Jews and Leftist Politics

The relationships, past and present, between Jews and the political left remain of abiding interest to both the academic community and the public. *Jews and Leftist Politics* contains new and insightful chapters from world-renowned scholars and considers such matters as the political implications of Judaism; the relationships of leftists and Jews; the histories of Jews on the left in Europe, the United States, and Israel; contemporary anti-Zionism; the associations between specific Jews and Communist Parties; and the importance of gendered perspectives. It also contains fresh studies of canonical figures, including Gershom Scholem, Gustav Landauer, and Martin Buber, and examines the affiliations of Jews to prominent institutions, calling into question previously widely held assumptions. The volume is characterized by judicious appraisals made by respected authorities and sheds considerable light on contentious themes.

Jack Jacobs is Professor of Political Science at John Jay College and the Graduate Center, City University of New York. He is the author of a number of titles including most recently *The Frankfurt School, Jewish Lives, and Antisemitism* (Cambridge University Press, 2015). He was a Fulbright Scholar at Tel Aviv University in 1996–1997 and served as Fulbright Scholar at the Vilnius Yiddish Institute in 2009.
Jews and Leftist Politics

Judaism, Israel, Antisemitism, and Gender

JACK JACOBS

John Jay College and the Graduate Center,
City University of New York
## Contents

**List of Contributors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Acknowledgments**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Introduction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Jack Jacobs*

**PART ONE**

**POLITICAL IMPLICATIONS OF JUDAISM**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The Strangeness of Jewish Leftism</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Michael Walzer</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART TWO**

**ANTISEMITISM AND THE LEFT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The Dualisms of Capitalist Modernity: Reflections on History, the Holocaust, and Antisemitism</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Moishe Postone</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Marxism’s Other Jewish Questions</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Lars Fischer</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART THREE**

**ISRAEL, ZIONISM, AND THE LEFT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Socialist Zionism and Nation Building</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Anita Shapira</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Delegitimation of Israel or Social-Historical Analysis?</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Debate over Zionism as a Colonial Settler Movement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Yoav Peled</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Does the Left Have a Zionist Problem? From the General to a Particular</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Mitchell Cohen</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

**PART FOUR: JEWS AND COMMUNISM**

7 Jews and Communism in the Soviet Union and Poland
   *Antony Polonsky*

8 Jews and American Communism
   *Harvey Klehr*

**PART FIVE: GENDERED PERSPECTIVES**

9 Gesia Gelfman: A Jewish Woman on the Left in Imperial Russia
   *Barbara Alpern Engel*

10 Manya Shochat and Her Traveling Guns: Jewish Radical Women from Pogrom Self-Defense to the First Kibbutzim
   *Deborah Hertz*

11 The Gender of Jews and the Politics of Women: A Reflection
   *Alice Kessler-Harris*

**PART SIX: CANONICAL FIGURES**

12 Gershom Scholem and the Left
   *Steven E. Aschheim*

13 The Romantic Socialism of Gustav Landauer
   *Michael Löwy*

14 Martin Buber between Left and Right
   *Uri Ram*

**PART SEVEN: CASE STUDIES**

15 The Soviet Union, Jewish Concerns, and the New York Electoral Left, 1939–1944
   *Daniel Soyer*

16 Jews and the Left at the New School
   *Judith Friedlander*

17 Deutscher and the Jews: On the Non-Jewish Jew – An Analysis and Personal Reflection
   *Samuel Farber*

*Glossary* 351

*Index* 355
Contributors

Steven E. Aschheim is Emeritus Professor of History at the Hebrew University, Jerusalem, where he held the Vigevani Chair of European Studies. He is the author of *Brothers and Strangers: The East European Jew in German and German–Jewish Consciousness, 1800–1923* (1982); *The Nietzsche Legacy in Germany, 1890–1990* (1992); *Culture and Catastrophe: German and Jewish Confrontations with National Socialism and Other Crises* (1996); *In Times of Crisis: Essays on European Culture, Germans and Jews* (2001); *Scholem, Arendt, Klemperer: Intimate Chronicles in Turbulent Times* (2001); and *Beyond the Border: The German–Jewish Legacy Abroad* (2007), and the editor of *Hannah Arendt in Jerusalem* (2001). His latest book, *At the Edges of Liberalism: Junc- tions of European, German and Jewish History*, appeared in 2012.

Mitchell Cohen is Professor of Political Science at Baruch College and the Graduate Center, City University of New York, as well as Co-Editor Emeritus of *Dissent*. His books include *Zion and State* (1987) and *The Wager of Lucien Goldmann* (1994). His articles and essays have appeared in the *New York Times Sunday Book Review*, the London *Times Literary Supplement*, and numerous other publications.

Contributors


Lars Fischer is Teaching Fellow in History and Hebrew and Jewish Studies at UCL (University College London). He served as Councillor of the Royal Historical Society from 2012 to 2015 and Secretary of the British Association for Jewish Studies from 2010 to 2012. Among his publications is the monograph The Socialist Response to Antisemitism in Imperial Germany (2007).

Judith Friedlander is Professor of Anthropology at Hunter College, City University of New York, where she has served as Dean of Social Sciences and Dean of Arts and Sciences. Among her published works are Being Indian in Hueyapan (1975) and Vilna on the Seine: Jewish Intellectuals in France since 1968 (1990). Currently she is writing a book on the history of the New School for Social Research, where she served as Dean of the Graduate Faculty of Political and Social Science (1993–2000) and held the Eberstadt Chair of Anthropology.

Deborah Hertz is the Herman Wouk Chair in Modern Jewish Studies at the University of California at San Diego. She is the author of Jewish High Society in Old Regime Berlin (1988) and How Jews Became Germans: The History of Conversion and Assimilation in Berlin (2007). The working title of her current book project is “Sailing to Utopia: Jewish Women’s Journeys from Odessa to Jaffa.”

Jack Jacobs is Professor of Political Science at John Jay College and the Graduate Center, City University of New York. He is the author of On Socialists and “the Jewish Question” after Marx (1992), of Bundist Counterculture in Intervar Poland (2009), and of The Frankfurt School, Jewish Lives, and Antisemitism (2015); and is the editor of Jewish Politics in Eastern Europe: The Bund at 100 (2001).

Alice Kessler-Harris is R. Gordon Hoxie Professor of American History at Columbia University, where she is also Professor in the Institute for Research on Women and Gender. Her books include In Pursuit of Equity: Women, Men and the Quest for Economic Citizenship in Twentieth
Century America (2001) and, most recently, A Difficult Woman: The Challenging Life and Times of Lillian Hellman (2012). Among American Jewish scholars, she is widely known for introducing Anzia Yezierska’s Bread Givers to new audiences.

Harvey Klehr is Andrew Mellon Professor of Politics and History at Emory University. He is the author, coauthor, or editor of fourteen books including The Secret World of American Communism (1995), which was a selection of the History Book Club, Book of the Month Club, and Conservative Book Club, and Spies: The Rise and Fall of the KGB in America (2009). His newest book is The Secret Cables of the Comintern. He has written numerous articles and reviews for professional journals as well as for Commentary, the New Republic, New York Review of Books, Wall Street Journal, and the Weekly Standard. He served as a member of the National Council on the Humanities from 2004 to 2010.


Yoav Peled is Professor of Political Science at Tel Aviv University and a lawyer. His book Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship, coauthored with Gershon Shafir (2002), won the Albert Hourani Prize of the Middle East Studies Association of North America for best book in Middle East studies in 2002 and was published in Hebrew in 2005 under the title Mihu Yisraeli. His most recent book, The Challenge of Ethnic Democracy, was published in 2014. Peled has edited or coedited five collections of essays, including Democratic Citizenship and War, published in 2010. He is Co-Editor in Chief of The Public Sphere: Tel Aviv Journal of Political Science.

Antony Polonsky is Albert Abramson Professor of Holocaust Studies at Brandeis University and the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum and Chief Historian at the Museum of the History of Polish Jews in Warsaw. He is Chair of the editorial board of Polin: Studies in Polish Jewry, and author of such books as Politics in Independent Poland (1972), The Little Dictators (1975), and The Great Powers and the Polish
Contributors

Question (1976). He is coauthor of A History of Modern Poland (1980) and of The Beginnings of Communist Rule in Poland (1981) and coeditor of Contemporary Jewish Writing in Poland: An Anthology (2001) and of The Neighbors Respond: The Controversy over the Jedwabne Massacre in Poland (2004). His most recent work is The Jews in Poland and Russia (2010). He has been awarded the Officer’s Cross of the Order of Polonia Restituta, the Officer’s Cross of the Order of Independent Lithuania, the Kulczycki Prize for the best work in 2011 in the field of Polish studies and, in 2012, the Pro historia Polonorum prize awarded by the Senate of the Republic of Poland for the best book on Polish history in a foreign language published in the last five years.

Moishe Postone is Thomas E. Donnelley Professor of Modern European History and The College, and Co-Director of the Chicago Center for Contemporary Theory, at the University of Chicago. He has written Time, Labor, and Social Domination: A Reinterpretation of Marx’s Critical Theory (1993) and Deutschland, die Linke und der Holocaust: Politische Interventionen (2005); has coedited (with Eric Santner) Catastrophe and Meaning: The Holocaust and the Twentieth Century (2003); and has numerous other publications on Marx, Critical Theory, and antisemitism.

Uri Ram is a Professor of Sociology at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. He is the author of The Globalization of Israel: McWorld in Tel Aviv – Jihad in Jerusalem (2008) and of Israeli Nationalism: Social Conflicts and the Politics of Knowledge (2011). His book The Return of Martin Buber: National and Social Thought in Israel from Buber to the Neo-Buberians was published in Hebrew in 2015.

Anita Shapira, Professor Emerita at Tel Aviv University, served that institution as Ruben Menenfeld Professor in the Study of Zionism, Dean of the Faculty of Humanities and Head of the Rabin Center. Among her best-known works are Berl: The Biography of a Socialist Zionist, Berl Katznelson 1887–1944 (1984), Land and Power, the Zionist Resort to Force, 1881–1948 (1992), Yigal Allon, Native Son: A Biography (2008), and Yosef Haim Brenner: A Life (2015). Her most recent book, Ben-Gurion: Father of Modern Israel, was published in 2014. She has won many prizes and awards, including, in 2008, the Israel Prize, and currently serves as an academic editor of the Jewish Lives book series published by Yale University Press and as a coeditor of the Journal of Israeli History.

Daniel Soyer is Professor of History at Fordham University in New York. He is author, along with Annie Polland, of Emerging Metropolis: New...
Contributors

York Jews in the Age of Immigration, 1840–1920 (2012), winner of the National Jewish Book Award.

Michael Walzer, Professor Emeritus at the Institute for Advanced Study, has addressed a wide variety of topics in political theory and moral philosophy: political obligation, just war, and economic justice. His books, Just and Unjust Wars (1977) and Spheres of Justice (1983), have played a part in the revival of practical ethics and in the development of a pluralist approach to political life. Walzer was the coeditor of Dissent for more than thirty years. His most recent book is The Paradox of Liberation: Secular Revolutions and Religious Counter- Revolutions (2015). He is currently working on volume 3 of The Jewish Political Tradition.
Many of the chapters of this book originated as talks delivered at an international conference on Jews and the Left that took place in 2012 in New York and was sponsored by the YIVO Institute for Jewish Research and co-presented by the American Jewish Historical Society. My thanks to Jonathan Brent, the YIVO’s executive director, who suggested to me that I organize such a conference, and who worked long and hard to help bring it into being. My thanks as well to the other members of the conference planning committee – Deborah Hertz, Jonathan Karp, Tony Michels, Antony Polonsky, and Daniel Soyer – who collectively shaped the conference, and to all the members of YIVO’s staff, who contributed to its success. In the years following 2012, a number of eminent scholars who did not participate in the conference – Steven E. Aschheim, Samuel Farber, Michael Löwy, and Uri Ram – graciously agreed to write for this volume. I am delighted to include their work alongside the work of my esteemed friends, colleagues, and debating partners Mitchell Cohen, Barbara Alpern Engel, Lars Fischer, Judith Friedlander, Deborah Hertz, Alice Kessler-Harris, Harvey Klehr, Yoav Peled, Antony Polonsky, Moishe Postone, Anita Shapira, Daniel Soyer, and Michael Walzer. My gratitude to one and all for their cooperation, insight, and forbearance.