

Just and Unjust Military Intervention

Classical arguments about the legitimate use of force have profoundly shaped the norms and institutions of contemporary international society. But what specific lessons can we learn from the classical European philosophers and jurists when thinking about humanitarian intervention, preventive self-defense, or international trusteeship today? The contributors to this volume take seriously the admonition of contextualist scholars not to uproot classical thinkers' arguments from their social, political and intellectual environment. Nevertheless, this collection demonstrates that contemporary students, scholars, and policymakers can still learn a great deal from the questions raised by classical European thinkers, the problems they highlighted, and even the problematic character of some of the solutions they offered. The aim of this volume is to open up current assumptions about military intervention to critical reflection and to explore the possibility of reconceptualizing and reappraising contemporary approaches.

STEFANO RECCHIA is University Lecturer (assistant professor) in International Relations at the University of Cambridge.

JENNIFER M. WELSH is Professor of International Relations at the European University Institute, Florence, Italy, and Co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law and Armed Conflict.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-04202-5 — Just and Unjust Military Intervention
Edited by Stefano Recchia, Jennifer M. Welsh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Just and Unjust Military Intervention

European Thinkers from Vitoria to Mill

Edited by

Stefano Recchia and Jennifer M. Welsh



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-04202-5 — Just and Unjust Military Intervention
 Edited by Stefano Recchia, Jennifer M. Welsh
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107042025

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2013

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Just and unjust military intervention: European thinkers from Vitoria to
 Mill / edited by Stefano Recchia and Jennifer Welsh.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04202-5 (Hardback)

1. Peace-building – Europe. 2. Humanitarian assistance – Europe.
 3. Intervention (International law). I. Recchia, Stefano, 1978– contributing
 editor. II. Welsh, Jennifer M. (Jennifer Mary), 1965– contributing editor.
 JZ5584.E85J87 2013

341.5'84–dc23 2013014384

ISBN 978-1-107-04202-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Notes on contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction: the enduring relevance of classical thinkers STEFANO RECCHIA AND JENNIFER M. WELSH	1
1 Intervention in European history, c.1520–1850 DAVID TRIM	21
2 War in the face of doubt: early modern classics and the preventive use of force ARIEL COLONOMOS	48
3 Vitoria: the law of war, saving the innocent, and the image of God WILLIAM BAIN	70
4 Grotius, Hobbes, and Pufendorf on humanitarian intervention RICHARD TUCK	96
5 John Locke on intervention, uncertainty, and insurgency SAMUEL MOYN	113
6 Intervention and sovereign equality: legacies of Vattel JENNIFER PITTS	132
7 David Hume and Adam Smith on international ethics and humanitarian intervention EDWIN VAN DE HAAR	154
8 Sovereignty, morality, and history: the problematic legitimization of force in Rousseau, Kant, and Hegel PIERRE HASSNER	176
	v

vi	Contents	
9	Revisiting Kant and intervention ANDREW HURRELL	196
10	Edmund Burke and intervention: empire and neighborhood JENNIFER M. WELSH	219
11	The origins of liberal Wilsonianism: Giuseppe Mazzini on regime change and humanitarian intervention STEFANO RECCHIA	237
12	J. S. Mill on nonintervention and intervention MICHAEL DOYLE	263
	<i>Select bibliography</i>	288
	<i>Index</i>	294

Notes on contributors

WILLIAM BAIN is Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science, National University of Singapore. He is currently working on a project entitled *The Political Theology of International Society: God, Man, and the Ways of Order*, which explores the theological foundations of the modern states-system. He is the author of *Between Anarchy and Society: Trusteeship and the Obligations of Power* (2003), as well as several articles and book chapters that take up issues of international political theory, the English School, and the history of ideas.

ARIEL COLONOMOS is Senior Research Fellow at the National Center for Scientific Research (CNRS) in Paris. He is also a Research Professor at Sciences Po, where he teaches courses on international relations theory and the ethics of war. He is the author of *The Gamble of War: Is it Possible to Justify Preventive War?* (2013), *Moralizing International Relations: Called to Account* (2008), and *Eglises en réseaux: trajectoires politiques entre Europe et Amérique* (2000). He has published widely in the areas of international relations, the ethics of war, and political sociology.

MICHAEL W. DOYLE is the Harold Brown Professor of International Affairs, Law and Political Science at Columbia University. His major publications include *Ways of War and Peace* (1997), *Empires* (1986), *Making War and Building Peace* (2006), and *Striking First: Pre-emption and Prevention in International Conflict* (2008). From 2001 to 2003 he served as Assistant Secretary-General at the United Nations, where his responsibilities included strategic planning (the “Millennium Development Goals”), outreach to the international corporate sector (the “Global Compact”) and relations with Washington. He currently chairs the UN Democracy Fund.

EDWIN VAN DE HAAR is an international relations scholar who has taught at Leiden University and Ateneo de Manila. He specializes in

viii Notes on contributors

the liberal tradition in international political theory and is the author of *Classical Liberalism and International Relations Theory: Hume, Smith, Mises and Hayek* (2009), and *Beloved Yet Unknown: The Political Philosophy of Liberalism* (2011, in Dutch). He has contributed to the *Oxford Handbook of Adam Smith* (2013) and published a number of articles on Smith, Hume, and the wider liberal tradition in political thought.

PIERRE HASSNER has been a fellow at CERI-Sciences Po in Paris since 1959. Between 1964 and 2003 he taught International Relations at Sciences Po and the Johns Hopkins University, Bologna. A member of the editorial board of the journal *Survival* and a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, he was awarded the Alexis de Tocqueville Prize in 2003 and was made Doctor Honoris Causa of Université du Québec à Montréal in 2008. His many publications include *Change and Security in Europe* (1968), *Violence and Peace: From the Atomic Bomb to Ethnic Cleansing* (1997), and, with Gilles Andréani, *Justifying War? From Humanitarian Intervention to Counterterrorism* (2008).

ANDREW HURRELL is Montague Burton Professor of International Relations at Oxford University and a fellow of Balliol College. His research interests cover theories of international relations, theories of global governance, the history of thought on international relations, comparative regionalism, and the international relations of the Americas, with particular reference to Brazil. His book, *On Global Order: Power, Values and the Constitution of International Society* won the International Studies Association Prize for Best Book in the field of International Relations in 2009. Other publications include (with Ngaire Woods), *Inequality, Globalization and World Politics* (1999), and (with Louise Fawcett), *Regionalism in World Politics* (1995).

SAMUEL MOYN is Professor of History at Columbia University, where he has taught since 2001. He is the author of three books, most recently *The Last Utopia: Human Rights in History* (2010). He has also edited, with Andrew Sartori, *Global Intellectual History* (2013).

JENNIFER PITTS is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Chicago. She is author of *A Turn to Empire: the Rise of Imperial Liberalism in Britain and France* (2005) and editor and translator of *Alexis de Tocqueville: Writings on Empire and Slavery* (2001).

Her research interests lie in the fields of modern political and international thought (particularly British and French thought of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries), empire, the history of international law, and global justice. She is a co-editor of the Cambridge University Press series *Ideas in Context*.

STEFANO RECCHIA is a lecturer (assistant professor) in International Relations at Cambridge University. His research interests are in contemporary international security studies, international ethics, and classical international political thought. He obtained a PhD from Columbia University in 2011 (with distinction) and has held fellowships at Harvard, the Brookings Institution, and the European University Institute. He has published a number of journal articles on questions of international intervention and trusteeship and has edited (with Nadia Urbinati) *A Cosmopolitanism of Nations: Giuseppe Mazzini's Writings on Democracy, Nation Building, and International Relations* (2009).

DAVID TRIM is Director of the Archives of the General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists. A fellow of the Royal Historical Society, he has published over forty scholarly articles or book chapters, and edited or co-authored nine books including *The Huguenots: History and Memory in Transnational Context* (2011), *Humanitarian Intervention: a History* (Cambridge University Press, 2011), *European Warfare 1350–1750* (Cambridge University Press, 2010) and *Amphibious Warfare 1000–1700: Commerce, State Formation and European Expansion* (2006).

RICHARD TUCK is the Frank G. Thomson Professor of Government at Harvard University. His work addresses a variety of topics in political theory, including political authority, human rights, natural law, and toleration, and focuses on a number of thinkers, including Hobbes, Grotius, Selden, and Descartes. His publications include *Natural Rights Theories* (Cambridge University Press, 1979), *Hobbes* (1989), and *The Rights of War and Peace* (1999).

JENNIFER M. WELSH is Professor of International Relations at the European University Institute, Florence, Italy, and Co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law and Armed Conflict. She is the author of *Edmund Burke and International Relations* (1995), and the editor/co-editor and author of several works on the ethics

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-04202-5 — Just and Unjust Military Intervention
Edited by Stefano Recchia, Jennifer M. Welsh
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

x Notes on contributors

and politics of humanitarian intervention, including *Humanitarian Intervention and International Relations* (2004) and *The United Nations Security Council and War* (2008). She is currently leading a research project on the prevention of mass atrocity crimes.

Acknowledgements

In the course of this project we have acquired a number of debts to individuals and institutions. We would like to thank, first and foremost, the authors who have contributed chapters to this volume. Our contributors make up a truly international and inter-disciplinary group, including scholars from European, North American, and Asian institutions; and spanning the academic disciplines of international relations, history, and political theory. All of them have displayed remarkable patience, accepting several rounds of revisions and tolerating our sometimes intrusive editing aimed at ensuring an intellectually coherent final product. We have immensely enjoyed working with these extraordinary individuals and have learned a great deal from each of them in the process.

Furthermore, we would like to thank several scholars who contributed to our initial two-day conference held at Columbia University in 2009 by writing papers and serving formally or informally as commentators, but who did not write chapters for this volume. Their sharp comments and insights have improved many of the chapters and have had a positive impact on the volume as a whole. These scholars include Andrew Arato, Gary Bass, Jean Cohen, Alex Gourevitch, Stephen Holmes, Pablo Kalmanovitz, Benedict Kingsbury, Melissa Schwartzberg, and Tim Waligore. We are especially grateful to Nadia Urbinati, who strongly supported the idea of an edited volume about classical European thought on intervention from the beginning, and offered much welcome advice. Michael Doyle, in addition to being a chapter author, has also been a source of encouragement throughout and aided us in the crucial task of selecting a title for the book.

We also thank the institutions that provided financial support for our conference: the Center for European Studies at Columbia University; the Saltzman Institute for War and Peace Studies; the Political Science Department at Columbia; the Institute for Social and Economic Research and Policy (ISERP); and the Columbia-Sciences Po Alliance Program. We are particularly grateful to the leaders of those institutions,

xii Acknowledgements

especially Richard Betts of the Saltzman Institute and Victoria de Grazia of the European Institute, who decided to support us from an early stage.

We appreciate the efforts of John Haslam, our remarkably efficient and supportive commissioning editor at Cambridge University Press. We further wish to thank Fleur Jones, the assistant editor, as well as Tom O'Reilly and Gaia Poggiogalli, our production editors, who cheerfully helped us steer the manuscript to publication. Finally, we are grateful to the two anonymous reviewers, whose constructive and generous feedback has helped us significantly strengthen the book.

As co-editors, this project has allowed us to further develop our mutual friendship and esteem. We have played roughly equal and complementary roles in defining the focus and scope of the volume, coaxing authors, editing draft chapters, crafting the introduction, and making final judgments on the quality of potential contributions. It has been much more enjoyable “steering the ship” with a collaborator, rather than trying to “sail solo.” Jennifer Welsh would particularly like to thank Stefano Recchia for initially proposing the idea of the conference and an edited volume, and for patiently putting up with the competing demands on her time. Working on this project over the last three years has exposed us to new ideas and modes of thinking that have enriched our own individual research in numerous ways. We hope that our readers will also find these chapters illuminating and thought-provoking, and that they will be reminded of the great treasure that lies within classical thinking on war and intervention.