

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04241-4 - Substantive Protection under Investment Treaties: A Legal and Economic Analysis

Jonathan Bonnitcha

Index

[More information](#)

## Index

- Abs-Shawcross Draft Convention on Investments Abroad (1959), 143
- arbitral tribunals
  - arbitral decisions, unified jurisprudential theory explanation, 164–6, 243–5
  - deference to host states policy judgements, 333–4
  - as evidentiary source, selection bias, 57–8
  - existing treaty protections and, 334
  - levels of protection, 5–6
  - reasoning structure of, 13
- Association of South East Asian Nations (ASEAN) Comprehensive Investment Agreement, 3–4
- bilateral investment treaties (BITs)
  - common features, 3
  - in developing countries, 22
  - history of, 2–3
- CAFTA (Dominican Republic-Central America-United States of America Free Trade Agreement), 268–70
- Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA) Investment Agreement, 3–4
- direct expropriation, 71–2, 229–30
- distributive consequences and justice, 83–4
  - analysis, evidence and theory, 84
  - compensated v. uncompensated losses, harm/benefit distinction, 89–91
  - cost and benefits division, *ex ante*, 85–7, 101
  - cost and benefits division, *ex post*, 84–5, 101
  - demoralization costs (Michelman), 95–7
  - egalitarian theories, 92–4, 101–2
  - libertarian theories, 92, 101
  - political process theories, non-discrimination and, 97–101, 102
  - consequences for individuals, disaggregating the state and, 88–9
  - questions of scale, 89
  - summary, 101–2
  - utilitarian theories, 94–7, 102
- efficiency analysis, net economic benefits (or costs)
  - contract v. investment treaty protection, 75–8
- efficiency concept, 62–3
- efficient government, fiscal illusion, 69–72
- efficient government, investor conduct, 68–80
- efficient investor conduct, hold-ups, moral hazard problem, 72–5
- foreign direct investment (FDI) flows, 64
- free markets, competitive equality (non-discrimination), 65–8
- global approach, 63–4
- Hicks-Kaldor efficiency, 62–3
- incommensurable consequences and, 64–5
- investor risk aversion, political risk insurance, 78–80
- Pareto efficiency, 62
- property rights, Coase theorem, 80–2
- summary, 82–3
- theory, evidence in, 65
- Energy Charter Treaty (ECT), 3–4
- Equal Protection Clause, Fourteenth Amendment, 28
- European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), 23
- expropriation. *See* direct expropriation; indirect expropriation

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04241-4 - Substantive Protection under Investment Treaties: A Legal and Economic Analysis

Jonathan Bonnitcha

Index

[More information](#)

## 394 INDEX

- fair and equitable treatment (FET), 1, 3
  - bad faith and, 160–1
  - discriminatory practices and, 158–60
  - equivalent standards, 156
  - excluded parameters, 156–7
  - fact specific reasoning and, 166–7
  - FET clauses, drafting patterns, 146–7
  - FET provisions, textual variations, decisions analysis, 153–6
  - foundational doctrinal issues in interpretation, 146–56
  - international minimum standard (IMS) v. autonomous treaty standard, 148
  - legal content of, 146
  - as liability rules, 59–60
  - NAFTA and, 151–6
  - origination of, 143
  - popularity of, 144
  - state's judicial institutions conduct and, 157–8
  - taxonomy of elements, 161–4
  - unified jurisprudential theory of, 164–6
  - United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) model types, 147
- fair and equitable treatment (FET), procedural review of governmental conduct, 194–210
  - administrative proceedings, 208
  - Chemtura*, intermediate approach, 205, 210, 289
  - Chorzów Factory*, FET breach compensation, 196, 241
  - Genin*, narrow approach, 195, 197–9, 210, 289
  - intermediate v. exacting approach, 293–7
  - narrow v. intermediate approach, 289–93
  - procedural fairness in contractual dealings, 201–3, 209
  - Tecmed*, exacting approach, 196, 199–206, 210, 289
  - transparency, 204–5, 207–8
- fair and equitable treatment (FET), protection of investor's legitimate expectations
  - business plan v. stability approach, 276–9
  - legitimate expectations, business plan approach, 190–4, 275
  - legitimate expectations, in general, 167–70
  - legitimate expectations, legal rights approach, 170–5, 194, 275
  - legitimate expectations, representations approach, 175–84, 194, 275
  - legitimate expectations, stability approach, 184–90, 194, 275
  - representations v. legal rights approach, 283–8
  - stability v. representations approach, 279–83
- fair and equitable treatment (FET), substantive review of governmental conduct, 210–27
  - margin of appreciation v. no substantive review approach, 309
  - margin of appreciation v. politics-as-irrationality approach, 298–304
  - margin of appreciation v. proportionality approach, 304–9
  - proportionality approach, 224–7, 298
  - reasonableness review, in general, 215–16
  - reasonableness review, margin of appreciation approach, 216–20, 298
  - reasonableness review, no substantive review approach, 298
  - reasonableness review, politics-as-irrationality approach, 220–3, 298
- foreign direct investment (FDI), 18, 20
- bilateral trade agreements (BITs)
  - relationship, empirical evidence, 105–9
- commitment theory, hold-ups and, 109–10, 113
- efficiency analysis, 64–5
- investment protection impact, summary, 113
- and investment protection, theoretical insights, 109–12
- investment treaty protections, evidence and theory, 104–5, 113
- investment treaty protections
  - interaction, investment climate influences, 112–13
- normative desirability, proxy for economic benefits, 102–4, 113
- signalling theory, governance and, 110–12
- Friendship Commerce and Navigation (FCN), 143
- ICSID Convention, 3, 60, 129
- indirect expropriation
  - appropriation effect, alternative approach, 255
- arbitral decisions, unified jurisprudential theory explanation, 243–5
- Australia-Mexico BIT example, 231
- balancing structure of inquiry, 260–3
- Canadian Model BITs, 266–71
- creeping, 234–5
- direct v. indirect, 229–30

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04241-4 - Substantive Protection under Investment Treaties: A Legal and Economic Analysis

Jonathan Bonnitcha

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX 395

- Dutch BITs, 232
- effects structure of inquiry, 247–55
- exception structure of inquiry, 256–60
- fact specific reasoning and, 245
- French BITs, 232
- indirect expropriation, customary international law, 235
- indirect expropriation, part of an investment, 239–40
- indirect expropriation, treaty text variation, 232–5
- inquiry stages, 231–2
- investment defined, significance, 235–40
- investment treaty provisions, 231–2
- legal requirements, including compensation, 240–1
- Metalclad v. Mexico*, effect on economic value, 247–51, 315
- Metalclad v. Pope & Talbot* approach, 316–20
- Methanex v. US*, police powers carve-out, 256–60, 315
- Methanex v. US annex v. Pope & Talbot* approach, 324–30
- model BITs, characterisation approach codification, 266–71
- NAFTA, Article 1110, 232–3
- Pope & Talbot v. Canada*, property interest deprivation, 251–5, 315
- state's breach of contract with investor v. contract expropriation, 246
- Tecmed v. Mexico*, proportionality balancing, 261–3, 315
- US annex approach, 263–71, 315
- US annex v. *Tecmed* approach, 320–4
- US Model BITs (2004, 2012), 266–71
- US-Ecuador BIT, 237
- investment treaties
  - arbitral deference to host states policy judgements, 333–4
  - arbitral tribunals, existing treaty protections and, 334
  - balance, 45–8
  - defined, 4
  - drafting, amendment, clarification of, 337–50
  - economic objectives, 13
  - exception clauses use, 332–3
  - existing protections redrafting, preferred level of protection, 343–4
  - existing treaties amendment, 344–7
  - existing treaties amendment, extent of states' power, 344–5
  - existing treaties amendment, investors' rights impact, 345–7
  - existing treaty practice, case for reconsidering, 337–8
  - expansive rights of, 1–2
  - foreign direct investment (FDI) role, 18, 20
  - future of debate, 363–4
  - general, impartial prospective, justifications for, 8–9
  - history of, 2–4
  - ideology, policy preferences of states, 341
  - interpretation, drafting of, 13–15
  - investors' rights, interpretive statements impact, 349–50
  - levels of protection, 13
  - modern era of, 2–3
  - new protections v. existing provision redrafting, 343
  - objectives, causal assumptions, 11–12
  - options available to states, 338–9
  - primary norms, 49–50
  - proportionality, 47–8, 224–7, 261–3, 304–9
  - regional examples, 3–4
  - respect for rule of law and, 334
  - revisions to, 6
  - secondary norms, 45–8
  - single state perspective, 9, 86, 140, 339–41
  - states' authority, interpretive statements clarifying treaty provisions, 348–9
  - substantive protections drafting, new investment treaties, 341–4
  - sustainable development, 46–7, 50
- investment treaties, criticisms
  - comparative methodology and, 22–30
  - constitutional rules and, 25–6
  - environmental norms, 37–9
  - historical methodology and, 21–2
  - human rights norms and, 33–7
  - judicial deference in public law and, 28–30
  - public law and, 24–6
  - Razian rule of law norms and, 30–1
  - sovereignty concept and, 31–3, 49
  - sustainable development and, 50
- investment treaties, existing debate
  - structure, 16–17
  - content of investment treaties, theories, 18–20
  - economic liberalism and, 19
  - explanatory theories, 18–20
  - neo-classical economic theory and, 19–20
  - rational actor theories, 17–18
  - social scientific scholarship, assumptions and premises, 17
  - social scientific scholarship, summary, 20

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04241-4 - Substantive Protection under Investment Treaties: A Legal and Economic Analysis

Jonathan Bonnitcha

Index

[More information](#)

## 396 INDEX

- investment treaties, interpretation of
  - existing, 350–7
  - consequentialist arguments, 355
  - extra-legal factors influence, 357–62
  - treaty's object, purpose and, 351–7
- investment treaties, justifications
  - consent, self-interest, 41–2
  - good governance, rule of law norms, 42–5, 50
  - property rights, 50
  - treaties' purpose, realisation of, 39–41
- investment treaty protections
  - debate, synthesis of, 48–51
  - defined, 4
  - economic arguments, 331–2
  - host, home states consequences, 140
  - investment treaties rationales, unrelated consequences, 141
  - as liability rules, 58–62
  - lower levels of protection, 332
  - non-pecuniary remedies, 59–61
  - state-to-state disputes, 61–2
- Japan-Korea-China Trilateral Investment Treaty, 3, 267
- most favoured nation (MFN) clauses, 8–9, 155–6
- New Haven school of law and economics, 13, 54–7
- New York Convention, 3, 60
- North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), 4
  - Article 1105(1), 151–6, 345–6
  - Article 1110, 232–3
- Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Draft Convention on the Protection of Foreign Property (1967), 143
- procedural rights, defined, 1
- Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership (RCEP), 4
- regulatory chill
  - complex effects on government decision-making, 127–9
  - empirical evidence assessment, 118–27
  - empirical testing, liability and chilling, 120–2
  - empirical testing, uncertainty and chilling, 120–2
- environmental conservation, human rights and, 113–15, 129–32
- existing evidence, theory, 115–16
- hypothesis testing, 118–19
- state disaggregation, institutional complexity and, 119–20
- summary propositions, 132–3
- theoretical debate, existing literature, 116–18
- threat v. internalisation chill, 118
- uncertainty argument, 117
- WTO policy review process and, 128
- rule of law
  - host state institutional complexity and, 139
  - internalisation effects, 138–9
  - investment treaties and respect for rule of law, theories, 136–7
  - investment treaty and rule of law, hypothesis formulation, 137–9
  - investment treaty protections impact in host states, empirical evidence, 136
  - investment treaty protections impact, theory and evidence, 134–6
  - Razian conception, 133–4, 139
  - summary propositions, 139
- substantive protections, exceptions, 7
- substantive rights, defined, 1
- Third Restatement of the Foreign Relations Law of the United States (Third Restatement)*, 257
- TransAtlantic Trade and Investment Partnership (TTIP), 4
- TransPacific Partnership (TPP), 4
- UNCITRAL Rules, 3, 60
- Vandevelde norms of good governance, 43–5
- Vanessa Ventures case, 123
- Vienna Convention of the Law of Treaties (VCLT), 14, 40, 153
  - Articles 31, 351–2, 355, 358
  - Articles 36, 37, 346–7
  - Articles 39, 344
- World Trade Organisation (WTO), 23, 128