

## America's Battle for Media Democracy

How did the American media system become what it is today? Why do American media have so few public interest regulations compared with other democratic nations? How did the system become dominated by a few corporations, and why are structural problems like market failures routinely avoided in media policy discourse? By tracing the answers to many of these questions back to media policy battles in the 1940s, this book explains how this happened and why it matters today. Drawing from extensive archival research, the analysis uncovers the American media system's historical roots and normative foundations. It charts the rise and fall of a forgotten media reform movement to recover alternatives and paths not taken. As much about the present and future as it is about the past, the book proposes policies for remaking media founded on democratic values for the digital age.

Victor Pickard is an assistant professor in the Annenberg School for Communication at the University of Pennsylvania. His research explores the history and political economy of media institutions, media activism, and the politics and normative foundations of media policy. Previously he taught media studies at New York University and the University of Virginia and worked on media policy in Washington, DC. He served as a Policy Fellow for Congresswoman Diane Watson and as a Senior Research Fellow at the media reform organization Free Press and the think tank the New America Foundation. His work has been published in numerous scholarly journals and anthologies, and with Robert McChesney he coedited the book Will the Last Reporter Please Turn out the Lights? He frequently speaks to the press about mediarelated issues and his op-eds have appeared in venues like the Guardian, the Seattle Times, the Philadelphia Inquirer, and the Huffington Post.





### Communication, Society and Politics

#### Editors

W. Lance Bennett, University of Washington Robert M. Entman, The George Washington University

Politics and relations among individuals in societies across the world are being transformed by new technologies for targeting individuals and sophisticated methods for shaping personalized messages. The new technologies challenge boundaries of many kinds - between news, information, entertainment, and advertising; between media, with the arrival of the World Wide Web; and even between nations. Communication, Society and Politics probes the political and social impacts of these new communication systems in national, comparative, and global perspective.

### Other Books in the Series

Evolution of Political Power

Erik Albæk, Arjen van Dalen, Nael Jebril, and Claes de Vreese, Political Journalism in Comparative Perspective

Eva Anduiza, Michael James Jensen, and Laia Jorba, eds., Digital Media and Political Engagement Worldwide: A Comparative Study

C. Edwin Baker, Media Concentration and Democracy: Why Ownership Matters

C. Edwin Baker, Media, Markets, and Democracy

W. Lance Bennett and Robert M. Entman, eds., Mediated Politics: Communication in the Future of Democracy

Rodney Benson, Shaping Immigration News: A French-American Comparison Bruce Bimber, Information and American Democracy: Technology in the

Bruce Bimber, Andrew Flanagin, and Cynthia Stohl, Collective Action in Organizations: Interaction and Engagement in an Era of Technological

Murray Edelman, The Politics of Misinformation

Frank Esser and Barbara Pfetsch, eds., Comparing Political Communication: Theories, Cases, and Challenges

Myra Marx Ferree, William Anthony Gamson, Jürgen Gerhards, and Dieter Rucht, Shaping Abortion Discourse: Democracy and the Public Sphere in Germany and the United States

Hernan Galperin, New Television, Old Politics: The Transition to Digital TV in the United States and Britain

Tim Groeling, When Politicians Attack: Party Cohesion in the Media

Richard Gunther and Anthony Mughan, eds., Democracy and the Media: A Comparative Perspective

(Continued after index)





## America's Battle for Media Democracy

The Triumph of Corporate Libertarianism and the Future of Media Reform

VICTOR PICKARD

University of Pennsylvania





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107694750

© Victor Pickard 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Pickard, Victor W.

America's battle for media democracy: the triumph of corporate Libertarianism and the future of media reform / Victor Pickard, University of Pennsylvania.

pages cm. - (Communication, society and politics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03833-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-69475-0 (pbk.)

1. Mass media policy – United States – History. 2. Broadcasting policy –

United States - History. I. Title.

P92.U5P44 2014

302.23-dc23 2014015034

ISBN 978-1-107-03833-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-69475-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
	Introduction: The Policy Origins and Normative Foundations of American Media	I
ı.	The Revolt against Radio	9
2.	A Progressive Turn at the FCC	38
3.	The Battle of the Blue Book	62
4.	The Origins of the Fairness Doctrine	98
5.	The 1940s Newspaper Crisis and the Birth of the Hutchins Commission	124
6.	Should the Giants Be Slain or Persuaded to Be Good?	152
7.	The Postwar Settlement for American Media	190
	Conclusion: Confronting Market Failure	212
Bibliography of Primary Sources		233
Index		235

vii





## Acknowledgments

America's Battle for Media Democracy was made possible with the help of innumerable friends, family members, mentors, and colleagues. This nearly decade-long project began during my doctoral studies at the Institute of Communications Research at the University of Illinois, where I had the good fortune to work with top-notch faculty, staff, and graduate students who created a rich intellectual environment. Special recognition goes to my mentor and friend, Robert McChesney, whose exemplary work first led me to the field of communication. Bob gave me excellent guidance as my dissertation advisor, and he also graciously shared some of his hard-earned archival materials, which helped me understand the depth of 1940s radio criticism. Also joining my dissertation committee of all-star scholars were John Nerone, Dan Schiller, and Bruce Williams. Their collective wisdom on the historical relationships involving media, democracy, and policy helped set my focus on 1940s media reform efforts. Another valued mentor and friend (and co-editor of this book series), Lance Bennett, inspired me to look at normative questions about the role of media in a democratic society. Lance encouraged me to publish with Cambridge, and through him I met Robert Entman, the other co-editor of this series. I was very fortunate to work with Bob, a fantastic editor who challenged me to sharpen my critical analysis.

In addition to these core advisors was a solid intellectual community of friends and colleagues who encouraged me along the way and offered constructive criticism. It is impossible for me to thank all of them, but those whose conversations and advice informed various aspects of this project include: John Anderson, Jack Bratich, Kevin Coe, Jeff Cohen, Matt Crain, James Curran, Brian Dolber, David Domke, Susan Douglas, John Downing, Matt Ehrlich, Mark Fackler, Liz Fones-Wolf, Des Freedman, Lew Friedland, Kelly Gates, Jay Hamilton, James Hay, Deepa Kumar, Mark Leff, Marie Leger, Steve Livingston, Mark Lloyd, Steve Macek, Rick Maxwell, Sascha Meinrath, Tony

ix



X

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-03833-2 - America's Battle for Media Democracy: The Triumph of Corporate Libertarianism and the Future of Media Reform Victor Pickard Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

Nadler, Phil Napoli, Russ Newman, John Nichols, Molly Niesen, Janice Peck, Jeff Pooley, Matt Powers, Andrea Press, Craig Robertson, Amit Schejter, Andy Schwartzman, Ben Scott, Josh Silver, Pete Simonson, Michael Socolow, Laura Stein, Inger Stole, Sharon Strover, and Siva Vaidhyanathan. Conversations with my good friends Christina Dunbar-Hester and Todd Wolfson, whose books are coming out at the same time as mine, were particularly therapeutic. Ed Baker, one of my intellectual heroes, who was quickly becoming a close mentor before he passed away, gave me key advice about my book's Conclusion. The late Norman Corwin and Everett Parker generously allowed me to interview them at length about their experiences with 1940s media reform efforts.

A number of individuals deserve special thanks for reading and commenting on specific chapters and early drafts of articles, including Mark Cooper, Mike Kittross, Ben Lennett, John Nerone, Allison Perlman, Manuel Puppis, Michael Schudson, Michael Stamm, Josh Stearns, and Chris Sterling. Michael Copps, Richard John, and Chris Ali generously read the entire book and offered valuable feedback. My dear friend Joseph McCombs carefully copyedited the entire book. Joe is one of the top copy editors in the nation, and this manuscript greatly benefited from his expert attention. My "best man" Jonathan Evans read an early draft of the book and offered spirited encouragement.

All of my colleagues at the University of Pennsylvania have been very supportive and offered helpful suggestions on all manner of book-related issues, especially Michael Delli Carpini, Peter Decherney, Marwan Kraidy, Carolyn Marvin, Monroe Price, Joe Turow, and Barbie Zelizer. I would also like to thank my former NYU colleagues, particularly Rod Benson, Brett Gary, Eric Klinenberg, and Mark Miller, for their camaraderie and for their feedback on my work. Marita Sturken was a wonderful departmental chair during my time at NYU. This book also benefited from the attention of a number of superb research assistants, including Doug Allen, Chris Cimaglio, Tim Libert, Beza Merid, Samantha Oliver, Luke Stark, Doron Taussig, and Alex Williams. I often tasked these young scholars with tracking down and researching obscure historical literature, and they always exceeded my expectations. Chris deserves special recognition for proofreading the entire book, editing all of my footnotes, and offering sharp feedback. Doug and Tim's feedback on my Conclusion chapter helped strengthen a number of key points. Annenberg is incredibly fortunate to have an amazing staff, and I especially thank Joe Diorio, our communications director, and Sharon Black, our librarian, for crucial book-related assistance. And I am deeply indebted to Lew Bateman and Shaun Vigil at Cambridge, who always kept things on track, handled my first-time-author anxieties with great aplomb, and made sure that the book was published. Of course, any errors are entirely on me.

Archival work is expensive, labor-intensive, and time-consuming. These factors make financial support from academic institutions and professional aid from archivists absolutely essential. Along these lines, I thank my past and present academic homes: the University of Illinois, New York University, and the



Acknowledgments

xi

Annenberg School for Communication at the University of Pennsylvania. I also thank the archivists at libraries and collections who offered me tremendous professional assistance, including those based at the Alabama Department of Archives and History, Dallas Smythe Collection at Simon Fraser University, the Library of American Broadcasting at the University of Maryland, the Library of Congress, the National Archives in College Park, the Rare Book & Manuscript Library at Columbia University, the Special Collections Division at the University of Washington, and the University of Chicago's Regenstein Library. Sections of this book appeared in earlier form in various journal articles, which I reference at the beginning of specific chapters. The media reform organization Free Press and the public policy think tank New America offered intellectual and institutional support as I was finishing my dissertation and during the early stages of book writing. I would also like to thank the media activists and progressive policy makers, past and present, whose struggle I hope to honor with this project.

I want to thank my family for their unconditional love and help over the years. My sister Lara Bury and her family – Steve, Willow, and Ryan – were crucial in providing me the strength to complete this project. I would also like to thank my wife's family members, especially Julilly Kohler, Chuck and Jean Hausmann, and Issa Kohler-Hausmann and her partner, Marty LaFalce, who have always been incredibly supportive during these often challenging years.

I thank my two vivacious children, Zaden and Lilia, for reminding me every day that I am first and foremost "Daddy" and that there are more important things in this world beyond writing books. Beginning an academic career at the same moment as creating a new family is not the most ideal in terms of timing or sanity. But I could not ask for a better-suited companion with whom to share this crazy adventure than my amazing wife, Julilly Kohler-Hausmann. In addition to being an incredible mother and loving partner, Julilly is a world-class historian, and her spot-on comments on each chapter of my book were invaluable. Julilly was with me during every stage of this book process and I am forever deeply in her debt. I am so blessed to have her in my life.

Finally, this book – and, indeed, my existence – would not be possible without the love and support from my parents. Victor Willoughby Pickard, Jr., who passed away during my first year of grad school, taught me to not back down from my convictions and was always very encouraging of my writing (even when he disagreed with its arguments). Kay Pickard, who for many years worked long, difficult hours, often away from home, to put me through college, taught me to work hard, read deeply, and enjoy the many wonders of life. It is to this amazing woman, my mother and my hero, that this book is dedicated.