The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel

Why is there such a large gap between the declarations that countries make about human rights and their imperfect implementation of them? Why do states that have enacted laws and signed treaties about human rights choose not to enforce these laws in daily life? Why have activists failed to achieve the goals of ensuring human rights domestically and internationally? This book examines the issue of human rights in the Israeli domestic arena by analyzing the politics and strategies of defending human rights. To do so, it integrates the tools of social choice theory with a unique institutionalist perspective that looks at both formal and informal, and local and international factors. The book offers an analysis explaining the processes through which Israel is struggling to promote human rights within a specific institutional environment, thus determining the future of Israeli democracy and its attitude toward human rights.

Assaf Meydani is an Associate Professor in the School of Government and Society at the Academic College of Tel Aviv–Yaffo, Israel. His research interests include public policy, politics and law, and political economy. He is the author of several books, including The Israeli Supreme Court and the Human Rights Revolution: Courts as Agenda Setters (2011), Political Transformations and Political Entrepreneurs: Israel in Comparative Perspective (2009), and Public Responsibility and Political Consumption (2009, in Hebrew). His articles have appeared in journals such as Israel Studies, Israel Law Review, Policy and Society, Constitutional Political Economy, Rationality and Society, Land Use Policy, Contemporary Security Policy, and the International Journal of Public Administration, as well as in the Encyclopedia of Public Administration and Public Policy.
To my beloved daughters Romi and Alma

for a better world of human rights
The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel

Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice

ASSAF MEYDANI

The Academic College of Tel Aviv-Yaffo
Contents

Acknowledgments

1. Introduction
   1.1 The Structure of the Book

   2.1 Human Rights Theory: Toward a Practical Positivist Approach
   2.2 The Book’s Contribution – Human Rights Organizations in the Process of Policy Making
      2.2.1 The Relationship between the Public and Politicians
Contents

2.2.2 Nongovernmental Organizations as Interest Groups 23
2.2.3 The Involvement of Bureaucrats in Human Rights Policies 24

3. Between Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice 29

4. Structural and Cultural Variables Favoring a Short-Term Orientation 39
4.1 Nongovernability in Israel 40
4.1.1 The Government's Core Instability 44
4.1.2 The Parliamentary Supervision of the Executive Authority 48
4.1.3 The Formal and Informal Roles of the State Comptroller 53
4.1.4 The Functioning of the Legislative and Parliamentary Authorities 55
4.1.5 The Local Authority 57
4.1.6 The Defense Establishment 61
4.1.7 Summary of Nongovernability in Israel 64

4.2 Liberal Political Culture versus Nonliberal Political Culture 66
4.3 Orientation toward Outcomes versus Orientation toward Process 68
4.4 Effects of the Culture and Institutions on the Behavior of Individuals in a Nonliberal Polity 72

4.5 Judicialization: A Well-Known Strategy of Human Rights NGOs 77

5. The Right to Be Free from the Threat of Torture 81
   5.1 The Institutional Arena 83
   5.2 Public Demand for Supervision of the GSS 85
   5.3 The GSS: A Political Survivor 91
   5.4 Judicialization: An Alternative Route for Human Rights Activists 97
   5.5 Security Issues: Obstacles for Human Rights Activists 102
   5.6 The Torture Case as a Catalyst 103
   5.7 Public Policy Reform as Electoral Capital 110
   5.8 Summary and Conclusions 114

6. The Right to Equality: Gender Segregation on Orthodox Buses Following the Israeli High Court of Justice’s 2011 Ruling on the “Segregated Lines” 115
   6.1 “We the Orthodox Community Don’t Want Any Favors from This State” 121
   6.2 Nongovernmental Organizations as Interest Groups 122
Contents

6.3 The Langer Committee versus the High Court: Rhetoric or Practice 126
6.4 The Public – A Decline in the Belief in Human Rights 131
6.5 Politicians: The Motivation of Reelection 135
6.6 Summary 142

7.1 Rhetoric on Rights but Failure in Practice 148
7.2 Public Attitudes in Israel 152
7.3 Various Groups Advocating for the Disabled as an Obstacle 159
7.4 Bureaucrats and Their Influence 161
7.5 Politicians’ Position as a Catalyst in Promoting Rights 167
7.6 Summary 170

8. The Human Rights Commission in Israel That Never Was 173
8.1 “Manifesto”: A Public Appeal 177
8.2 Public Exposure: Impediment or Catalyst? 179
8.3 Civil Servants: Impediment or Catalyst? 181

| viii |
## Contents

8.4 Change of Personnel in the Ministry of Justice 183
8.5 Founding of the NGOs' Coalition 185
8.6 The Coalition’s Strategy: Failure versus the Political Echelon 187
8.7 New Life for the Initiative 187
8.8 The Goal-Focusing Approach: A Success 190

9. Property Rights: Designing the Separation Fence Policy 193
   9.1 Public Opinion on the Separation Fence 204
   9.2 The Bureaucrats versus an Interest Group 211
   9.3 The Politicians' Position 215
   9.4 Conclusion: Limitations on the Right to Private Property or the Political Limits of the High Court 219

    10.1 “Until the Law Comes into Force the Following Procedure Is Introduced” 227
    10.2 “I Am in Favor, but Leave Me Alone; I Prefer Not to Think about It” 234
    10.3 “When You Want to Save Your Child, You Don’t Ask Questions” 237
    10.4 “Ethically Speaking, This Trade Is Similar to Slavery or Prostitution” 242
Contents

10.5 The Political Middle Road 251
10.6 Conclusions 255

11.1 A Conceptual Framework for the Evaluation of Public Policy 258
11.2 Analyzing the Study's Main Findings Using the Policy Evaluation Approach 263
11.3 Summary of the Study's Findings 264

Bibliography 273

Index 293
Acknowledgments

This book is a result of more than a decade of research, study, and teaching, as well as involvement in the Israeli political arena. Some of its rationales and ideas have appeared in journals such as Israel Studies, POLITIKA: The Israeli Journal of Political Science, Israel Law Review, Contemporary Security Policy, International Journal of Intelligence and Counter intelligence, and Israel Affairs. Portions of the book have also been presented at conferences held by the Law and Society Association, the American Political Science Association, the Association for Israel Studies, and the International Political Science Association. I would like to thank Gideon Doron, God rest his soul; Shlomo Mizrahi; Gad Barzilai; Arye Naor; David Nachmias; Shimon Shetreet; Daphne Barak-Erez; Maoz Rosenthal; Ronen Shamir; Ruvi Ziegler; Ofer Arian; Eran Vigoda-Gadot; Abraham Diskin;
Acknowledgments

Dov Waxman; Nurit Hashimshoni-Yaffe; Yoram Rabin; Avishai Ehrlich; David Rueda; Menachem Hofnung; Itzhak Galnoor; Philip Robins; Moshe Maor; Aharon Barak; Amnon Rubinstein; Derek Penslar; and Mota Kremnitzer for their advice and collaboration.

I am grateful beyond measure to the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford, for its gracious hospitality during the 2012–13 academic year. I especially wish to thank Denis J. Galligan, William Twining, Marc Hertogh, David Erdos, Marina Kurkchiyan, Fernanda Pirie, Danlin Li, Amir Paz-Fuchs, Iris Benöhr, Lisa Vanhala, Sacha Meuter, Rogier Creemers, Iginio Gagliardone, and Nicole Stremlau for their advice and collaboration.

Special thanks to Sandra Fredman and to the Oxford Human Rights Hub, University of Oxford, for its hospitality and welcome support during my stay in Oxford.

I would also like to express my gratitude to the School of Public Policy at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem for providing a friendly and stimulating environment during my stay there between March and June 2013. Special thanks too to Momi Dahan, Sharon Gilad, Margit Cohn, David Levi-Faur, and Raanan Sulitzeanu-Kenan.

I owe a debt of gratitude to Naomi Chazan for her time and support. Thanks, too, to the Academic College of Tel Aviv–Yaffo for its generous support, and especially to Nehemia Friedland, Shlomo Biderman, and Benny Alon.
Acknowledgments

The manuscript would never have achieved its final form but for the editorial skill and dedication of Diane Romm. In addition, my sincere thanks to John Berger, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for his insightful advice and support. Finally, my thanks to the anonymous readers for their helpful remarks.