The rise of China, along with problems of governance in democratic countries, has reinvigorated the theory of political meritocracy. But what is the theory of political meritocracy, and how can it set standards for evaluating political progress (and regress)? Can meritocracy be reconciled with democracy, and, if so, how? What is the history of political meritocracy, and what can it teach us today? How is political meritocracy practiced in contemporary societies – in China, Singapore, and elsewhere – and what are its advantages and disadvantages in terms of producing just outcomes and contributing to good governance? To help answer these questions, this volume gathers a series of commissioned research papers from an interdisciplinary group of leading philosophers, historians, and social scientists. The result is the first book in decades to examine the rise (or revival) of political meritocracy and what it will mean for political developments in China and the rest of the world. Despite its limitations, meritocracy has contributed much to human flourishing in East Asia and beyond and will continue to do so in the future. This book is essential reading for those who wish to further the debate and perhaps even help to implement desirable forms of political change.

Daniel A. Bell is Professor of Ethics and Political Philosophy and Director of the Center for International and Comparative Political Philosophy at Tsinghua University (Beijing) and Zhiyuan Chair Professor in the Institute of Arts and Humanities at Jiaotong University (Shanghai). He has coedited three previous books for Cambridge University Press and authored, coauthored, and coedited seven other books. He is a frequent contributor to leading media outlets in China and the West. His writings have been translated into twenty-three languages.

Chenyang Li is Associate Professor and founding director of the philosophy program at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Previously, he served as Professor and Chair of the Philosophy Department at Central Washington University, where he received the Distinguished Research Professor Award, Outstanding Department Chair Award, and Keys to Success Award (Student Service). He was a 2008–2009 American Council on Education Fellow. His research interests include Chinese philosophy, comparative philosophy, and value theory. Among his publications are The Confucian Philosophy of Harmony (2013); The Tao Encounters the West: Explorations in Comparative Philosophy (1999); and The Sage and the Second Sex: Confucianism, Ethics, and Gender (ed., 2000), as well as about 100 journal articles and book chapters.
The East Asian Challenge for Democracy

POLITICAL MERITOCRACY IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

Edited by
DANIEL A. BELL
Tsinghua University
Shanghai Jiaotong University

CHENYANG LI
Nanyang Technological University
Singapore
From Daniel A. Bell
To Valérie, Oliver, and Yana

From Chenyang Li
To Fay and Hansen
Contents

Contributing Authors

Acknowledgments

Introduction: The Theory, History, and Practice of Political Meritocracy
Daniel A. Bell

SECTION I. THE THEORY OF POLITICAL MERITOCRACY

1. Political Meritocracy and Meritorious Rule: A Confucian Perspective
   Joseph Chan

   Tongdong Bai

3. Confucian Meritocracy for Contemporary China
   Ruiping Fan

4. The Liberal Critique of Democracy
   John Skorupski

5. Meritocratic Representation
   Philip Pettit
SECTION II. THE HISTORY OF POLITICAL MERITOCRACY

6. Between Merit and Pedigree: Evolution of the Concept of “Elevating the Worthy” in Pre-imperial China
   Yuri Pines

7. A Society in Motion: Unexpected Consequences of Political Meritocracy in Late Imperial China, 1400–1900
   Benjamin Elman

8. Meritocratic Democracy: Learning from the American Constitution
   Stephen Macedo

SECTION III. REALIZING POLITICAL MERITOCRACY TODAY

9. How East Asians View Meritocracy: A Confucian Perspective
   Doh Chull Shin

10. Political Meritocracy in Singapore: Lessons from the PAP Government
    Benjamin Wong

11. Meritocracy and Political Liberalization in Singapore
    Kenneth Paul Tan

12. China’s Meritocratic Examinations and the Ideal of Virtuous Talents
    Hong Xiao and Chenyang Li

    Philippe C. Schmitter

14. Political Meritocracy and Direct Democracy: A Hybrid Experiment in California
    Nicolas Berggruen and Nathan Gardels

Index
Contributing Authors

Tongdong Bai is the Dongfang Chair Professor of Philosophy at Fudan University in China. His research interests include Chinese philosophy and political philosophy, especially the comparative and contemporary relevance of traditional Chinese political philosophy. His books are *A New Mission of an Old State: The Comparative and Contemporary Relevance of Classical Confucian Political Philosophy* (in Chinese, Peking University Press, 2009) and *China: The Political Philosophy of the Middle Kingdom* (in English, Zed Books, 2012).

Daniel A. Bell (贝淡宁) is Professor of Ethics and Political Philosophy and Director of the Center for International and Comparative Political Philosophy at Tsinghua University (Beijing) and Zhiyuan Chair Professor in the Institute of Arts and Humanities at Jiaotong University (Shanghai). He has coedited three previous books with Cambridge University Press and authored, coauthored, and coedited seven books with Princeton University Press. He is a frequent contributor to leading media outlets in China and the West. His writings have been translated into twenty-three languages.

Nicolas Berggruen is an investor and philanthropist and founder and president of Berggruen Holdings, a private investment company, and the Nicolas Berggruen Institute, a think tank that works on addressing governance issues.

Joseph Chan is Professor and Head of the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong. His research interests include contemporary liberalism and perfectionism, Confucian political philosophy, the theory and practice of human rights, civil society and NGOs, and social cohesion. He has published articles in...
Contributing Authors


Benjamin Elman is the Gordon Wu ’58 Professor of Chinese Studies, Professor of East Asian Studies and History, and chair of the Department of East Asian Studies at Princeton University. He works at the intersection of several fields including history, philosophy, literature, religion, economics, politics, and science. His ongoing interest is in rethinking how the history of East Asia has been told in the West as well as in China, Japan, and Korea. He is currently studying cultural interactions in East Asia during the eighteenth century – in particular, the impact of Chinese classical learning, medicine, and natural studies on Tokugawa, Japan, and Choson, Korea.

Ruiping Fan is Professor of Philosophy in the Department of Public Policy at City University of Hong Kong. He authored Reconstructionist Confucianism: Rethinking Morality after the West (2010) and Contemporary Confucian Bioethics (2011). He is the editor or coeditor of Confucian Bioethics (1999), Confucian Society and the Revival of Dao (2008), The Renaissance of Confucianism in Contemporary China (2011), Ritual and the Moral Life (2012), and A Confucian Constitutional Order (2013).

Nathan Gardels is editor-in-chief of NPQ and Global Services of the LA Times Syndicate. He is coauthor with Nicolas Berggruen of “Intelligent Governance for the 21st Century: A Middle Way between West and East.”

Chenyang Li is Associate Professor and founding director of the philosophy program at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. He served as Professor in and Chair of the Philosophy Department at Central Washington University (1999–2010). His research interests include Chinese philosophy, comparative philosophy, and value theory. His publications include The Confucian Philosophy of Harmony (Routledge, 2013); The Tao Encounters the West: Explorations in Comparative Philosophy (State University of New York Press, 1999; Chinese trans. Remin University Press, 2005); and The Sage and the Second Sex:
Contributing Authors

Confucianism, Ethics, and Gender (ed., Open Court, 2000), and about 100 journal articles and book chapters. He is a member of the editorial/academic boards of the Journal of Chinese Philosophy and thirteen other scholarly publications.

Stephen Macedo is Laurence S. Rockefeller Professor of Politics in the University Center for Human Values at Princeton University, where he has also served as Director of the Center and Founding Director of the Program in Law and Public Affairs. His books include Diversity and Distrust: Civic Education in a Multicultural Democracy and Liberal Virtues: Citizenship, Virtue, and Community in Liberal Constitutionalism (Chinese trans., Yilin Press, 2010).

Philip Pettit is Laurence S. Rockefeller University Professor of Politics and Human Values at Princeton University and Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the Australian National University. His recent books include On the People’s Terms: A Republican Theory and Model of Democracy (Cambridge University Press, 2012), Group Agency (with Christian List, Oxford University Press, 2011), and A Political Philosophy in Public Life (with Jose Marti, Princeton University Press, 2010). His work is the focus in Common Minds: Themes from the Philosophy of Philip Pettit (Oxford University Press, 2007), edited by H. G. Brennan et al.


Philippe C. Schmitter is Professorial Fellow and a recurring lecturer at the Istituto Italiano di Scienze Umane (SUM) in Florence and at the Central European University in Budapest. He has published books and articles on comparative politics, regional integration in Western Europe and Latin America, the transition from authoritarian rule in Southern Europe and Latin America, and the intermediation of class, sectorial, and professional interests. His current work is on the political
Doh Chull Shin is Jack W. Peltason Scholar in Residence at the Center for the Study of Democracy at the University of California, Irvine. His publications include *Mass Politics and Culture in Democratizing Korea* (Cambridge University Press, 1999); *Economic Crisis and Dual Transition in Korea* (Seoul National University Press, 2004); *Citizens, Democracy, and Markets around the Pacific Rim* (Oxford University Press, 2006); *How East Asians View Democracy* (Columbia University Press, 2009); *The Quality of Life in Korea* (Kluwer Academic, 2003); and *The Quality of Life in Confucian Asia* (Springer, 2006).

John Skorupski studied philosophy and economics at Cambridge University. After lecturing at the University of Glasgow, he moved to the Chair of Philosophy at Sheffield University in 1984 and to the Chair of Moral Philosophy at Saint Andrews in 1990. His interests at the moment are moral and political philosophy, meta-ethics and epistemology, and the history of nineteenth- and twentieth-century philosophy. His books include *John Stuart Mill* (1989), *Ethical Explorations* (1999), and *The Domain of Reasons* (2010).

Kenneth Paul Tan is Associate Professor at the National University of Singapore’s Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy. He has written widely about Singapore, mainly on governance, democracy, and civil society; the creative city and culture industry; and race, gender, and sexuality. He has published in leading international journals such as *Asian Studies Review*, *Critical Asian Studies*, *International Political Science Review*, and *Position: Asia Critique*. He has authored two books: *Renaissance Singapore? Economy, Culture, and Politics* (NUS Press, 2007) and *Cinema and Television in Singapore: Resistance in One Dimension* (Brill, 2008).

Benjamin Wong is Associate Professor of Policy and Leadership Studies at the National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University. His teaching and research interests include history of political thought, Singapore politics, and education policy. He is coeditor of *Dissident Democrats: The Challenge of Democratic Leadership in Asia* and has published articles in the *Journal of Chinese Philosophy, Philosophy East and West*, and *Millennium: Journal of International Studies*, among others.
Hong Xiao is Associate Professor of Sociology and Director of Master of Arts in Contemporary China at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. She served as Professor and Chair of the Sociology Department at Central Washington University (1999–2010). She is the author of *Childrearing Values in the United States and China: A Comparison of Belief Systems and Social Structure* (Praeger, 2001) and has published on topics such as social class and values, child socialization, culture and values, gender, domestic violence, and human rights.
Acknowledgments

The editors thank the Center for Liberal Arts and Social Sciences of the College of Humanities, Arts, and Social Sciences at Nanyang Technological University for a generous grant and Ang Wee Li, Leo Chung Hoe Gary, and Li Jifen for their dedicated service in support of the conference “The Idea of Political Meritocracy: A Nanyang Technological University Interdisciplinary Symposium” on 6–8 January 2012, from which this volume was generated. This project was partially supported by NTU Research Grant M4080394. Thanks are also due to Alan Chan, Ian Chong, Chua Beng Huat, Michael Dowdle, Prasenjit Duara, Daniel Goh, He Baogang, Leigh Jenco, Leo Koguan, Loy Hui Chieh, William Nienhauser, Pan Wei, Michael Puett, Lisa Raphals, Tan Ern Ser, Tan Sor-hoon, Ten Chin Liew, and Zheng Yongnian, for participating in the conference and for providing valuable comments on the papers; to Mark Elliott for helpful suggestions of translations of Chinese key terms; to Gu Qingfeng and Song Bing for helping us obtain the cover photo, and to photographer of the cover photo Hu Yong at Center for Public Service Examinations, Organization Department, Changsha City (Hunan province, China), for permitting us to use it; to Wu Huawei, Li Jifen, and Sun Qingjuan for help with proofreading and technical assistance in preparing the manuscript; and last but not least, especially to our thoughtful and efficient editor at Cambridge University Press, John Berger, who has made publishing this volume a particularly pleasant and rewarding experience.