

# EATING AND ETHICS IN SHAKESPEARE'S ENGLAND

David B. Goldstein argues for a new understanding of Renaissance England from the perspective of communal eating. Rather than focusing on traditional models of interiority, choice, and consumption, Goldstein demonstrates that eating offered a central paradigm for the ethics of community-formation. The book examines how sharing food helps build, demarcate, and destroy relationships – between eater and eaten, between self and other, and among different groups. Tracing these eating relations from 1547 to 1680 - through Shakespeare, Milton, religious writers, and recipe-book authors – Goldstein shows that to think about eating was to engage in complex reflections about the body's role in society. In the process, he radically rethinks the communal importance of the Protestant Eucharist. Combining historicist literary analysis with insights from social science and philosophy, the book's arguments reverberate well beyond the Renaissance. Ultimately, Eating and Ethics forces us to rethink our own relationship to food.

DAVID B. GOLDSTEIN is Associate Professor of English at York University in Toronto. He writes on issues related to Shakespeare, early modern and Renaissance literature, food studies, and contemporary poetry. He has received numerous grants and awards, including fellowships at the Huntington Library, the Lilly Library, and the University of Wisconsin-Madison. A former food magazine editor and restaurant critic, he is also a widely published poet.



# EATING AND ETHICS IN SHAKESPEARE'S ENGLAND

DAVID B. GOLDSTEIN







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107039063

© David B. Goldstein 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2013 Reprinted 2014 First paperback edition 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Goldstein, David B., 1972–

Eating and Ethics in Shakespeare's England / David B. Goldstein.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-03906-3 (hardback)

1. English literature – Early modern, 1500–1700 – History and criticism.

2. Food in literature. 3. Eating (Philosophy) 4. England – Civilization –

17th century. 5. Ethics, Renaissance, in literature. 1. Title.

PR428.F66G65 2013

820.9'3559-dc23 2013017356

ISBN 978-1-107-03906-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-43908-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> For my parents, who taught me how to eat. For Mindy, Noa, and Micah, my constant commensals.



### Contents

List of illustrations		<i>page</i> viii	
Ac	knowledgments	xi	
	Introduction: eating relations	I	
PA	RT I CANNIBAL ETHICS		
	Excursus: the body edible	29	
I	The cook and the cannibal: <i>Titus Andronicus</i> and New World eating	32	
2	I will not eat with you: failures of commensality in <i>The Merchant of Venice</i>	67	
PA	RT II COMMUNION AND COMMUNITY		
3	Anne Askew, John Bale, and the stakes of eating	97	
	Excursus: receiving the recipe	135	
4	How to eat a book: Ann Fanshawe and manuscript recipe culture	139	
5	Eaters of Eden: Milton and the invention of hospitality	171	
	Conclusion: toward a relational ethics of eating	205	
Notes		212	
Bibliography		254	
Index		273	

vii



## Illustrations

ı.	Annibale Carracci, The Bean Eater (Mangiafagioli) (1580–90),	
	Galleria Colonna, Rome, Italy. Photo credit: Scala/Art	
	_ ·	page 2
2.	Hans Holbein the Younger and work shop "Venus Painter,"	1 0
	The Last Supper, c. 1527 (inv. no 316). Lime wood (?),	
	115.5 × 97.5 cm. Kunstmuseum Basel, Martin P. Bühler	21
3.	Peter Paul Rubens, Saturn Devouring His Children (1623),	
•	Museo del Prado, Madrid, Spain. Photo credit: Scala/Art	
	Resource, NY	39
4.	Image of cannibals preparing bodies for consumption from	
	André Thevet, La cosmographie universelle (1575). By permission	
	of the New York Public Library	41
5.	Anon., broadsheet with hand-colored woodcut and text from	
	Vespucci, Dise figur anzaigt uns das Volck und Insel (Augsburg:	
	Froschauer, 1505). BSB, Munich, Einbl. V, 2. Photo Credit:	
	Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Munich	42
6.	Cavalier d'Arpino (attr.), "America," from Cesare Ripa's	
	Iconologia (1603). Courtesy of the Rare Book & Manuscript	
	Library, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign	43
7.	Image of cannibals preparing bodies for consumption from	
	Theodor de Bry, Americae tertia pars (1592). By permission of	
	the Royal Ontario Museum. Photo Credit: Mindy Stricke	62
8.	Page from the Huntington Library copy of Bale's edition of	
	Askew's Examinations, with marginalia (1546). By permission	
	of the Huntington Library	III
9.	Two pages from the receipt book of Elizabeth Maynard (1696).	
	Courtesy of the Lilly Library, Indiana University, Bloomington,	,
	Indiana	144

viii



	List of illustrations	ix
10.	Title page of Ann, Lady Fanshawe's receipt book (late seventeenth century). By permission of the Wellcome Library,	
	London	156
II.	Page from the receipt book of Ann, Lady Fanshawe, showing attributions and cancellations (late seventeenth century). By	-
	permission of the Wellcome Library, London	162
12.	Martin Parr, "Steep Lane Baptist Chapel buffet lunch" (1976).	
	Photo Credit: Magnum	206



# Acknowledgments

From its infancy, this book has received nourishment from a long and generous list of critics, cooks, and friends. Academia is often thought of as a solitary profession, designed for antisocial lovers of musty archives. For my part, I'm happiest when scholarly research feels like table talk. My ideas have always formed in the crucible of conversation, and I owe my most general debt to all those with whom I've had the privilege of discussing and honing my notions about eating, ethics, literature, and living.

The book began as a dissertation at Stanford under the thoughtful eye of Stephen Orgel, who provided me with a utopian model of dissertation advising, and has continued to offer wisdom and hospitality for both the project and myself, long after he had every right to be let off the hook. David Riggs and Jennifer Summit have also, individually and as a committee, played a tremendous role in the book's development. Fellowships and research grants from Stanford made possible the archival research on cookbooks that became the core of the book's scholarship.

Laura King and Heather James, who along with Lynn Enterline helped instill in me a love of early modern literature, read drafts and made suggestions at crucial points. Bill Worthen, David Scott Kastan, and Martin Evans all gave unstintingly of their time and expertise. Amy Tigner, Jim Marino, and Richard Preiss have been reading drafts and providing encouragement since the project's inception. To them, as well as to the rest of my graduate cohort at Stanford, I am also grateful for hours of conversation, debate, and conviviality.

I owe a debt to the faculty and administration of the University of Tulsa, where this project began its long gestation from dissertation to book (I doubt that more than a few sentences remain of the original thesis). Lars Engle, besides embodying the Platonic ideal of faculty mentor, proved an invaluable interlocutor for my developing ideas. Grant Jenkins, Laura Stevens, and the rest of the English faculty likewise provided unfailing intellectual and social hospitality. A Faculty Research Grant, a Summer



xii

#### Acknowledgments

Development Grant, and an Oklahoma Humanities Council Grant all helped give me the time and funds necessary for work on the project.

At York, I have felt supported in countless ways, large and small. My Renaissance colleagues, Liz Pentland and Deanne Williams, set the gold standard for scholarly generosity. Between the two of them they have probably read and commented upon every sentence of the manuscript, and our conversations have stretched over a blissful landscape of shared meals. Marcus Boon has likewise shown himself to be a wise friend and host to me and my ideas. Julia Creet and Art Redding, as department chairs during the book's growth, created an environment conducive to research, and to the feedback loop between research and teaching. The undergraduate and graduate students in my courses on food and writing helped fashion an exciting and engaged space to debate ideas about eating and literature – they have contributed to this book more than they can know. I am grateful to Dean Bob Drummond for his flexibility and encouragement, and for the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council Grant in Aid of Travel and Faculty of Arts Council Travel Grant, which helped me to share my work at conferences. I would also like to thank my hardworking graduate assistants, Amanpreet Dhami, Anthony Hicks, Gabrielle Sugar, Navneet Alang, Adele Meleca, and Amanda Fiorelli, and Lee Frew, for his thorough index.

I revised most of the book while a Solmsen Fellow at the Institute for Research in the Humanities at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. I am grateful both for the fellowship and the essential gift of time it provided, and to my colleagues there – especially Rick Avramenko, Dan Birkholz, Susan Friedman, Jon Pollack, Jordan Rosenblum, and Brian Sandberg – for their advice and companionship. During this period, a Mellon Fellowship at the Huntington Library and a Helm Fellowship at the Lilly Library at Indiana University helped me finish the book's archival research.

Other friends and colleagues have contributed in important ways. I am thankful to Mark Clamen both for an offhand remark upon our first encounter ("You know that Emmanuel Levinas writes about food, don't you?") and for bearing the brunt of listening to how that remark shaped my resulting ideas. Katie Field read drafts and unhesitatingly shared her vast knowledge of the recipe archive. Leonard Barkan and Wendy Wall have also shared ideas and unpublished work. Doug Saunders helped me refine my writing habits. Bill Germano, John Felstiner, and Geoff Huck all helped me navigate the world of book publishing with wisdom and aplomb. At Cambridge, I have been grateful to Sarah Stanton, editor extraordinaire, to the Press's excellent staff, and to the two anonymous reviewers whose suggestions dramatically strengthened the book.



#### Acknowledgments

xiii

Various pieces of the book began as articles, invited talks, and conference papers. A version of Chapter 1 appeared in *Shakespeare Studies*. I worked out bits of the first section in a review article in *Literature Compass* and in an entry for the *Greenwood Shakespeare Encyclopedia*, and of the second section in entries on recipe writers for the Blackwell *Encyclopedia of English Renaissance Literature*. My ideas about Levinas found first expression in an article published in *Gastronomica*. I thank audiences and organizers at various academic gatherings, including the Modern Language Association, Shakespeare Association of America, Renaissance Society of America, Conference on Food Justice, Société Française Shakespeare, and Group for Early Modern Cultural Studies, among many others, for the nuance and challenge they brought to my ideas.

Most of all, my gratitude goes to my parents, who instilled in me the ethical value of eating well and demonstrated the practical skills of hospitality and cookery to achieve it; to my children, who teach me every day about the pleasure and strangeness of eating; and to Mindy Stricke, for her good grace in the face of this book's demands on my time and energy, her indefatigable willingness to help me explore my ideas, her unstinting encouragement, and, most importantly, her enthusiasm for a shared meal.