The first three centuries AD saw the spread of new religious ideas through the Roman Empire, crossing a vast and diverse geographical, social, and cultural space. In this innovative study, Anna Collar examines both how this happened, and why. Drawing on research in the sociology and anthropology of religion, physics and computer science, Collar examines the relationship between social networks and religious transmission to explore why some religious movements succeed, while others, seemingly equally successful at a certain time, ultimately fail. Using extensive epigraphic data, Collar provides new interpretations of the diffusion of ideas across the social networks of the Jewish Diaspora and the cults of Jupiter Dolichenus and Theos Hypsistos, and in turn offers important reappraisals of the spread of religious innovations in the Roman Empire. This study will be a valuable resource for students and scholars of ancient history, archaeology, ancient religion and network theory.

Anna Collar is Fellow of the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at the University of Cambridge, and has published articles in Mediterranean Historical Review, Asia Minor Studien, Iuppiter Dolichenus (Habelt), and Network Analysis and Archaeology.
RELIgIOUS NETWORKS IN THE ROMAN EMPIRE

The Spread of New Ideas

ANNA COLLAR

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
Content

List of figures and maps  page vi
Acknowledgements  viii
List of select abbreviations  xi

Introduction  1
1 The network approach  5
2 Networks and religion in the Roman world  40
3 Jupiter Dolichenus: military networks on the edges of empire  79
4 The Jewish Diaspora in the west: the rabbinic reforms, ethnicity and the (re?)activation of Jewish identity  146
5 Theos Hypsistos: God-fearers, the rabbinic reforms, the fiscus Judaicus and the redefinition of the Jewish–gentile relationship  224
Conclusions: religion and social networks in archaeology and ancient history  287

Bibliography  292
Index  316
Figures and maps

FIGURES
1.1 The small-world network page 11
1.2 Upper and lower boundaries within which information cascades are possible 21
3.1 Stele from the central temple of Jupiter Dolichenus at Doliche 87
3.2 Stele of Jupiter Dolichenus found at Carnuntum 88

MAPS
3.1 The region of Doliche 81
3.2 Early distribution map of evidence for the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus 100
3.3 Movements of officers worshipping Jupiter Dolichenus in the Roman army 118
3.4 Full distribution map of evidence for the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus 120
3.5 Full PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus 126
3.6 Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: first century BC—AD 150 128
3.7 Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: AD 151–211 130
3.8 Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: AD 212–253 132
3.9 Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: AD 254–300 134
4.1 Movements of Jews in the western Jewish Diaspora 204
4.2 Distribution map of evidence for the western Jewish Diaspora 206
4.3 Full PPA of the Jewish Diaspora 208
4.4 Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: first—second centuries AD 214
4.5 Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: third century AD 216
4.6 Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: fourth century AD 218
4.7 Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: fifth—sixth centuries AD 220
5.1 Distribution map of evidence for the cult of Theos Hypsistos 242
List of figures and maps

5.2 Full PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos 272
5.3 Temporal PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos: Hellenistic period–first century BC 276
5.4 Temporal PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos: first century AD 278
5.5 Temporal PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos: second–third centuries AD 280
This book has been a long time coming, and, of course, there are many people without whom it could not have been achieved at all. The original research was completed as my Ph.D. thesis, written between 2004 and 2008 at the University of Exeter, under the supervision of Stephen Mitchell and as part of his AHRC-funded project on *Pagan Monotheism in its Intellectual Context*. Stephen’s consistent intellectual generosity and vision gave me the confidence and freedom to pursue new lines of thought, and his lucid criticism, careful guidance and unstinting support ensured that the project met with success. His continued friendship and enthusiasm for my work mean that I cannot thank him enough. My work has been fundamentally inspired by that of Carl Knappett, whose intellect, drive and quest for innovative approaches to archaeology have always challenged and demanded more of me. Without our numerous conversations and his influence and support I should be a laggard indeed.

A number of institutions have generously supported my research, both financially and in kind: the AHRC, the British Institute at Ankara, the British School at Athens, the Kluge Center at the Library of Congress and the Forschungsstelle Asia Minor in Münster. My thanks are due to Elmar Schwertheim, who welcomed me to the Forschungsstelle, and Engelbert Winter, who incorporated me into the excavation team at Dülük Baba Tepesi and who has supported my work ever since. My thanks go to the entire team in all its configurations, and especially to my epigraphic guides, Margherita Facella and Charles Crowther. In my third year I was fortunate enough to be an AHRC British Council fellow at the Kluge Center, I thank everybody there for the opportunity and for their great hospitality. Working alongside the people in the Classics and Ancient History department at Exeter was a great pleasure, my thanks to all of them, and especially to the tireless and wonderful Claire Turner and Kerensa Pearson. Irad Malkin I thank wholeheartedly for his enthusiastic support and for pushing for the inclusion of my initial, tentative attempt at exploring networks in the first
Acknowledgements

volume of the special edition of the Mediterranean Historical Review. I am grateful to Tom Elliott (previously of the Ancient World Mapping Center) for enabling my access to the electronic versions of the Barrington Atlas. My editor at Cambridge University Press, Laura Morris, has been patient, kind and supportive; my sub-editor, Anna Lowe, has helped greatly with thinking about images and the final production and Barbara Docherty has done an incredible job of copy-editing: I thank them all most warmly for their hard work in getting this book into production.

The chapter on Jupiter Dolichenus has been enormously improved by conversations with and corrections by Michael Blömer, my special thanks go to him for freely sharing with me his knowledge and ideas, and for being such a genial excavation partner and intellectual sounding board over many years. Anthony Birley generously shared his thoughts on the new Vindolanda Dolichenum and altar with me, and Simon James encouraged me greatly with his questions at the American Institute of Archaeology meeting in Philadelphia in 2009. My thoughts on networks, innovation and evolution have benefited greatly from intense and meandering conversations with physicists and philosophers: Jonathan Davies, Harry Platanakis and Jake Snow.

During my second year at Manchester University, I was privileged enough to be taught by Geoff Stone, who rekindled my childhood love of the ancient world, and who has encouraged my efforts ever since: to him I offer my warmest thanks. Along the way I have been blessed by the friendship of a huge number of people. During my time in America, and beyond, Alice Bellini, Theo Black, Jessica Bogo, Amie Brautigam, Fabrizio de Francesco, Daniel Matlin, Sonja and Al Mitchell, Ger O'Donoghue, Stefanie Reetz, Dave Saunders, Elsa Suckle, Jørgen, Jasper and Zoe Thomsen and Aaron Tugendhaft. From Exeter, Anna Blurtsyan, Rowan Fraser, Sean Goddard, Brutus Green, Pauline Hanesworth, Jill Hilditch, the Reverend Dr John Hughes, Alan Outram, Gillian Ramsey and Matthew Wright. My stints at the British Institute at Ankara have been made thoroughly enjoyable by both the staff, Yaprák Eran, Yiğit Erbil, Gülgün Gürdivan and Lutgarde Vandepoot, and by various companions along the way: Shane Brennan, Tristan Carter, Anastasia Christophilopoulou, Ricardo Borges de Castro, Boran Dervişoğlu, Hugh Elton, Naoise Mac Sweeney, Peter Popkin, Janine Su and Mark Weedon. Other great friends who have been instrumental over the years are Amalia Kakissis, Pete Lockley, Michael Scott and Pete Vardon. In particular, Laura Searle and Polly Westlake have been humorous and adventurous travel companions, risking their lives on more than one occasion to visit extreme places in Turkey with me. The long
Acknowledgements

and painful process of writing my Ph.D. would have been far less enjoyable without the company of some wonderful women: Susannah Cornwall, Cassie Hague, Sandra Lohmann, Sarah Lorimer, Bee Taylor, and especially, my blood, Rebecca Catto. Their support, brilliance and humour kept me sane.

My warmest thanks go to my Ph.D. examiners, Elena Isayev and Martin Millett who, during my viva, combined being excited and enthused about my project with clear criticisms and suggestions for improvement. Since then, they have both been the most supportive examiners one could hope for. I am extremely grateful to the two anonymous reviewers who have read this manuscript a number of times and who have offered useful suggestions and advice. This book would be poorer by far without the aid of these guides.

As ever, my most enormous love and thanks go to my amazing family, for their emotional, intellectual and financial support: my inspirational, irreverent, hilarious sisters Beth and Clio Collar. My wonderful, generous grandparents, Eileen and Leslie Carter, for always telling me to get a real job but actually being proud of me – it is a great sadness to me that my beloved grandpa did not live to see the final outcome of this effort. And finally, the triple stars in my sky – my radiant husband Stuart Eve, for everything, and my darling sons Wilfred and Edwin, the most extraordinary things in the world.

I here repeat and augment the dedication made in my Ph.D. thesis: to my adored dad, Nigel Collar, and to my incredible mum, Alison Carter. They have both in their different ways given me more than I could ever thank them for enough – argument, challenge, independence of thought and self, encouragement, love and an appreciation of the value of knowledge for its own sake.

This is for them.
Select abbreviations

AA Archäologischer Anzeiger
AE L'Année Épigraphique
AJA American Journal of Archaeology
AJP American Journal of Philology
AJS American Journal of Sociology
AJSLL American Journal of Semitic Languages and Literature
ANRW Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt
AOAT Alter Orient und Altes Testament
ASR American Sociological Review
AW Antike Welt
BA Biblical Archaeologist
CCID Corpus Cultus Iovis Dolicheni
CIG Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum, 4 vols. Berlin, 1825–1877
CIJ Corpus Inscriptionum Judaicum
CIL Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum
CJZC Corpus jüdischer Zeugnisse aus der Cyrenaika
EA Epigraphica Anatolica
HSCP Harvard Studies in Classical Philology
HThR Harvard Theological Review
IG Inscriptiones Graecae, 14 vols. Berlin, 1873–1890
IJO 1–3 Inscriptiones Judaicae Orientis vols. 1–111
IM Istanbuller Mitteilungen
JAOS Journal of the American Oriental Society
JECS Journal of Early Christian Studies
JIGRE Jewish Inscriptions of Graeco-Roman Egypt
JIWE Jewish Inscriptions of Western Europe
JJS Journal of Jewish Studies
JMA Journal of Mediterranean Archaeology
JPE Journal of Political Economy
JRA Journal of Roman Archaeology

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
List of select abbreviations

JRS  Journal of Roman Studies
JSJ  Journal for the Study of Judaism
KST  Kazi Sonuçları Toplantısı
MHR  Mediterranea Historical Review
RIB  The Roman Inscriptions of Britain
SCI  Scripta Classica Israelica
SEG  Supplementum epigraphicum graecum
Syll³  W. Ditterberger, Sylloge inscriptionum graecarum (SIL). Leipzig, 1915–1924
TAM  Tituli Asia Minoris
WA  World Archaeology