The Material Culture of the Jacobites

The Jacobites, adherents of the exiled King James II of England and VII of Scotland and his descendants, continue to command attention long after the end of realistic Jacobite hopes down to the present. Extraordinarily, the promotion of the Jacobite cause and adherence to it were recorded in a rich and highly miscellaneous store of objects, including medals, portraits, pincushions, glassware and dice-boxes. Interdisciplinary and highly illustrated, this book combines legal and art history to survey the extensive material culture associated with Jacobites and Jacobitism. Neil Guthrie considers the attractions and the risks of making, distributing and possessing ‘things of danger’; their imagery and inscriptions; and their place in a variety of contexts in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Finally, he explores the many complex reasons underlying the long-lasting fascination with the Jacobites.

Neil Guthrie is a lawyer by profession and has published articles on Jacobite material culture, law and literary history, including ‘Johnson’s Touch-piece and the “Charge of Fame”: Personal and Public Aspects of the Medal in Eighteenth-century Britain’ in The Politics of Samuel Johnson, eds. H. Erskine-Hill and J. C. D. Clark (2012).
The Material Culture of the Jacobites

NEIL GUTHRIE
LOOK LOVE AND FOLLOW

Medal, c. 1750

Fine delle reliquie – Fine di tutto

GIUSEPPE TOMASI DI LAMPEDUSA, IL GATTOPARDO
(1960), INDEX ENTRY FOR CHAPTER 8
Contents

List of illustrations  [page viii]
Acknowledgments  [x]
Note on terminology and dates  [xiv]
List of abbreviations  [xvi]

Introduction  [1]
1 'By things themselves': the danger of Jacobite material culture  [18]
2 'Many emblems of sedition and treason': patterns of Jacobite visual symbolism  [41]
3 'Their disloyal and wicked inscriptions': the uses of texts on Jacobite objects  [79]
4 ‘Tempora mutantur et nos mutamur in illis’: phases and varieties of Jacobite material culture  [111]
5 'Those who are fortunate enough to possess pictures and relics': later uses of Jacobite material culture  [143]

Notes  [167]
Bibliography  [228]
Index  [264]
Illustrations

5. Anamorphic picture of Prince Charles Edward, c. 1745 (courtesy of the Trustees of the West Highland Museum, Fort William). [38]
11. Inscribed egg, West Africa, c. 1760 (ABDUA 47718, courtesy of the University of Aberdeen). [75]
12. Needle-case, c. 1689–1730 (courtesy of Hampshire County Council Arts and Museums). [99]
14. (a) and (b) Marginalia in John Gay, *Fables* (Glasgow, n.d.), author’s collection (photograph by Stefanie Moy-Schuster). [106]
15. Pincushion, c. 1746 (ABDUA 17969, courtesy of the University of Aberdeen). [109]
16. David Le Marchand, James Francis Edward, ivory plaque (frame, 29.7 x 25.6 cm; overall, 8.3 x 6.5 cm), c. 1720 (Thomson Collection © Art Gallery of Ontario). [122]
List of illustrations

17. Cambric rose cockade, c. 1745 (© National Museums Scotland). [125]
18. Relics of James II and VII, Maria Clementina and the 3rd Earl of Derwentwater, Stonyhurst College, Clitheroe, Lancs (by permission of the Governors of Stonyhurst College). [127]
21. Kalendar with the arms of Cardinal Prince Henry Benedict, before 1788, probably acquired by Queen Victoria (supplied by Royal Collection Trust © Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II 2012). [146]
22. Vincennes porcelain broth bowl and cover, c. 1748–52, probably made for Prince Charles Edward, acquired by Her Majesty The Queen (supplied by Royal Collection Trust © Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II 2012). [147]
Acknowledgments

Material from the Stuart Papers in the Royal Archives at Windsor Castle is quoted by the gracious permission of Her Majesty The Queen. I am grateful to Miss Pamela Clark, Registrar of the Royal Archives, and her staff for their kind assistance with this and previous projects. I am also grateful to Daniel Bell of the Picture Library, Royal Collection.

Patricia Brückmann started me on the whole Jacobite inquiry, suggested the writing of this book (appropriately, on 10 June 2008, the 320th anniversary of the birth of James Francis Edward), read earlier drafts, suggested much interesting further reading and provided invaluable help and encouragement along the way (a way which goes back to my first year as an undergraduate). I am greatly indebted.

Deidre Lynch also read a draft, pointed me in interesting directions on the cultural context of things and provided comments on the MS that I hope have borne fruit here. She also suggested a number of authors whose work has been illuminating: Miguel Tamen, Lynn Festa and Susan Manning in particular. I am very grateful for her willingness to help with my project.

My parents have helped as well, both directly and indirectly: my debt to them is immense. My sister Gay Guthrie, art historian and specialist on decorative arts, read earlier drafts and provided helpful comments.

Edward Corp, Eveline Cruickshanks, Anne Barbeau Gardiner, Howard Erskine-Hill, Niall MacKenzie and Richard Sharp have been very generous with their knowledge and advice. Jonathan Clark shared a pre-publication draft of his account of the history of Jacobite scholarship. Simon Stern brought to my attention some interesting aspects of the law of things.

A research associateship at Trinity College, University of Toronto, offered me library privileges and the opportunity to participate in the life of my undergraduate college, for which (and membership in the Senior Common Room) I am most grateful.

Linda Bree of Cambridge University Press and her two anonymous readers made very good recommendations on the manuscript, which I hope I have adequately reflected. (I have borrowed some phrasing here and there from Reader B’s report, with a due sense of acknowledgment.)
Linda Bree, Anna Bond, Samantha Richter and Bryony Hall of Cambridge University Press and the copy-editor Hilary Hammond were a pleasure to deal with during the editorial process that brought this book into being.

I should also like to thank the following for helpful responses to highly miscellaneous enquiries and general advice: Benjamin Alspop, British Museum; Robin Alston; Mark Bainbridge, Assistant Librarian, Worcester College, Oxford; Edward Baldwin, A. H. Baldwin & Sons Ltd, London; Peter Barber, British Museum; Jonathan Bell, Things; John Millensted, Bonhams, London; Julian Brooks, Ashmolean Museum; the late Laurence Brown, LVO; Ted Buttrey, Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge; Conrad Brunström, National University of Ireland, Maynooth; Bernard Williams, Christie’s, Edinburgh; Timothy Clayton; Linda Corman, John W. Graham Library, Trinity College, Toronto; Christina Corsiglia, Consulting Curator, Thomson Collection, Art Gallery of Ontario; Jean-Marie Darnis, Monnaie de Paris; William Eisler, Musée cantonal de Vaud, Lausanne; Godfrey Evans, National Museums of Scotland; Linda Rousseau and Pamela Sher, Fan Association of North America; Colin Fraser, Lyon & Turnbull, Edinburgh; Jill Gage, Reference Librarian, Special Collections, Newberry Library, Chicago; Simon Gilmour, Society of Antiquaries of Scotland; Elina Glenday, Tabley House Collection Trust, Knutsford, Cheshire; Jan Graffius, Curator, Stonyhurst College, Clitheroe, Lancashire; Elizabeth Hahn, Librarian, American Numismatic Society, New York; Gail Arnott, Alison J. Carter and Neil Hyman, Hampshire County Council Museums and Archives Service, Winchester; Robin Harris, Badminton House; Marian Hebb, Hebb Sheffer, Toronto; Richard Hewlings; Jack Hinton, Philadelphia Museum of Art; Alan Hobson, field officer, Jacobite Studies Trust; Tim Knox, Sir John Soane’s Museum, London; Janet Larkin, British Museum; Rebecca Lodge, Senior Curatorial Assistant, Chiddingstone Castle; Duncan B. MacGregor; Allan MacInnes, University of Strathclyde; Charles McKean, University of Dundee; the late Jay Macpherson; Jennifer Montagu; Catharine Niven, Senior Curator, Inverness Museum and Art Gallery; Tim Osborne and Victoria Osborne, Delomosne & Son Ltd, North Wraxall, Chippenham, Wilts; Serafina Pennestri, Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali; Jane Rhodes, Image Resources, Art Gallery of Ontario; Alison Roberts, Senior Curator, European and Early Prehistoric Collections, Ashmolean Museum, Oxford; Chris Rosebrugh; Bruce Ryan, Virtual Hamilton Palace Trust; Celia Irvine, Sampson & Horne Antiques, London; Stefanie Moy-Schuster, for photography and technical advice; Sally Sharp, Holborn Direct Mail; Robin Simon, British Art Journal; David Gaimster and Heather Rowland, Society of Antiquaries of London; John
Acknowledgments

Hughes, Neville Hayman and John Rank, Speechly Bircham LLP, London; Catherine Maxwell Stuart, Traquair House, Innerleithen, Peeblesshire; David Taylor, Blairs Museum, Aberdeen; Adriana Valarezo, *The Magazine Antiques*, New York; Br Ken Vance, SJ, St Francis Xavier’s Church, Liverpool; Paolo Vian, Director, Manuscript Department, Vatican Library; Felicity Wake; Thomas Holman, Wartski Ltd, London; Amy Wygant, *Seventeenth-Century French Studies*.

I also wish to thank staff of the Libraries and Museums, University of Aberdeen; Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto; Ashmolean Museum, Oxford; Bodleian Library, Oxford; Bonhams, London; British Library, London; British Museum, London; Cambridge University Library; Archival and Special Collections, Library, University of Guelph, Ontario; Inverness Museum and Art Gallery, and High Life Highland; Mills Memorial Library, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario; National Archives, Kew; National Galleries of Scotland; National Museums of Scotland; Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto; Probate Sub-Registry, HM Court Service, York; Library and Archives, Royal Ontario Museum, Toronto; Ryerson Polytechnic University Library, Toronto; Toronto Public Library; John W. Graham Library, Trinity College, University of Toronto; John P. Robarts Library (the inter-library loan department and the staff of the fourth-floor reference desk, in particular), Thomas Fisher Rare Book Library and Gerstein Science Information Centre, University of Toronto; Manuscript Department, Vatican Library (but not the Medagliere); Victoria & Albert Museum, London; E. J. Pratt Library, Victoria College, University of Toronto; and West Highland Museum, Fort William, Inverness-shire. Dropbox (www.dropbox.com) provided an important spur to my productivity, Evernote (www.evernote.com) to my management of information.

My thanks as well to the dealers who have helped to educate me and to feed the collecting bug that lies at the heart of this endeavour, including Baldwin’s, London; Bonhams, London; Christopher Eimer, London; Daniel Fearon, New Maldon, Surrey (who also helped with Fig. 1); Grosvenor Prints, London; Sanda Lipton, London; Timothy Millett, London; Morton & Eden, London; Sanders of Oxford; Spink & Son, London; and Timothy Hughes Rare Newspapers, Williamsport, Pennsylvania.

Chris Fauske and Rick Kleer allowed me to bring Jacobite material culture to *Money, Power and Print: The Third Colloquium on Interdisciplinary Studies of the Financial Revolution in the British Isles, 1688–1776*, in St John’s, Newfoundland in June 2008, where I spoke about the *Unica Salus* medal and two pamphlets as Jacobite responses to the South Sea.
Bubble. The discussion at that session sparked a number of ideas I have pursued in this study, even though its relation to the financial revolution of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries is only tangential.

A version of Chapter 1 was presented to the Eighteenth-Century Group, Trinity College, University of Toronto, on 7 October 2008, and I am grateful for helpful comments from participants on that occasion and afterwards.

Portions of Chapters 2 and 3 have appeared previously, and somewhat differently, in 1650–1850: Ideas, Aesthetics and Inquiries in the Early Modern Era, The Georgian Group Journal and The Medal. I am grateful to the editors of these journals (Kevin Cope, Richard Hewlings and Philip Attwood) for being agreeable about a certain amount of recycling in these pages, and for their help with earlier versions. The acknowledgments made in my articles in those journals are hereby reiterated.

URLs cited in the pages that follow were accurate as of the time of access but may have changed, the virtual not always being as durable as the material.

Errors of fact or judgment are mine alone.
How to refer to historical figures on both sides of the Jacobite divide is, fittingly, something of a treacherous business. Neutrality would not go amiss in this field of inquiry. My own interest in the phenomenon – or, to be more accurate, the phenomena – of Jacobitism – has no particular axe to grind. The viability of the Pretender’s enterprise (at its moments of greatest strength) has in my view been seriously underestimated, but there has, at the same time, been a tendency in certain quarters to find Jacobites under more beds than is strictly warranted.

I have no interest in promoting the claims of ‘King Francis II’ – something the Duke of Bavaria himself also appears to have no desire to do. (It is one of the delicious ironies of history that the Jacobite inheritance has devolved on a German, given the pains of the Stuarts to assert their Britishness in contrast to their rather distant cousins from Hanover.) At the same time, however, one ought to chafe against the still too prevalent view of the Jacobite fact as some kind of bizarre, anachronistic aberration, a mere footnote of history. Had Jacobitism been the retrograde irrelevance we have often been told it was, would it not have disappeared from sight by the end of the seventeenth century?1 It is remarkable that the Jacobite idea retained some form of currency a century after the revolution of 1688 – and while traditionalist, its espousal of religious toleration seems in retrospect positively progressive. There were no foregone conclusions in 1688, 1715 or 1745 about who was king and who pretender. And perhaps not even in 1750: it is probably also a mistake to regard Culloden as the end of the Jacobite venture, given the late flowering of its material culture – glassware, medals and prints in particular – in the late 1740s and early 1750s, as will be discussed in Chapter 4 of this book. One of King George III’s daughters made a telling comment: ‘I was ashamed to hear myself called Princess Augusta, and never could persuade myself that I was so, as long as any of the Stuart family were alive; but after the death of Cardinal York [in 1807], I felt myself to be really Princess Augusta.’2

It seems churlish in any event to refer to the son of King James II and VII as just plain ‘James Francis Edward Stuart’; this smacks of ‘Citizen Capet’ and looks like an attempt to gloss over the fact that the exiled
Stuarts were, at the very least, princes of Great Britain and Ireland – as George III graciously conceded to James Boswell. On the other hand, it seems silly to refer to George I and his descendants after 1714 as Elector (or King) of Hanover only. My own preference is to refer to the Pretender (a neutral term, by the bye, if understood in the sense of ‘claimant’ rather than ‘impostor’) by his Christian name, but not to go so far as to call him king and ascribe regnal numbers. ‘Cardinal York’ is traditional and harmless. Numbering is useful for the Hanoverians, given the replication of ‘George’ in both Hanoverian electoral and British royal numbering. ‘Queen Anne’ presents no difficulties in my view (as for many of her contemporaries), although I confess to finding it hard to say ‘King William III’ or ‘Queen Mary II’ – but here again that issue can be fudged somewhat since William was the third Prince of Orange of that name, so ‘William III’ in any event. Jacobite peerage titles are generally indicated in this work as such (e.g., ‘titular Earl of Inverness’ or ‘Earl of Inverness in the Jacobite peerage’), except where the use of a Jacobite title on its own would not confuse or provides a convenient shorthand. Holders of dignities conferred by the Hanoverians are referred to by those titles.

Eighteenth-century documents which originate on the Continent may be assumed to be dated according to the New Style; those dated from Britain before the shift to the Gregorian calendar according to the Old.

Notes

1 It is refreshing to see Steve Pincus’s characterisation of the adherents of James II and William as two sets of modernisers, albeit with contrasting visions, in 1688: The First Modern Revolution (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2009).


Abbreviations

Archaeological Institute  

BM  
*Burlington Magazine*

BNJ  
*British Numismatic Journal*

Corp  

Drambuie  

Dryden  

ECL  
*Eighteenth-Century Life*

ER  

Farquhar  

Forrer  

GEC  
| N&Q          | Notes & Queries |
| ODNB         | Oxford Dictionary of National Biography (online) |
| OED          | Oxford English Dictionary (online) |
| Plates       | Companion volume of plates to illustrate Hawkins. London: Trustees of the British Museum, 1904, 1911; reprinted Lawrence, Mass.: Quarterman Publications in association with British Museum Publications, 1979. References are by plate and figure number (e.g., clxvi.2). |
| PRO/SP       | Public Record Office (now National Archives), State Papers |
### List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PSAS</td>
<td><em>Proceedings of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RA/SP</td>
<td><em>Royal Archives, Stuart Papers</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCLE</td>
<td><em>The Second Centenary Loan Exhibition of Jacobite Relics and Rare Scottish Antiquities</em>; Edinburgh: Scottish National Appeal for Boys’ Clubs, 1946. References are by page and catalogue number.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woolf</td>
<td>Noel Woolf, <em>The Medallic Record of the Jacobite Movement</em>. London: Spink &amp; Son, 1988. References to specific medals are by catalogue number alone (e.g., 14:2a); to Woolf’s text, by page number only (e.g., 57).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>