MICHELANGELO'S DAVID

This book takes a new look at the interpretations of, and the historical information surrounding, Michelangelo's David. New documentary materials discovered by Rolf Bagemihl add to the early history of the stone block that became the David and provide an identity for the painted terracotta colossus that stood on the Cathedral buttresses for which Michelangelo's statue was to be a companion. The David, with its placement at the Palazzo della Signoria, was deeply entwined in the civic history of Florence, where public nakedness played a ritual role in the military and in the political lives of its people. This book, then, places the David not only within the artistic history of Florence and its monuments but also within the popular culture of the period.

John T. Paoletti is Professor of the History of Art, Emeritus, and the William R. Kenan Professor of the Humanities, Emeritus, at Wesleyan University. He taught the history of Italian Renaissance art and of the art of the twentieth century there from 1972 to 2009. He received Wesleyan's Binswanger Prize for Excellence in Teaching and the College Art Association’s Distinguished Teaching of Art History Award. He has been a Fellow at the School of Historical Studies, the Institute of Advanced Study at Princeton and a visiting professor at the Villa I Tatti, the Harvard Center for Renaissance Studies in Florence. From 1996 to 2000, he was the editor in chief of The Art Bulletin. He is coauthor, with Gary Radke, of Art in Renaissance Italy, now in its fourth edition. He is coeditor, with Roger Crum, of Renaissance Florence: A Social History (Cambridge University Press, 2006).
Michelangelo, *David*, 1501–1504, marble, 516 cm h. (672 cm with the base), Florence, Accademia (Photo: Alinari/Art Resource, NY)
MICHELANGELO'S DAVID

FLORENTINE HISTORY
AND CIVIC IDENTITY

JOHN T. PAOLETTI

with documents newly transcribed and edited by

ROLF BAGEMIHL
for Leslie
CONTENTS

List of Figures  page viii

INTRODUCTION  1

1. THE COMMISSION AND HISTORY OF THE DAVID  17
   Box 1.1. The 1504 Advisory Committee  45
   Box 1.2. Chronology for the David  58

2. DAVID, NARRATIVE AMBIGUITY, AND THE
   COMPETITION WITH ANTIQUITY  76

3. THE DAVID AND SCULPTURE AT THE CATHEDRAL  111
   Box 3.1. Chronology of Sculpture at the Cathedral and Baptistry at the Beginning of the Sixteenth Century  127

4. DAVID AND THE SYMBOLS OF THE STATE AT THE
   PALAZZO DELLA SIGNORIA  141
   Box 4.1. Chronology of Decorative and Sculptural Programs at the Palazzo della Signoria and Associated Historical Events  167

5. NAKED MEN IN PIAZZA  175

Appendix A. Concerning Michelangelo’s David and Other Related Commissions  199
   Part 1: Original Documents for Michelangelo’s David and Its Predecessors  201
   Part 2: Translation of Documents for Michelangelo’s David and Its Predecessors  264

Appendix B. Report of the Committee to Advise on the Placement of the David: Transcription and Translation  313

Notes  323
Bibliography  363
Index  377
FIGURES

Frontispiece. Michelangelo, *David*, 1501–1504, marble, 516 cm h. (672 cm with the base), Florence, Accademia

1. Michelangelo, *Battle of the Centaurs and Lapiths*, c. 1492, marble, 84.5 × 90.5 cm, Florence, Casa Buonarroti, Inv. 194

2. Michelangelo, *Bacchus*, 1496–1497, marble, 195 cm h. (209 cm with the base), Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello, Inv. S.10

3. Cartoon from 1872 showing the *David* in a protective box


5. View of the Piazza della Signoria from the Via Calzaiuoli

6. Nanni di Banco, *Isaiah*, 1408, marble, 190 cm (75″) h., Florence, Cathedral

7. Attributed to Donatello, *Prophet*, c. 1409, marble, 188 cm (74″) h., Florence, Museo dell’Opera del Duomo (shown in reverse)

8. Donatello, *David*, c. 1416 (?), marble, 191 cm (75 1/4″) h., Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello

9. Stefano Bonsignori, *Nova pulcherrimae civitatis Florentiae topographia accuratissima delineata*, 1584, engraving, detail showing the Cathedral, Florence, Museo di Firenze Com’era

10. Fiberglass reproduction of the *David* in place on the buttress of the Duomo of Florence in November 2010


13. Donatello, *David*, c. 1460–1469, bronze, 159 cm h., Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello (formerly in the courtyard of the Medici Palace, and, after 1495, in the courtyard of the Palazzo della Signoria)

14. Andrea del Verrocchio, *David*, c. 1463–1465, bronze with partial gilding, 125 cm h., Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello (formerly at the entrance of the Sala dei Gigli in the Palazzo della Signoria). The photograph shows the head of Goliath displaced from between the feet of the figure, as it was shown after the completion of the restoration in 2003
15. Photomontage showing the David located in the central arch of the Loggia della Signoria

16. Fra Angelico, SS. Cosmas and Damian before the Sultan Lycias, panel from the predella of the San Marco Altarpiece, c. 1439–1440, tempera on poplar, 37.8 × 46.6 cm, Munich, Alte Pinakotek, Inv. WAF 36

17. Michelangelo, David, 1501–1504, seen from behind, Florence, Accademia


19. Michelangelo, David, detail of left arm and hand showing cracks in the marble from the damage of 1527

20. Illustration from Nuova Illustrazione, January 18, 1874, showing David being moved in 1873 to the Accademia

21. Michelangelo, David, view from the left side

22. Raphael, Drawing after Michelangelo's David, c. 1504–1508, pen and brown ink with faint traces of underdrawing in black chalk, 39.3 × 21.9 cm, London, The British Museum, Department of Prints and Drawings

23. Leonardo da Vinci, Sketches for a Figure of Neptune with Seahorses and a Palace, c. 1503–1508, charcoal or soft black chalk, partly reworked with pen and brown ink, 27 × 20.1 cm, Windsor, Royal Library, no. 12591 recto

24. Mariano del Buono, illumination for Giovanni di Paolo da Castro, Expositio in Psalmum 'Miserere mei Deus,' c. 1466, Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Ms. Plut. 10.27, f. 23v, Su concessione del Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali; the figure accompanies an independent letter within the bound volume dedicated to Piero di Cosimo de' Medici, Divino Petri Magni Cosme de Medicis Johannes Castrensis humili cum commendatione salutem [fols. 21v–23r]

25. Michelangelo, drawing of his bronze David, c. 1503, brown ink on paper with traces of black chalk, 262 × 185 cm, Paris, Louvre, Inv. n. 714F

26. Michelangelo, St. Matthew, c. 1503–1512, marble, 271 cm h., Florence, Accademia

27. Antonio Rossellino, St. Sebastian, c. 1475, Empoli, Museo del Collegiata di Sant'Andrea

28. Michelangelo, David, detail of right hand

29. Master of the St. John Statuettes, David, late fifteenth–early sixteenth century, terracotta, 50 cm h., Washington, National Gallery of Art, Samuel H. Kress Collection, 1943.4.81


31. Lorenzo and Vittorio Ghiberti (with assistants), Adam, c. 1453–1463/64, bronze, Florence, San Giovanni, left reveal of the south door
32. Antonio Rizzo, *Adam*, after 1483 (?), marble, 202 cm, Venice, Palazzo Ducale (originally on the Arco Foscari in the courtyard of the Palazzo Ducale) 86
33. Tullio Lombardo, *Adam*, c. 1490–1494, marble, New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, Fletcher Fund, 36.163 (formerly Venice, SS. Giovanni e Paolo, Vendramin Tomb) 87
34. Masaccio, *Expulsion of Adam and Eve from Paradise*, c. 1426, fresco, Florence, Santa Maria del Carmine, Brancacci Chapel, left wall of entrance arch 88
35. Michelangelo, *Temptation of Adam and Eve and the Expulsion of Adam and Eve from Paradise*, c. 1510, fresco, Vatican City, Sistine Chapel, ceiling 89
36. Masolino, *Temptation of Adam and Eve*, c. 1424–1427, fresco, Florence, Santa Maria del Carmine, Brancacci Chapel, right wall of entrance arch 90
37. Nicola Pisano, *Hercules/Daniel*, 1260, marble, Pisa, Baptistry, detail from marble pulpit 91
38. *Hercules*, c. 1335–1337, marble, Florence, Cathedral, left reveal of the Porta della Mandorla 92
39. Antonio Pollaiuolo, *Hercules and Anteus*, c. 1475, tempera and oil on panel, 16 × 9 cm, Florence, Uffizi 93
40. Antonio del Pollaiuolo, *Hercules and Anteus*, c. 1475, bronze, 45 cm h., Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello 94
41. Andrea Pisano, *Hercules and Cacus*, late 1330s–early 1340s, marble, 32 3/4 × 27 1/8” (83 × 69 cm.), Florence, Museo dell’Opera del Duomo (formerly on the Campanile of the Florence Cathedral) 97
42. Michelangelo, *David*, detail of the tree stump 98
44. *Hercules*, second century BCE gilt bronze, 2.40 m., Rome, Palazzo dei Conservatori 103
46. Michelangelo, *Pietà*, 1498–1499, Rome, St. Peter’s, detail of Mary’s belt showing Michelangelo’s signature 107
47. Michelangelo, *Battle of Cascina*, c. 1505, chalk and silver on paper, 2.35 × 356 cm (9 1/4 × 14”), Florence, Uffizi, Gabinetto dei Disegni e delle Stampe 109
48. Andrea Sansovino, *Baptism of Christ*, 1502–1505, Florence, Museo dell’Opera del Duomo (formerly over the east door of the Baptistery) 112
49. Giovan Francesco Rustici, *Preaching of the Baptist*, 1506–1511, bronze, Florence, Museo dell’Opera del Duomo (formerly over the north door of the Baptistry) 114
52. Andrea Ferrucci, *St. Andrew*, 1512–1514, marble, Florence, Cathedral 119
53. Donatello, Abraham and Isaac, c. 1421 marble, 191 cm h., Florence, Museo dell’Opera del Duomo
54. Benedetto da Rovere, St. John the Evangelist, 1513–1514, marble, Florence, Cathedral
55. Bernardo Ciuffagni, King David, 1433, marble, Florence, Cathedral
56. Baccio Bandinelli, St. Peter, 1515–1517, marble, Florence, Cathedral
57. Donatello, St. Mark, c. 1411–1413, marble, Florence, Museo di Or San Michele (originally for the niche of the Linen Workers’ Guild, on the south side of Or San Michele)
58. Giovanni Toscani, Feast of St. John the Baptist, cassone panel, tempera on panel, early fifteenth century, Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello
59. Ricci di Lorenzo, St. Thomas, c. 1436, fresco, Florence, Cathedral
60. Plan of the Cathedral of Florence showing dedication of altars of the tribunes (modified from Giovanni Poggi, Il Duomo di Firenze)
62. Baccio Bandinelli, Orpheus, 1519, marble, Florence, Palazzo Medici, courtyard
63. Tivoli General, late second or early first century BCE, marble, 194 cm, Rome, Museo Nazionale Romano, Palazzo Massimo alle Terme
64. View of Old St. Peter’s, detail, Rome, Vatican Palace, Quartiere delle Guardie Nobili (Apartment of Julius III), fresco, c. 1555–1559
65. Martin van Heemskerck, Lansenquets in Front of Castel Sant’Angelo, engraving from Victorias de Carlos V – Clemente VII Cercado en el Castillo de Sant Angelo – 1527 – Saqueo de Roma, after 1555, engraving, Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, Coleccion
66. Florence, Palazzo della Signoria, view of the main portal showing the David paired with Baccio Bandinelli’s Hercules and Cacus, put in place in 1534
67. Florence, Loggia della Signoria, detail of pier showing lion heads
69. Niccolò di Forzore Spinelli [Niccolò Fiorentino], Medal of Lorenzo de’ Medici, c. 1490, bronze, 9 cm diam., New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Ann and George Blumenthal Fund, 1950.58.4
70. Hercules and Telephus (sometimes referred to as Hercules Commodus), Roman copy of a Greek bronze statue of the fourth century BCE, marble, Vatican, Vatican Museums, Museo Chiaramonti
71. Giovanni Stradanus, detail of Presentation of Leo X’s gift of a papal hat and sword to the Priors of Florence, c. 1560–1561, fresco, Florence, Palazzo Vecchio, Room of Leo X, basamento
72. Parade “giants” in the procession for the feast of St. Firmin, Pamplona
73. Flight into Egypt from Meditations on the Life of Christ, fourteenth century, Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Ms. Ital. 115, fol. 39v
74. Filippo Lippi, *Studio nudes*, 1475, silverpoint on prepared paper, Oxford, Christ Church Picture Gallery (pasted into a portfolio of drawings for his collection by Giorgio Vasari)


76. Michelangelo, *Nude*, after 1513, marble, 7′ 6″ h., Paris, Musée du Louvre; originally created for the tomb of Julius II

77. Francesco del Cossa, Ercole de’ Roberti and others, on designs probably provided by Cosmé Tura, Hall of the months, detail of April and May, 1469–1470, fresco, Ferrara, Palazzo Schifanoia

78. Jerome Cock, after Martin van Heemskerk, *Sack of Rome and the Death of Charles de Bourbon*, from *Divi Caroli V Imp. opt max victoriae*, 1555, copper engraving

79. Lippo Vanni, *Victory of the Sienese Troops at the Val di Chiana in 1363*, c. 1364 (?), fresco, Siena, Palazzo Pubblico, Sala del Mappamondo

80. After Antonio Pollaiuolo, *Battle of the Naked Men*, c. 1490 (after original, c. 1465–1470), engraving, 40 × 58 cm, New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, Maitland F. Griggs, B.A. 1896, Fund, 1951.9.18

81. Andrea del Sarto, *Two Men Hanging Upside Down*, 1530, red chalk on cream paper, 20.6 × 19.2 cm, Chatsworth House, Derbyshire, Devonshire Collection

82. *Death and Mutilation of Simon de Montfort at the Battle of Evesham* [1265], late thirteenth century, vellum, from the *Commendatio Lamentabilis in transitu Edward IV*, London, British Library, Cotton MS Nero D ii, fol. 177