

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03789-2 — The Cambridge History of Music Criticism
Edited by Christopher Dingle
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF
MUSIC CRITICISM

Music criticism has played a fundamental and influential role throughout music history, with numerous composers such as Berlioz, Schumann and Wagner, as well as many contemporary musicians, also maintaining careers as writers and critics. *The Cambridge History of Music Criticism* goes beyond these better-known accounts, reaching back to medieval times, expanding the geographical reach both within and beyond Europe and including key issues such as women and criticism, recordings and the story of criticism in jazz, popular music and world music. Drawing on a blend of established and talented young scholars, this is the first substantial historical survey of music criticism and critics, bringing unprecedented scope to a rapidly expanding area of musicological research. An indispensable point of reference, *The Cambridge History of Music Criticism* provides a broad historical overview of the field while also addressing specific issues and events.

CHRISTOPHER DINGLE is Professor of Music at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. In addition to research on music criticism, he has authored/edited five books on Messiaen, including the acclaimed *The Life of Messiaen* (Cambridge, 2007). His realisation of the orchestration of Messiaen's *Un oiseau des arbres de Vie (Oiseau Tui)* was premiered at the 2015 BBC Proms, and a critical edition of the score will be published in 2019. A book of conversations with the composer Julian Anderson is in preparation, and Dingle has also written for *BBC Music Magazine* for twenty-five years.

THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF
MUSIC

The Cambridge History of Music comprises a group of reference works concerned with significant strands of musical scholarship. The individual volumes are self-contained and include histories of music examined by century as well as the history of opera, music theory and American music. Each volume is written by a team of experts under a specialist editor and represents the latest musicological research.

The Cambridge History of American Music
Edited by David Nicholls

The Cambridge History of Music Criticism
Edited by Christopher Dingle

The Cambridge History of Musical Performance
Edited by Colin Lawson and Robin Stowell

The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory
Edited by Thomas Christensen

The Cambridge History of World Music
Edited by Philip V. Bohlman

The Cambridge History of Medieval Music
Edited by Mark Everist and Thomas Forrest Kelly

The Cambridge History of Fifteenth-Century Music
Edited by Anna Maria Busse Berger and Jesse Rodin

The Cambridge History of Sixteenth-Century Music
Edited by Iain Fenlon and Richard Wistreich

The Cambridge History of Seventeenth-Century Music
Edited by Tim Carter and John Butt

The Cambridge History of Eighteenth-Century Music
Edited by Simon P. Keefe

The Cambridge History of Nineteenth-Century Music
Edited by Jim Samson

The Cambridge History of Twentieth-Century Music
Edited by Nicholas Cook and Anthony Pople

THE CAMBRIDGE
HISTORY OF
MUSIC CRITICISM

*

EDITED BY
CHRISTOPHER DINGLE
Royal Birmingham Conservatoire



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-03789-2 — The Cambridge History of Music Criticism
 Edited by Christopher Dingle
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi - 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107037892
 DOI: 10.1017/9781139795425

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Dingle, Christopher Philip.

TITLE: The Cambridge history of music criticism / edited by Christopher Dingle.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, [2019] |

Series: The Cambridge history of music | Includes bibliographical references.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019001094 | ISBN 9781107037892

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Musical criticism – History.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC ML3880 .C26 2019 | DDC 781.1/709-dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019001094>

ISBN 978-1-107-03789-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

| | |
|---|----------------|
| <i>List of Music Examples, Figures and Tables</i> | <i>page ix</i> |
| <i>Notes on Contributors</i> | <i>x</i> |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | <i>xv</i> |

Introduction 1

CHRISTOPHER DINGLE

PART I THE EARLY HISTORY OF MUSIC CRITICISM 7

1 · Speaking of Plainsong in the Middle Ages 9

CHRISTOPHER PAGE

2 · Music Criticism in the Late-Medieval and Renaissance Era 25

STEFANO MENGOZZI

3 · Musical Discourse in Italy, 1500–1800 42

CARRIE CHURNSIDE

4 · Music Criticism in France before the Revolution 62

CHARLES DILL

5 · Music Criticism in Britain up to Burney 81

REBECCA HERISSONE

6 · German-Language Music Criticism before 1800 104

STEPHEN ROSE

PART II THE RISE OF THE PRESS 125

7 · French Music Criticism in the Nineteenth Century, 1789–1870 127

MARK A. POTTINGER

8 · Gatekeeping, Advocacy, Reflection: Overlapping Voices in
Nineteenth-Century British Music Criticism 147

LEANNE LANGLEY

9 · Constructing a Musical Nation: German-Language Criticism in the
Nineteenth Century 170

LAURA TUNBRIDGE

10 · Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century Italy 190

ALEXANDRA WILSON

11 · Music Criticism in Imperial Russia 208

EMILY FREY

PART III CRITICAL INFLUENCE AND INFLUENCES 229

12 · Critiquing the Canon: The Role of Criticism in
Canon Formation 231

LAURA HAMER

13 · Comparing Notes: Recording and Criticism 249

CHRISTOPHER DINGLE

14 · The Gender Paradox: Criticism of Women and
Women as Critics 272

LAURA HAMER

PART IV ENTERING THE TWENTIETH CENTURY 291

15 · Music Criticism in the United States and Canada up to the Second
World War 293

MARK MCKNIGHT

16 · Music Criticism in Portugal: Towards an Overview 317

PAULO F. DE CASTRO

- 17 · Spanish Music Criticism in the Twentieth Century: Writing Music
 History in Real Time 331
 EVA MOREDA RODRÍGUEZ
- 18 · Critical Battlegrounds in the French Third Republic 344
 DELPHINE MORDEY
- 19 · British Music Criticism, 1890–1945 371
 PAUL WATT
- 20 · Music Criticism in Norway 392
 PER DAHL
- 21 · Aesthetic Conservatism and Politics in German-Language Music
 Criticism, 1900–1945 408
 KAREN PAINTER
- 22 · Music Criticism in Hungary until the Second World War 424
 LYNN M. HOOKER
- 23 · The ‘People’ in Czech and Slovak Music Criticism 440
 KELLY ST PIERRE
- PART V NEW AREAS 457
- 24 · Jazz Criticism in America 459
 MARK RACZ
- 25 · Catalysing Latin American Identities: Alejo Carpentier’s Music
 Criticism as a Cuban Case Study 484
 CAROLINE RAE
- 26 · Writing about Popular Music 502
 SIMON FRITH
- 27 · Working in the Cool Capitalism Complex: The Role of Critics in the
 World Music Field 527
 TIMOTHY D. TAYLOR

- 28 · Cultural Anxieties, Aspirational Cosmopolitanism and Capacity
 Building: Music Criticism in Singapore 542

SHZREETAN

PART VI DEVELOPMENTS SINCE THE SECOND WORLD
 WAR 569

- 29 · Music Criticism in the USSR from Asafyev to Cherednichenko 571

PETER J. SCHMELZ

- 30 · The *Feuilleton* and Beyond: Criticism in the Federal Republic of
 Germany and Austria after the Second World War 590

MARK BERRY

- 31 · Music Criticism in Italy in the Twentieth Century 609

RAFFAELE POZZI

- 32 · Wider Still and Wider: British Music Criticism since the Second
 World War 629

CHRISTOPHER DINGLE

- 33 · Music Criticism in France since the Second World War 648

CHRISTOPHER BRENT MURRAY

- 34 · Old Divisions and New Debates: Music Criticism in Post-War
 America 671

SOPHIE REDFERN

POSTLUDE 693

- 35 · Stop the Press? The Changing Media of Music Criticism 695

CHRISTOPHER DINGLE AND DOMINIC MCHUGH

Bibliography 707

Index 789

Music Examples, Figures and Tables

Music Examples

- 2.1 Dissonances rendered acceptable by underlying consonances in Johannes Boen's *Musica*. *page* 31

Figures

- 7.1 J. J. Grandville, 'Les Romains échevelés à la 1re représentation d'*Hernani*', 1830 lithograph, 250 x 180 mm, Maison de Victor Hugo, Paris. *page* 134
- 33.1 Duelling critics Antoine Goléa (left) and Bernard Gavoty (right) in an uncredited photomontage for *Musica* magazine, December 1956. 665

Tables

- 13.1 Key traits of concert and record reviewing. *page* 251
- 32.1 Samples of music content in *The Times*. 639

Notes on Contributors

MARK BERRY is Reader in Music History at Royal Holloway, University of London. The author of *Treacherous Bonds and Laughing Fire: Politics and Religion in Wagner's 'Ring'*, *After Wagner: Histories of Modernist Music Drama from 'Parsifal' to Nono* and *Arnold Schoenberg*, he also regularly writes musical criticism.

PAULO F. DE CASTRO (PhD, Royal Holloway, University of London) is Associate Professor at Universidade NOVA de Lisboa (Portugal) and a researcher with a focus on intertextuality and the philosophy of music. He has written extensively on the cultural significance of twentieth-century music in France, Russia and the Iberian Peninsula.

CARRIE CHURNSIDE is Senior Lecturer and Director of the Forum for Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Music at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. She works on Italian Baroque vocal music and has published on cantatas, oratorios and music printing in the period. Carrie is also on the council of the Handel Institute.

PER DAHL studied musicology, philosophy and psychology at the University of Trondheim and has been employed at the Music Conservatory in Stavanger since 1979. He has worked as a music critic (1989–2001), written programme notes (1992–2002) and is the author of books in Norwegian on aesthetics and analysis, as well as *Music and Knowledge: A Performer's Perspective* (2017).

CHARLES DILL is the author of *Monstrous Opera: Rameau and the Tragic Tradition* (1998) and editor of *Opera Remade, 1700–1750* (2010). He has contributed to *Oxford Bibliographies Online*, *Studies in Music History*, *Cambridge Opera Journal*, the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* and the *Journal of the American Musicological Society*.

CHRISTOPHER DINGLE is Professor of Music at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. In addition to research on music criticism, he has authored/edited five books on Messiaen, and a substantial book of conversations with Julian Anderson is in preparation. He has also written for *BBC Music Magazine* for over twenty-five years.

EMILY FREY is Assistant Professor of Music at Brandeis University. Her articles have appeared in the *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, *19th-Century Music* and *Rimsky-Korsakov and His World*, and she is currently finishing her first book, *Russian Opera in the Age of Tolstoy and Dostoevsky*.

SIMON FRITH, FBA is Emeritus Professor of Music at the University of Edinburgh, where he held the Tovey Chair from 2005 to 2017. He had a long career as a music journalist and was the *Sunday Times*'s first rock critic. He chaired the judges of the Mercury Music Prize from 1993 to 2017.

LAURA HAMER works for the Open University. Her primary research interest is women in music. She is the author of *Female Composers, Conductors, Performers: Musiciennes of Interwar France, 1919–1939* (2018) and the editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Women in Music since 1900* (Cambridge, forthcoming).

REBECCA HERISSONE is Professor of Musicology at the University of Manchester and co-editor of *Music & Letters*. She works primarily on the creativity, material culture and reception of early modern English music, has published three monographs, most recently *Musical Creativity in Restoration England*, and was awarded the Diana McVeagh Prize for Best Book on British Music (2015) and the Westrup Prize (2007).

LYNN M. HOOKER, Associate Professor of Music at Purdue University, is the author of *Redefining Hungarian Music from Liszt to Bartók* (2013). She has published on music and modernism, nationalism, and popular and folk culture. Her current project addresses the role of Romani musicians in twentieth-century Hungarian music.

LEANNE LANGLEY is Lifetime Fellow at the University of London. Her work includes revisionist studies of the (Royal) Philharmonic Society, George Grove's *Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, Henry J. Wood and the Proms, Thomas Beecham, the artist John Singer Sargent, the British reception of Berlioz and Schubert, and English music publishing.

DOMINIC MCHUGH is Senior Lecturer in Musicology at the University of Sheffield. He founded the website *MusicalCriticism.com* and is the author or editor of six books on the Broadway musical, including *The Wizard of Oz: From Baum to MGM and Beyond* (2018) and *The Complete Lyrics of Alan Jay Lerner* (2018).

MARK MCKNIGHT is Head of the University of North Texas Music Library and also teaches courses on music research and American music for the University of North Texas College of Music. His research interests include nineteenth-century

American music criticism, early American sheet music and the music of Louisiana and New Orleans.

STEFANO MENGOZZI (University of Michigan) specialises in the music and music theory of the Renaissance. His chapter in this collection is part of a larger project exploring the contribution of late-medieval religious culture to the emergence of affective and text-centred musical styles in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

DELPHINE MORDEY is an Affiliated Lecturer in Music at the University of Cambridge, and Fellow and Director of Studies in Music at Newnham College, Cambridge. Her work on late nineteenth-century French music has appeared in *19th-Century Music*, *Cambridge Opera Journal* and *Music & Letters*.

EVA MOREDA RODRÍGUEZ is Lecturer in Music at the University of Glasgow and the author of *Music and Exile in Francoist Spain* (2015) and *Music Criticism and Music Critics in Early Francoist Spain* (2016).

CHRISTOPHER BRENT MURRAY is a Maître de conférences in the musicology department of the Université libre de Bruxelles. A specialist on twentieth-century French and Belgian musical life, Murray co-authored *Le Modèle et l'invention: Olivier Messiaen et la technique de l'emprunt* (2017) with Yves Balmer and Thomas Lacôte.

CHRISTOPHER PAGE is Professor of Medieval Music and Literature in the University of Cambridge, a Fellow of the British Academy, a Fellow of the Society of Antiquaries and a member of the Academia Europaea. Until October 2018 he was Gresham Professor of Music at Gresham College, London (founded 1597).

KAREN PAINTER, Professor at the University of Minnesota, is researching music for fallen soldiers in Germany, 1914–45. A recipient of the Humboldt Fellowship and the Berlin Prize, she was visiting scholar at Harvard's Center for European Studies (2015–16) and the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (2010).

MARK A. POTTINGER is Associate Professor of Music in the Visual and Performing Arts Department at Manhattan College. A recipient of the prestigious Berlin Prize in 2017, he is the author of a number of publications on the music and cultural life of nineteenth-century Europe.

RAFFAELE POZZI is Full Professor of Musicology at the Università di Roma Tre (Italy). His research focuses on the history and aesthetics of twentieth-century music. He contributed to the *Enciclopedia della Musica* (2001) and has published

a book on Olivier Messiaen (2002) and several articles on Italian contemporary music.

MARK RACZ is a pianist and music educator who studied at Rutgers University and the Manhattan School of Music. Resident in the UK since 1980, he was responsible for setting up the BMus (Jazz) Programme at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. He is currently Deputy Principal and Dean of the Royal Academy of Music.

CAROLINE RAE is Reader in Music at Cardiff University and a pianist. She has published widely on twentieth-century French music as well as on the musical writings of Alejo Carpentier, and is contributing editor of the first book on Jolivet in English, *André Jolivet, Music Art and Literature* (Routledge, 2019). She was made a Chevalier de l'Ordre des Arts et des Lettres in 2018.

SOPHIE REDFERN has held teaching and research positions at Liverpool Hope University, Royal Birmingham Conservatoire and the University of Sheffield. A specialist in twentieth-century American music and dance, she is the author of the forthcoming *Bernstein and Robbins: The Early Ballets*.

STEPHEN ROSE is Professor of Music at Royal Holloway, University of London. He specialises in German music 1500–1800, and his books include *The Musician in Literature in the Age of Bach* (Cambridge, 2011) and *Musical Authorship from Schütz to Bach* (Cambridge, 2019). He is co-editor of the journal *Early Music*.

PETER J. SCHMELZ is Associate Professor of Musicology at Arizona State University, Tempe. He is completing *Alfred Schnittke's Concerto Grosso No. 1* (forthcoming, 2019) and *Sonic Overload: Polystylism as Cultural Practice in the Late USSR*. He has begun writing a book on experimental music in the 1980s USSR.

KELLY ST PIERRE works as an Associate Professor of Musicology at Wichita State University. Her first book, *Bedřich Smetana: Myth, Music, and Propaganda*, was published in March 2017. Her research has also appeared in *19th-Century Music* and *Grove Music Online*, Oxford Music Online.

SHZREE TAN is Senior Lecturer and ethnomusicologist at the Music Department of Royal Holloway, University of London. A specialist in soundscapes of Sinophone worlds, she also researches music and migration, gender and inequality. She is currently co-editor of the journal *Ethnomusicology Forum*.

TIMOTHY D. TAYLOR is a Professor in the Department of Ethnomusicology at the University of California, Los Angeles. He is the author of numerous articles and

books, most recently *Music and Capitalism: A History of the Present* (2016) and *Music in the World: Selected Essays* (2017).

Laura Tunbridge is Professor of Music at the University of Oxford. Her publications include *Schumann's Late Style* (2007), *The Song Cycle* (2010) and *Singing in the Age of Anxiety: Lieder Performances in New York and London between the World Wars* (2018). She was editor of the *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* from 2013 to 2018.

Paul Watt is an Associate Professor of Musicology at Monash University. His research interests include musical criticism, historiography and aesthetics, popular music and biography. He is the author of *The Regulation and Reform of Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century England* (2018) and *Ernest Newman: A Critical Biography* (2017).

Alexandra Wilson is Professor of Music and Cultural History at Oxford Brookes University. She is the author of three books: *The Puccini Problem: Opera, Nationalism, and Modernity* (2007), *Opera: A Beginner's Guide* (2010), and *Opera in the Jazz Age: Cultural Politics in 1920s Britain* (2019).

Acknowledgements

It is unsurprising that the gestation of this volume, a large book with an extensive number of contributors covering an exceptionally broad range of areas, has been lengthy. I should like to thank, first and foremost, the wonderful contributors, not just for their marvellous chapters, which have taught me so much in such an engaging manner, but also for their immense patience and understanding. Secondly, I should like to thank all at Cambridge University Press, notably Vicki Cooper, who first suggested the book, Kate Brett, her successor as Music Editor, Eilidh Burrett, her Editorial Assistant, Lisa Sinclair, Podhumai Anban and Lesley Hay, as well as various others who have assisted at different points in the book's gestation. I should also like to thank my colleagues at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire and Birmingham City University for their friendship and enthusiasm, and my institution for financial assistance with aspects of the project. Particular thanks should go to Sophie Redfern for her extensive ferreting, eagle eyes and insightful comments. Finally, nothing that I do would be possible without the love and support of my wife, Liz, and my sons, Wilfred and Nathaniel, who collectively enable me to remember what is truly important.