TRANSITIONAL AND RETROSPECTIVE JUSTICE IN THE BALTIC STATES

More than twenty years after the fall of Communism, many countries in Central and Eastern Europe are still seeking truth and justice for the repression suffered under communist rule. This search has been particularly notable in the Baltic states, given the three countries' histories as both former Soviet republics and later member states of the European Union. On the one hand, the legacy of Stalinist oppression was more severe in these countries than elsewhere in Central Europe, but on the other hand much of this past could more easily be externalized onto the former Soviet Union (and by extension Russia) following re-independence.

Transitional and Retrospective Justice in the Baltic States develops a novel conceptual framework in order to understand the politics involved with transitional and retrospective justice, and then applies this outline to the Baltic states to analyze more systematic patterns of truth- and justiceseeking in the post-communist world.

EVA-CLARITA PETTAI is Senior Researcher at the Institute of Government and Politics, University of Tartu, Estonia.

VELLO PETTAI is Professor of Comparative Politics and Director of the Institute of Government and Politics, University of Tartu, Estonia.

TRANSITIONAL AND RETROSPECTIVE JUSTICE IN THE BALTIC STATES

EVA-CLARITA PETTAI and VELLO PETTAI







University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107049499

© Eva-Clarita Pettai and Vello Pettai 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-04949-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Amma and Raul

CONTENTS

List of figures and tables page viii Acknowledgments ix List of abbreviations xii

1

Introduction

- 1 Post-communist transitional justice: framing the subject 14
- 2 Comparable or incomparable: placing the Baltic states in context 43
- 3 Punishing the perpetrators: criminal investigations and trials 65
- 4 Truth or punishment: purges, bargains and exposure of wrongdoing 115
- 5 Righting past wrong: rehabilitation, compensation and restitution for victims 168
- 6 Official recognition of victims: non-judicial truth-seeking and commemoration 215
- 7 External reverberations: the international dimension of Baltic truth and justice 271

Conclusion 312

References339Interviews and communications370Index371

FIGURES AND TABLES

Figures

1.1	Grodsky's "Justice spectrum" page 20
1.2	Three temporalities of post-communist truth and justice 30
8.1	Scale of state involvement in truth and justice 315
8.2	Lithuania's landscape of the politics of truth and justice 320
8.3	Estonia's landscape of the politics of truth and justice 324
8.4	Latvia's landscape of the politics of truth and justice 327
Tat	oles
1.1	A matrix interpretation of Offe's justice categories 16
1.2	Calhoun's forms of legal redress 17
1.3	Types of response to past injustices, Offe and Poppe 18
1.4	An integrated analytical model of truth and justice measures 21
1.5	A full matrix of post-communist truth and justice 32
2.1	Estimated human costs of Soviet and Nazi occupations 1940–1956 55
3.1	Comparative table of criminal-legal trials against Stalinist-era
	perpetrators 85
4.1	Types of political-administrative measures against perpetrators 123
5.1	Victim categories in Latvia's repressed persons' status law 186
5.2	Victim categories in Lithuania's repressed persons' status law 189
5.3	Victim categories in Estonia's repressed persons' status law 195
5.4	Major victim-oriented policies in the Baltic states 200
5.5	Property restitution provisions and outcomes in the Baltic states 204
6.1	State remembrance days for victims of Stalinism and Nazism 227

55

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

If we were to explain how this book project came about, it would definitely be a case of social science overkill to say that it resulted from both "distal and proximate causes." Still, it is true that already in the early 1990s both of us had a strong interest in the politics of the past in the Baltic states. Whether it was a concern with the "democratization of history" in Latvia (Eva-Clarita) or a fascination with the doctrine of "legal continuity" in Estonia (Vello), there was a strong overlap in the questions we were asking about how the past is played out in contemporary politics. In 2008, these two trajectories merged into one, when Carlos Closa Montero invited us to contribute to a European Union commissioned project entitled "How the Memory of Crimes Committed by Totalitarian and/or Other Repressive Regimes in Europe Is Dealt With." We agreed to prepare jointly the national report on Estonia. And when in 2009 this research was completed, our appetite had been whetted for a more extensive and comparative study of the Baltic states.

While we drew some inspiration from the other project reports on Latvia and Lithuania that had been written (and kindly shared with us) by Andrejs Plakans (Latvia) and Tomas Balkelis and Violeta Davoliūtė (Lithuania), we realized that there was much more that could be researched on these issues, particularly from a political science perspective that was our own. We therefore examined the broad array of conceptual and theoretical frameworks that have been put forward to make sense of the politics of truth and justice in post-communist societies. We also harnessed our combined language skills (in Estonian, Latvian, Russian, French and German) to access as many additional archival, legal, scholarly and media resources as possible. Where our own language skills were not enough (i.e. in Lithuanian), our quick and abiding research assistant Lukas Pukelis helped made up the difference. The core of our endeavor was complete.

Along the way, however, we also benefited from other help. One of these impulses came from the participants in the workshop "Between Retribution and Restoration: Explaining the Politics of Transitional x

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Justice" organized by Klaus Bachmann and Adam Czarnota at the 2012 Joint Sessions of the European Consortium for Political Research. Although our final conceptual framework bears only a partial resemblance to what we presented there, this is perhaps the finest tribute that we can pay to the Workshop, since its participants helped alert us to many initial weaknesses in our argument. Other readers such as Lavinia Stan and, again, Klaus Bachmann helped to refine our thoughts at different stages, especially with regard to the conceptual parts of our book.

In 2012–13, as we entered the *tous azimuts* stage of data collection and fact checking, Mārtiņš Kaprāns kept us abreast of a number of additional sources and developments in Latvia. Aigi Rahi-Tamm offered her insights on Estonia. And a number of key interviewees in all three countries (see our list after the References) provided even more perspective on the very diverse realms of truth and justice. Maija Skurska also supplied additional research assistance for Latvia.

Eventually, when authors begin to think that they know enough about a topic to start writing about it, they inevitably look for support from institutions and other kind folk to facilitate their textual creativity. Our primary source of support came, of course, from the University of Tartu and two important research grants from the Estonian Ministry of Education and Research (Targeted Finance Project nr SF0180128s08 and Institutional Research Grant nr IUT20–39). Our thanks also go to the European University Institute (and here in particular to Andreas Frijdal, László Bruzst and their support staffs) for making possible two weeks of intensive writing at the Villa San Felice during March–April 2013. Another absolutely blissful period of creative writing was enabled by Vieda Skultāne, who graciously offered her flat in Riga to Vello during two weeks in January 2014 so that two more chapters could be brought across the finish line.

When all of our analyses, arguments, claims and conclusions were complete, it remained for people like Lina Strupinskienė, Rein Taagepera, Lukas Pukelis and Dovilė Budrytė to assess our work as collegial critics, and for Cambridge University Press' own reviewer to have his/her say. We integrated their comments as extensively as we could. Many were extremely thorough and insightful! Our thanks also go to Elizabeth Spicer at Cambridge for her generosity when it came to extending deadlines and to the editing team at the Press.

Needless to say, our closest help for this project came from our son Jakob who, amidst his seven years of age, endured valiantly each time his

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

mom and dad started debating 'Box 2' vs. 'Box 3' in a language (English) he had yet to master. We trust, however, that he will eventually come to understand this tongue, as well as the import of this book, for as an Estonian-German his heritage, too, encompasses the many issues dealt with on these pages. We also take the opportunity to thank Jakob's grandparents, Adam and Verena, who on many occasions helped pass their grandson's time as different chapters came into being.

Lastly, it bears mentioning that just as key parts of this work were being completed in Florence, one of the people to whom we dedicate this work, Clarita von Trott zu Solz (or Amma) departed this world. Because totalitarianism, loss and remembrance were all a part of Amma's remarkable life, her example was forever present in our minds as we tackled these difficult issues. Similarly inspirational was the story of Raul Pettai, who in 1944 was forced to leave his homeland just as the most anguishing clash of two totalitarian powers took place. That he moved on with his life while maintaining his national identity is a testimony to the Baltic peoples' ability not to be crushed by the weight of the past, but always to push forward with an enduring sense of character and purpose.

xi

ABBREVIATIONS

CoE	Council of Europe
EC	European Commission
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
EPP-ED	European Peoples Party-European Democrats
EU	European Union
IKUERK	Inimsusevastaste kuritegude uurimise Eesti rahvusvaheline
	komisjon (Estonian International Commission for the Investigation
	of Crimes Against Humanity)
JHA	Justice and Home Affairs
KAPO	Kaitsepolitsei (Estonian Security Police Board)
KGB	Komitet gosudarstvennoy bezopasnosti (Soviet Committee on State
	Security)
LAF	Lietuvos aktyvistų frontas (Lithuanian Activists Front)
LDDP	Lietuvos demokratinė darbo partija (Lithuanian Democratic Labor
	Party)
LGGRTC	Lietuvos gyventojų genocido ir rezistencijos tyrimo centras
	(Lithuanian Genocide and Resistance Research Center)
LOM	Latvijas Okkupācijas mūzejs (Occupation Museum of Latvia)
LPKTS	Lietuvos politinių kalinių ir tremtinių sąjunga (Lithuanian Union of
	Political Prisoners and Deportees)
LPRA	Latvijas politiski represēto apvienība (Latvian Association of
	Victims of Political Repression)
LVK	Latvijas vēsturnieku komisija (Commission of the Historians of Latvia)
MGB	Ministerstvo gosudarstvennoi bezopasnosti (Soviet Ministry of State
	Security)
MEP	Member of European Parliament
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
NKGB	Narodnyi komissariat gosudarstvennyi bezopasnosti (People's
	Commissariat for State Security)
NKVD	Narodnyi komissariat vnutrennykh del' (People's Commissariat for
	Internal Affairs)

CAMBRIDGE

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xiii

ORURK	Okupatsioonide repressiivpoliitika uurimise riiklik komisjon (State
	Commission for the Examination of Repressive Policies Carried
	Out During the Occupations)
PACE	Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe
SAB	Satversmes aizsardzības birojs (Latvian Constitutional Protection
	Bureau)
STS	Specialiųjų tyrimų skyrius (Special Investigations Division,
	Lithuanian Prosecutor General's Office)
SWC	Simon Wiesenthal Center
TKNSORNLI	Tarptautinė komisija nacių ir sovietinio okupacinių režimų
	nusikaltimams Lietuvoje įvertinti (International Commission for
	the Evaluation of the Crimes of the Soviet and Nazi Occupation
	Regimes in Lithuania)
TRNIK	Totalitāro režīmu noziegumu izmeklēšanas komisija (Investigative
	Commission for the Crimes of the Totalitarian Regimes)
TRNIN	Totalitāro režīmu noziegumu izmeklēšanas nodaļa (Investigative
	Division for Crimes of the Totalitarian Regimes, Latvian Prosecutor
	General's Office)
TSDC	Totalitārisma seku dokumentēšanas centrs (Center for the
	Documentation of the Consequences of Totalitarianism)
TS-LDK	Tėvynės sąjunga-Lietuvos krikščionys demokratai (Homeland
	Union-Lithuanian Christian Democrats)