GENDER, IDENTITY AND THE BODY IN GREEK AND ROMAN SCULPTURE

Gender, Identity and the Body in Greek and Roman Sculpture offers incisive analysis of selected works of ancient art through a critical use of cutting-edge theory from gender studies, body studies, art history and other related fields. The book raises important questions about ancient sculpture and the contrasting responses that the individual works can be shown to evoke. Rosemary Barrow gives close attention to both original context and modern experience, while directly addressing the question of continuity in gender and body issues from antiquity to the early modern period through a discussion of the sculpture of Bernini. Accessible and fully illustrated, her book features new translations of ancient sources and a glossary of Greek and Latin terms. It will be an invaluable resource and focus for debate for a wide range of readers interested in ancient art, gender and sexuality in antiquity, and art history and gender and body studies more broadly.

At the time of her death in 2016, Rosemary Barrow was Reader in Classical Art and Reception at the University of Roehampton. She had previously held academic positions at King's College London and the University of Bristol. She was the author of *Lawrence Alma-Tadema* (2001), *Creating Continuity with the Traditions of High Art: The Use of Classical Art and Literature by Victorian Painters*, 1860–1912 (2007) and *The Classical Tradition: Art, Literature, Thought* (2014), coauthored with Michael Silk and Ingo Gildenhard.

Michael Silk is Emeritus Professor of Classical and Comparative Literature at King's College London, Adjunct Professor in the Department of English and Comparative Literature at UNC, Chapel Hill, and a Fellow of the British Academy. From 1991 to 2006 he was Professor of Greek Language and Literature at King's; between 2003 and 2007 he held Visiting Professorships at Boston University. He has published extensively on poetry, drama, thought and theory in antiquity and the modern world, from Homer to Virgil, Nietzsche to Aristotle, Shakespeare to Ted Hughes.

CAMBRIDGE



Rosemary Barrow at Roehampton

GENDER, IDENTITY AND THE BODY IN GREEK AND ROMAN SCULPTURE



R. J. BARROW

Prepared for publication by Michael Silk with the assistance of Jaś Elsner, Sebastian Matzner and Michael Squire



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107039544 D01: 10.1017/9781139600439

© R. J. Barrow 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in United Kingdom by TJ International

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Barrow, R. J. (Rosemary J.), author. | Silk, M. S. (Michael Stephen), 1941- author. TITLE: Gender, identity and the body in Greek and Roman sculpture / Rosemary Barrow, University of Roehampton, Michael Silk, King's College London. DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018009343 | ISBN 9781107039544 (hardback : alk. paper) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Gender identity in art. | Sex in art. | Sculpture, Greek–Themes, motives. | Sculpture, Roman–Themes, motives. | Sculpture, Classical. | Bernini, Gian Lorenzo, 1598–1680.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC NB1952.G46 B37 2018 | DDC 733-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018009343

ISBN 978-1-107-03954-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

List of Figures		
Preface by Michael Silk		
Practical Information		
Acknowledgements		
Introduction: Approaching Gender		
1 The Male Body: Doryphoros	21	
2 The Female Body: Aphrodite of Cnidos	35	
3 The Veiled Body: Tanagra Statuette	49	
4 The Ageing Body: Drunken Old Woman	62	
5 The Indefinite Body: Sleeping Hermaphrodite	76	
6 The Political Body: Prima Porta Augustus	89	
7 The Incongruous Body: Portrait of 'Marcia Furnilla' as Venus	110	
8 The Beloved Body: Antinous	123	
9 The Other Body: Marble Relief with Female Gladiators	138	
10 The Non-Human Body: Pan and a She-Goat	153	
Epilogue: Bernini's 'Neptune and Triton'	164	
Glossary of Greek and Latin Terms		
Bibliography		
Index	213	

FIGURES

	Frontispiece Rosemary Barrow at Roehampton	page ii
I	Bronze Mirror Cover (c. 320-300 BC)	2
2a–b	Barberini Faun (Roman copy of a Greek original,	
	c. 200 BC)	II-I2
3	Doryphoros (Roman copy after a Greek original by Polyclitus,	
	<i>c</i> . 440s BC)	22
4	Euphronios, Athenian red-figure krater showing a gymnasium	
	scene (c. 510 BC)	29
5	Aphrodite of Cnidos (Roman copy after a Greek original by	
	Praxiteles, c. 350 BC)	38
6	Roman terracotta statuette of Baubo (III–I BC)	42
7	Tanagra statuette (c. III BC)	50
8	Attic red-figure kylix attributed to the Briseis Painter	
	(c. 480 BC)	57
9a–b	'Drunken Old Woman' (I AD Roman copy of a	
	Greek original, III–II BC)	63-4
10	Terracotta statuette of an old woman (c. 350 BC)	74
11а—с	Sleeping Hermaphrodite (Roman copy of a Greek original,	
	III/II BC)	77-8
12	Marble statuette of an anasyromenos Hermaphrodite (I BC)	81
13a–d	Prima Porta Augustus (late I BC–I AD)	90-8
14	Marlborough gem (14–37 AD)	107
15	Portrait of 'Marcia Furnilla' as Venus (I AD)	III
16	Silver tridrachm of Domitia Longina (c. 82 AD)	115
17	Antinous (130–8 AD)	124
18	Adonis Centocelle (II AD)	133
19	Marble relief with female gladiators (I/II AD)	139
20	Bronze statuette of a female athlete (I AD)	150

LIST OF FIGURES VII

21	Marble statuette of Pan and a she-goat (I AD)	154
22	Pottery lamp (c. III AD)	162
23	Giovanni Lorenzo Bernini, 'Neptune and Triton' (1622–3)	165
24a–b	Marble 'Altar of Domitius Ahenobarbus' (II BC)	175-6

PREFACE BY MICHAEL SILK

This book, as the title page indicates, has been 'prepared for publication' by myself, 'with the assistance of' Jaś Elsner, Sebastian Matzner and Michael Squire. The author, Rosemary Barrow, my close and long-time friend, died in 2016, at the age of forty-eight. The book was in progress, under contract to Cambridge University Press, when she was diagnosed with lung cancer on her birthday in 2015. In early 2016 she completed a rough first draft, and – against the odds – produced a revised draft and sent it to the Press around the end of June. She died in September. Some time in August, she expressed anxiety about the book, and I assured her that I would 'do whatever was needed' and 'see it through the Press'.

In this spirit, at the end of September, I approached the three named colleagues and friends – three notable scholars with relevant expertise in the fields of gender and body studies, ancient art and cultural history – who all readily offered their help. Though myself without obvious credentials in any of these fields, I had the advantage of a comprehensive knowledge of Rosemary's books and other publications and an intimate acquaintance with her prose style. I had read virtually all her published work, often before publication (including the first draft of this book), and only a few years earlier the two of us (along with Ingo Gildenhard) had co-authored a substantial book ourselves. I duly explained the situation to Beatrice Rehl at the Press, who was at once supportive.

Towards the end of 2016 I began work on the revised copy. My task in the first instance was twofold: to assess the scale of any necessary adjustments, with the aid of a newly arrived report by an anonymous reader for the Press (it arrived too late for Rosemary herself to see it), and to provide a clean text for my expert helpers to comment on, as appropriate. Given the speed and circumstances of its production, the revised copy inevitably required some attention. In broad terms it was admirably complete and elegantly written,

х

PREFACE

but there were some minor queries, along with a larger number of low-level imperfections to deal with: from slips of coordination to typos or other small details of phraseology. I tidied up and presented the adjusted text to my three helpers. They each read the new copy, answered specific queries and made additional comments and suggestions, none of them (I was glad to find) such as to challenge the integrity of Rosemary's work: its structure, perspectives, arguments, idiom or (in all but a handful of cases) detail.

Adjustments to Rosemary's text, as she left it, have thus been strictly limited; and the text in its final form, I am confident, is as she would have wished it to be. She had, however, no opportunity to see to the scholarly adjuncts to the main text itself. Accordingly, the Practical Information and Acknowledgements sections, the glossary, the index and of course this preface are all 'editorial' additions. Sebastian Matzner and Michael Squire have provided significant assistance with the index, and Michael Squire, again, has helped greatly by seeing to the illustrations (some provided by himself or by Jaś Elsner) and the necessary permissions. The main text, though, including notes and Bibliography, remains Rosemary's and properly represents her scholarship and her distinctive sensibility.

The obituary that follows is based on an unpublished notice that I wrote in the last months of 2016. I have left it essentially unchanged, set in the then-present and referring to myself in the third person. The obituary celebrates Rosemary's life and achievement with special reference to her most publicly acclaimed work up to that point, in the field of nineteenthcentury art history. For obvious reasons, I have cut the paragraph that deals with the present book. However, it should be said that this was her first book-length treatment of ancient art, while its frequent appeal to modern theory and experience, and equally the presence of a chapter on Bernini, characteristically illustrates the way that in her understanding of art, as in her life, she stood for connection and continuity of response.

Rosemary Barrow: Obituary Notice

For most of the twentieth century, the once fashionable Victorian painter, Lawrence Alma-Tadema, was the object of scorn, his work seen as the epitome of unthreatening 'academic' art, made up of quasi-photographic reconstructions of an idealized classical antiquity. An important part in his international rehabilitation was played by Rosemary Barrow. Her public involvement with the artist began in 1996/7, as one of the authors (though herself still a research student) of the catalogue for the influential Alma-Tadema exhibition that delighted large crowds of visitors in Amsterdam,

PREFACE

Liverpool and New York. Then in 2001 she produced the definitive book on the artist and his 'technical expertise, sensuous appeal, and subversive irony' (phrases from her article on Alma-Tadema in the *New Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*). Insistence on the irony was central to her argument. In painting after painting she identified half-concealed details that undercut an apparently innocent surface portrayal, while amply demonstrating the remarkable precision with which Alma-Tadema had indeed represented the look of that antique world. This book was among the achievements of a gifted and exceptionally versatile scholar whose early death has deprived the often separate worlds of art history, classics and classical reception studies of a notable presence. In an age of depressing compartmentalization, she successfully crossed these and other boundaries.

Rosemary Julia Barrow was born in Skewen, South Wales, the youngest of three children; her father, the local doctor, died when she was a year old, and the family moved to Merthyr Tydfil. She was educated at the Brecon Convent School and Cyfarthfa High School, a comprehensive in Merthyr. In 1989 she graduated in Classical Studies with English from the University of Leicester, before taking a few years out of academic life, initially to look after her sister's three young sons. She then began a significant association with King's College London, demonstrating a flair for art history in general and classical-subject art in particular. In the Classics Department at King's, she took her MA in Classical Archaeology in 1994 and then her PhD, on British classical-subject painting, in 1999. An important part in her development at this time was played by three senior scholars at King's: her research supervisor, Professor of Classical Archaeology, Geoffrey Waywell (who died earlier in 2016); Leonee Ormond, latterly Professor of Victorian Studies; and especially the comparatist Michael Silk, then Professor of Greek Language and Literature. Academic positions soon followed, their variety reflective of the range of her interests and expertise. Between 2000 and 2002, she was Faculty of Arts Research Fellow at the University of Bristol; between 2002 and 2004, the first Lecturer in Visual Culture at King's in what soon became the flourishing Department of Culture, Media and Creative Industries; and from 2005 to 2016 (having, for personal reasons, turned down a prospective lectureship in art history at one northern university), Lecturer, then Senior Lecturer, then Reader in Classical Art and Reception at the University of Roehampton. At Roehampton, her impact was considerable, as an immensely popular teacher of art history in general and ancient art in particular, and a tireless promoter of the ancient world and its multifarious legacy.

Lawrence Alma-Tadema, beautifully produced by Phaidon in 2001, was her first book. The volume soon acquired an authoritative status (though the

xi

xii

PREFACE

idea of Alma-Tadema's irony was too much for the limited horizons of Brian Sewell in London's Evening Standard), and was subsequently translated into Italian, Spanish, French and Japanese. Next came an expanded version of her doctoral thesis, Creating Continuity with the Traditions of High Art: The Use of Classical Art and Literature by Victorian Painters, 1860–1912 (Edwin Mellen Press, 2007), a unique overview whose impact was not assisted by the ponderous title (this was the publishers' idea; her own proposal for the first part had been evocative and personal, 'The Scent of Roses'). Then, in the winter of 2013/14, came a very different book, published by Wiley-Blackwell, and co-authored with Ingo Gildenhard and Michael Silk: The Classical Tradition: Art, Literature, Thought. Unusually, 'co-authored' here meant that the three authors adjusted or expanded each other's drafts, so that individual contributions are not always easy to pick out. Nevertheless, her stamp is apparent in a variety of wide-ranging treatments of (among much else) the influence of the Roman architectural writer Vitruvius, the importance of concrete in the story of the dome, the eccentric evolution of modern archaeology, the exotic manifestations of the classical on the popular stage and screen, the history of the female nude, the power of Titian and the enigmas of de Chirico. Reviewing The Classical Tradition in the journal Arion, the American art historian Paul Barolsky pronounced it 'a ... cornucopian book ... so rich that no review will do it justice': a tribute in no small measure to her contributions.

Compelling scholarship, presented with a light touch, was her forte. Her public presentations entertained as well as instructed, whether in university contexts or settings like Tate Britain and Leighton House. Her writing was marked by elegance and economy, across the several specialist fields that she moved easily between. She wrote with authority across the range of Western art history, from the Renaissance to Rothko; on ancient art, Greek and Roman; on popular culture and cultural theory. The variety of learned journals in which she published articles and reviews is indicative of her range: *Classical Review, International Journal of the Classical Tradition, Archeologia Viva, Theatre Journal, Feminist Theory* among them. As a teacher and colleague, she was 'much respected and much loved' – one of numerous tributes on the University of Roehampton website, where many students expressed their feelings for 'an amazing, inspiring lecturer'.

Blessed with great charm and beguilingly good looks, also with selfdeprecating irony ('I scrub up well'), Rosemary made an impression on many who only met her casually. 'Beautiful – and fun', was the verdict of the Greek scholar Edith Hall. She was indeed 'fun': in different phases of her life, dancing the night away at the 100 Club in London's Oxford Street;

PREFACE

tracking down hidden artworks in the galleries and museums of Paris, Florence and New York; delighting her students at Roehampton by bringing her Chihuahua, Pompey, as a support dog into classes; inventing her own version of a card game ('Not in my Collection') to instil art history into the heads and hearts of her three young nephews. In 2005 she married Dr Mark Betz, then Lecturer in Film Studies at King's; the marriage ended in 2010. She leaves a devoted partner, Ryan Cooper, who gave up his job in the Research Office at Roehampton to look after her in her last months; her sister Helen, formerly a special needs teacher, had earlier done the same.

Dr Rosemary Barrow, Reader in the Department of Humanities at the University of Roehampton, was born on 9 April 1968. She died of cancer on 21 September 2016, aged forty-eight.

xiii

PRACTICAL INFORMATION

- *Secondary literature*: modern works cited in the notes are listed in full in the Bibliography. Citations are often deliberately indicative rather than unusably comprehensive.
- Ancient authors and texts: references to ancient authors and texts (and abbreviations of the names) broadly follow the practice in standard works of reference, e.g. Hornblower, Spawforth and Eidinow (2012).
- Translations from Greek, Latin and other texts: all translations are new unless otherwise indicated.
- Citation of Greek and Latin words: this poses notoriously difficult problems, especially in the case of Greek items, which can be presented in several alternative ways, many of them awkward for different reasons. The practice in this book is broadly to follow common usage, item by item, irrespective of minor inconsistencies in the outcomes. However, where there are common alternatives, Greek proper names (or similar) are Romanized ('Polyclitus') or half Romanized ('Doryphoros'), in preference to more mechanical realizations of the Greek original ('Polykleitos', strictly 'Polukleitos', etc.) - whereas most other Greek words cited, generally in italics, are mechanically transliterated, with indication of long e (\bar{e}) and long o (\bar{o}): hence doru, erastes, eromenos, kharis (not e.g. dory, erastes, eromenos, charis). But any Greek (and Latin) words commonly used as technical terms in scholarly publications are cited in the commonly used form – which often means treated as honorary English words without italics, and (for Greek words) in Romanized or half-Romanized form: hence Greek chiton (not khiton) and kylix (not kulix), and Latin pudica (not *pudica*). Except for proper names, Greek and Latin terms cited are normally listed, with English translation, in the glossary (pp. 181-5); proper names are listed in the index (pp. 213-25).

xvi

PRACTICAL INFORMATION

'*Classical' and 'classical'*: 'classical' (with lower-case 'c') refers to Greek and Roman antiquity as a whole, or any feature of it; 'Classical' (with capital 'C') designates a style or period of Greek visual art or culture (approximately the fifth and fourth centuries BC), between the Archaic and the Hellenistic ages.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Sincere thanks are due to Beatrice Rehl and the staff of Cambridge University Press for their patience, efficiency and understanding in dealing with this publication and all the complications arising from Rosemary Barrow's illness and untimely death; then too to the anonymous reader for the Press for helpful comments, which have been duly taken into account in the final version of this book.

I am glad to have the opportunity to express my appreciation to a number of institutions, colleagues and friends for waiving or reducing reproduction fees for illustrations. Formal acknowledgement is due to all institutions that have provided permissions and photographs; relevant information is provided in the captions to the text figures, in addition to which the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, is thanked for Figure I (*Mirror Cover with Eros and erotic scene (symplegma*): Greek, Late Classical or early Hellenistic Period, about 340–320 BC: Bronze and silvered bronze: 17.5 × 2.5 cm [6⁷/₈ × I in.]: Gift of Edward Perry Warren) and Figure I4 (*Cameo with Livia holding a bust of Augustus (?)*: Roman, Imperial Period, AD I4–37: turquoise: $3.I \times 3.8 \times$ I.6 cm [1¹/₄ × 1¹/₂ × ⁵/₈ in.]: Henry Lillie Pierce Fund).

To my three expert helpers and friends, I express my great gratitude. Jaś Elsner, Sebastian Matzner and Michael Squire have done everything I asked, and more; their specific contributions are outlined in the Preface.

And two more personal acknowledgements: it is hard to overstate what Rosemary owed to her partner, Ryan, and her sister, Helen, for sustaining her during her illness. Their love and support, over the last eighteen months of her life, helped to make this book a reality.

Michael Silk

xvii