THE CONSTITUTION OF RISK

The Constitution of Risk is the first book to combine constitutional theory with the theory of risk regulation. The book argues that constitutional rulemaking is best understood as a means of managing political risks. Constitutional law structures and regulates the risks that arise in and from political life, such as an executive coup or military putsch, political abuse of ideological or ethnic minorities, corrupt self-dealing by officials, or pathological regulatory decision making by experts. The book claims that the best way to manage political risks is an approach it calls "optimizing constitutionalism" – in contrast to the worst-case thinking that underpins "precautionary constitutionalism," a mainstay of liberal constitutional theory. Drawing on a broad range of disciplines such as decision theory, game theory, welfare economics, political science, and psychology, this book advocates constitutional rulemaking undertaken in a spirit of welfare maximization and offers a corrective to the pervasive and frequently irrational attitude of distrust of official power that is prominent in American constitutional history, theory, and public discourse.

Adrian Vermeule is John H. Watson Professor of Law at Harvard Law School. He is the author or coauthor of seven previous books, most recently *The System of the Constitution* (2011). He was formerly Bernard D. Meltzer Professor of Law at the University of Chicago, and he was elected to the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in 2012.

The Constitution of Risk

Adrian Vermeule

Harvard Law School



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107618978

© Adrian Vermeule 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Vermeule, Adrian. The constitution of risk / Adrian Vermeule, Harvard Law School pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-04372-5 (hardback) 1. Constitutional law – United States. 2. Risk management – Political aspects – United States. I. Title. KF4550.V366 2013 342.73-dc23 2013027300

ISBN 978-1-107-04372-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-61897-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	Introduction	page 1
PAR	RT I. THEORY	
1.	Precautionary Constitutionalism	27
2.	Optimizing Constitutionalism: The Mature Position	52
PAR	TTII. APPLICATIONS	
3.	The Framers' Self-Defeating Precautions	91
4.	The Risks of Impartiality: On Judging in One's Own Cause	107
5.	The Risks of Deliberation: Second Opinions	141
6.	The Risks of Expertise: Political Administration and Expert Groupthink	163
	Conclusion: Constitutional Rulemaking Without a Style	186
Acknowledgments		193
Index		195

"One of the chief advantages derived by the present generation from the improvement and diffusion of philosophy, is deliverance from unnecessary terrours, and exemption from false alarms.... The advancement of political knowledge may be expected to produce, in time, the like effects. Causeless discontent, and seditious violence, will grow less frequent and less formidable, as the science of government is better ascertained, by a diligent study of the theory of man."

Samuel Johnson, "The False Alarm," 1770