

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel

Why is there such a large gap between the declarations that countries make about human rights and their imperfect implementation of them? Why do states that have enacted laws and signed treaties about human rights choose not to enforce these laws in daily life? Why have activists failed to achieve the goals of ensuring human rights domestically and internationally? This book examines the issue of human rights in the Israeli domestic arena by analyzing the politics and strategies of defending human rights. To do so, it integrates the tools of social choice theory with a unique institutionalist perspective that looks at both formal and informal, and local and international factors. The book offers an analysis explaining the processes through which Israel is struggling to promote human rights within a specific institutional environment, thus determining the future of Israeli democracy and its attitude toward human rights.

Assaf Meydani is an Associate Professor in the School of Government and Society at the Academic College of Tel Aviv–Yaffo, Israel. His research interests include public policy, politics and law, and political economy. He is the author of several books, including *The Israeli Supreme Court and the Human Rights Revolution: Courts as Agenda Setters* (2011), *Political Transformations and Political Entrepreneurs: Israel in Comparative Perspective* (2009), and *Public Responsibility and Political Consumption* (2009, in Hebrew). His articles have appeared in journals such as *Israel Studies*, *Israel Law Review*, *Policy and Society*, *Constitutional Political Economy*, *Rationality and Society*, *Land Use Policy*, *Contemporary Security Policy*, and the *International Journal of Public Administration*, as well as in the *Encyclopedia of Public Administration and Public Policy*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*To my beloved daughters Romi and Alma
for a better world of human rights*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel

Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice

ASSAF MEYDANI

The Academic College of Tel Aviv-Yaffo



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107054578

© Assaf Meydani 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Meydani, Assaf.

The anatomy of human rights in Israel : constitutional rhetoric and state practice / Assaf Meydani.

pages cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-05457-8 (hardback)

1. Human rights – Israel. 2. Human security – Israel. 3. Israel – Politics and government. I. Title.

JC599.I68.M49 2014

323.095694–dc23 2013040687

ISBN 978-1-107-05457-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
1. Introduction	1
1.1 The Structure of the Book	8
2. Institutional Theory and Social Choice Studies: Understanding the Anatomy of Human Rights	13
2.1 Human Rights Theory: Toward a Practical Positivist Approach	15
2.2 The Book's Contribution – Human Rights Organizations in the Process of Policy Making	19
2.2.1 The Relationship between the Public and Politicians	21

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)**Contents**

2.2.2	Nongovernmental Organizations as Interest Groups	23
2.2.3	The Involvement of Bureaucrats in Human Rights Policies	24
3.	Between Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice	29
4.	Structural and Cultural Variables Favoring a Short-Term Orientation	39
4.1	Nongovernability in Israel	40
4.1.1	The Government's Core Instability	44
4.1.2	The Parliamentary Supervision of the Executive Authority	48
4.1.3	The Formal and Informal Roles of the State Comptroller	53
4.1.4	The Functioning of the Legislative and Parliamentary Authorities	55
4.1.5	The Local Authority	57
4.1.6	The Defense Establishment	61
4.1.7	Summary of Nongovernability in Israel	64
4.2	Liberal Political Culture versus Nonliberal Political Culture	66
4.3	Orientation toward Outcomes versus Orientation toward Process	68

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

4.4	Effects of the Culture and Institutions on the Behavior of Individuals in a Nonliberal Polity	72
4.5	Judicialization: A Well-Known Strategy of Human Rights NGOs	77
5.	The Right to Be Free from the Threat of Torture	81
5.1	The Institutional Arena	83
5.2	Public Demand for Supervision of the GSS	85
5.3	The GSS: A Political Survivor	91
5.4	Judicialization: An Alternative Route for Human Rights Activists	97
5.5	Security Issues: Obstacles for Human Rights Activists	102
5.6	The Torture Case as a Catalyst	103
5.7	Public Policy Reform as Electoral Capital	110
5.8	Summary and Conclusions	114
6.	The Right to Equality: Gender Segregation on Orthodox Buses Following the Israeli High Court of Justice's 2011 Ruling on the "Segregated Lines"	115
6.1	"We the Orthodox Community Don't Want Any Favors from This State"	121
6.2	Nongovernmental Organizations as Interest Groups	122

Contents

6.3	The Langer Committee versus the High Court: Rhetoric or Practice	126
6.4	The Public – A Decline in the Belief in Human Rights	131
6.5	Politicians: The Motivation of Reelection	135
6.6	Summary	142
7.	The Right to Enjoy a Decent Lifestyle: The Case of the Laron Law – National Insurance Law (Amendment no. 109) of 2008 Encouraging the Disabled to Work	145
7.1	Rhetoric on Rights but Failure in Practice	148
7.2	Public Attitudes in Israel	152
7.3	Various Groups Advocating for the Disabled as an Obstacle	159
7.4	Bureaucrats and Their Influence	161
7.5	Politicians' Position as a Catalyst in Promoting Rights	167
7.6	Summary	170
8.	The Human Rights Commission in Israel That Never Was	173
8.1	“Manifesto”: A Public Appeal	177
8.2	Public Exposure: Impediment or Catalyst?	179
8.3	Civil Servants: Impediment or Catalyst?	181

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

8.4	Change of Personnel in the Ministry of Justice	183
8.5	Founding of the NGOs' Coalition	185
8.6	The Coalition's Strategy: Failure versus the Political Echelon	187
8.7	New Life for the Initiative	187
8.8	The Goal-Focusing Approach: A Success	190
9.	Property Rights: Designing the Separation Fence Policy	193
9.1	Public Opinion on the Separation Fence	204
9.2	The Bureaucrats versus an Interest Group	211
9.3	The Politicians' Position	215
9.4	Conclusion: Limitations on the Right to Private Property or the Political Limits of the High Court	219
10.	The Right to Human Dignity and Liberty: The Organ Transplant Law 5768–2008	223
10.1	“Until the Law Comes into Force the Following Procedure Is Introduced”	227
10.2	“I Am in Favor, but Leave Me Alone; I Prefer Not to Think about It”	234
10.3	“When You Want to Save Your Child, You Don't Ask Questions”	237
10.4	“Ethically Speaking, This Trade Is Similar to Slavery or Prostitution”	242

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)**Contents**

10.5	The Political Middle Road	251
10.6	Conclusions	255
11.	Policy Evaluation: Analyzing the Reality for Human Rights	257
11.1	A Conceptual Framework for the Evaluation of Public Policy	258
11.2	Analyzing the Study's Main Findings Using the Policy Evaluation Approach	263
11.3	Summary of the Study's Findings	264
	<i>Bibliography</i>	273
	<i>Index</i>	293

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

This book is a result of more than a decade of research, study, and teaching, as well as involvement in the Israeli political arena. Some of its rationales and ideas have appeared in journals such as *Israel Studies*, *POLITIKA: The Israeli Journal of Political Science*, *Israel Law Review*, *Contemporary Security Policy*, *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter intelligence*, and *Israel Affairs*. Portions of the book have also been presented at conferences held by the Law and Society Association, the American Political Science Association, the Association for Israel Studies, and the International Political Science Association. I would like to thank Gideon Doron, God rest his soul; Shlomo Mizrahi; Gad Barzilai; Arye Naor; David Nachmias; Shimon Shetreet; Daphne Barak-Erez; Maoz Rosenthal; Ronen Shamir; Ruvy Ziegler; Ofer Arian; Eran Vigoda-Gadot; Abraham Diskin;

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Dov Waxman; Nurit Hashimshoni-Yaffe; Yoram Rabin; Avishai Ehrlich; David Rueda; Menachem Hofnung; Itzhak Galnoor; Philip Robins; Moshe Maor; Aharon Barak; Amnon Rubinstein; Derek Penslar; and Mota Kremnitzer for their advice and collaboration.

I am grateful beyond measure to the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford, for its gracious hospitality during the 2012–13 academic year. I especially wish to thank Denis J. Galligan, William Twining, Marc Hertogh, David Erdos, Marina Kurkchian, Fernanda Pirie, Danlin Li, Amir Paz-Fuchs, Iris Benöhr, Lisa Vanhala, Sacha Meuter, Rogier Creemers, Iginio Gagliardone, and Nicole Stremlau for their advice and collaboration.

Special thanks to Sandra Fredman and to the Oxford Human Rights Hub, University of Oxford, for its hospitality and welcome support during my stay in Oxford.

I would also like to express my gratitude to the School of Public Policy at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem for providing a friendly and stimulating environment during my stay there between March and June 2013. Special thanks too to Momi Dahan, Sharon Gilad, Margit Cohn, David Levi-Faur, and Raanan Sulitzeanu-Kenan.

I owe a debt of gratitude to Naomi Chazan for her time and support. Thanks, too, to the Academic College of Tel Aviv–Yaffo for its generous support, and especially to Nehemia Friedland, Shlomo Biderman, and Benny Alon.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-05457-8 - The Anatomy of Human Rights in Israel: Constitutional Rhetoric
and State Practice

Assaf Meydani

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The manuscript would never have achieved its final form but for the editorial skill and dedication of Diane Romm. In addition, my sincere thanks to John Berger, my editor at Cambridge University Press, for his insightful advice and support. Finally, my thanks to the anonymous readers for their helpful remarks.