INDEX

aboriginal peoples see indigenous peoples activity test, 'insubstantial' activity, 79-80 administrative simplification see Australia advancement of education see education advancement of religion see religion advocacy as charitable activity, xi-xii, 1-2, 37-8, 45-6, 64-5, 102-3, 149-53, 186, 193, 278, 282 containment clauses in grant agreements, 361 express advocacy and issue advocacy distinguished, 77-8 see also electoral speech Andrews, William, 202-3 Aristotle theory of good, 15-16, 30-1 theory of matter, 23 art and national heritage, taxation on lifetime gifts, 272 Australia administrative simplification as reform objective, 362-3 administrative simplification progress, 378-9, 384-6 business days taken for standard processes (table), 366 commercialisation and tax reform see commercialisation compliance costs overviewed, 363-8 constitutional government, xii constitutional leverage for law reform, 37-9, 60

constitutional status of politically active charities, 44-5, 52-5 controversy over charity statute, 2-3, 178 conversion to charity status, 365 definition of charity, 91, 92, 93, 94-6, 98-9, 100-2, 103, 104, 106-7, 109, 111-12 electoral speech regulation see electoral speech form completion times (table), 376 fundraiser administration (table), 372 fundraising approval procedures, 365-7 fundraising legislation reform, 368-71 globalisation and tax reform see globalisation grant application simplification, 371-9 implied freedom of political communication, 40-2 implied freedoms and political objects doctrine in tension, 42 'in Australia' tax measures, 247-8 indigenous Australians see indigenous peoples law reform process, 135-6 limitation of public benefit head, 46-7, 56-7 political objects doctrine, 40 political parties as charities, 45-6, 52-6 proportionate regulation, 379-84 public benefit concept, 44, 52

387

388

INDEX

Australia (cont.) qualification for tax-exempt status, 64 - 5reform objectives, 359-63 reform process overviewed, 358-9 registration procedures, 368 small associations reform issues, 381 - 4start up costs for charities, 363-8 start up procedures, 367-8 tax complexity, 286-9 tax concession abuse, 289-90 tax concession applications, 367 tax concessions, 48, 57-60 tax policy consistency, 284-6 tax reform approaches, 292-3 tax reform assessed, 293-4 tax reform background, 276-8 tax reform opportunities, 290-2 tax reform problem areas, 284 tax reform proposals, 199-200 theoretical framework for tax policy development, 278-84 US not-for-profit sector compared, 63-9 Barbados, definition of charity, 190 behavioural responses to regulation, 324-9 Bittker, Boris, 202-3, 205-6 Bromley, E Blake, 202-3 Brooks, Neil, 205-6 budgeting, need for comparative analysis, 22 Canada advocacy, 1-2 background to charity tax regime, 199–200 capital gains exemptions on property gifts, 223-6 definition of charity, 183-4, 185, 189, 190, 194 donation by income 1987-1988 (table), 222 donation by income 1989-1996 (table), 223

donation by income 2001-2008 (table), 227 donation frequency 1989-1996 (table), 223 effect of tax reforms, 229 'First-time Donor's Super Credit' proposal, 230-1 increase in income ceilings for property gifts, 226 share of donations and credits by income (table), 228 tax concessions as incentive or reward, 207 tax concessions reform, 218 tax concessions reform approach summarised, 229-31 tax considerations in definition of charity, 115, 116-17, 120, 126 - 7tax credit rates (table), 221 tax credit reform, 218-23 tax reform proposals, 199-200 tax statistics (table), 229 capital gains see taxation charitable trusts see trust law Charities Acts 2006 and 2011 (UK) author's analytical approach, 137-9 background and context, 134-6 campaigning and political activity, 149-53 ex ante approach, 316-19 ex ante strategies critiqued, 319-23 further reform prospects, 157-8 implications for Charity Commission, 154-5 implications for Charity Tribunal, 155 - 7independent schools, 139-43 main features, 136-7 regulatory framework, 314-15 religious organisations, 143-9 think tanks claiming to be educational, 153 charity brand power of, 182 definition of see definition of charity

INDEX

giving see taxation historical significance of, 181-2 illegal see illegality importance and value of, 179-82 philosophy of see philosophical perspectives purposes of, 186-8 as theme of study, 5-6 see also philanthropy Charity Commission for England and Wales clarification of mandate, 329-34 definition of religion, 144 future of, 154-5 guidance on campaigning and political activity, 149-53 mandate, 314-15 reform of, 2-3 relationship with Charity Tribunal, 348-50 charity law reform constitutional leverage for, 37-9, 60 experience of, 9-11 global trend, 1-2 see also regulation; specific countries charity sector analytical perspective, 22 distinctiveness see distinctiveness; philosophical perspectives need for comparative analysis, 19-20 relationships with regulators, 348-50 resource allocation, 309-10 social organisational model, 23-4 trustworthiness, 302-9 utilities regulation in relation, 324-9 wider civil society in relation, 312-13 Charity Tribunal for England and Wales achievement of objectives, 341-5 author's analytical approach, 336 future of, 155-7 High Court proceedings contrasted, 351-3 overview of, 336-40

referrals to, 348 reform of, 353-7 registration applications heard by, 347-8 regulatory issues heard by, 347 relationships with Charity Commission and charity sector, 348 - 50statutory inquiries heard by, 346-7 workload, 345-8 Christian perspectives, 20 civil society sector see charity sector; not-for-profit sector; philanthropy classical philosophy see philosophical perspectives Colinvaux, Roger, 200, 203, 204-5 Colombo, John, 207–8 commercial law, regulatory emphasis on, xi commercialisation activities compatible with charity, 235 - 8author's analytical approach, 233-4 growth of, 234-5 tax reform proposals, 233-4 taxation of unrelated commercial activities, 238-43 compliance simplification see Australia Compton-Oppenheim test, 97-8 'conception of the good', 15-16 concessions see taxation

389

- constitutional law and governmental process, xii
 - implied freedom of political communication, 40–2 implied freedoms and political objects doctrine in tension, 42 leverage for law reform, 37–9, 60

not-for-profit sector in relation, 7–8 see also electoral speech contributions see taxation corporate corruption and electoral speech, 78–9

corporate electoral speech in US, 74–7 cy-près doctrine, threshold test for operation, 21–2

reasons for creation of, 340–1

390

INDEX

definition of charity author's analytical approach, 7, 115, 297-8 balancing of public benefit and private enjoyment, 99-100 balancing of public benefit and private profit, 98–9 'benefit' element, 103 Charities Act 2013 (Australia), 194 - 6coherence as aim, 133 constraints on expansion, 97-107 consultation as to, 191-2 difficulties as to, 113-15 education in relation, 92-4 English and Australian compared, 179-82, 186 English case law, 88-90 English development, 182-4, 185, 186-8, 189-90 expansion of legal definition, 90 expansionary influences summarised, 110-12 fiscal considerations as determinant, 115-23 fiscal considerations as distortion, 123-32 fiscal influences for expansion, 109-10 future of, 196 generally, xi-xii, 64 government distinguished, 100-2 governmental influences for expansion, 108-9 heads of charity, 90-7 history of reform, 182-90 'ideal conception', 115 importance of, 179-82 influences for expansion, 107-10 introduction of, 159-60, 165, 179 jurisprudential difficulties, 113-15 mortmain legislation, 124-6 need for reform, 185-6 no presumption of benefit, 105-6 politics distinguished, 102-3 precedential influences for expansion, 107-8 presumption of benefit, 103-5

public benefit, question of role, 106 - 7'public' element, 97-8 public submissions as to, 193-4 purposes of charity, 186-8 reform proposals, 188–90 religion in relation, 94-5 scope of charity, 186-8 social and economic change in relation, 8 Statute of Charitable Uses 1601 ('preamble'), 87-8 Delany, V T H, 140 disclosures under electoral system regulation, 71 - 4under tax regulations, 69-71 distinctiveness charity brand power, 182 'ideal conception' of charity, 115 importance and value of charity, 179-82 question of, 6-7 tax treatment in relation see taxation see also definition of charity; philosophical perspectives distributive effects of taxation public benefit test, 7 questions as to, 4-5 donations see taxation economic and social change,

not-for-profit sector in relation, 8_9 education expansion of legal definition of charity, 92-4 think tanks claiming to be educational, 153 electoral speech Australian constitutional protection, 62 author's analytical approach, 62-3 corporate corruption and, 78-9 corporate speech, 74-7 disclosure effectiveness, 81-4 disclosures under electoral system regulation, 71-4

INDEX

391

disclosures under tax regulations, 69-71 express advocacy and issue advocacy distinguished, 77-8 key US cases, 74-7 national charitable sectors compared (Australia/US), 63-9 organisational speech, 74-7 organisations prohibited from overt political activities, 64-6 political organisations, 69 regulatory imprecision as to, 79-80 regulatory inconsistency between multiple agencies, 80-1 social welfare charities, 66-9 US constitutional guarantee, 61 England and Wales 'charity' defined see definition of charity charity law reform, 1-2 see also Charities Acts 2006 and 2011 Charity Tribunal see Charity Tribunal for England and Wales impact of new regulatory framework, 335 mortmain legislation, 124-6 political objects doctrine, 40 proceedings in High Court and Tribunal contrasted, 351-3 regulation see Charities Acts 2006 and 2011; Charity Commission for England and Wales; regulation Statute of Charitable Uses 1601 ('preamble'), 87-8 taxation see taxation trust law see trust law European Union, transnational charitable taxation, 249-51 express advocacy and issue advocacy distinguished, 77-8 family benefit and public benefit test, 159, 164-5 financial management, need for

First Nations see indigenous peoples fiscal state, commercialisation and globalisation in relation, 232-4 Fraser, Nancy, 'Keynesian-Westphalian frame', 232-3, 252-3 functional model of philanthropy advantages of, 28-9 classical normative approach compared, 30, 35-6 limitations of, 23, 24 neo-classical synthesis, 33-5 normative assumptions of, 28-33 overview of, 23-33 fundraising regulation see Australia Gift Aid see United Kingdom gifts to the nation, taxation on lifetime gifts, 272 giving to charity see taxation globalisation author's analytical approach, 233-4 challenge of, 252-3 charitable activity abroad, 245-6 donations for activities abroad, 246-7 growth of, 243-5 international aid, relief and development charities, 252 national tax approaches, 248-52 offshore tax avoidance measures, 247 - 8tax reform proposals, 233-4 'good thing', definition of, 15–16, 30 Goode, Richard, 205-6 government charity distinguished, 100-2 definition of charity, 108-9 governmental process and constitutional law, xii Greek philosophy see philosophical perspectives Haig, Robert, 201 heads of charity, definition of charity, 90-7 High Court and Tribunal proceedings contrasted, 351-3

Hochman, Harold, 214

comparative analysis, 22

392

INDEX

Hong Kong, charity law reform, 1–2 household sector as organisational type, 23 in standard functional model of philanthropy, 24–5 human rights law, religious organisations, 144–5 illegality, doctrine of, 180 incentives *see* taxation

income tax see taxation indigenous peoples charity law reform, 176-7 charity law reform assessed, 177-8 family-based structure as barrier to charity establishment, 159 public benefit test's effect on, 163-4 see also Maori people inheritance tax see taxation internationalisation see globalisation Ireland charity law reform, 1-2 charity legislation, 134-5 definition of charity, 183-4, 190 Islamic perspectives, 20 issue advocacy and express advocacy distinguished, 77-8

Jewish perspectives, 20

'Keynesian-Westphalian frame', 232–3, 252–3 Kingdon, John, 278–82

landholding and public benefit test, 169–72 law reform *see* charity law reform legal literature and research, scope of, 3 lifetime gifts *see* taxation Locke, John, theory of the state, 25–8 Luxton, Peter, 137–8, 143, 146, 155, 156–7 Maori people charity law reform, 159–60 charity law reform assessed, 177–8 family-based structure as barrier to

charity establishment, 164–5

landholding and public benefit test, 169-72 public benefit test, 166-7 public benefit test reform, 172-4 McDaniel, Paul, 206, 207 mortmain legislation and definition of charity, 124-6 multiple agencies, regulatory inconsistency between, 80-1 Muslim perspectives, 20 national heritage, taxation on lifetime gifts, 272 neo-classical philosophy see philosophical perspectives New Zealand advocacy, 1-2 Charities Commission decisions on public benefit test, 174-6 charity law reform, 1-3 definition of charity, 96, 98, 106-7, 165, 183-4, 189, 190 income tax exemption, 165-7 indigenous peoples see indigenous peoples public benefit test judicially critiqued, 167-9 public benefit test reform, 172-4 see also Maori people Northern Ireland charity law reform, 1-2 charity legislation, 134-5 definition of charity, 190 not-for-profit sector comparative approach to study, 5 constitutional law in relation, 7-8 content of essays summarised, 5 - 11definition of, 1-2 definitional issues, 3-4 distinctiveness of see distinctiveness evaluation of reforms, xii legal literature and research, 3 lessons from law reform, 8-9 national sectors compared (Australia/US), 63-9 public policy in relation, xi-xii questions as to, 6-11 regulatory emphasis on, xi-xii, 1-2

INDEX

393

scope of study, xii social and economic change in relation, 8-9 taxation see taxation thematic approach to study, 5-6 O'Connell, Ann, 58-9 offshore taxation see taxation organisations social theory of, 23-4 types of, 23 other charitable purposes, expansion of legal definition of charity, 95-7 overseas activities see globalisation performance measurement, comparative analysis, 18-23 philanthropy analytical perspective, 22 author's analytical approach, 18 definition, 22-3 effect of tax reforms, 270-1 functional model see functional model of philanthropy goodness defined, 15-16, 30 individualist nature of giving, 213-14 insufficiency, 309-10 need for comparative analysis of, 19 - 20need for unified theory of, 16 paradoxes in standard theory of, 17 - 18particularism, 309-10 performance measurement, 18-23 philosophical perspectives see philosophical perspectives religious perspectives, 20 standard functional model, 25-8 ubiquity of, 19 philosophical perspectives Aristotle see Aristotle classical and functional normative assumptions compared, 30, 35-6 functionalism see functional model of philanthropy 'good thing', definition of, 15-16, 30 'ideal conception' of charity, 115

Locke's theory of the state, 25-8 neo-classical synthesis, 33–5 theory of matter, 23 see also religious perspectives Plato, theory of the good, 30-1 political objects doctrine implied constitutional freedoms in tension, 42 legal background, 40 overview of, 40 political organisations, tax-exempt status, 69 political speech see electoral speech politics advocacy see advocacy charity distinguished, 102-3 and charity law reform, 9-11 guidance on campaigning and political activity, 149-53 'inappropriate' political activities, 65-6 organisations prohibited from overt political activities, 64-6 as theme of study, 5-6 think tanks claiming to be educational, 153 see also Charities Acts 2006 and 2011; electoral speech; philosophical perspectives precedential influences on definition of charity, 107-8 presumption of benefit, definition of charity, 103-5 private enjoyment, public benefit in relation, 99-100 private profit, public benefit in relation, 98–9 property tax see taxation public benefit balancing with and private enjoyment, 99-100 balancing with private profit, 98-9 'benefit' element, 103 Compton-Oppenheim test, 97-8 concept, 44, 52, 152 illegality doctrine, 180 indigenous peoples see indigenous peoples; Maori people

394

INDEX

public benefit (cont.) judicial critique of test, 167-9 limitation of public benefit head, 46-7, 56-7 no presumption of benefit, 105-6 operation of test, 160-3 presumption of benefit, 103-5 'public' element, 97-8 role questioned, 106-7 social and economic change in relation, 9 test requirement, 180 public policy, not-for-profit sector in relation, xi-xii purpose test 'dominant' purpose, 79-80 requirements of, 168-9, 170-1, 180 red tape reduction see Australia reform see charity law reform regulation adverse behavioural responses, 324-9 author's analytical approach, 7, 297-8, 314-15 coupling of competing regulatory goals, 312-13 of electoral speech see electoral speech ex ante and ex post approaches, 315-16 inconsistency between multiple agencies, 80-1 promotion of trust, 302-9 reasons for, 301 regulatory imprecision, 79-80 resource allocation, 309-10 as theme of study, 5-6 see also Charities Acts 2006 and 2011; Charity Commission for England and Wales; definition of charity; specific countries regulators importance of clear mandate, 329-31 relationships with charity sector,

see also Charity Commission for England and Wales relief of poverty, expansion of legal definition of charity, 90-2 religion Charity Commission definition, 144 expansion of legal definition of charity, 94-5 human rights law, 144-5 perspectives on philanthropy, 20 see also philosophical perspectives religious organisations and charity law reform, 143-9 resource allocation to charity sector, 309-10 Rodgers, James, 214 schools see education Scotland charity law reform, 1-2 definition of charity, 183-4, 190 Simons, Henry, 201-2 Singapore, definition of charity, 98 social and economic change author's analytical approach, 232-4 commercialisation see commercialisation definition of charity see definition of charity globalisation see globalisation not-for-profit sector in relation, 8-9 taxation in relation see taxation social theory of organisations, 23-4 social welfare charities' tax-exempt status, 66-9 South Africa, definition of charity, 183-4, 190 'specialness' of charity see distinctiveness Statute of Charitable Uses 1601 ('preamble'), definition of charity, 87-8 statutory definition see definition of charity Surrey, Stanley, tax expenditures concept, 205

348-50

INDEX

395

taxation author's analytical approach, 200 cap on relief see United Kingdom capital gains exemptions on property gifts, 223-6 categories of tax-exempt not-for-profit organisations, 63-9 commercialisation and tax reform see commercialisation concessions as incentive or reward, 205 - 8concessions as indirect subsidy to charities, 208-18 concessions as state subsidy, 48, 204 - 5cost-effectiveness of incentives, 210-13 deductibility of contributions, 20-1, 63-9 definition of charity see definition of charity design of policy, 200 disclosures, 69-71 distributive effects see distributive effects of taxation donations for activities abroad, 246 - 7'First-time Donor's Super Credit' proposal, 230-1 fiscal state, commercialisation and globalisation in relation, 232-4 form of incentives, 214-18 Gift Aid see United Kingdom globalisation and tax reform see globalisation income tax exemption, 21, 57-60 increase in income ceilings for property gifts, 226 indigenous peoples see indigenous peoples; Maori people individualist nature of charitable giving, 213-14 inheritance tax on legacies, 271-2 international aid, relief and development charities, 252 'Keynesian-Westphalian frame', 232-3, 252-3

lifetime gifts of national heritage items, 272 lifetime legacies, 272-3 measurement of tax base, 201-4 mortmain legislation, 124-6 national 'frame' of analysis, 232-3 not-for-profit sector generally, 4-5 offshore avoidance measures, 247-8 political organisations, 69 qualification for tax-exempt status, 64-5, 180-1 rationales for indirect subsidies, 210 rationales for tax concessions, 200, 205, 208-10 recognition of charity distinctiveness, 7 reform and policy design see Australia reform proposals, 199-200 social and economic change in relation, 9-10, 232-4 tax expenditures concept, 205 as theme of study, 5-6 see also specific countries territoriality and globalisation see globalisation think tanks claiming to be educational, 153 Thirsk, Wayne, 214 trade and commerce see commercial law tribunal see Charity Tribunal for England and Wales trust law cy-près doctrine, 21–2 quantitative test for charities, 21-2 threshold for altering charitable purposes, 21-2 trustworthiness of charity sector, 302-9 United Kingdom approach to reform overviewed, 273 - 5background to 'Big Society' agenda, 254 - 6cap on Gift Aid relief compliance issues for charities, 271

396

INDEX

United Kingdom (cont.) effect on giving, 270-1 issues as to, 267 proposal, 263-7 rich charities, 269–70 rich donors, 267-9 charity law reform, 1–2 see also Charities Acts 2006 and 2011 charity redefined, 256-8 Gift Aid changes background, 258-9 inconsistent approach, 258 small donations, 259-61 substantial donations, 261-3 inheritance tax on legacies, 271-2 lifetime gifts of national heritage items, 272 lifetime legacies, 272-3 see also England and Wales; Northern Ireland; Scotland United States advocacy, 1-2 Australian not-for-profit sector compared, 63-9, 84 categories of not-for-profit organisations, 63 comparative measures of charitability, 20-1 corporate corruption and electoral speech, 78-9 corporate electoral speech, 74-7 definition of charity, 96 disclosure effectiveness, 81-4 disclosures under Federal Election Campaign Act, 71-4

disclosures under Internal Revenue Code, 69–71 electoral speech regulation see electoral speech express advocacy and issue advocacy distinguished, 77-8 'inappropriate' political activities, 65-6 key cases on electoral speech, 74-84 organisational electoral speech, 74 - 7organisations prohibited from overt political activities, 64-6 political organisations' tax exemption, 69 qualification for tax-exempt status, 64-5 regulatory imprecision as to electoral speech, 79-80 regulatory inconsistency between multiple agencies, 80-1 social welfare charities, 66-9 tax concessions as incentive or reward, 205-6, 207 tax deductibility of contributions, 20-1,66 tax expenditures concept, 205 tax reform proposals, 199-200 transnational charitable taxation, 249 utilities regulation, adverse behavioural responses, 324-9

works of art, taxation on lifetime gifts, 272