Terrorism and the Right to Resist

In recent times the words 'rebellion' and 'revolution' have gained a renewed prominence in the vocabulary of world politics and with them so has the question of justifiable armed 'resistance'. In this book Christopher Finlay extends just war theory to provide a rigorous and systematic account of the right to resist oppression and of the forms of armed force it can justify. He specifies the circumstances in which rebels have the right to claim recognition as legitimate actors in revolutionary wars against domestic tyranny and injustice, and wars of liberation against wrongful foreign occupation and colonialism. Arguing that violence is permissible only in a narrow range of cases, Finlay shows that the rules of engagement vary during and between different conflicts and explores the potential for irregular tactics to become justifiable, such as non-uniformed guerrillas and civilian disguise, the assassination of political leaders and regime officials, and the waging of terrorist war against civilian targets.

CHRISTOPHER FINLAY is Reader in Political Theory in the Department of Political Science and International Studies at the University of Birmingham. He previously taught History at Trinity College Dublin and Political Philosophy at University College Dublin.

Terrorism and the Right to Resist

A Theory of Just Revolutionary War

CHRISTOPHER J. FINLAY University of Birmingham





University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107040939

© Christopher J. Finlay 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-04093-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Leona

Contents

Acknowledgements page x 1 Introduction 1 Revolutions armed and unarmed 1.1 1 1.2 Armed resistance and the concept of terrorism 3 1.3 Outline of the argument 8 Part I Theory and principles 19 2 Justice, oppression, and the right to resist 2.1 A right to resist 19 20 2.2 Oppression and the objects of resistance 2.3 Human rights and 'the revolutionary stance' 27 2.4 From human rights to the right to resist 30 2.5 Self-determination and social justice as goals of rightful resistance 36 2.6 Justice and the duty to resist 42 2.7 Conclusion: resistance to oppression as a right 52 Rights worth killing for 55 3 The problem of narrow proportionality 55 3.1 3.2 Three possible responses 58 3.3 Political oppression and conditional threats 63 3.4 Two qualifications 67 Contexts for rightful armed resistance 3.5 76 The codes of resistance 87 4 4.1 Introduction 87 4.2 The jus in bello 90 4.3 Limits of the Standard jus in bello 109 4.4 Conclusion 123 5 Rights worth dying for: Distributing the costs of resistance 125 The jus ad bellum and the in bello codes 5.1 125

vii

Cambridge University Press	
978-1-107-04093-9 - Terrorism and the Right to Resist: A Theory of Just Revolutionary Wa	ar
Christopher J. Finlay	
Frontmatter	
More information	

Contents

proportionality	128
ity: balancing innocent casualties	136
d unfriendly	139
neficiaries	141
aries: offsetting innocent casualties	146
esistance	149
adox	151
: Fighting within the Standard JI	В
uthority to wage war	157
	157
om attack	159
l the Standard JIB	168
l non-state groups	178
	184
on, and the problem of lawful	
	190
	190
egal liability of just combatants	193
iscrimination	199
rights of irregular combatants	206
	214
he law of war	
esistance beyond the laws	
	219
	219
	220
ric war	231
the Partisan JIB	238
	245
	247
	247
	250
errorism	255
	errorism

 9.4
 Models for all-things-considered justification (A):
 261

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04093-9 - Terrorism and the Right to Resist: A Theory of Just Revolutionary War
Christopher J. Finlay
Frontmatter
More information

Contents	ix
9.5 Models for all-things-considered justification (B): fairnes9.6 The Terrorist JIB	s 274 283
10 Back to the start: The ethics of beginning	286
10.1 As if from nowhere	286
10.2 Revolutionary strategy	290
10.3 The moral dimensions of revolutionary entrepreneurship 10.4 Conclusion: proportionality and overwhelmingly violent	
regimes	310
Conclusions	313
Bibliography	318
Index	336

Acknowledgements

I have built up a large number of debts during the years spent working on this book that I would like to acknowledge.

During the earliest stages, the University College Dublin Politics Department (later the School of Politics and International Relations) and the Dublin European Institute (DEI), UCD, provided me with the opportunity to start working on the theme of political violence. Some of the earliest thinking for the book began in lectures that I prepared for the modules I taught there on the three pillars of legitimate political violence: rule, revolution, and war. I would like to thank Attracta Ingram, Iseult Honohan, and Tom Garvin for welcoming me to the department in 2002 and my colleagues at the Dublin European Institute and more widely at UCD - Ben Tonra, Brigid Laffan, Daragh O'Connell, Tobias Theiler, Jennifer Todd, Dolores Burke, Anna Gwiazda, Etain Tannam, Katy Hayward, and Colin Shaw - for providing such a tremendously warm and supportive environment during the happy years I spent there. The encouraging words of Desmond Dinan were crucial in restoring my sense of purpose at an important moment at that time, a kindness for which I am very grateful. My brilliant friend, Stefan Auer, was a wonderful source of encouragement and wisdom while at UCD and since.

The Department of Political Science and International Studies (POL-SIS) at the University of Birmingham has been my academic home since 2007. My thanks to Thomas Diez for being such a welcoming head of department, and to his successors, Mark Beeson, Colin Thain, and David Dunn, for their support since. For engagement with the project at various points and for written comments on parts of the manuscript, I would like to thank Lou Cabrera, Richard North, Kerstin Budde, and Rita Floyd. My other colleagues in the Political Theory Research group, Richard Shorten, Peter Lassman, and the late Steve Buckler, provided a friendly and compact arena within which to expose some of my ideas on questions of political violence and ethics. For support

xi

Acknowledgements

and encouragement while at POLSIS, my thanks especially to David Bailey, Saori Shibata, Ted Newman, Hasan Qunoo, Stephen Bates, Laura Jenkins, Peter Kerr, Asaf Siniver, Ces Moore, Pete Burnham, Tim Haughton, Stefan Wolff, Mark Webber, and Sarah Colvin.

The first draft of this book materialized with the support of a British Academy Leverhulme Trust Senior Research Fellowship from autumn 2010 until autumn 2011. I would like to thank the Academy and Leverhulme Trust for this award and the School of Government and Society at Birmingham for allowing me to take time away from teaching and administration for these purposes and for a further sabbatical early in 2012.

I have been extraordinarily fortunate in the philosophers and scholars who have helped me develop my ideas over the past number of years. Jeff McMahan's generosity in supporting aspiring philosophers is legendary. I cannot thank him enough for the time he has taken to comment on and support my work at various points over the past number of years. Allen Buchanan proposed a book workshop on the penultimate draft of the manuscript which he then convened in May 2014. I am forever in his debt for this, an event which undoubtedly improved the book enormously. I would like to thank the speakers at the workshop for taking the time to read the work and present their comments, which were extremely helpful as I revised and edited the draft later in the year. In order of the chapters to which they responded (starting from Chapter 2), they were Julian Culp, Mattias Iser, Philippa Webb, Jeff McMahan, Uwe Steinhoff, Guiglielmo Verdirame, Cécile Fabre, Victor Tadros, and Kim Hutchings. My thanks too to Leif Wenar, Antoinette Scherz, and Mervyn Frost who also participated and who were generous with both critical suggestions and encouragement with the work, and to Allen Buchanan for written comments on Chapter 2. The event was hosted by the Dickson Poon School of Law at King's College London and received financial support from the School as well as from the KCL Centre for Defence Studies, the British Academy, and the Normative Orders Cluster of Excellence at the Goethe University Frankfurt. I would like to thank Rainer Forst, who co-organized the workshop series of which this was a part.

My thanks to James Pattison and Cian O'Driscoll for their engagement with the work at the 2011 meeting of the British International Studies Association in Manchester during our panel on asymmetric

xii

Acknowledgements

conflicts, and to Jonathan Parry, Michael Gross, and Yitzhak Benbaji for comments on the argument that now appears in Chapter 7. I had the opportunity to present some arguments from the book to an audience of international postgraduate students at the Tenth Tallinn Postgraduate Summer School in Social and Cultural Studies on 'Revisiting the Revolution, Past, Present Perspectives' in 2012. My thanks to Piret Peiker, Tarmo Jüristo, and Linda Kaljundi for inviting me to participate and to Todd May for his engagement with my ideas at that time, his critical suggestions, and his encouragement with the project. Mattias Iser's conference on 'Justice and Violence' at the Goethe University in May 2013 provided another opportunity to try out some ideas from the book and receive critical feedback. I am grateful to Mattias himself for his careful critical engagement, particularly with my arguments in Chapter 3. It was enormously helpful to have such a capable sparring partner then and since.

As editor of The Journal of Political Philosophy, Robert E. Goodin guided me in improving and completing my article, 'Legitimacy and Non-state Political Violence,' which was the basis for Chapter 6. It benefited greatly from a set of reports by anonymous referees (and from Jeff McMahan). I gratefully acknowledge permission from the publishers, Wiley-Blackwell, to reproduce material from this and one other piece (the basis for Chapter 7), both of which have been revised quite extensively for the book: 'Legitimacy and Non-state Political Violence', Journal of Political Philosophy, 18(3) (2010): 287-312 (first published online, 2009) and 'Fairness and Liability in the Just War: Combatants, Non-Combatants and Lawful Irregulars', Political Studies, 61 (2013): 142-60 (published online in May 2012). I would also like to thank the anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press for their comments on an earlier draft of the book and, above all, for the patient support of John Haslam, who commissioned the book. My thanks to Carrie Parkinson and Fleur Jones at the Press for bringing it forward to production, to Anamika Singh for managing the copy editing, and to Deniz Artun at the Galeri Nev, Ankara, for her assistance with the cover art.

On a more personal note, I have some historic debts as well as more recent ones that I would very much like to mention. Without the extraordinary kindness and support of Russell Rees as an early mentor I might not have taken the path towards academia. Russell was (and is) a brilliant teacher and first-rate historian. Many, many thanks.

Acknowledgements

My work on the themes of this book is roughly coeval with the lives of my fantastic young children, Hugh and Cara. They have probably suffered from it at times, for which I apologize, but they have also been an inspiration in life generally and have thereby contributed an enormous battery of borrowed energy in completing the project. As they grow up and as I find myself tasked with helping them achieve some realization of their evident intellectual potential, I am ever more impressed with the greatness of the task my own parents achieved many years ago when they coached my brother, Mark, and me through primary school, the 'eleven plus', and the various stages of grammar school. They were and are extraordinary parents, and I take this opportunity to thank them once again for their many sacrifices and great love. Let me mention too the great generosity of Dónal and Valerie Walker in whose house a good deal of the writing took place during summer and Christmas visits to Ireland.

Finally, I must mention my wife, Leona. She is a remarkable person in many, many ways, as everyone who has been blessed with her acquaintance knows. And for me, her love has been unstinting, quietly selfless, and undeserved. Nothing good would have come of me without her. This book is dedicated to her in immense gratitude.