The Multilingual Mind

Language lies at the heart of the way we think, communicate, and view the world. Most people on this planet are in some sense multilingual. The *Multilingual Mind* explores, within a processing perspective, how languages share space and interact in our minds.

The mental architecture proposed in this volume permits research across many domains in cognitive science to be integrated and explored within one explanatory framework, recasting compatible insights and findings in terms of a common set of terms and concepts. The MOGUL framework has already proven effective for shedding light on the relationship between processing and learning, metalinguistic knowledge, consciousness, optionality, crosslinguistic influence, the initial state, ‘UG access’, ultimate attainment, input enhancement, and even language instruction.

This ground-breaking work will be essential reading for linguists working in language acquisition, multilingualism, language processing, and for those working in related areas of psychology, neurology, and cognitive science.

**Michael Sharwood Smith** is Emeritus Professor at Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh, and Honorary Proforsorial Fellow at Edinburgh University. He is also the founding editor of the journal, *Second Language Research*.

**John Truscott** is Professor at the National Tsing Hua University in Taiwan, and has extensive experience teaching English as a foreign language, along with classes in linguistics, psychology, and language teaching.
The Multilingual Mind

A Modular Processing Perspective

Michael Sharwood Smith
John Truscott
To Luke, Noah and Kate, and their future (MSS)

To my parents, for everything (JT)
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of figures</th>
<th>page xiii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Introduction 1

1.1 Overview 1
1.2 Theories, frameworks, and safety zones 2
1.3 Terminological and conceptual traps 5
1.4 The pros and cons of compartmentalisation: SLA as a case in point 8
1.5 Cross-fertilisation 12
1.6 Some MOGUL 'prehistory' 12
1.7 MOGUL: the basics 13
  1.7.1 The main components 13
  1.7.2 Interface systems 19
  1.7.3 MOGUL in context 21
1.8 An outline of the chapters to follow 24
1.9 Chapter summary 25

Part I The framework 29

2 The language module: architecture and representations 29

2.1 Chapter outline 29
2.2 Modularity 30
  2.2.1 Modularity in general 30
  2.2.2 Modularity in language 31
  2.2.3 Jackendoff’s version of modularity 34
2.3 The language module(s) in MOGUL 36
  2.3.1 The general architecture 36
  2.3.2 Processors 39
  2.3.3 Lexical stores 40
  2.3.4 MOGUL and the nature of modularity 42
  2.3.5 Representations: the locus of language development 43
2.4 Representations at SS 44
  2.4.1 Syntactic categories and combinations of syntactic categories 44
  2.4.2 Functional categories and their feature values 46
  2.4.3 I and its features 46
  2.4.4 Case items 48
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Representations at CS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Conceptual role items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 Conceptual grids</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Connections among SS, CS, and PS items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1 Words: whole-form vs. decompositional storage/access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2 Beyond subcategorisation frames</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3 Functional categories: form and meaning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.4 A note on indexes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Representations and the notion of knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Working memory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.1 Research and theory on working memory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.2 Working memory in MOGUL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 Chapter summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Processing in the language module</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Chapter outline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Theory and research on processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Processing and linguistic theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Modularity and interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Incremental processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5 Activation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.6 Dual storage and processing as a race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.7 Serial vs. parallel processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Processing in MOGUL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 Processing and linguistic theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Modularity and interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3 Competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4 Incremental processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5 Activation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.6 Dual storage and processing as a race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.7 Serial vs. parallel processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Putting the elements together: the nature of processing activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 The process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 An example</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Another example: input including a fixed expression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4 Processing as dynamic equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.5 A note on neurological plausibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 The place of an L2 in the language module</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Chapter summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Growth of the language module: acquisition by processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Chapter outline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Acquisition by processing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The logic of APT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 APT and priming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 APT and dynamic systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 APT and connectionism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.5 APT and emergentist approaches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.6 APT as a strong claim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.7 What is acquired?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

4.2.8 Development within a store: representations and their activation levels 102
4.2.9 Development of connections between stores: indexes and their activation levels 105
4.2.10 Conclusion 107

4.3 The growth of syntactic structures 107
4.3.1 Syntactic categories and combinations of syntactic categories 107
4.3.2 Functional categories 109

4.4 The growth of conceptual structures 112
4.4.1 Conceptual role items 112
4.4.2 Conceptual grids 113
4.4.3 Crosslinguistic variation in conceptual role assignment 114

4.5 The growth of some combinations of SS, CS, and PS items 116
4.5.1 Words: whole-form vs. decompositional storage/access 116
4.5.2 Beyond subcategorisation frames 121
4.5.3 Constructions vs. principles and parameters 123
4.5.4 Functional categories 126
4.5.5 Influences of conceptual processing on the growth of SS 128

4.6 APT in perspective 130
4.6.1 Hypotheses and rules 130
4.6.2 Principles guiding acquisition 130
4.6.3 APT and working memory 132
4.6.4 Language acquisition outside the language module 132
4.6.5 The role of frequency 133

4.7 Chapter summary 134

5 Beyond the language module 137

5.1 Chapter outline 137

5.2 The overall architecture of the mind 138
5.2.1 Processors and information stores 138
5.2.2 Perceptual processing units 143
5.2.3 Visual structures (VS) 143
5.2.4 Auditory structures (AS) 145
5.2.5 Perceptual output structures (POpS) 148
5.2.6 Conceptual structures (CS) 152
5.2.7 Affective structures (AfS) 154
5.2.8 Modularity revisited 159
5.2.9 Conclusion 160

5.3 The nature of knowledge 161
5.3.1 Non-linguistic knowledge 162
5.3.2 Metalinguistic knowledge 165
5.3.3 Word meaning 167
5.3.4 Orthography 168
5.3.5 The place of emotion in knowledge 169

5.4 Growth 169
5.4.1 The growth of non-linguistic knowledge 169
5.4.2 The growth of metalinguistic knowledge 171
5.4.3 The growth of word meaning 173
5.4.4 Orthography 175
5.4.5 The role of emotion 176

5.5 Chapter summary 177
Part II Applying the framework

6 The bilingual mind introduced

6.1 Chapter outline
6.2 Setting the boundaries
6.3 Bilingualism: an overview
6.3.1 Multiple systems as the norm
6.4 Language systems in the mind: the differentiation problem
6.4.1 Avoiding Babel
6.4.2 The Language Tagging Hypothesis
6.4.3 The Conceptual Triggering Hypothesis
6.4.4 Different types of conceptual trigger
6.4.5 Bilingualism and the concept of native speaker
6.4.6 Language dominance
6.5 Language systems in the mind: crosslinguistic influence (CLI)
6.5.1 Types of CLI
6.5.2 Crosslinguistic influence in MOGUL
6.5.3 Code-switching
6.6 Conscious versus subconscious bilingual processing
6.6.1 An overview
6.6.2 Metalinguistic abilities in bilinguals
6.6.3 Translation
6.6.4 Interpreting
6.6.5 Language systems in the brain: a neurolinguistic perspective
6.7 Chapter summary

7 The growth of a second language

7.1 Chapter outline
7.2 Studying second language acquisition: central issues
7.2.1 First steps
7.2.2 Creative construction
7.2.3 Krashen’s contribution to creative construction theory
7.2.4 The ‘UG’ group
7.2.5 Bottleneck, Interfaces, and Interpretability
7.2.6 Pienemann’s Processability Theory
7.2.7 VanPatten’s input processing account
7.2.8 Carroll’s Autonomous Induction Theory
7.2.9 The generalists in SLA
7.2.10 MOGUL in relation to earlier approaches
7.3 APT and new languages
7.4 The growth of phonological and syntactic structures
7.4.1 A sketch of PS growth
7.4.2 Syntactic categories
7.4.3 Subcategorisation frames
7.4.4 Functional categories
7.5 The growth of conceptual structures
7.5.1 Case-conceptual role connections
7.5.2 Conceptual grids
7.5.3 Crosslinguistic variation in conceptual role assignment
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>The growth of some combinations of SS, CS, and PS items</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6.1</td>
<td>Word meaning</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6.2</td>
<td>Words: whole-form vs. decompositional storage/access</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6.3</td>
<td>Beyond subcategorisation frames</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6.4</td>
<td>Functional categories</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>The growth of metalinguistic knowledge</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>Language attrition</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>Chapter summary</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Consciousness and attention</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Chapter outline</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Consciousness</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1</td>
<td>The nature and function of consciousness</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2</td>
<td>Awareness of knowledge and its development</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>The nature of consciousness in MOGUL</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1</td>
<td>POPs and consciousness</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.2</td>
<td>Affective structures and consciousness</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.3</td>
<td>Explaining some characteristics of consciousness</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>Attention</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.1</td>
<td>Channels, filters, and limited resources</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2</td>
<td>Limited resources and the MOGUL framework</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.3</td>
<td>Development inside and outside the language module</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.4</td>
<td>Development and the characteristics of automatic processes</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.5</td>
<td>The trouble with attention as a theoretical entity</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.6</td>
<td>Deriving attention phenomena in the MOGUL framework</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>Chapter summary</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The role of consciousness in language growth</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Chapter outline</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Consciousness and growth of a first language</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.1</td>
<td>Consciousness and growth of the language module</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.2</td>
<td>Consciousness and growth of metalinguistic knowledge</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.3</td>
<td>Consciousness and growth of word meaning</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.4</td>
<td>Consciousness and growth of orthography</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.5</td>
<td>Conclusion: consciousness in the growth of language</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Consciousness and second language acquisition: noticing and understanding</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1</td>
<td>The trouble with noticing</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2</td>
<td>The MOGUL approach to noticing</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.3</td>
<td>Noticing vs. global awareness of input</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.4</td>
<td>Noticing vs. awareness at the level of understanding</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.5</td>
<td>Noticing and form–meaning connections</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.6</td>
<td>Noticing/understanding and automatic processes</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.7</td>
<td>Implicit learning revisited</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.8</td>
<td>Noticing the gap</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.9</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Implications for second language instruction</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.1</td>
<td>Teaching for metalinguistic knowledge and its use in performance</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

9.4.2 Adjusting learners’ input 303
9.4.3 Teaching metalinguistic knowledge to help learners adjust their own input 304

9.5 Chapter summary 306

10 Issues in SLA revisited 308
10.1 Chapter outline 308
10.2 Stages and continua 308
  10.2.1 Stages and what’s right about them 309
  10.2.2 Continua and what’s right about them 309
  10.2.3 A MOGUL resolution 313
  10.2.4 The evidence revisited 314
  10.2.5 Conclusion 315
10.3 The initial state and crosslinguistic influence 316
  10.3.1 The initial state 316
  10.3.2 Crosslinguistic influence 318
10.4 Optionality 320
  10.4.1 The phenomena 320
  10.4.2 Optionality in MOGUL 324
  10.4.3 Conclusion 326
10.5 Ultimate attainment 327
  10.5.1 The MOGUL approach to ultimate attainment 328
  10.5.2 The case of English past tense forms 329
  10.5.3 Optionality as an interface problem 334
  10.5.4 A note on individual differences 335
  10.5.5 Conclusion 336
10.6 Anxiety in second language acquisition 337
10.7 Chapter summary 339

11 Conclusion 341
11.1 Chapter outline 341
11.2 The challenge revisited 341
11.3 MOGUL summarised: the big picture 342
11.4 On birds, dogs, apes, and humans 344
11.5 More or fewer modules; the case for parsimony 347
11.6 Some MOGUL reconceptualisations 351
  11.6.1 What is a representation? 352
  11.6.2 What is ‘working memory’? 353
  11.6.3 What is ‘input’ in MOGUL? 353
  11.6.4 What is a ‘lexical item’ in MOGUL? 354
  11.6.5 What is ‘executive function’? 355
  11.6.6 What is a ‘parsing strategy’? 356
  11.6.7 What is ‘input enhancement’ in MOGUL? 357
11.7 The MOGUL brain 359
11.8 Closing comments 360

References 361
Index 401
Figures

1.1 Language broadly defined (version 1).  page 14
1.2 Language broadly defined (version 2).  17
1.3 (a) The tripartite structure of language according to Jackendoff (2002). (b) The tripartite structure of language according to MOGUL.  18
2.1 Language input as a multiple phenomenon: an example with four separate inputs triggered by environmental stimuli.  35
2.2 MOGUL architecture.  36
2.3 The word lamp as a linking of a variety of representations.  40
2.4 Indexes.  42
2.5 The representation of tense forms.  55
2.6 Working memory.  61
3.1 Processing Ron kicked the football: three different cases.  86
4.1 An aspect of APT: successive activation of an item in working memory on each occasion raises that item’s resting level.  95
4.2 The development of complex items during processing.  103
4.3 The interaction of rule-based and memory-based processing: comprehension of ‘kick the ball’.  125
5.1 Cognitive architecture: an example of four linked processing units.  140
5.2 Generic illustration of a complex representation with labelled connections.  141
5.3 An example of a structural ring for horse.  148
5.4 Perceptual Output Structures (POpS) as a combined store.  150
5.5 The Affective System.  155
5.6 MOGUL cognitive architecture.  161
8.1 Perceptual Output Structures as the Global Workspace in MOGUL.  256
8.2 Affective structures and POpS supporting conscious experience.  259
Preface

This book is the first detailed description of a particular theoretical framework for studying language development and language performance. The framework is called MOGUL (Modular On-line Growth and Use of Language). It has been the topic of numerous publications and presentations since the appearance of our 2004 keynote article in *Bilingualism: Language and Cognition*. MOGUL is not just about how a language grows in the individual child: it is about how the mind expands to accommodate more than one language both in childhood and later in life and how these various linguistic systems share space and interact.

The intended audience is interdisciplinary so the more technical details of, for example linguistic theory, have been avoided where possible or explained so that the book can appeal to a wider audience interested in language, bilingualism and language acquisition including specialists and students at graduate level in linguistics, psycholinguistics, neurolinguistics, and cognitive psychology. A detailed MOGUL glossary is currently available at the following website: www.cambridge.org/sharwoodsmith_truscott.

This book draws together insights from a number of related fields in cognitive science to provide an overall cross-disciplinary ‘big picture’ perspective within which research in separate research domains can be viewed and re-evaluated. In demonstrating how the framework may be used it also makes a number of specific claims about the growth and use of languages.

The work of Ray Jackendoff has been a major inspiration and starting point, although his views are developed and interpreted here in a number of ways peculiar to the MOGUL framework. Our aim has been to set out in some detail what may be the first explicit representational account of exactly how languages develop in the mind of an individual millisecond by millisecond as well as month by month in response to exposure to utterances in the environment. It is an on-line processing-based account that is broadly compatible with logical explanations in the generative linguistics literature which focus on the properties of developmental grammars at different stages and not how they actually change over time. In other words, this is a symbolic representational account as well as a processing one.
MOGUL, as set out in this book, is definitely unfinished business. Its future depends in large measure on its usefulness to the disciplines to which it seeks to contribute. To the extent that it has already got somewhere interesting, we can attribute its value to a mixture of serendipity and the valuable help we have received along the way from friends, students, colleagues, and also anonymous reviewers both of this book and of the various MOGUL-related publications that have appeared since 2004. In particular, we are grateful for the help and encouragement we have received from many friends, colleagues, and students, including members of the Developmental Linguistics group at Edinburgh University, but particularly to Harald Clahsen, Ray Jackendoff, Donna Lardiere, William O’Grady, Monika Schmid, Ianthi Tsimpili, Paul van Buren, Melinda Whong, and Bill VanPatten. In all fairness we should include in our acknowledgements the inspirational city of Edinburgh itself, which might well be regarded as the home of MOGUL (MOGUL’s midwife!), but not forgetting its MOGUL sister, Hsinchu in Taiwan, and the much travelled digital highway that links these two cities. Much of the work on this book was done during two research leaves that Truscott spent in Edinburgh, allowing us to go beyond the inevitable limitations of the digital highway. We wish to thank National Tsing Hua University for these opportunities. Last but definitely not least very special thanks are due to Ewa for her support and infinite patience with this long-lasting and time-consuming project.
Abbreviations

AfS: Affective structure(s)  
APT: Acquisition by Processing Theory  
AS: Auditory structure(s)  
CLI: Crosslinguistic influence  
CS: Conceptual structure(s)  
GS: Gustatory structure(s)  
GW: Global workspace  
L1: A first language  
L2: Any language learned after the first language  
L2A (also SLA): Second language acquisition  
LTM: Long-term memory  
MS: Motor structure(s)  
OfS: Olfactory structure(s)  
POpS: Perceptual output structure(s)  
PS: Phonological structure(s)  
PU: Processing unit  
SLA (also L2A): Second language acquisition  
SmS: Somatosensory structure(s)  
SS: Syntactic structure(s)  
UG: Universal Grammar  
VS: Visual structure(s)  
WM: Working memory

A glossary of MOGUL terms, concepts and notation may be found at:  
www.cambridge.org/sharwoodsmith_truscott

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org