

An Introduction to the Philosophy of Art

An Introduction to the Philosophy of Art is a clear and compact survey of philosophical theories of the nature and value of art, including in its scope literature, painting, sculpture, music, dance, architecture, movies, conceptual art, and performance art. This second edition incorporates significant new research on topics including pictorial depiction, musical expression, conceptual art, Hegel, and art and society. Drawing on classical and contemporary philosophy, literary theory, and art criticism, Richard Eldridge explores the representational, formal, and expressive dimensions of art. He argues that the aesthetic and semantic density of the work, in inviting imaginative exploration, makes works of art cognitively, morally, and socially important. This importance is further elaborated in discussions of artistic beauty, originality, imagination, and criticism. His accessible study will be invaluable to students of philosophy of art and aesthetics.

RICHARD ELDRIDGE is Charles and Harriett Cox McDowell Professor of Philosophy at Swarthmore College. He is the author of five books, including most recently *Literature*, *Life*, and *Modernity* (2008), and the editor of four volumes, including *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Literature* (2009) and (with Bernard Rhie) *Stanley Cavell and Literary Studies: Consequences of Skepticism* (2011).





An Introduction to the Philosophy of Art

Second edition

RICHARD ELDRIDGE

Swarthmore College, Pennsylvania





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107614444

© Richard Eldridge, 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First edition first published 2003, and reprinted three times. Second edition first published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Eldridge, Richard Thomas, 1953-

An introduction to the philosophy of art / RICHARD ELDRIDGE, Swarthmore College, Pennsylvania. – Second edition.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04169-1 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-61444-4 (pbk.) 1. Arts–Philosophy.

2. Aesthetics. I. Title.

BH39.E535 2014

111'.85-dc23 2013036864

ISBN 978-1-107-04169-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-61444-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgments		page viii
Preface to the second edition		xi
1	The situation and tasks of the philosophy of art	1
	Who needs a theory of art?	1
	Philosophy as articulation	4
	Art as a natural social practice	5
	Action, gesture, and expressive freedom	7
	Schiller on art, life, and modernity	12
	Identification versus elucidation	17
	What may we hope for from the philosophy of art?	21
2	Representation, imitation, and resemblance	25
	Representation and aboutness	25
	Aristotle on imitation	26
	Visual depiction, resemblance, and game-playing	31
	Contemporary theories of depiction	38
	Representing as natural, human, world-responsive activity	44
	Distinctive functions of artistic representation	47
3	Beauty and form	53
	Beauty, absorption, and pleasure	53
	Kant on natural and artistic beauty	57
	General versus individual form	62
	Beardsley's theory of individual form	63
	Criticisms of formalist-aesthetic theories of art	67
	Defenses of the aesthetic interest of art	70
4	Expression	75
	Feelings about subject matters in life: Wordsworth, Tolstoy,	
	and Collingwood	75
	What is expressed in art? Hegel versus Danto	82

v



vi Contents

	How is artistic expression achieved?	92
	Collingwood's psychodynamic theory	93
	Physiognomic similarity theories	98
	"Working-through" theories	103
	Emotions and contemporary psychology	104
	Why does artistic expression matter?	109
5	Originality and imagination	115
	Genius and the pursuit of the new: Kant	115
	Hegel's criticisms of subjectivism	120
	Why originality matters: Adorno on free meaning-making	122
	Criticisms of the pursuit of originality: postmodernism	
	and feminism	127
	Originality and imagination within common life	132
	Creativity: Scruton and Coleridge on artistic imagination	135
6	Understanding art	142
	Six strategies for understanding art	142
	The natures of thought and action: Hegel, Baxandall, and others Pluralism and constraint in interpretation: Abrams, Fish,	145
	and Derrida	150
	The special importance of the elucidation of formal-semantic elements	156
	Nehamas and Felski on what calls for elucidatory interpretation	160
	The possibility of agreement in understanding	163
7	Identifying and evaluating art	167
	Why we go on arguing about which works are good	167
	Subjectivism and the sociology of taste: Smith and Bourdieu	170
	Dickie's institutional theory	173
	Historical and narrative identifications: Levinson and Carroll	176
	Objectivism: Mothersill and Savile	178
	Hume on feeling and judgment	182
	Kant on feeling and judgment	187
	Personal and/versus discussable: Isenberg, Scruton, and Cohen	
	on taste	196
8	Art and emotion	200
	Some varieties of emotional response	200
	The paradox of fiction	202
	Hume on tragedy: denying (1)	204
	Making-believe and quasi-emotions: Walton, Levinson, and Feagin	207
	Robinson on affective appraisals: denying (3)	213



		Contents	vii
	Danta and Cahan an navyons of attentive involvement	214	
	Danto and Cohen on powers of attentive involvement Aristotle on catharsis	214 218	
	Artistic making and the "working through" of emotion	218	
	Artistic making and the working through of emotion	221	
9	Art and morality	225	
	Some controversial cases: Mapplethorpe, Serrano, Finley,		
	and others	225	
	Autonomism and experimentalism	227	
	Moralism and the clarification of thought and feeling	234	
	Clarificationism and responding to complexity	237	
	Art, propaganda, advertising, and cliché	244	
	Ethical understanding and working through puzzlement	247	
10	Art and society: some contemporary practices of art	253	
	The reproduction of social life vis-à-vis "infinite satisfaction"	253	
	Art and modernity: Schiller and others	255	
	Lukács, Marcuse, and Adorno	261	
	Structuralism and structural opposition in social life: Lévi Stra	uss	
	and Althusser	263	
	Foster's postmodern sociocultural criticism	267	
	Avant-gardism and contemporary art	268	
	Can artistic beauty still matter? What about fun?	271	
	Art and social aspiration	272	
	Some contemporary practices of art: primitivism, vernacularis	m,	
	avant-gardism, and constructivism	274	
11	Epilogue: the evidence of things not seen	284	
Bibliography		289	
Index		304	



Acknowledgments

Hilary Gaskin suggested this book project to me. She secured insightful readers for my first proposal, and their comments and her suggestions helped me to find what is, I hope, a useful scheme of topics.

I have been fortunate to have had gifted teachers of philosophy in general and of the philosophy of art in particular. First among the philosophers of art who were my teachers, I thank Ted Cohen. I am grateful to have had his influence on the substance of my thinking about art and on my philosophical sensibility and style. This influence was evident to me continuously as I wrote, including but well beyond the direct discussions of his work in these pages.

Over the last twenty years I have had detailed conversations on every topic in this book with members of the American Society for Aesthetics. I am pleased to count its members as my colleagues and friends. It is a wonderful society, with members ready both to argue and to listen, always with genuine enthusiasm for both the practices of art and for philosophical understanding. The talks I have heard, the essays I have read, and the conversations I have enjoyed are far too numerous to detail, even if I could recall all the dates and names, as I cannot. Together with particular thanks to Stanley Bates (also once my teacher), who has heard and discussed so many ASA talks with me, I must let an expression of gratitude to the Society cover my manifold debts to all its members.

Alex Neill read a late draft of Chapter 8 and provided detailed and acute comments that led to improvements; any errors that remain are mine, not his.

The philosophers who have through their writing especially influenced my thinking are discussed in the text and listed in its footnotes. Among them, however, I especially note here Monroe Beardsley, my predecessor as a teacher of the philosophy of art at Swarthmore College. Though I have sometimes disagreed with him, I found much more agreement than disagreement between my thoughts and his as I worked through the topics of this book.

viii



Acknowledgments

ix

I am pleased to think of myself as connected with him not only by philosophical interests, but also in sharing a common extended audience in the students of Swarthmore College. I have worked out many of my thoughts in this book in the course of teaching the philosophy of art to them and in the conversations that have accompanied that teaching. I am grateful to the college that Beardsley helped to shape and to the students who have graced my classes within it.

Joan Vandegrift read every sentence of this manuscript as it came into being chapter by chapter. She served as a patient scrutinizer of both the accessibility of the prose and the plausibility of the thought, as well as acting as a constant source of encouragement and support. I also thank Hannah Eldridge, Sarah Eldridge, and Jonathan Eldridge, who are now to my delight old enough to ask at the dinner table what I have been writing all day, to take an interest in the answers, and to offer thoughts of their own. Together Joan, Hannah, Sarah, and Jonathan have been this book's daily and first audience, and I thank them for encouraging me in their responses to think that it might find a wider audience as well.





Preface to the second edition

Once again I am grateful to Hilary Gaskin, this time for proposing this revised and expanded edition and for seeing it through production.

The past ten years or so have seen a wide variety of important new work in aesthetics that is of very high quality. While the overall structure and argument of this book are unaltered in this new, expanded edition, I am pleased to have been able now to take substantial notice of the following significant (mostly) recent work: on the theory of pictorial depiction (Robert Hopkins, John Hyman, Dominic Lopes, Michael Newell), on demonstrative attention (John Spackman), on artistic form (Robert Kaufman, Martin Seel), on expression (Stephen Davies, Mitchell Green, Jerrold Levinson, Jenefer Robinson), on Hegel (Annemarie Gethmann-Siefert, Benjamin Rutter), on imagination (Gregory Currie, Kirk Pillow, Richard Moran, Martin Seel), on interpretation (Rita Felski, Alexander Nehamas), on emotion (Gregory Currie, Deborah Knight, Ted Cohen, Jenefer Robinson), on art and morality (Ted Cohen, Berys Gaut, Alexander Nehamas), and on contemporary art (Peter Bürger, Daniel Herwitz, Gregg Horowitz, Dominic Lopes, Sianne Ngai, Peter Osborne). I am also pleased to have been able to incorporate at least brief reference, which may be useful to some readers, to Denis Dutton and Stephen Davies on art and evolution, to Frederick Beiser on Schiller, and to Carolyn Korsmeyer and Aaron Meskin and colleagues on the theory of taste, among others. I have also taken the opportunity of a new edition to improve the clarity and precision of certain wordings where I could.

For roughly the past ten years, I have regularly discussed in detail most of the new work mentioned above with the members of the Philadelphia Area Aesthetics Reading Group: almost always including Noël Carroll, Paul Guyer, Susan Feagin and either Espen Hammer or Kristin Gjesdal, plus at various times Emily Brady, John Carvalho, Liz Camp, Lara Ostaric, Kirk Pillow, Nola Semczyszyn, and Mary Wiseman. The group has been mostly organized and most regularly

хi



xii Preface to the second edition

hosted by Susan Feagin; we are all indebted to her for her efficiency and extraordinary hospitality. I cannot imagine a better setting than this reading group in which to think continuously, productively, and pleasurably about contemporary developments in aesthetics. Its life has been a model for me of collegiality and mutual interest coupled with sharpness of engagement, and this new edition would certainly not be what it is without it.

Finally, I am grateful to my seminar students in the philosophy of art at Swarthmore, this time for having had the patience and goodwill over the last ten years to work with the first edition of this book and to talk with me imaginatively and critically about what art is and how it matters to them.