
WILLIAM C. WOHLFORTH

6 Status Signaling, Multiple Audiences, and China’s Blue-Water Naval Ambition 141
XIAOYU PU AND RANDALL L. SCHWELLER
vi  Contents

Part IV  International Institutions and Status

7 Status Accommodation through Institutional Means: India’s Rise and the Global Order  165
   T. V. PAUL AND MAHESH SHANKAR

8 Setting Status in Stone: The Negotiation of International Institutional Privileges  192
   VINCENT POULIOT

Part V  Status, Authority, and Structure

9 Status Conflict, Hierarchies, and Interpretation Dilemmas  219
   WILLIAM R. THOMPSON

10 Status, Authority, and the End of the American Century  246
   DAVID A. LAKE

Part VI  Conclusions

11 Why Status Matters in World Politics  273
   ANNE L. CLUNAN

Index  297
Figures

9.1 Regional transitions ........................................ page 235
9.2 Global transitions ........................................ 235
9.3 Regional-global transitions, part 1 ..................... 236
9.4 Regional-global transitions, part 2 ..................... 236
9.5 The cold war .................................................. 237
Tables

3.1 Major power status club membership compared to COW status designations, aggregated at five-year intervals, 1951–2010  

3.2 Major power status and MID joining, 1951–2001  

3.3 Threshold entry requirements for Brazil and India compared with new major powers, 2000–2008  

3.4 Projections for Brazil and India, baseline scenario  

3.5 Projections for Brazil and India, status quo accelerated scenario  

3.6 Projections for Brazil and India, minimally contested accelerated scenario  

4.1 Durkheimian and Weberian great-power criteria  

4.2 Perceived population in millions and size of armed forces by manpower for Poland, Czechoslovakia, Lithuania, France, Germany, and the USSR for the years 1922 and 1937  

4.3 Four types of powers, defined in terms of degrees of capabilities and civilizational standard fulfillment  

6.1 Chinese opinions on the aircraft carrier project: A survey  

9.1 Various types of leadership transitions and warfare
Contributors

RYAN G. BAIRD received his PhD in 2010 from the School of Government and Public Policy at the University of Arizona and now works as an operations research analyst for the Joint Warfare Analysis Center. His latest publications include the (coedited) book entitled *Major Powers and the Quest for International Status in International Politics: Global and Regional Perspectives* (2011) and the article “Unpacking Governance and Democracy: Conceptualizing Governance Infrastructure,” forthcoming in *Social Science Information*.

ANNE L. CLUNAN is Associate Professor of National Security at the Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, CA. Her research has focused on status aspirations in Russian security policy, nuclear and biological weapons and nontraditional security threats, and the impact of globalization and non-state actors on governance, security, and sovereignty. She is the author of *The Social Construction of Russia’s Resurgence: Aspirations, Identity and Security Interests* (2009). She coedited *Ungoverned Spaces? Alternatives to State Authority in an Era of Softened Sovereignty* (2010) and *Terrorism, War or Disease? Unraveling the Use of Biological Weapons* (2008).

RENATO CORBETTA is Associate Professor of Political Science in the Department of Government at The University of Alabama at Birmingham. His research focuses on conflict expansion, networks in international relations, and major powers in international politics. He has published in *International Studies Quarterly, Political Research Quarterly, and Conflict Management and Peace Science* and is a coeditor of and contributor to *Major Powers and the Quest for Status in International Politics* (2011).

KEITH A. GRANT is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science at James Madison University. His most recent scholarship includes the (coedited) book *Major Powers and the Quest for Status in International Politics* (2011) and journal articles "Outsourcing Security:


IVER B. NEUMANN is currently Montague Professor at the London School of Economics but wrote his chapter while he was director of research at the Norwegian Institute of International Affairs. His current research projects include cooperation with Serbian colleagues, a joint book project on the historical sociology of the Eurasian steppe with Einar Wigen, and work on a diplomacy book for Hearst. He is most recently the author of At Home with the Diplomats (2012).

T. V. PAUL is James McGill Professor of International Relations in the Department of Political Science at McGill University and formerly Director (Founding) of the Center for International Peace and Security Studies. Paul is the author or editor of fifteen books and more than fifty-five scholarly articles and book chapters. He is the author of The Warrior State: Pakistan in the Contemporary World (2014); Globalization and the National Security State (with Norrin Ripsman, 2010); The Tradition of Non-use of Nuclear Weapons (2009); India in the World Order: Searching for Major Power Status (with Baldev Nayar, 2002); Power versus Prudence: Why Nations Forgo Nuclear Weapons (2000); and Asymmetric Conflicts: War Initiation by Weaker Powers (1994). His most recent edited volume is International Relations Theory and Regional Transformation (2012).

VINCENT POULIOT is Associate Professor and William Dawson Scholar in the Department of Political Science at McGill University. He is also Director of the Center for International Peace and Security Studies. He is the author of International Security in Practice: The Politics of NATO-Russia Diplomacy (2010) and coeditor (with Emanuel Adler) of International Practices (2011). Pouliot’s articles have appeared in
Contributors

XIAOYU PU is an assistant professor in the Political Science Department at University of Nevada, Reno. During the 2012–2013 academic year he was a postdoctoral Fellow in the Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program. He received his PhD from The Ohio State University. His research has appeared in journals such as International Security, The China Quarterly, and The Chinese Journal of International Politics, as well as in edited volumes.

J. PATRICK RHAMEY, JR., is an assistant professor in the Department of International Studies and Political Science at the Virginia Military Institute. His recent contributions include a book chapter outlining a method of identifying regional powers in Major Powers and the Quest for Status in International Politics and the prospects for further regional integration in Regional and International Relations of Central Europe. His research interests focus on domestic-international linkages and the sources of regional order in the political capacity of domestic institutions.


MAHESH SHANKAR is Assistant Professor of International Affairs at Skidmore College, New York. He has a PhD from McGill University and was previously Research Fellow at the South Asia Programme, S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies in Singapore.

ALEXEI SHEVCHENKO is an associate professor in the Department of Political Science, California State University, Fullerton. He holds a doctorate in political science from the University of California, Los Angeles. His research interests include IR theory and Russian and Chinese foreign policy and domestic politics. His work has been published in Communist and Post-Communist Studies, International Organization, International Security, and several edited volumes.
Contributors

WILLIAM R. THOMPSON is Distinguished Professor and Donald A. Rogers Professor of Political Science at Indiana University, Bloomington. His books include The Comparative Analysis of Politics (with Monte Palmer); Contending Approaches to World System Analysis; Rhythms in Politics and Economics (with Paul Johnson); Seapower in Global Politics, 1494–1993 (with George Modelski); On Global War: Historical-Structural Approaches to World Politics; War and State Making: The Shaping of the Global Powers (with Karen Rasler); The Great Power and Global Struggle, 1490–1990 (with Karen Rasler); Leading Sectors and World Politics: Coevolution in Global Economics and Politics (with George Modelski); Great Power Rivalries; and The Emergence of the Global Political Economy. He has published a number of articles, monographs, and book chapters on such topics as regional subsystems, military coups, alliance processes, war rivalries, and long waves of economic growth.

THOMAS J. VOLGY is Professor of Political Science at the University of Arizona, specializing in international politics, democratic processes, and domestic public policy. He has published dozens of articles in professional journals and is the author and/or coauthor of several books, including Major Powers and the Quest for Status in International Politics (2011); Mapping the New World Order (2009); International Politics and State Strength (2003); Politics in the Trenches: Experimenting with Democracy in America (2001); and The Forgotten Americans (1992).

DEBORAH WELCH LARSON is professor of political science at the University of California, Los Angeles. She is the author of Origins of Containment (1985), which traces the development of Cold War belief systems by studying postwar U.S. policy makers from a cognitive psychological perspective. Her second book, Anatomy of Mistrust (2000), uses game theory, social psychology, and bargaining theory to explain missed opportunities as well as cases where the United States and Soviet Union were able to overcome mistrust during the Cold War. Welch Larson’s articles have appeared in International Organization, International Security, and International Studies Quarterly, among others. Her edited book, Good Judgment in Foreign Policy: Theory and Application (2003) (with Stanley Renshon), analyzes the use of judgment for complex, difficult foreign policy decisions.

WILLIAM C. WOHLFORTH is the Daniel Webster Professor in the Dartmouth College Department of Government, of which he was chair for three academic years (2006–2009). He is the author or editor of six books and some sixty articles and book chapters on topics ranging
The rise of new centers of power such as China, India, and Brazil and the relative decline of current leading states have brought forth the need for greater understanding of status in world politics. Our aim in this volume is to give status in its various dimensions the importance it deserves in international relations. After all, if the major powers fail to manage their respective status expectations and claims, the world will suffer the costs of foregone cooperation at best and intensified interstate rivalry and even war at worst. And if there is one thing nearly all academics and practitioners can agree on, it is that sound, scholarly knowledge about the contemporary politics of international status is in short supply. This volume evolved out of a conference the editors organized at the John Sloan Dickey Center for International Understanding at Dartmouth College, New Hampshire, in October 2010 in collaboration with the McGill-University of Montréal Center for International Peace and Security Studies (CIPSS). With a generous gift from Mr. David Raynolds, the Dickey Center and Director Ambassador Kenneth S. Yalowitz and Associate Director Christianne Hardy Wohlforth provided an ideal intellectual and institutional setting for the project’s launch. The original papers underwent substantive revisions in response to comments by discussants and the two readers for Cambridge University Press. We organized six panels based on the papers at various conferences of the American Political Science Association, International Studies Association, and International Political Science Association. The discussants at these meetings – in particular Stephen Brooks, Steve Chan, Bridget Coggins, Charles Doran, David Kang, Patrick Morgan, Jonathan Renshon, and Norrin Ripsman – helped shape our ideas further. Deborah Welch Larson presented her paper with Alexei Shevchenko at the University of Southern California, where she received useful comments from Jacques Hymans, as well as at the International Relations Workshop at UCLA. William C. Wohlforth received insightful comments from participants in seminars at Yale University, the University of Toronto, Concordia University, and George Washington University. Funding for the project came from the John Sloan
Acknowledgments

Dickey Center for International Understanding at Dartmouth College, Fonds québécois de recherche sur la société et la culture (FQRSC), the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC), the James McGill Chair, and the UCLA Political Science Department. We thank Jean-François Bélanger and Mahesh Shankar for their able and dedicated research assistance. The contributors stayed with us through the long process of reviews and revisions and we thank them for their perseverance. Finally, we thank our editor at Cambridge University Press, John Haslam, for his strong interest in the volume. Last, but not least, our respective families supported us throughout this venture.