

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## AQUINAS'S *DISPUTED QUESTIONS ON EVIL*

Thomas Aquinas's *Disputed Questions on Evil* is a careful and detailed analysis of the general topic of evil, including discussions on evil as privation, human free choice, the cause of moral evil, moral failure, and the so-called seven deadly sins. This collection of ten specially commissioned new essays, the first book-length English-language study of *Disputed Questions on Evil*, examines the most interesting and philosophically relevant aspects of Aquinas's work, highlighting what is distinctive about it and situating it in relation not only to Aquinas's other works but also to contemporary philosophical debates in metaphysics, ethics, and philosophy of action. The essays also explore the history of the work's interpretation. The volume will be of interest to researchers in a broad range of philosophical disciplines including medieval philosophy and history of philosophy, as well as to theologians.

M. V. DOUGHERTY is Professor of Philosophy at Ohio Dominican University. He is the author of *Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas* (Cambridge, 2011) and editor of *Pico della Mirandola: New Essays* (Cambridge, 2008).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

*Titles published in this series:*Hegel's *Phenomenology of Spirit*

EDITED BY DEAN MOYAR AND MICHAEL QUANTE

Mill's *On Liberty*

EDITED BY C. L. TEN

Kant's *Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim*

EDITED BY AMÉLIE OKSENBERG RORTY AND JAMES SCHMIDT

Kant's *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals*

EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMANN

Kant's *Critique of Practical Reason*

EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMANN

Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*

EDITED BY ARIF AHMED

Kierkegaard's *Concluding Unscientific Postscript*

EDITED BY RICK ANTHONY FURTAK

Plato's *Republic*

EDITED BY MARK L. MCPHERRAN

Plato's *Laws*

EDITED BY CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH

Spinoza's *Theological-Political Treatise*

EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED AND MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL

Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics*

EDITED BY JON MILLER

Kant's *Metaphysics of Morals*

EDITED BY LARA DENIS

Nietzsche's *On the Genealogy of Morality*

EDITED BY SIMON MAY

Kant's *Observations and Remarks*

EDITED BY RICHARD VELKLEY AND SUSAN SHELL

Augustine's *City of God*

EDITED BY JAMES WETZEL

Descartes' *Meditations*

EDITED BY KAREN DETLEFSEN

Kant's *Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason*

EDITED BY GORDON MICHALSON

Kant's *Lectures on Anthropology*

EDITED BY ALIX COHEN

Kierkegaard's *Fear and Trembling*

EDITED BY DANIEL CONWAY

Kant's *Lectures on Ethics*

EDITED BY LARA DENIS AND OLIVER SENSEN

Aristotle's *Physics*

EDITED BY MARISKA LEUNISSEN

Aristotle's *Politics*

EDITED BY THORNTON LOCKWOOD AND THANASSIS SAMARAS

Aquinas's *Disputed Questions on Evil*

EDITED BY M. V. DOUGHERTY

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

AQUINAS'S *Disputed*  
*Questions on Evil*

A Critical Guide

EDITED BY

M. V. DOUGHERTY



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide  
 Edited by M. V. Dougherty  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107044340](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107044340)

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Aquinas's *disputed questions on evil*: a critical guide / edited by M. V. Dougherty.

pages cm. – (Cambridge critical guides)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04434-0 (hbk)

1. Thomas, Aquinas, Saint, 1225? – 1274. *Quaestiones disputatae de malo*.
2. Good and evil. 3. Sin – Christianity. I. Dougherty, M. V., 1973– editor.

BJ1400.T483.A68 2015

III'.84–dc23 2015023046

ISBN 978-1-107-04434-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction	I
<i>M. V. Dougherty</i>	
1 Metaphysical themes in <i>De malo</i> , I	12
<i>John F. Wippel</i>	
2 Weakness and willful wrongdoing in Aquinas's <i>De malo</i>	34
<i>Bonnie Kent and Ashley Dressel</i>	
3 Free choice	56
<i>Tobias Hoffmann and Peter Furlong</i>	
4 Venial sin and the ultimate end	75
<i>Steven J. Jensen</i>	
5 The promise and pitfalls of glory: Aquinas on the forgotten vice of vainglory	101
<i>Rebecca Konyndyk DeYoung</i>	
6 The goodness and evil of objects and ends	126
<i>Thomas M. Osborne, Jr.</i>	
7 Evil and moral failure in <i>De malo</i>	146
<i>Carl N. Still and Darren E. Dahl</i>	
8 Attention, intentionality, and mind-reading in Aquinas's <i>De malo</i> , q. 16, a. 8	164
<i>Therese Scarpelli Cory</i>	

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

*Contents*

9	Evil as privation: the Neoplatonic background to Aquinas's <i>De malo</i> , 1 <i>Fran O'Rourke</i>	192
10	Moral luck and the capital vices in <i>De malo</i> : gluttony and lust <i>M. V. Dougherty</i>	222
	<i>Bibliography</i>	235
	<i>Index</i>	246

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contributors

THERESE SCARPELLI CORY is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. She is the author of *Aquinas on Human Self-Knowledge* (Cambridge, 2014) and has published articles in journals including *Recherches de Théologie et Philosophie médiévales*, *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, *Tópicos*, and *Vivarium*.

DARREN E. DAHL is Adjunct Professor in the Department of Religion and Culture at St. Thomas More College and a Fellow in the Classical, Medieval, and Renaissance Studies Program at the University of Saskatchewan.

REBECCA KONYNDYK DEYOUNG is Professor of Philosophy at Calvin College. She is the author of *Vainglory: The Forgotten Vice* (2014) and *Glittering Vices: A New Look at the Seven Deadly Sins and Their Remedies* (2009). She is co-author of *Aquinas's Ethics: Metaphysical Foundations, Theological Context, and Moral Theory* (with Colleen McCluskey and Christina Van Dyke, 2009). She has published articles in journals including *Res Philosophica*, *The Thomist*, and *Faith and Philosophy*.

M. V. DOUGHERTY is Professor of Philosophy at Ohio Dominican University. He is the author of *Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas* (Cambridge, 2011) and editor of *Pico della Mirandola: New Essays* (Cambridge, 2008). His articles have appeared in journals including *Recherches de Théologie et Philosophie médiévales* and *The Review of Metaphysics*.

ASHLEY DRESSEL is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at The College of St. Scholastica in Duluth, Minnesota. She has published articles in journals including *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

*Contributors*

PETER FURLONG is Assistant Professor of Humanities at Valencia College in Orlando, Florida. His recent articles have appeared in *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly*, *Faith and Philosophy*, and *International Philosophical Quarterly*.

TOBIAS HOFFMANN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at The Catholic University of America. His publications include *Creatura intellecta: Die Ideen und Possibilitäten bei Duns Scotus mit Ausblick auf Franz von Mayronis, Poncius und Mastrius* (2002) and he has edited and co-edited several collections, including *Aquinas and the 'Nicomachean Ethics'* (with Jörn Müller and Matthias Perkams, Cambridge, 2013), *A Companion to Angels in Medieval Philosophy* (2012), and *Weakness of Will from Plato to the Present*. He has also published Latin-German text editions, most recently *Johannes Duns Scotus: Freiheit, Tugenden und Naturgesetz* (2012).

STEVEN J. JENSEN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of St. Thomas, Houston, Texas. His publications include *Knowing the Natural Law* (2015), *Living the Good Life* (2013), and *Good and Evil Actions* (2010). His articles have appeared in journals including *Nova et Vetera*, *International Philosophical Quarterly*, and *The Thomist*.

BONNIE KENT is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Irvine. She is the author of *Virtues of the Will: The Transformation of Ethics in the Late Thirteenth Century* (1995), and her articles have appeared in journals including *History of Philosophy Quarterly*, *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, and *Journal of the History of Philosophy*.

FRAN O'ROURKE is Associate Professor of Philosophy at University College Dublin. He is the author of *Aristotelian Interpretations* (2016), *Pseudo-Dionysius and the Metaphysics of Aquinas* (2005), and *Allwisest Stagyrte: Joyce's Quotations from Aristotle* (2005). He edited *What Happened in and to Moral Philosophy in the Twentieth Century? Philosophical Essays in Honor of Alasdair MacIntyre* (2013) and *Human Destinies: Philosophical Essays in Memory of Gerald Hanratty* (2012).

THOMAS M. OSBORNE, JR., is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Center for Thomistic Studies, University of St. Thomas, Houston, Texas. His publications include *Human Action in Thomas Aquinas, John Duns Scotus, and William of Ockham* (2014) and *Love of Self and Love of God in Thirteenth-Century Ethics* (2005). His



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Contributors*

ix

recent articles have been published in journals including *Recherches de Théologie et Philosophie médiévales* and *The Thomist*.

CARL N. STILL is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Dean at St. Thomas More College, University of Saskatchewan. He is co-author of *Aquinas: A Guide for the Perplexed* (with Peter S. Eardley, 2010), and co-editor of *Essays in Medieval Philosophy and Theology in Memory of Walter H. Principe, CSB: Fortresses and Launching Pads* (with James R. Ginther, 2005) and *Being and Thought in Aquinas* (with Jeremiah Hackett and William Murnion, 2004). His articles have appeared in journals including *International Philosophical Quarterly*, *Canadian Journal of History*, and *The Thomist*.

JOHN F. WIPPEL is the Theodore Basselin Professor of Philosophy at The Catholic University of America. He is the author of *Metaphysical Themes in Thomas Aquinas II* (2007), *The Metaphysical Thought of Thomas Aquinas* (2000), *Mediaeval Reactions to the Encounter between Faith and Reason* (1995), *Boethius of Dacia: 'On the Supreme Good,' 'On the Eternity of the World,' 'On Dreams'* (1987), *Metaphysical Themes in Thomas Aquinas* (1984) and *The Metaphysical Thought of Godfrey of Fontaines* (1981).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## *Acknowledgments*

I am pleased to acknowledge those who have assisted with this book. Hilary Gaskin invited me to propose a volume for the *Cambridge Critical Guides* series and offered excellent guidance along the way. The reviewers for the press provided insightful and helpful suggestions. It has been a pleasure to work with the authors of each chapter, and I am grateful to them for their contributions and support for this project. For help in the production and editing phases of the volume, I would like to thank Rosemary Crawley, Jenny Slater, Jonathan Ratcliffe, Christofere Nzalankazi, and Emma Collison. My colleagues at Ohio Dominican University continue to provide an outstanding working environment, and I am particularly indebted to Lawrence Masek, Matthew Ponesse, Justin Habash, and Bruce Gartner.

The library staff at Ohio Dominican University offered valuable help, and I would like to thank Tim Sandusky, Shaunda Tichelaar, and Matilda Davis-Northrup. The cover illustration of *De malo* from Thomas Aquinas's *Opera omnia* (Antwerp: Ioannes Keerbergius, 1612) was generously allowed by the A. T. Wehrle Memorial Library at the Pontifical College Josephinum, and I am grateful to Peter Veracka for his assistance. A 2014 Faculty Summer Grant from Ohio Dominican University assisted with the completion of this project. My wife, Michelle Dougherty, has been a continual source of excellent editorial advice and good cheer.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations***Series**

PG	<i>Patrologia Graeca</i>
PL	<i>Patrologia Latina</i>
CSEL	<i>Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum</i>
CCSL	<i>Corpus Christianorum Series Latina</i>

**Works**

<i>DCD</i>	Augustine, <i>De civitate Dei</i>
<i>DLA</i>	Augustine, <i>De libero arbitrio</i>
<i>DMM</i>	Augustine, <i>De moribus Manichaeorum</i>
<i>DMS</i>	Proclus, <i>De malorum subsistentia</i>
<i>DN</i>	Pseudo-Dionysius, <i>De divinis nominibus</i>
<i>DNB</i>	Augustine, <i>De natura boni</i>
<i>DSS</i>	Aquinas, <i>De substantiis separatis</i>
<i>ENC</i>	Augustine, <i>Enchiridion</i>
<i>In BDT</i>	Aquinas, <i>Expositio super librum Boethii De Trinitate</i>
<i>In DA</i>	Aquinas, <i>Sententia libri De anima</i>
<i>In DDN</i>	Aquinas, <i>Expositio super Dionysium De divinis nominibus</i>
<i>In MR</i>	Aquinas, <i>Sententia libri De memoria et reminiscencia</i>
<i>In Meta</i>	Aquinas, <i>Sententia super Metaphysicam</i>
<i>In NE</i>	Aquinas, <i>Sententia libri Ethicorum</i>
<i>In Rom</i>	Aquinas, <i>Lectura super Epistolam Pauli Apostoli ad Romanos</i>
<i>In Sent</i>	Aquinas, <i>Scriptum super libros Sententiarum</i>
<i>QDC</i>	Aquinas, <i>Quaestiones disputatae De caritate</i>
<i>QDM</i>	Aquinas, <i>Quaestiones disputatae De malo</i>
<i>QDP</i>	Aquinas, <i>Quaestiones disputatae De potentia</i>
<i>QDV</i>	Aquinas, <i>Quaestiones disputatae De veritate</i>

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04434-0 - Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil: A Critical Guide

Edited by M. V. Dougherty

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

*Abbreviations*

<i>QDVCom</i>	Aquinas, <i>Quaestio disputata De virtutibus in communi</i>
<i>QQ</i>	Aquinas, <i>Quaestiones de quodlibet I-XII</i>
<i>Resp. de 43 art.</i>	Aquinas, <i>Responsio de 43 articulis</i>
<i>Resp. de 36 art.</i>	Aquinas, <i>Responsio de 36 articulis</i>
<i>SCG</i>	Aquinas, <i>Summa contra Gentiles</i>
<i>ST</i>	Aquinas, <i>Summa theologiae</i>