

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization

This book examines how the constitutional requirements of the lawmaking process, together with factional divisions within the parties, affect the distribution of power within the House. Gisela Sin's consideration of constitutional actors and intraparty factions in the analysis of House rule making marks a significant departure from previous theories, which postulate the House as an institution that sets its rules in isolation. Sin argues that, by constitutional design, the success of the House in passing laws is contingent on the preferences of the Senate and the president; House members thus anticipate these preferences as they make strategic decisions about rules. Through an examination of major rule changes from 1879 to 2013, the author analyzes how changes in the preferences of constitutional actors outside the House, as well as their political alignments vis-à-vis House factions, predict the timing of rule changes and the type of rules adopted.

Gisela Sin is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. She studies political institutions with an emphasis on the strategic elements of separation of powers and is currently working on a book on presidential veto politics in Latin America. She is coauthor of a book on Argentinean institutions, *Congreso, Presidencia, y Justicia en Argentina*, and her research has been published in *Comparative Political Studies*, the *Journal of Law, Economics, and Organization*, *Studies in American Political Development*, the *Journal of Politics in Latin America*, *Perspective on Politics*, and *Public Choice*. Sin has presented her work at universities throughout Latin America and Europe and was a scholar in residence at Universidad de Salamanca and a Fulbright Scholar in the United States. She holds a Ph.D. in political science from the University of Michigan and a B.A. from Universidad del Salvador in Argentina.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

“While most congressional scholars (myself included) generally don’t look to the Constitution to explain chamber rules, after reading Professor Sin’s groundbreaking work, I am convinced. The amazing thing about her argument is that it is on the one hand obvious, but on the other almost completely overlooked by a generation of congressional scholars. This book will drive significant revisions to both theories of Congress and theories of legislative design more generally.”

– William Bianco, Indiana University

“In this highly original book, Gisela Sin argues that considerations of bargaining influence vis-à-vis the Senate and Executive shape rules choices within the House of Representatives. It is an important departure from existing chamber-centric accounts of historical procedural developments, and a much needed foray into the strategic implications of bicameralism.”

– John D. Wilkerson, University of Washington

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization

*The President, the Senate, and Political  
Parties in the Making of House Rules*

GISELA SIN

*University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President,  
the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules  
Gisela Sin  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107048799](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107048799)

© Gisela Sin 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Sin, Gisela, author.

Separation of powers and legislative organization : the President, the Senate,  
and political parties in the making of House rules / Gisela Sin.

pages    cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04879-9 (hardback)

1. United States. Congress. House.    2. Legislation – United States.    3. Separation of  
powers – United States.    4. United States. Congress. House. – Rules and practice.    I. Title.

KF4990.S57    2015

328.73'07653–dc23    2014009944

ISBN 978-1-107-04879-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs  
for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not  
guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President,  
the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*To Nate, Sophia, and Tobias*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President,  
the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	page x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 A Constitutional Perspective on House Organization	I
2 Constitutional Actors and Intraparty Groups	8
<i>Constitutional Actors</i>	8
<i>Intraparty Groups</i>	10
Identifying Intraparty Groups	13
Majority Intraparty Groups within the Democratic and Republican Parties	17
<i>Conclusion</i>	36
3 A Constitutional Theory of Legislative Organization	37
<i>Theories and Models of Lawmaking in the United States</i>	37
<i>The Model: Explaining Changes in House Organization</i>	40
The Power-Sharing Game	42
The Legislative Game	44
<i>Equilibrium Properties</i>	47
<i>Conclusion</i>	51
4 Timing of House Organizational Changes	53
<i>Timing of Rule Changes: Current Perspectives</i>	53
<i>Constitutional Actors and the Timing of Rule Changes: Empirical         Implications</i>	54
The Model's Implications for Timing: When Do House Members Adopt New Rules?	55
<i>House Rules: Defining the Universe of Rules and         Organizational Changes</i>	58
	vii

<i>Constitutional Actors and the Timing of Rule Changes:</i>	
<i>Empirical Analysis</i>	60
House Rule Changes, 1961	61
House Rule Changes, 1995–2013	62
House Rule Changes, 1879–2013	64
<i>Conclusion</i>	71
5 The Senate and White House Shadows: Centralization and Decentralization of the Rules of the U.S. House, 1879–2013	72
<i>The Directionality of Rule Changes: Current Perspectives</i>	72
<i>Theory: Explaining the Directionality of Rule Changes</i>	74
Centralization of Power – Empowering the Speaker	74
Decentralization of Power – Revolting against One’s Own Leader	79
Decentralization of Power – Empowering Outliers	83
<i>Empirical Implications: The Directionality of Rule Changes</i>	87
<i>Empirical Analysis: Data and Measurement</i>	87
Measuring the Positions of Constitutional Actors: House Factions, the Senate, and the President	87
Rules and the Distribution of Power within the Majority Party: Coding Centralization and Decentralization of Power in the House	90
<i>Analysis</i>	91
No Changes in CS	92
Change in CS and the Non-Speaker Group Gained an Ally (Allies) in the Senate and/or President (Senate and/or President Closer to the Non-Speaker Faction Than to the Speaker)	92
Change in CS and Senate and President Move Closer to the Speaker Group (Non-Speaker Group Has No Outside Allies)	94
Change in CS and the House Minority Party Gains Control of President and Senate	94
Multinomial Analysis	97
<i>Conclusion</i>	99
6 New Rules for an Old Speaker: Revisiting the 1910 Revolt against Speaker Cannon	101
<i>The Revolt against Speaker Cannon</i>	102
<i>Prevailing Interpretation of the Revolt</i>	104
<i>Is the Prevailing Interpretation Correct?</i>	105
<i>Timing of the Revolt: Why Did the Progressives Revolt Only after         Cannon Had Been Serving as the Speaker for More than Six Years?</i>	105
Why Not a Revolt before the 1909 CS Changes?	106
Why Did the Revolt Happen a Year after Taft’s Election?	113



<i>Contents</i>	ix
<i>Directionality of the Revolt</i>	121
<i>Presidential Change, Policy Differences, and Roll Call Data</i>	123
<i>Alternative Explanation: Cannon Was Most Autocratic during the Year prior to the Revolt</i>	125
<i>Conclusion</i>	126
7 Conclusion	127
<i>Appendix A Constitutional Actors, Partisanship, and House Majority Party Factions</i>	131
<i>Appendix B Theoretical Proof</i>	142
<i>Appendix C List of Changes in the Rules and Procedures of the House</i>	152
<i>Appendix D Universe of Rules and Procedures</i>	157
<i>Appendix E Coding of William H. Taft and Calvin Coolidge Presidencies</i>	159
<i>Appendix F Directionality of Rules and Procedures</i>	162
<i>Appendix G Senate’s Ideal Point</i>	174
<i>Bibliography</i>	177
<i>Index</i>	191

Figures and Tables

FIGURES

2.1	House organizational decisions within a constitutional framework	<i>page 9</i>
3.1	The power-sharing game	43
3.2	The constitutional stage	47
3.3	Disconnected constitutional sets	49
3.4	Power-sharing arrangement example	51
4.1	Timing of rule changes: example 1	56
4.2	Timing of rule changes: example 2	57
5.1	Centralization of power in the Speaker: homogenous majority party	76
5.2	Centralization of power in the Speaker: heterogeneous majority party	77
5.3	Directionality of rule changes: centralization of power	80
5.4	Directionality of rule changes: decentralization of power	81
5.5	Directionality of rule changes: outlier result	84
5.6	Range of outliers	86
6.1	Floor median, majority party median, and minority party median in the House, 57th–61st Congresses	107
6.2	Majority party homogeneity and party polarization, 57th–61st Congresses	108
6.3	Percentage of party members who supported their party on less than 50 percent of all party votes	124

TABLES

2.1	Intraparty groups in the Democratic and Republican parties, 1879–2013	15
-----	---	----

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President,  
the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules  
Gisela Sin  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

<i>Figures and Tables</i>	xi
3.1 Definitions of variables	41
4.1 Schickler and Sin’s classification of changes and no changes in rules, by Congress	59
4.2 Relationship between partisan change in constitutional actors and changes in rules, 1995–2013	63
4.3 Logit estimates for changes in House organization, given a change in the CS, 1879–2013	67
4.4 Logit estimates for changes in House organization, 1879–2013	69
4.5 Percentage of major rule changes, given different sources of shifts in the partisan control of constitutional actors, 1879–2013	70
5.1 Number of Congresses in which the House changed its internal organization, by type of rules adopted, 1879–2013	91
5.2 Distribution of Congresses by nature of the change and preference alignment of constitutional actors, 1879–2013	93
5.3 Multinomial logit estimates for models of changes in House organization, 1879–2013	95
6.1 Important legislation enacted while Cannon was Speaker and Roosevelt was president	109

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President,  
the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

This book started as my dissertation at the University of Michigan. I was fortunate to be surrounded by extraordinary faculty in a remarkable academic environment. I am especially indebted to my dissertation committee members, who patiently took the time and helped guide the project that ultimately evolved into this book: Skip Lupia, who served as chair; Ken Kollman, Jake Bowers, and Liz Gerber. Each of them offered valuable advice, careful criticism, and constant enthusiasm. In Michigan, it was Jenna Bednar, Dan Carpenter, and Rick Hall who first sparked my interest in U.S. politics. Countless talks with them, as well as their classes, were essential to broadening my understanding of how American political institutions interact with each other. Scott James at UCLA was also important in the origins of this book. During a year-long stay in Ann Arbor, Scott generously met with me for hours every week for a directed reading in which he shared his vast knowledge of U.S. history and politics.

Many other people have helped to bring this book to fruition. Without a doubt, I owe my greatest professional debt to Skip Lupia. As my mentor and teacher, he has been both my toughest critic and my strongest booster. Skip was the first person to share my enthusiasm about the core idea of this book and encouraged me from the beginning to refine and further strengthen the social science that supports it. I have benefited tremendously from his insight, patience, and willingness to talk with me about anything related to this book. His intellect, craftsmanship, and pure love of learning have been a constant source of inspiration to me.

After arriving at the University of Illinois, I was privileged to receive the helpful advice and support of my colleagues in the Department of Political Science. They generate a stimulating intellectual environment conducive to scholarly work that influenced the development of this book in myriad ways. My deepest gratitude goes to my friends and colleagues Scott Althaus, Jake Bowers, Damarys Canache, Xinyuan Dai, Samantha Frost, Craig Koslowsky,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Jeff Mondak, Bob Pahre, Milan Svolik, Wendy Tam Cho, Bonnie Weir, Matt Winters, and Cara Wong. These scholars provided multiple rounds of feedback, were sounding boards and thoughtful contributors at various stages, and never ceased to encourage me to push this project forward. I have also benefited from constructive feedback from Bill Bernhard, Laura Hastings, Pete Nardulli, Tom Rudolph, Tracy Sulkin, and John Vasquez. Some of my colleagues may not even be aware of the major effect that a casual conversation had on my thinking. Throughout this project I was also privileged to interact with a number of very bright graduate students: Chase Boren, Jillian Evans, Chris Grady, Katie Graham, David Hendry, Gina Reynolds, Jamie Scalera, and Carly Schmitt. They provided excellent research assistance and listened patiently as I developed many of the ideas for this book.

I am especially grateful to my friend and mentor, Jim Kuklinski, for his profound understanding of what I seek to accomplish in this book. The insights he provided helped make it approximate the vision originally set for it. He read countless drafts of the manuscript and was always willing to provide the tough but necessary feedback that often led to long discussions and even longer revisions. Jim's intellectual worldview has also shaped my own.

Jose Cheibub stands for genuine friendship and professionalism. I am grateful to him for reading many drafts, and even though its subject is somewhat removed from his principal academic interests, Ze did so with the utmost seriousness and constantly pushed me to improve the manuscript. He has been a wonderful mentor since we both arrived at Illinois, and I am grateful for his kindness and constant enthusiasm for new ideas.

Brian Gaines has also been a wonderful colleague and took large chunks of time to discuss my argument in great detail. This book has benefited tremendously from Brian's unique exactitude with the subject matter as well as his mastery of the English language.

Many other scholars outside Michigan and Illinois contributed to this book. John Aldrich read various portions of it throughout the years, and he has my deep gratitude for his excitement about the project, as well as his insightful comments. I thank Chris Achen, Scott Adler, Bill Bianco, Chuck Cameron, Dan Carpenter, Gary Cox, Larry Evans, Will Howell, Jeff Jenkins, Orit Kedar, Yanna Krupnikov, Glen Krutz, Adam Levine, David Rohde, Richard Valelly, John Wilkerson, and Alan Wiseman, who offered constructive feedback at different stages and made valuable contributions to the completion of this book.

Both the University of Michigan and University of Illinois provided generous grants and leaves that were essential to this book's completion. I appreciate the financial help from the Gerald Ford Fellowship at the University of Michigan, the Political Science Department at the University of Illinois, and the University of Illinois Research Board. The NSF funded the EITM program, which put me into contact with a tight and vibrant community of scholars. For data I thank Sarah Binder, Keith Poole, Eric Schickler, and Gary Young.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xv

I also extend my gratitude to Jesse Menning, who provided programming assistance at the very beginning of this project and made exceptionally valuable comments on some of the early chapters. I have benefited greatly from seminar participants at Florida State, Pittsburgh, Universidad Catolica de Chile, Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, University of Illinois, University of Virginia, and Instituto de Iberoamerica at Universidad de Salamanca.

It was also a genuine pleasure to work with Cambridge University Press to bring this book to print. I thank the team of Lew Bateman, Shaun Vigil, Mark Fox, and Bhavani for providing support and amazing attention to detail and for making the final steps of completing this book a smooth process. I am also grateful to the two anonymous reviewers for their enormous contributions to this book.

My longtime friends, colleagues, and hotel-sharing group deserve special recognition: Rosario Aguilar, Carolina De Miguel, Damarys Canache, Mariely Lopez-Santana, and Valeria Palanza. All the people in this group took the time to help each other with our various projects while forming wonderful personal relationships. Conversations with these beloved friends continue to shape my work and the contours of my life.

Bonnie Weir helped me stay focused on what is important in academia and life, even during hard times. She has been an amazing friend, always ready to lend a hand with anything I need. Bonnie and her husband, Milan, have also played a unique role in my family's life in Urbana. Both have created countless special memories for my children and me. I don't think any of us can imagine celebrating Valentine's Day, Easter, or Halloween without their presence.

Numerous friends from Argentina, some dating back to my childhood, also deserve my gratitude. I am confident that without them none of this would have been possible. Analia Bejar, Lili Caivano, Gabi Catterberg, Brad Gorbet, Marina Hondeville, Leo Nusblat, Valeria Palanza, Evange Petrizza, and Juan Carlos Ughetti were there by my side, to support the effort of going through grad school and writing this book. Clarisa Bejar shared my whole academic life, from elementary school in La Pampa, through college in Buenos Aires, and finally grad school in Michigan. I deeply cherish her patience, love, and good humor throughout the years. Clarisa is literally "one phone call away" from being by my side for any reason. No matter where or how far our paths have gone, all these "amigos" are dear to me.

I also want to extend my appreciation to the friends I made in Urbana: Traci and Jonathan Pines, Janet Morford, Brianna Lawrence, Carmen and Juan Loo, Ivana and Pega Hrnjak, Carmen Ugarte, Marlah and Erik McDuffie, Kathy Anthony, Christy Lleras, Andy Gewirth, Jenn Kirwan, and Amy and Matt Rosenstein. From play dates to dinner parties to school functions, I have enjoyed watching our children grow up together in Urbana.

One friend deserves special recognition for carrying me through the process of researching and writing this book: Nancy Abelmann. I can't even begin to imagine where I would be without her professional support and personal

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

friendship. Nancy's "first book" group was a remarkable sounding board, and I was extremely fortunate to be a participant. She has been an important source of encouragement, advice, and common sense. Nancy shaped the work in innumerable ways: She read draft chapters, proofread, and suggested more succinct ways to communicate my ideas. I am also thankful to her for introducing me to an amazing editor, Maria Gillombardo. Maria read the manuscript many times and helped polish and refine its prose. Working with her has been amazing.

My family provides the unconditional loving environment crucial to my professional and personal well-being. My parents, Tati Silva and Noty Sin, have been a constant source of reassurance and love. They have done more than any child could ask for, including making enormous sacrifices to ensure that I could pursue a career in academia. My mother's triumphs in her life continuously inspire me in the conduct of my own. She is my definition of motivation. Her core values as a mother who recognizes what I want out of life and relentless encouragement to achieve my goals are the same values I hope to instill in my children. I am extraordinarily fortunate to have her unwavering support to achieve my dreams, no matter how far from home they took me.

My in-laws, Carol and Michael Schmitz, also "lived" this project and infused it with their enthusiasm and constant affection. Their warmth and caring nature always made me feel at home and one of the family. They were essential in keeping me on track with the manuscript by reading it and providing valuable feedback from outside the box. I also appreciate having been able to spend many wonderful summer and winter holidays with Ted, Erica, Adam, and Susan Schmitz and my nieces, Alexandra, Olivia, Addison, and Caroline.

My grandparents, Lola, Maneco, Mame, and Nona, were also a source of continuous inspiration. My brother Sebastian always took the time to be there for my family and me when we were in Argentina. I am also thankful to my stepmother, Liliana; my sister Valeria; and my brothers Maxi and Poqui. All of them were constantly cheering me on. Finally, I owe special gratitude to my sister Luciana. Her willingness to come to Urbana and endure one of the harshest winters on record to help take care of my family at the end of this process made all the difference.

My extended "familia" is too large to name, but Tia Gladys, Kitty, Pochi, Sonia as well as Tio Chino, Pity, Antonio, and Jorge provided me with support through phone calls, e-mails, Skype, and WhatsApp. Their love, together with the constant anecdotes, jokes, and messages from my cousins Christian, Benchy, Bebo, Rafa, Juan, Jose, Joaquina, Lichy, and Facu, provided me with much-needed relief and connection to Corrientes. I am also extremely touched by my family, who eagerly received with open hearts the presence of my children, Sophia and Tobias, every summer during these last seven years.

One of the largest debts is to my husband, Nate Schmitz. Nate's support since my years as an undergraduate has been unconditional. His faith in the



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04879-9 - Separation of Powers and Legislative Organization: The President, the Senate, and Political Parties in the Making of House Rules

Gisela Sin

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

### *Acknowledgments*

xvii

merits of my project's goals has made the experience of being an assistant professor far better than it would otherwise have been. His cooking improved quite a bit over that time to the benefit of the whole family. Finally, I wish to thank my daughter, Sophia, and my son, Tobias. They are constant reminders of the importance of enjoying life to the fullest, especially outside academia. I hope I make them proud, and I look forward to celebrating this accomplishment with them. Nate, Popa, y Toto, los quiero mucho!