The Other Saudis

Toby Matthiesen traces the politics of the Shia in the Eastern Province of Saudi Arabia from the nineteenth century until the present day. This book outlines the difficult experiences of being Shia in a Wahhabi state, and casts new light on how the Shia have mobilised politically to change their position. Shia petitioned the rulers, joined secular opposition parties, and founded Islamist movements. Most Saudi Shia opposition activists profited from an amnesty in 1993 and subsequently found a place in civil society and the public sphere. But since 2011 a new Shia protest movement has again challenged the state. The Other Saudis shows how exclusionary state practices created an internal Other and how sectarian discrimination has strengthened Shia communal identities. The book is based on little-known Arabic sources, extensive fieldwork in Saudi Arabia, and interviews with key activists. Of immense geopolitical importance, the oil-rich Eastern Province is a crucial but little known factor in regional politics and Gulf security.

Toby Matthiesen is a Research Fellow in Islamic and Middle Eastern Studies at Pembroke College, University of Cambridge.
Cambridge Middle East Studies

Editorial Board
Charles Tripp (general editor)
Julia Clancy-Smith
F. Gregory Gause
Yezid Sayigh
Avi Shlaim
Judith E. Tucker

Cambridge Middle East Studies has been established to publish books on the nineteenth- to twenty-first-century Middle East and North Africa. The series offers new and original interpretations of aspects of Middle Eastern societies and their histories. To achieve disciplinary diversity, books are solicited from authors writing in a wide range of fields including history, sociology, anthropology, political science, and political economy. The emphasis is on producing books affording an original approach along theoretical and empirical lines. The series is intended for students and academics, but the more accessible and wide-ranging studies will also appeal to the interested general reader.

Other titles in the series can be found after the index.
The Other Saudis

Shiism, Dissent and Sectarianism

TOBY MATTHIESEN

University of Cambridge
To my parents
Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Maps and Pictures</th>
<th>page xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Note on Conventions</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xxiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Introduction
- In the Shadow of the Wahhabiyya 1
- The Shia in Historiography 10
- Sectarianism and Communal Politics 14
- Structure of the Book 19

1. Politics of Notables 24
- Shia Islam in Eastern Arabia 24
- An Imperial Frontier 29
- Political Economy of Piety 37
- The Shaykhyya and Clerical Networks 40
- Ibn Saud's Conquest of al-Hasa and Qatif 45
- The Shia Court in Qatif 54
- The Shia Court in al-Hasa 60
- Conclusion 64

2. Oil and Dissent 66
- A Saudi Workers Movement 68
- Local Elections 76
- Searching for the Arab Nation 81
- Communists and Co-optation 86
- Conclusion 89
## Contents

3. Shia Islamism
   - The Shirazi Movement
     - The Uprising of 1979
     - The Limits of Notable Politics
   Conclusion

4. A Decade of Confrontation
   - Revolutionary Iran and the Gulf Shia
   - Lost in Exile
   - A Female Vanguard
   - A New Governor and the Decline of the Left
   - The Hajj and Saudi-Iranian Tensions
   - The Line of the Imam
   Conclusion

5. No More Revolution
   - The Gulf Crisis and Calls for Reform
   - The Petitions Movement
   - Secret Negotiations
   - The Deal with King Fahd
   - Divided Opposition and the Khobar Bombings
   Conclusion

6. Marginal Recognition
   - The Integration of the Opposition
   - Civil Society
   - Shia Courts between Notables and Islamists
   - A Saudi Public Sphere
   - Abdullah and the 2003 Petitions
   - Politics of Representation
   - An Imagined Community Online
   Conclusion

7. A New Intifada
   - Sectarian Clashes
   - A Renewed Shia Protest Movement
   - Arrests and the Politics of Notables
   - The First Deaths
   - A Manhunt and Simmering Tensions
   Conclusion
   Conclusion: The Politics of Sectarianism

Bibliography
Index
Maps and Pictures

MAPS
1. Map of Saudi Arabia page xxiv
2. Map of al-Ahsa Oasis 3
3. Map of the coastal areas of the Eastern Province 7

PICTURES
0.1. Market and Ottoman fort in Hufuf 5
0.2. Tarut Island 6
1.1. Market in Hufuf 27
1.2. Fishermen in Dammam 31
1.3. Street scene in the Old City of Hufuf 33
1.4. Mansur bin Jum’a 37
1.5. Rock mountain and the village of al-Qara, al-Ahsa oasis 43
1.6. ʿAli Abu ʿAbd al-Karim al-Khunayzi 48
1.7. Ottoman fort and palace of the governor of al-Ahsa, Hufuf 54
1.8. Entrance to the Old City of Qatif 56
2.1. Date farmer in Qatif 67
2.2. Gas station in Qatif 71
2.3. Street scene in Dammam 74
3.1. Muhammad al-Shirazi 92
3.2. Aerial view of parts of Tarut Island 95
3.3. Protest during the 1979 uprising 104
3.4. Protest on 29 November 1979 (9 Muharram 1400), Safwa 106
3.5. Protesters carry a picture of Khomeini during the 1979 uprising 107
3.7.  Ruins of the Old City of Qatif  111
4.1.  Street scene in Qatif  124
4.2.  Picture of Khomeini on a door in Awwamiyya, 2008  127
4.3.  Picture of the four Hizbullah al-Hijaz members executed in 1988, Azhar ‘Ali al-Hijaj (bottom left), ‘Ali ‘Abdallah al-Khatim (center), Muhammad ‘Ali al-Qarus (top right), Khalid ‘Abd al-Hamid al-‘Alq (bottom right); as well as Muhammad Hasan al-Hayik (top left), who was arrested in 1996 and subsequently died in prison  136
5.1.  Logo of the Organisation for the Islamic Revolution in the Arabian Peninsula  145
6.1.  Mulla Hussayn al-Hammadi during Ashura, Imam Hussayn Mosque in the Old Town of Qatif, 24 November 2012  180
6.2.  King Abdullah and Hasan al-Saffar at the first National Dialogue meeting, June 2003, Riyadh  182
7.1.  Ashura in Qatif, 24 November 2012  199
7.2.  Protests in Qatif after the arrest of Nimr al-Nimr, 8 July 2012  211
Acknowledgements

This book is the product of countless conversations, extensive fieldwork and a close reading of textual sources. During my main period of fieldwork in Saudi Arabia, in 2008, discussing the histories and contemporary manifestations of being Shia in Saudi Arabia was possible in a way that it would not be for much longer. The mid-2000s were characterised by national dialogues and a public recognition on the part of King Abdullah that the Shia are an integral part of Saudi Arabia. Unlike in previous decades, particularly the most confrontational phase between 1979 and 1993, the history of Shia dissent, and of discrimination against them, was a topic that some Saudis were willing to discuss. When I finished the doctorate on which this book is based in 2011, what is often simplistically called ‘the Shia question’ in Saudi Arabia was framed very differently, however. Shia in the Eastern Province had staged mass protests for more rights, which undermined the notion that Saudi Arabia was somehow exempt from the fallout of the Arab uprisings. Research on Saudi Arabia, and particularly on a sensitive issue such as Shia politics, is extremely difficult and sources are hard to come by. While I had the opportunity to carry out fieldwork across Saudi Arabia, including in various cities and villages of the Eastern Province, I broadened the geographical scope of my fieldwork considerably. I interviewed Saudi Shia, opposition activists but also clerics, intellectuals, journalists and less politically active people in Europe, the United States, Bahrain, Kuwait, Syria and Lebanon. Across these countries I also searched for opposition publications and local historiographical books on Saudi Shia history. I found some on the outdoor book market in the Eastern Province city of Qatif, where one can buy books that are banned in Saudi Arabia for discussing Shia religious
Acknowledgements

beliefs or promoting historical narratives that contradict those of the rulers. I found them in Bahraini village bookshops; the owner of one of these bookshops has since been tortured to death as part of the crackdown on the 2011 uprising. I found them in the bustling alleys that lead up to the Shia shrine of Sayyida Zeinab outside of Damascus, then still a preferred holiday location for Gulf Shia and now a site of fierce fighting. I found some of the books in the Shia libraries in Kuwait, in the vast second-hand bookshops off of Beirut’s cosmopolitan Hamra Street and in the Shia publishing houses of Beirut’s southern suburbs, where most Saudi Shia historical books are published. I found them on London’s Edgware Road, and in libraries and private archives in Britain and the United States.

I have written about some of the fieldwork trips that led to this book elsewhere, particularly in *Sectarian Gulf*. In many ways, the two books complement each other, *The Other Saudis* outlining the historical struggle of the Shia in Saudi Arabia, and *Sectarian Gulf* detailing the protest movements and sectarian politics across the Gulf since 2011.

Many people have made this research possible; this list will inevitably be incomplete. Some of the Saudis and other Khalijis who shared their memories with me asked to remain anonymous but I hope they will recognise their voices in the book. Charles Tripp, the supervisor of my doctoral dissertation, and Laleh Khalili, my second supervisor, have been a tremendous source of support. In Saudi Arabia, I am indebted to Awad al-Badi, Sadiq al-Jubran, Habib Al Jumay‘, Kamil al-Khatti, Ja‘far al-Shayib and many others. Several friends and colleagues have commented on earlier versions of this manuscript, and have in some cases read it several times. Their comments have significantly improved this book, and I am beholden to them: Khalid Abdallah, Safa Al Ahmad, Khadija von Zinnenburg Carroll, Werner Ende, Thomas Hegghammer, Claudia Honegger, Laurence Louër, Laetitia Nanquette, James Piscatori, Anees Alqudaihi, Siavush Randjbar-Daemi, Glen Rangwala, Madawi al-Rasheed, Adrian Ruprecht, Tawfiq al-Sayf, Roger Tomkys, Kristian Coates Ulrichsen, Marc Valeri, Max Weiss and Alice Wilson, as well as the Cambridge reviewers. Louis Allday deserves a special mention for coining the term that became the title of this book, and for reading this manuscript over and over again. ‘Ali al-Ahmad, Hamza al-Hasan,

Acknowledgements

Fu’ad Ibrahim, Toby Jones, and Guido Steinberg have shared their private archives and libraries with me and have been very generous with their time. In addition, I would like to thank ʿAbd al-Nabi al-ʿAkri, Atef Alshaer, Rochana Baijai, Matthias Determann, Nelida Fuccaro, Ulrike Freitag, Robert Gleave, Arshad Hadjirin, Kai Hafez, Bernard Haykel, Steffen Hertog, Ghanim Jawad, Gilles Kepel, Ubay al-Khunayzi, Gudrun Krämer, Stéphane Lacroix, Marc Lynch, Phebe Marr, Kai Matthiesen, J.E. Peterson, Amélie Le Renard and Reinhard Schulze.

I have presented parts of this book at various research seminars. I would particularly like to thank the organisers and participants of seminars at the Berlin Graduate School Muslim Cultures and Societies, BRISMES, George Washington University, the Middle East Study Group, MESA, Princeton University, SOAS and the University of Cambridge. I would also like to thank Robert Gleave and the participants of the ‘Clerical Authority in Shi’ite Islam’ project sponsored by the British Academy, which also provided funding for research trips that contributed to this book.

My doctoral research at SOAS was funded by the German Academic Exchange Service and the Swiss National Science Foundation. Additional fieldwork assistance was provided by the British Institute for the Study of Iraq and the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE). The staff at the American University of Beirut, the Arab World Documentation Unit at the University of Exeter, the British Library, Cambridge University Library, the Centre for Arab Unity Studies in Beirut, Georgetown University Library, King Fahd National Library in Riyadh, the Library of Congress, SOAS Library and the Zentrum Moderner Orient were most helpful in locating sources. Post-doctoral fellowships at Pembroke College, University of Cambridge and the LSE granted me the time to rewrite my dissertation while the old Arab order was unravelling before our eyes. What will replace this old order is not yet clear, but a historical understanding of how and why sectarian politics emerges and what role it plays in key Middle Eastern states is as important as ever.
This book largely uses the transliteration guide of the *International Journal of Middle East Studies* (IJMES). Names and places that have a common English spelling will be spelled accordingly and no diacritic marks added (such as King Abdullah, Al Saud, Shia). Al refers to the larger family of someone, as in Al Saud, and is therefore transliterated differently from the common al- in front of last names. Arabic names are transcribed according to the IJMES system and the article is dropped before common place names unless a different transcription is dominant in English (e.g. Tarut not Tarout, Qatif not al-Qatif, Khobar not al-Khubar, al-Ahsa not al-Hasa or Hasa, Riyadh not al-Riyadh, Awwamiyya not al-ʿAwwamiyya, Hufuf not Hofuf or al-Hufuf, Saihat not Seihat). Arabic words are not capitalised, except if they refer to places, names and publications (*hawza* not *Hawza*, *qadi* not *Qadi*). For Iranian names and places I largely use the Persian transliteration.

In some instances there are disagreements about the dating of a particular incident or the birth or death of a prominent figure. Often, the birth and death dates of historical figures are only roughly given in the Islamic (AH) calendar, which means that the date can often be in two separate years in the Gregorian calendar. Therefore, I have chosen sometimes to put both possibilities in the text, such as 1842/3.

The various Web sites cited in this book were last accessed in September 2013 (in some cases also in early 2014) and stored electronically by the author. Therefore, consultation dates of Internet sources have been omitted. The Internet archive was used to retrieve earlier versions of defunct Web sites and can be used in the future to retrieve Web sites cited in this book (http://web.archive.org). Full URLs are only provided in cases...
where the title of a Web page is not mentioned in the footnotes. The typing of an English title into a search engine should allow the reader to find the article. In the case of Arabic or Persian Web sites, the titles have been transliterated and translated into English. Using the transliteration, readers familiar with these languages can retrieve the article or a copy thereof even after the original Web site has changed its URL or has closed down by typing the title into a search engine.
Glossary

This is based on the glossary in Meir Litvak, Shi'i Scholars of Nineteenth-Century Iraq: The 'Ulama' of Najaf and Karbala' (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 235–237.

'alim, pl. 'ulama' 'learned man', cleric

Akhbari, Akhbariyya the Shia school of jurisprudence that rejects deductive methodology in the study of law and requires unmitigated adherence to the limited meaning of the akhbar, the traditions (words and deeds) of the Prophet and the Shia Imams as transmitted by chains of narrators

Al the house of/the clan of

Amir governor

Ashura tenth day of the month of Muharram; commemoration of the martyrdom of Hussayn, the Prophet Muhammad's grandson and third Imam in Shia Islam, in 680

ayatallah lit. sign of God, title for a senior mujtahid

diwaniyya, pl. diwaniyyat lit. salon, semi-public discussion forum or gathering

Hasawi from al-Ahsa (Hasa)

hawza 'ilmiyya lit. territory of learning, refers to a community of learning in a specific location and encompasses the actual sites of learning
but also the social bonds, the organisation and the finances in a specific hawza; while the main Shia hawzat are in Najaf, Karbala and Qom, the religious schools of Qatif, al-Ahsa, Kuwait, Tehran and Sayyida Zaynab are also referred to as hawzat

**hussainiyya, pl. hussainiyyat** Shia mourning house for the commemoration of the martyrdom of Hussayn, also community centres

**ijtihad** the process of arriving at independent legal judgment in matters of religious law by using the principles of jurisprudence (usul al-fiqh)

**Imam** one of the twelve recognised hereditary successors of the Prophet Muhammad in Twelver Shia Islam

**intifada** lit. uprising, refers here to the uprising of Saudi Shia in the Eastern Province in 1979/80

**khums** religious tax, while it was originally paid to the Prophet, and by Shia Muslims to the Imam, Shia Muslims now pay these taxes to the marji’ al-taqlid in his capacity as representative of the Imam, and at the local level to the representative (wakil) of the marji’

**leftist** here used as a term describing all broadly left-leaning and secular Saudi opposition groups

**Majlis al-Shura** Consultative Council

**marji’ al-taqlid, pl. maraji’** lit. reference point for emulation, someone who is qualified through his learning and probity to be followed in all points of religious practice and law by the generality of Shia Muslims

**marji’iyya** authority, the institution of marji’ al-taqlid

**mujtahid, pl. mujtabidun** an ‘alim that reached the level of competence and scholarship necessary to perform ijtihad
Glossary

**mutasarrif**
governor of a sanjak (Ottoman sub-province)

**nakhawila**
name for the indigenous Shia community in Medina

**qadi**
judge

**qaimaqam**
governor of an Ottoman provincial district (kaza)

**al-qalʿa**
lit. castle, Old city of Qatif

**Qatifi**
from Qatif

**Shaykhi, Shaykhiyya**
followers of Ahmad al-Ahsaʿi (1753–1826), esoteric strand of Shia Islam, sometimes deemed heretical by other Twelver Shia scholars

**shirazi, shiraziyya, pl. shiraziyyun**
transnational Shia political network, whose name derives from its spiritual leader, Muhammad al-Shirazi (1928–2001)

**taqlid**
the process of following and emulating the practices and pronouncements of a mujtahid in matters relating to religious law and practices

**Usuli, Usuliyya**
the school of jurisprudence that emphasizes the use of reason in the study of the principles of jurisprudence (usul al-fiqh)

**Wahhabi, Wahhabiyya**
followers of Muhammad ibn ʿAbd al-Wahhab (1703–92), whose teachings centered on the oneness of God (tawhid) and who wanted to purify Islam from innovations; official form of religious interpretation in Saudi Arabia

**wakil, pl. wukalaʾ**
local representative of a marjiʿ al-taqlid

**waqf, pl. awqaf**
religious endowment
Abbreviations

al-da’wa  Islamic al-Da’wa Party (*bīzīb al-da’wa al-islamiyya*)
ANLF  Arab National Liberation Front (*jabhat al-taharrur al-watani al-‘arabiyya*)
Baath Party  Arab Socialist Baath Party in Saudi (*bīzīb al-ba’th al-‘arabi al-ishtiraki fi al-su ‘udiyya*)
CDLR  Committee for the Defence of Legitimate Rights (*lajnat al-difa’`an al-huquq al-shari’iyya*)
bīzīb al-‘amal  Arab Socialist Action Party in the Arabian Peninsula (*bīzīb al-‘amal al-ishtiraki al-‘arabi: al-jazira al-‘arabiyya*)
IAO  Islamic Action Organisation in Iraq (*munazzamat al-‘amal al-islami fi al-‘Iraq*), Iraqi wing of MVM
IFLB  Islamic Front for the Liberation of Bahrain (*al-jabha al-islamiyya li-tabrir al-Bahrayn*), Bahraini wing of MVM
IRGC  Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps
MAN  Movement of Arab Nationalists (*harakat al-qawmiyyin al-‘arab*)
MVM  Movement of Vanguards’ Missionaries (*harakat al-risaliyyin al-tala’*)
OIRAP  Organisation for the Islamic Revolution in the Arabian Peninsula (*munazzamat al-thawra al-islamiyya fi al-jazira al-‘arabiyya*), Saudi wing of MVM
PDPAP  Popular Democratic Party in the Arabian Peninsula (*al-bīzīb al-dimuqrati al-sha’bi fi al-jazira al-‘arabiyya*)
RMS  Reformist Movement in Saudi (*al-harak al-islahiyya fi al-su ‘udiyya*)
MAP 1. Map of Saudi Arabia.