

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Inferences during Reading

*Inferencing* is defined as “the act of deriving logical conclusions from premises known or assumed to be true,” and it is one of the most important processes necessary for successful comprehension during reading. This volume features contributions by distinguished researchers in cognitive psychology, educational psychology, and neuroscience on topics central to our understanding of the inferential process during reading. The chapters cover aspects of inferencing that range from the fundamental bottom-up processes that form the basis for an inference to occur, to the more strategic processes that transpire when a reader is engaged in literary understanding of a text. Basic activation mechanisms, word-level inferencing, methodological considerations, inference validation, causal inferencing, emotion, development of inferences processes as a skill, embodiment, contributions from neuroscience, and applications to naturalistic text are all covered as well as expository text and online learning materials, and literary immersion.

EDWARD J. O'BRIEN is Professor of Psychology at the University of New Hampshire.

ANNE E. COOK is Professor of Educational Psychology at the University of Utah.

ROBERT F. LORCH, JR., is Professor of Psychology at the University of Kentucky.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# Inferences during Reading

---

*Edited by*

**Edward J. O'Brien**

*University of New Hampshire*

**Anne E. Cook**

*University of Utah*

**Robert F. Lorch, Jr.**

*University of Kentucky*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading  
 Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107049796](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107049796)

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

O'Brien, Edward J.

Inferences during reading / Edward J. O'Brien, University of New Hampshire, Anne E. Cook, University of Utah, Robert F. Lorch, Jr., University of Kentucky. – First Edition.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04979-6 (Hardback)

1. Inference. 2. Cognitive psychology. I. Cook, Anne E. II. Lorch, Robert F. III. Title.

BF442.O27 2015

418'.4019–dc23 2014044901

ISBN 978-1-107-04979-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of tables</i>	x
<i>List of boxes</i>	xi
<i>List of contributors</i>	xii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
EDWARD J. O’BRIEN, ANNE E. COOK, AND ROBERT F. LORCH, JR.	
1 Comprehending implicit meanings in text without making inferences	1
CHARLES A. PERFETTI AND JOSEPH Z. STAFURA	
2 Passive activation and instantiation of inferences during reading	19
ANNE E. COOK AND EDWARD J. O’BRIEN	
3 Cognitive theories in discourse-processing research	42
GAIL MCKOON AND ROGER RATCLIFF	
4 Validation of text and discourse inferences – and explicit content	68
MURRAY SINGER	
5 Inference generation in text comprehension: automatic and strategic processes in the construction of a mental representation	94
PAUL VAN DEN BROEK, KATINKA BEKER, AND MARJA OUDEGA	
6 Emotion inferences during reading: going beyond the tip of the iceberg	122
PASCAL GYGAX AND CHRISTELLE GILLIOZ	
7 Inference processing in children: the contributions of depth and breadth of vocabulary knowledge	140
JANE OAKHILL, KATE CAIN, AND DIANA MCCARTHY	
8 A general inference skill	160
PANAYIOTA KENDEOU	
	v

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading  
 Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

vi	Contents	
9	Toward an embodied approach to inferences in comprehension: the case of action language MANUEL DE VEGA	182
10	The cognitive and neural correlates of individual differences in inferential processes CHANTEL S. PRAT AND BRIANNA L. YAMASAKI	210
11	Inferences during text comprehension: what neuroscience can (or cannot) contribute EVELYN C. FERSTL	230
12	Causal inferences and world knowledge LEO NOORDMAN, WIETSKE VONK, REINIER COZIJN, AND STEFAN FRANK	260
13	Constructing inferences in naturalistic reading contexts ARTHUR C. GRAESSER, HAIYING LI, AND SHI FENG	290
14	Inference generation during online study and multimedia learning KIRSTEN R. BUTCHER AND SARAH DAVIES	321
15	What about expository text? ROBERT F. LORCH, JR.	348
16	The role of inferences in narrative experiences RICHARD J. GERRIG AND WILLIAM G. WENZEL	362
17	Interpretive inferences in literature SUSAN R. GOLDMAN, KATHRYN S. MCCARTHY, AND CANDICE BURKETT	386
	<i>Index</i>	416

# Figures

1.1 A hierarchical instrinsicalist view of explicit and implicit meaning.	page 2
1.2 Average amplitude over parietal electrodes following onset of critical word.	12
1.3 The mirrored pyramid view of text meaning processes.	15
4.1 Schematic depiction of the validation of anaphoric resolution.	70
4.2 Schematic depiction of validating a causal bridging inference.	74
5.1 The causal inference maker. Adapted from van den Broek, 1994.	105
7.1 Prediction of the two inference types.	147
7.2 Synonym and hypernym tasks as predictors of reading comprehension skill.	154
7.3 Theme words as predictors of reading comprehension.	155
9.1 Mean latencies of motor responses and semantic choices. Source: de Vega et al., 2014.	192
9.2 Activation changes as a function of task. Source: de Vega et al., 2013.	197
9.3 Scalp distribution of the mu oscillatory rhythms. Source: I. Moreno, M. de Vega, and I. León, "Understanding action language modulates oscillatory mu and beta rhythms in the same way as observing actions," <i>Brain and Cognition</i> , 82(3), 236–42. Copyright 2013, with permission from Elsevier.	200
9.4 Changes in the N400 component of ERP as a function of action compatibility. Source: E. J. Santana and M. de Vega, "An ERP study of motor compatibility effects in action language," <i>Brain Research</i> , 1526, 71–83. Copyright 2013, with permission from Elsevier.	202
10.1 Relationship between vocabulary size and right hemispheric activation. Source: C. S. Prat, R. A. Mason, and M. A. Just, "Individual differences in the neural basis of causal	

viii List of Figures

	inferencing,” <i>Brain and Language</i> , 116(1), 1–13. Copyright 2011, with permission from Elsevier.	219
10.2	Relation between average syntactic adaptability and individual working memory capacity. Source: C. S. Prat and M. A. Just, “Exploring the neural dynamics underpinning individual differences in sentence comprehension,” <i>Cerebral Cortex</i> , 2011, 21(8), by permission of Oxford University Press.	223
11.1	A left lateral view of the Talairach standard stereotaxic brain.	231
11.2	A right medial view of the Talairach standard stereotaxic brain.	232
11.3	Recalled idea units in a replication of the Anderson and Pichert paradigm. Source: E. C. Ferstl, T. Guthke, and D. Y. von Cramon, “Change of perspective in discourse comprehension: encoding and retrieval processes after brain injury,” <i>Brain and Language</i> , 70(3), 385–420. Copyright 1999, with permission from Elsevier.	235
11.4	The results of the coherence judgment task. Source: E. C. Ferstl and D. Y. von Cramon, “What does the frontomedian cortex contribute to language processing: coherence or theory of mind?” <i>NeuroImage</i> , 17(3), 1599–1612. Copyright 2002, with permission from Elsevier.	239
11.5	The extended language network. Source: Ferstl and von Cramon, 2002.	241
12.1	Example of a visual stimulus in the visual world paradigm experiment. Source: Reinier Cozijn, Edwin Commandeur, Wietske Vonk, and Leo Noordman (2011). “The time course of the use of implicit causality information in the processing of pronouns: a visual world paradigm study,” <i>Journal of Memory and Language</i> , 64(4), 381–403 with permission from Elsevier.	268
12.2	Knowledge representation of nonexperts. Source: L. G. M. Noordman, W. Vonk, and W. H. G. Simons (2000). “Knowledge representation in the domain of economics” in L. Lundquist and R. J. Jarvella (eds.), <i>Language, Text, and Knowledge: Mental Models of Expert Communication</i> (pp. 235–60), with permission from Mouton de Gruyter.	273
12.3	Knowledge representation of experts. Source: L. G. M. Noordman, W. Vonk, and W. H. G. Simons (2000), “Knowledge representation in the domain of economics,”	



Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading  
Edited by Edward J. O’Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

List of Figures ix

in L. Lundquist and R. J. Jarvella (eds.), <i>Language, Text, and Knowledge: Mental Models of Expert Communication</i> (pp. 235–60), with permission from Mouton de Gruyter.	274
17.1 Percentage of participants who made interpretive statements.	405
17.2 Percentage of participants identifying indicated concepts as symbols.	405

Tables

---

1.1	Passages showing manipulation of lexical association in the paraphrase effect (from Stafura and Perfetti, unpublished)	<i>page 11</i>
4.1	Mean target reading times and experimental question and answer times (in milliseconds [ms]) of Singer, Harkness, and Stewart (1997, Experiment 4) as a function of relation (explicit, implicit)	78
5.1	Causally relevant inferences	101
10.1	Sample stimuli used in Prat, Mason, and Just (2011)	218
11.1	Example materials for the four conditions of the experiment.	237
12.1	Mean reading and verification times (ms) in the causal relation experiments (the codes in the first column are for textual reference)	264
12.2	Mean reading and verification times (ms) in the <i>because</i> experiments (the codes in the first column are for textual reference)	270
12.3	Mean reading and verification times (ms) in the expert–nonexpert experiments (the codes in the first column are for textual reference)	276
13.1	Inference classes and their status of being generated during comprehension according to the constructionist model of Graesser, Singer, and Trabasso (1994)	297
13.2	Example Coh-Metrix measures and indices	304
16.1	Taxonomy of participatory responses (Bezdek, Foy, and Gerrig, 2013)	365
17.1	Four essay-writing instructions used in Harrison Bergeron study	399
17.2.	Length and composition of essays produced in the four task instruction conditions for Harrison Bergeron	400
17.3	Examples of responses classified as thematic or global interpretive inferences	404
17.4	Percentages of interpretive inferences for “The Butterfly” and “Eleven”	406

## Boxes

---

2.1 Example from O'Brien and Albrecht (1991)	22
2.2 Example from O'Brien, Shank, Myers, and Rayner (1988)	26
2.3 Example from Cook et al. (2001)	30
2.4 Example from Peracchi and O'Brien (2004) and Guéraud, Tapiero, and O'Brien (2008)	31
4.1 Sample materials for comparing causal consistent, causal inconsistent, and temporal-control conditions (Singer, 1993)	73
6.1 Example of an experimental narrative used in Gygax et al. (2007)	127
6.2 Example of an extended narrative used in Gygax et al. (2004)	128
6.3 Example of an ambiguous narrative used in Gygax et al. (2004) focused on the emotion of sad. In the ambiguous version, the ambiguous part is in italics	129
6.4 Example of an emotional narrative used in Gillioz and Gygax (2013) in two saliency conditions. The optimal condition has all components of emotion experiences and the moderate version has only three components (in italics are the filler sentences replacing the two removed component sentences)	133
9.1 Examples of materials from the action compatibility effect experiments by de Vega et al. (2013)	191
17.1 The Dog and the Shadow	390
17.2 Representative essays for each condition	401

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contributors

---

KATINKA BEKER Brain and Education Laboratory, Leiden University

CANDICE BURKETT Learning Sciences Research Institute, University  
of Illinois – Chicago

KIRSTEN R. BUTCHER Department of Educational Psychology, University  
of Utah

KATE CAIN Department of Psychology, Lancaster University

ANNE E. COOK Department of Educational Psychology, University  
of Utah

REINIER COZIYN Tilberg Center for Communication and Cognition,  
Tilburg University

SARAH DAVIES Department of Educational Psychology, University  
of Utah

MANUEL DE VEGA Department of Psychology, University of La Laguna

SHI FENG Department of Psychology, University of Memphis

EVELYN C. FERSTL IIG/Cognitive Science, University of Freiburg

STEFAN FRANK Centre for Language Studies, Radboud University  
Nijmegen

RICHARD J. GERRIG Department of Psychology, State University of  
New York – Stony Brook

CHRISTELLE GILLIOZ Department of Psychology, University of  
California – San Diego

SUSAN R. GOLDMAN Department of Psychology, University of Illinois –  
Chicago

ARTHUR C. GRAESSER Department of Psychology, University of  
Memphis

xii

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Contributors

xiii

PASCAL GYGAX Department of Psychology, University of Fribourg

PANAYIOTA KENDEOU Department of Educational Psychology,  
University of Minnesota

HAIYING LI Department of Psychology, University of Memphis

ROBERT F. LORCH, JR. Department of Psychology, University of  
Kentucky

DIANA MCCARTHY Department of Theoretical and Applied Linguistics,  
University of Cambridge

KATHRYN S. MCCARTHY Department of Psychology, University of  
Illinois – Chicago

GAIL MCKOON Department of Psychology, The Ohio State University

LEO NOORDMAN Tilberg Center for Communication and Cognition,  
Tilburg University

JANE OAKHILL School of Psychology, University of Sussex

EDWARD J. O'BRIEN Department of Psychology, University of  
New Hampshire

MARJA OUDEGA Brain and Education Laboratory, Leiden University

CHARLES A. PERFETTI Learning Research and Development Center,  
University of Pittsburgh

CHANTEL S. PRAT Institute for Learning and Brain Sciences, University  
of Washington

ROGER RATCLIFF Department of Psychology, The Ohio State  
University

MURRAY SINGER Department of Psychology, University of Manitoba

JOSEPH Z. STAFURA Learning Research and Development Center,  
University of Pittsburgh

PAUL VAN DEN BROEK Department of Educational Studies, Leiden  
University

WIETSKE VONK Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics and Centre  
for Language Studies, Radboud University Nijmegen

WILLIAM G. WENZEL Department of Psychology, State University of  
New York – Stony Brook

BRIANNA L. YAMASAKI Department of Psychology, University of  
Washington

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Preface

---

Research in the area of reading comprehension has made enormous progress during the last thirty or more years. There are numerous books, research articles, and journals devoted solely to work done on increasing our understanding of the comprehension process. Because reading comprehension is so complex, even today, there are no models of the complete process; instead, models are designed to address various subcomponents of the complete comprehension process. Perhaps one of the most important processes necessary for successful comprehension during reading is that of inferencing. Over the last twenty-five years, research on inference generation during reading has advanced to the point that it has become a relatively “mature” area. We know a great deal about this critical comprehension process. In fact, across disciplines (e.g., education, psychology) and perspectives, there has been a good deal of convergence in terms of theoretical accounts and understanding of both the reader and text characteristics that promote the types of inferential processes that facilitate comprehension. Despite this high level of convergence, there is no centralized resource that captures it. Our goal was to bring together a set of chapters that capture this convergence while also providing a unified resource for interested readers who want to learn about the current state of the field’s understanding of the inference process. The present book contains chapters by many distinguished researchers on topics central to our understanding of the inferential process during reading. These chapters cover aspects of inferencing that range from the fundamental bottom-up processes that form the basis for an inference to occur to the more strategic processes that occur when a reader is engaged in literary understanding of a text. Within this range, a wide variety of topics are covered that include basic activation mechanisms, word-level inferencing, methodological considerations, inference validation, causal inferencing, emotion, development of inference processes as a skill, embodiment, contributions from neuroscience, as well as applications to naturalistic, expository text, online learning materials, and literary immersion. We have used this progression from lower-level

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04979-6 - Inferences during Reading

Edited by Edward J. O'Brien, Anne E. Cook and Robert F. Lorch

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi Preface

to higher-level processing as the organizing framework for the sequence of chapters in the volume.

The topics in this volume are grounded in research that comes from a wide variety of perspectives, including basic cognitive psychology, applied educational psychology, and neuroscience. This interdisciplinary coverage is apparent throughout the volume; many chapters touched on different levels or topics in inferencing; and many topics were covered by chapters from a variety of different perspectives. Within this interdisciplinary mingle two fundamental principles emerged. First, there are some basic cognitive mechanisms (i.e., passive memory activation) that drive inference generation, regardless of whether the inference occurs at a very basic word level or at a higher level of literary interpretation. Second, when inferences are encoded, the exact nature of what is encoded affects ultimate comprehension, memory, and learning. This is true regardless of whether the inference occurs during reading of narrative text, expository text, or during the encoding of multimedia materials for academic purposes.

Challenges and directions for future work also emerge from this volume. It is clear that a better understanding of the active, strategic processes involved in the production of inferences is needed, such as those that include literary interpretation, or integrating content across several texts. Much of the research and theory presented in these chapters stopped short of providing any serious model of inference production that can explain and/or predict active, strategic processes on the part of the reader. It is clear that the next major step – and likely the most difficult step – in our understanding of the inference process will occur with the development of testable models of active inference production. Such a model would surely deepen our understanding of the inference process, as well as define where current models of inferencing succeed in explaining research findings, and, more important, where they fail.

We are indebted to the contributors to this volume for their efforts in writing chapters that captured the current state of research into inference processing. Each chapter contributes to this understanding in ways that are unique to each author's line of work, but also overlapping with other authors to the extent that the field has indeed begun to converge on a high level of understanding of the inference process. The chapters are ordered – roughly – in terms of the issues addressed, beginning with those that address the more bottom-up aspects of the inference process to those that address the interaction of both bottom-up and top-down processes, and finally to those chapters that raise the most interesting and still least understood aspects of inferencing during reading.

Edward J. O'Brien  
Anne E. Cook  
Robert F. Lorch