Race, Nation, and Citizenship in Postcolonial Africa

Nationalism has generated violence, bloodshed, and genocide, as well as patriotic sentiments that encourage people to help fellow citizens and place public responsibilities above personal interests. This study explores the contradictory character of African nationalism as it unfolded over decades of Tanzanian history in conflicts over public policies concerning the rights of citizens, foreigners, and the nation’s Asian minority. These policy debates reflected a history of racial oppression and foreign domination and were shaped by a quest for economic development, racial justice, and national self-reliance.

Ronald Aminzade is Professor of Sociology at the University of Minnesota. He has also taught at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, the University of Lund, and the University of Amsterdam. His research on the political consequences of capitalist development in nineteenth-century France has been published in numerous articles and in two books, Ballots and Barricades and Class, Politics, and Early Industrial Capitalism. He is the coeditor of The Social Worlds of Higher Education, on the sociology of education, and Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics, on social movements and contentious politics. His current research focuses on nationalism and the politics of economic development in East Africa.
Cambridge Studies in Contentious Politics

Editors

MARK BEISSINGER Princeton University
JACK A. GOLDSSTONE George Mason University
MICHAEL HANAGAN Vassar College
DOUG MCADAM Stanford University and Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences
SARAH SOULE Stanford University
SUZANNE STAGGENBORG University of Pittsburgh
SIDNEY TARBOR Cornell University
CHARLES TILLY (D. 2008) Columbia University
ELISABETH J. WOOD Yale University
DEBORAH YASHAR Princeton University

Rina Agarwala, InFormal Labor, Formal Politics, and Dignified Discontent in India
Ronald Aminzade, Race, Nation, and Citizenship in Post-Colonial Africa: The Case of Tanzania
Ronald Aminzade et al., Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics
Javier Auyero, Routine Politics and Violence in Argentina: The Gray Zone of State Power
W. Lance Bennett and Alexandra Segerberg, The Logic of Connective Action: Digital Media and the Personalization of Contentious Politics
Clifford Bob, The Marketing of Rebellion: Insurgents, Media, and International Activism
Charles Brockett, Political Movements and Violence in Central America
Valerie Bunce and Sharon Wolchik, Defeating Authoritarian Leaders in Postcommunist Countries
Lars-Erik Cederman, Kristian Skrede Gleditsch, and Halvard Buhaug, Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War
Christian Davenport, Media Bias, Perspective, and State Repression
Gerald F. Davis, Doug McAdam, W. Richard Scott, and Mayer N. Zald, Social Movements and Organization Theory
Donatella della Porta, Clandestine Political Violence
Todd A. Eisenstadt, Politics, Identity, and Mexico’s Indigenous Rights Movements
Daniel Q. Gillion, The Political Power of Protest: Minority Activism and Shifts in Public Policy

Jack A. Goldstone, editor, States, Parties, and Social Movements
Tamara Kay, NAFTA and the Politics of Labor Transnationalism
Joseph Luders, The Civil Rights Movement and the Logic of Social Change
Doug McAdam and Hilary Boudet, Putting Social Movements in Their Place: Explaining Opposition to Energy Projects in the United States, 2000–2005
Doug McAdam, Sidney Tarrow, and Charles Tilly, Dynamics of Contention

(continued after the index)
Race, Nation, and Citizenship in Postcolonial Africa

The Case of Tanzania

RONALD AMINZADE

University of Minnesota
To

CHUCK TILLY

TEACHER, MENTOR, AND INSPIRATION
# Contents

**Acknowledgments**  page xiii  
**Map of Tanzania**  xv  
**Chronology**  xvii  

1 Introduction  
- *Nationalism and the Politics of Exclusion*  
- *Imagined Communities and the Contentious Politics of Citizenship*  
- *The Dynamics of Political Contention: A Dialectical Approach*  
- *The Nation-Building Process: Leadership, Institutions, and Contentious Politics*  
- *History, Sociology, and the Study of Nationalism*  

PART I THE STRUGGLE FOR INDEPENDENCE AND BIRTH OF A NATION  

2 Colonialism, Racism, and Modernity  
- *Capital Accumulation, Imperialism, and the Colonial State*  
- *Foreign Domination: Mandated Territories, Indirect Rule, and Responsible Government*  
- *Racial Ideologies and the Institutionalization of a Tripartite Racial Order*  
- *Modernity, Development, and Colonial Rule*  

3 Foreigners and Nation-Building  
- *African Resistance to Colonialism and the Emergence of a Nationalist Movement*  
- *Divisions over Nonviolence and Race-Based Elections*  
- *Contestation over Transnational Visions of Political Community*  
- *The Africanization Debate, the Failed Army Mutiny, and a Restructured State*
Contents

Capital Accumulation, Foreign Aid and Investments, and the Cold War 90
The Union with Zanzibar: Cold War Politics or Pan-Africanism? 99

4 Race and the Nation-Building Project 104
The Nationalist Master Narrative and Asian-African Race Relations 104
Asian-Tanganyikans and the Quest for National Independence 105
Who Is a Tanganyikan? Asian-Tanganyikans and the Citizenship Debate 114
Racial Inequality, Citizenship, and the Africanization Debate 118
Africanizing the Economy: Asian-Tanganyikans and the Cooperative Movement 121
Creating a Unified Nation: The Challenge of Ethnic and Racial Divisions 124

PART II THE SOCIALIST EXPERIMENT

5 African Socialism: The Challenges of Nation-Building 135
Socialism and Self-Reliance: A New Development Strategy 135
The Socialist State: Single-Party Rule, Authoritarian Populism, and Political Legitimacy 138
Ideological Divisions: Marxist-Leninism, Social Democracy, and African Socialism 145
Institutional Divisions: Government Bureaucrats and Ruling Party Leaders 154
The Politics of Inclusion: Creating a Pan-Ethnic and Multiracial National Identity 162
The Politics of Exclusion: Combating Internal and External Enemies of the Nation 165

6 Socialism, Self-Reliance, and Foreigners 171
The Arusha Declaration and the Nationalization of Foreign Capital 171
The Debate over Expatriate Managers and Technicians 173
Foreign Aid: A Development Asset or a Threat to National Self-Reliance? 181
Foreigners, Modernity, and the Contentious Creation of a National Culture 185
The Cold War: Imperialism, Colonialism, and the Ugandan Dictatorship 192
A United Nation? Zanzibar and the Union 201
Foreigners and the Decline of State Socialism 205

7 Nationalism, State Socialism, and the Politics of Race 208
Divided Nationalists: Race, Citizenship, and the Nation-Building Project 208
Asian Noncitizens: Deportations and Property Confiscations 215
The Arusha Declaration and Asian-Tanzanians 218
The Nationalization of Commercial and Rental Properties 220
Internal Enemies of the Nation: The Campaign against Economic Sabotage 230
### Contents

**Racism across the Border: Tanzania’s Response to the Ugandan Expulsion**  
234  
**Race and the Decline of State Socialism**  
236

#### PART III NEOLIBERALISM, GLOBAL CAPITALISM, AND THE NATION-STATE

8 Neoliberalism and the Transition from State Socialism to Capitalism  
245  
*Market Economics, Multiparty Politics, and a Divided Political Elite*  
245  
*Neoliberal Economic Reforms and Global Financial Institutions*  
250  
*The First Phase: Structural Adjustment Policies and Market Fundamentalism*  
252  
*Neoliberal Populism and the Post-Washington Consensus*  
256  
*Neoliberal Populism: Rhetoric or Reality?*  
264  
*The Developmental State, Diversified Foreign Investments, and the Beijing Consensus*  
268  
*Tanzanian Neoliberalization: The State, the Nation, and Democracy*  
273

9 Neoliberalism, Foreigners, and Globalization  
276  
*Foreigners and the Contentious Politics of Neoliberalization*  
276  
*Political Contention over the Privatization of National Assets*  
278  
*Policy Reversals and the Retreat from Neoliberalization*  
284  
*From Indigenization to Popular Empowerment*  
297  
*Foreigners and the Citizenship and Immigration Laws of 1995*  
302  
*Regional Alliances and Conflicts over the Reconfiguration of National Sovereignty*  
307  
*The Fragile Nation: Contesting the Union between Tanganyika and Zanzibar*  
311  
*Neoliberalization and the Rights of Noncitizens*  
318

10 Neoliberalism, Race, and the Global Economy  
320  
*Race Relations and the Contentious Politics of Neoliberalization*  
320  
*Privatization, the Black African Bourgeoisie, and Asian-Tanzanian Economic Power*  
322  
*Racial Nationalism, Multiparty Politics, and the Indigenization Debate*  
326  
*Racial Violence over Rural and Urban Land*  
336  
*Race and the Politics of Corruption*  
337  
*The Global Economy and the Debate over Dual Citizenship*  
349  
*Racial Violence, Public Policies, and the Dual Transition*  
353

11 Conclusion: Race, Nation, and Citizenship in Historical and Comparative Perspectives  
356  
*The Politics of Exclusion and Prospects of Democratic Nationalism*  
357  
*Political Parties, Contentious Politics, and the Future of Nationalism*  
364  
*The Trajectory of Nation-Building: Path Dependency and Political Contention*  
368
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Dialectics of Political Change</th>
<th>370</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development, Exclusion, and Inclusion in a Global Economy</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

Two decades of doing research on nineteenth-century French politics provided me with an implicit comparative framework for subsequent work in East Africa, although it did little to prepare me for the joys and challenges of doing research on the African continent. When I first arrived in Tanzania in 1995, I was struck by the warmth and hospitality of the people I met. Hospitality toward guests and strangers remains a prominent feature of Tanzanian culture, and I was the beneficiary of it on numerous occasions. Many Tanzanians welcomed me into their homes and generously shared their food, time, and concern, helping me navigate numerous bureaucratic, linguistic, and cultural obstacles. Sulieman Ngware, Colman Titus Msoka, and Paul Manda directed me to valuable sources of information at the University of Dar es Salaam, offering useful advice and well-informed opinions about Tanzanian politics. A number of scholars at the University of Dar, including Marjorie Mbilinyi, Lucy Mboma, Betha Koda, and the late Seth Chachage, welcomed me to campus. Samuel Wangwe encouraged my research when he was the director of the Economic and Social Research Foundation and later in his capacity as director of Research on Poverty Alleviation (REPOA). Friends and colleagues at the Tanzania Gender Networking Programme always extended a warm and friendly welcome whenever I came to visit. Joseph Butiku and his colleagues at the Mwalimu Nyerere Foundation shared with me their passionate commitment to Julius Nyerere’s ideals and values, while Rakesh Rajani welcomed me at Haki Elimu and Twaweza. My thanks to members of the Tanzanian parliament who took time from their busy schedules to speak with me in Dodoma and Dar es Salaam.

This would have been a much better book had my teacher and mentor, the late Charles Tilly, been around to provide the frank, constructive, and supportive comments he always offered. For those who know his work, Chuck’s inspiration should be evident in the following pages. He treated me as a colleague from the day I first met him, with great generosity and kindness. Chuck taught me to disregard the disciplinary boundaries that sometimes constrain creative thinking and the
academic status hierarchies that often limit meaningful dialogue. He never sought
to create disciples and always encouraged me to follow my own idiosyncratic path.
As she has done throughout my career, M.J. Maynes provided unwavering support
as well as tough but constructive criticisms. I am also indebted to Paul Bjerk, Jim
Brennan, Teresa Gowan, Doug McAdam, Richa Nagar, Rachel Schurman, and
Eric Sheppard, who took time off from their busy schedules to critically read draft
chapters. My thanks to numerous friends and colleagues who provided insightful
comments on my work during the past decade, including Joyce Bell, the late Susan
Geiger, Joe Gerteis, Michael Goldman, Doug Hartmann, Alan Isaacman, Erik
Larson, Helga Leitner, Deborah Levison, Marjorie Mbilinyi, Jamie Monson,
David Pellow, William Roy, Thomas Spear, Eric Weitz, and Erik Olin Wright.
Letta Page provided superb copyediting, working her magic on my prose to
produce a more accessible manuscript.

Neema Ngware and Ben Pike were patient and encouraging Swahili teachers
who made learning a new language an enjoyable experience. As a research
assistant, Brian Dill helped organize my overflowing files of newspaper clippings
and articles, while Dorothy Kaloli assisted me with newspaper clippings; Betty
Masanga with focus groups in Dar es Salaam; and Swibert Kamazima, Rehema
Kilonzo, and Coleman Titus Msoka with interviews of legislators in Dodoma. I
learned a great deal about African politics and society from my former students
Susan Mlanga, June Msechu, Fortunata Songora, Andrew State, Sylvia Tamale,
and Samuel Zalanga. University of Minnesota graduate students Ryan Alaniz,
Kristin Haltinner, Ryan Moltz, Raphi Rechitsky, Jim Saliba, and Emily Springer
provided helpful comments on earlier chapter drafts. My thanks to the leader-
ship of Project Zawadi, Books for Africa, and Community Solutions for African
Development for giving me an opportunity to work with people devoted to
improving educational opportunities for the children of Tanzania. I am also
grateful for the support provided by the University of Minnesota; the Center for
Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences (National Science Foundation Grant
#SBR-9601236); the Rockefeller Center in Bellagio, Italy; and the American
Sociological Association Fund for the Advancement of the Discipline.

My thanks to John Wiley and Sons Publishers, Transaction Publishers,
Emerald Group Publishing, and Elsevier Publishers for allowing me to use por-
tions of the following published journal articles: “The Dialectic of Nation-
Building in Postcolonial Tanzania.” The Sociological Quarterly 54 (2013): 335–
366; “Nation Building in Post-Colonial Nation-States: The Cases of Tanzania and
Confront the Global: Discourses of Indigenous Rights in Fiji and Tanzania.” The
Indigenization and Politics in Tanzania and Fiji.” Research in Political Sociology
16 (2007): 121–166; “From Race to Citizenship: The Indigenization Debate in
Post-Socialist Tanzania.” Studies in Comparative International Development 38
Chronology

1885: German East Africa Company granted government charter to administer territory
1891: German state takes direct control over the territory from East African Company
1905–07: Maji Maji war
1922: Tanganyika becomes a League of Nations British Mandated Territory
1929: Creation of the Tanganyika African Association (TAA)
1946: Tanganyika becomes Trust Territory of Great Britain under the United Nations
1953: Election of Julius Nyerere as president of TAA
1954: Creation of Tanganyika African National Union (TANU)
1957: Elections ordinance to create multiracial Legislative Council (LEGCO)
1958: TANU conference at Tabora decides to participate in multiracial elections; creation of African National Congress (ANC); Nyerere convicted of libel and pays a fine rather than going to prison
1958–59: Victory of TANU in a multiracial election
1960: Massacre of Europeans in Congo; TANU general election victory
1961: Internal self-government granted; Parliament passes inclusive citizenship legislation; Tanganyika becomes independent with Nyerere as Prime Minister
1962: Election of Julius Nyerere as President
1964: Nyerere declares that “Africanization is dead”; Zanzibar Revolution; army mutiny suppressed by British troops
1964: Creation of United Republic of Tanzania via the union of Tanganyika and Zanzibar
Chronology

1965: Tanganyika breaks off diplomatic relations with Great Britain over Rhodesia
1966: Repression of student protest against National Service
1967: Arusha Declaration of Socialism
1970: Treason trial of Oscar Kambona, Bibi Titi Mohammed, and others; nationalization of wholesale commerce
1971: TANU Guidelines (*mwongozo*); creation of Peoples’ Militia; nationalization of rental properties (Acquisition of Buildings Act) followed by mass departure of Asians
1972: Assassination of Abedi Karume in Zanzibar; bomb explosions in Dar es Salaam and Portuguese air strikes on the southern border; expulsion of Asians from Uganda; Ugandan planes bomb border towns of Bukoba and Mwanza
1973: Repression of workers who took over Mount Carmel rubber factory; Nyerere orders all peasants to move to *ujamaa* villages
1976: Operation Maduka to replace small retail shops with cooperatives
1977: TANU and ASP merge to form Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM); dissolution of East African Community
1978: War with Uganda; Tanzanian troops defeat forces of Idi Amin
1979: Resignation of Minister of Finance Edward Mtei over Nyerere’s refusal to accept IMF structural adjustment policies
1983: Economic Sabotage Act; Economic Crimes Bill
1984: President of Zanzibar Aboud Jumbe is forced from office; death of Prime Minister Edward Sokoine
1985: Election of Ali Hassan Mwinyi as President
1986: Agreement with the IMF to adopt structural adjustment policies; implementation of the Economic Reform Program
1988: Removal of Seif Shariff as Chief Minister of Zanzibar after he calls for referendum on the Union
1989: Economic and Social Action Program to liberalize financial sector and allow privatization of parastatals
1990: Nyerere expresses support for multiparty politics; Investment Promotion and Protection Act
1991: Zanzibar Declaration repeals Leadership Code
1992: CCM accepts Nyalali Commission recommendation to create a multiparty system. Constitutional amendment to eliminate the single-party system and strengthen Parliament and allow private motions by MPs; anti-Asian race riot in Dar es Salaam
1993: National Assembly votes unanimously to establish separate mainland government but is overruled; establishment of Parastatal Sector Reform Commission; Zanzibar forced to withdraw from Islamic Conference Organization (IOC); looting of Asian shops in Dar es Salaam
1994: Protests over Dar es Salaam city council’s decision to sell Mnazi Mmoja to private Asian-Tanzanian developer
1995: New, more restrictive citizenship law and immigration bill; election of Benjamin Mkapa as President; disputed election and violence in Zanzibar
1996: Appointment of Presidential Commission on Corruption; forced repatriation of Rwandan refugees
1997: Tanzania Investment Act to attract foreign investments; former CCM secretary general Kolimba criticizes ruling party’s abandonment of the poor
1998: Mining Act to liberalize the sector and protect investors against nationalization; protectionist trade measures for sugar industry
1999: Death of Julius Nyerere; passage of Land Act and Village Land Act, making land available to large-scale investors; protectionist trade measures for domestic beer and tobacco industries; National Employment Protection Act to limit foreign ownership; Tanzanian withdrawal from COMESA; East African Treaty with Kenya and Uganda
2000: Reelection of President Mkapa; disputed election in Zanzibar
2001: Tanzania qualifies for debt reduction under World Bank/IMF Heavily Indebted Poor Country (HIPC) initiative; Coffee Act banning private traders in local markets; violent conflicts between small tanzanite miners and a South African mining company and between small gold miners and a foreign company in Mara region; revocation of citizenship of prominent dissident ruling party political leaders; violence in Zanzibar after arrest of CUF leaders, and thousands flee the islands to Kenya; signing of a reconciliation accord
2002: Attacks by villagers on Asian-owned commercial farms in Kiru valley
2003: Ban on export of raw tanzanite but slow implementation of policy; publication of Iddi Simba’s A Concept of Indigenization; CCM ban on use of term indigenization
2004: Economic Empowerment Bill to promote indigenous investors; political violence in Zanzibar
2005: Election of Jakaya Kikwete as President; cancellation of foreign management contract with City Water Services; eviction of small-scale gold miners at Bulyanhulu; villagers attack the Barrick gold mine in the North Mara region
2006: Creation of Export Processing Zones (EPZ) Authority; termination of South African management contract for TANESCO; government announces a plan to review all mining contracts
2007: Bank of Tanzania/EPA scandal
2008: Violence at the Barrick Gold North Mara mine; Presidential Commission on Mining criticizes foreign companies and calls for higher royalties and government co-ownership; Richmond and BAI scandals; resignation of Prime Minister Lowassa and dismissal of the entire cabinet; arrest of former Ministers of Finance and of Energy; creation of the Presidential Empowerment Fund

2009: President Kikwete halts the privatization process to investigate privatized firms; suspension of new biofuel investments; Wildlife Conservation Act limiting foreign investors

2010: Parliament passes a new Mining Act that increases royalties and restricts foreign ownership; Public Private Partnership Act; Zanzibar votes to permit the formation of a coalition government; reelection of President Kikwete