What Ifs of Jewish History

What if the Exodus had never happened? What if the Jews of Spain had not been expelled in 1492? What if Eastern European Jews had never been confined to the Russian Pale of Settlement? What if Adolf Hitler had been assassinated in 1939? What if a Jewish state had been established in Uganda instead of Palestine? Gavriel D. Rosenfeld’s pioneering anthology examines how these and other counterfactual questions would have affected the course of Jewish history. Featuring essays by sixteen distinguished scholars in the field of Jewish Studies, What Ifs of Jewish History is the first volume to systematically apply counterfactual reasoning to the Jewish past. Written in a variety of narrative styles, ranging from the analytical to the literary, the essays cover three thousand years of dramatic events and invite readers to indulge their imaginations and explore how the course of Jewish history might have been different.

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld is Professor of History at Fairfield University.
What Ifs of Jewish History
From Abraham to Zionism

Edited by
Gavriel D. Rosenfeld
CONTENTS

List of figures   page vii
List of figure acknowledgments   ix
List of contributors   x

Introduction: Counterfactual history and the Jewish imagination   1
Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

1 What if the Exodus had never happened?   24
Steven Weitzman

2 What if the Temple of Jerusalem had not been destroyed by the Romans?   43
René Bloch

3 What if King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella had not expelled the Jews of Spain in 1492?   58
Jonathan Ray

4 What if the “ghetto” had never been constructed?   81
Bernard Dov Cooperman

5 What if Spinoza had repented?   103
Eugene R. Sheppard
vi / Contents

6 What if Russian Jewry had never been confined to the Pale of Jewish Settlement? 123
   Jeffrey Veidlinger

7 What if a Christian state had been established in modern Palestine? 142
   Derek Jonathan Penslar

8 What if the Jewish state had been established in East Africa? 165
   Adam Rovner

9 What if Franz Kafka had immigrated to Palestine? 187
   Iris Bruce

10 What if the Palestinian Arab elite had chosen compromise instead of boycott in confronting Zionism? 215
    Kenneth W. Stein

11 What if Musa Alami and David Ben-Gurion had agreed on a Jewish–Arab state? 238
    David N. Myers

12 What if the Weimar Republic had survived? A chapter from Walther Rathenau’s memoir 259
    Michael Brenner

13 What if Adolf Hitler had been assassinated in 1939? 275
    Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

14 What if the Nazis had won the battle of El Alamein? 298
    Jeffrey Herf

15 What if the Final Solution had been completed?: Nazi memory in a victorious Reich 311
    Dirk Rupnow

16 What if the Holocaust had been averted? 332
    Jeffrey S. Gurock

Notes 355

Index 402
FIGURES

Cover: Postage stamp from the country of New Judea

1. The Crossing of the Red Sea (1633–4), oil on canvas, painting by Nicolas Poussin, page 2
2. Woodcut of Flavius Josephus from William Whiston’s translation of *Antiquities of the Jews* (1737), page 11
3. Israelites building the cities, page from the Barcelona Haggadah, fourteenth century, page 27
4. *Moses with the Ten Commandments* (1648), oil on canvas, painting by Philippe de Champagne, page 35
5. *The Destruction of the Temple of Jerusalem* (1638), painting by Nicolas Poussin, page 44
6. *The Sacrifice of the Old Covenant* (ca. 1626), oil on panel, painting by Peter Paul Rubens, page 48
7. Engraving of Sultan Mehmed IV of Turkey, page 60
8. King Ferdinand II of Aragon and Queen Isabella of Castile, page 66
9. View of the city of Cracow, woodcut from the *Nuremberg Chronicle* (1493) by Hartmann Schedel, page 86
11. Portrait of Benedict (Baruch) Spinoza, ca. 1665, page 104
12. Portrait of Heinrich Heine, 1838, page 118
13. Portrait of Tadeusz Kościuszko (1746–1817), page 130
viii / List of figures

14 Portrait of Tsar Alexander I (1777–1825) (1814), oil on canvas, painting by Baron François Pascal Simon Gerard (1770–1837) 135
15 Photograph of Chaim Weizmann 146
16 Photograph of Christian Templer settlers in Wilhelma, Palestine 149
17 Postage stamp from New Judea 166
18 Map of New Judea 183
19 Photograph of Franz Kafka, Israel’s first recipient of the Nobel Prize for Literature 188
20 Photograph of Franz Kafka in Prague before his departure to Palestine in 1924 195
21 Photograph of the Arab Higher Committee featuring Haj Amin Al-Husseini 220
22 Map of armistice lines in Palestine in 1947 and 1949 232
23 Photograph of David Ben-Gurion 240
24 Photograph of Musa Alami 241
25 Portrait of Walther Rathenau by Edvard Munch (1907) 260
26 Photograph of Albert Einstein 267
27 Photograph of Georg Elser 276
28 Postage stamp of Adolf Hitler 281
29 Photograph of Haj Amin Al-Husseini with Adolf Hitler (1941) 303
30 Photograph of General Erwin Rommel in North Africa 306
31 Photograph of mannequin of Jew holding Torah scroll in the Klaus synagogue 319
32 Photograph of Nazi ideologue Alfred Rosenberg 326
33 Photograph of Hjalmar Schacht and Adolf Hitler 335
34 Photograph of the ruins of the King David Hotel, Jerusalem 346
FIGURE ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Figure 1: National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne; Figure 2: © Getty images / Culture Club; Figure 3: © The British Library; Figure 4: Courtesy of Hermitage Museum, Saint Petersburg, Russia; Figure 5: © Heritage Image Partnership Ltd. / Alamy Ltd.; Figure 6: © Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, Massachusetts, USA / Gift of William A. Coolidge / Bridgeman Images; Figure 7: © Getty images / Hulton Archive; Figure 8: © Musée Condé, Chantilly, France / Bridgeman Images; Figure 9: © Private Collection / The Stapleton Collection / Bridgeman Images; Figure 10: © Private Collection / Bridgeman Images; Figure 11: © Alamy Ltd.; Figure 12: public domain; Figure 13: © De Agostini Picture Library / A. Dagli Orti / Bridgeman Images; Figure 14: © Musée National du Chateau de Malmaison, Rueil-Malmaison, France / Bridgeman Images; Figure 15: © Getty images / Three Lions; Figure 16: Library of Congress, matpc.09278; Figure 17: author’s creation / public domain; Figure 18: original artwork; Figure 19: National Library of Israel, public domain; Figure 20: © 2015 Archiv Klaus Wagenbach; Figure 21: © Getty images / Universal History Archive; Figure 22: original artwork; Figure 23: © Getty images / LIFE Picture Collection; Figure 24: public domain; Figure 25: Courtesy of the Rasmus Meyer Collection, Bergen, Norway; Figure 26: © E. O. Hoppé/Corbis; Figure 27: public domain; Figure 28: original artwork / public domain; Figure 29: © Bundesarchiv Bild 146 1987 004 09A; Figure 30: © Bundesarchiv Bild 101 1786 032 719; Figure 31: © Jewish Museum, Prague; Figure 32: © Bundesarchiv Bild 183 1985 072 3500; Figure 33: © Bpk picture agency; Figure 34: © Getty images / Hulton Archive.
CONTRIBUTORS

RENÉ BLOCH is Professor for Jewish Studies at the Institute for Jewish Studies and at the Institute for Classical Philology at the University of Bern.

MICHAEL BRENNER is Professor of Jewish History and Culture at the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich and holds the Seymour and Lillian Abensohn Chair in Israel Studies at American University in Washington.

IRIS BRUCE is Associate Professor of Linguistics and Languages at McMaster University.

BERNARD DOV COOPERMAN is Louis L. Kaplan Associate Professor of History at the University of Maryland.

JEFFREY S. GUROCK is the Libby M. Klaperman Professor of Jewish History at Yeshiva University.

JEFFREY HERF is Distinguished University Professor in the Department of History at the University of Maryland, College Park.

DAVID N. MYERS is Professor of History at the University of California, Los Angeles.

DEREK JONATHAN PENSLAR is the Stanley Lewis Professor of Israel Studies at the University of Oxford and Samuel Zacks Professor of Jewish History at the University of Toronto.
xi / List of contributors

JONATHAN RAY is the Samuel Eig Associate Professor of Jewish Studies in the Theology Department at Georgetown University.

GAVRIEL D. ROSENFELD is Professor of History at Fairfield University.

ADAM ROVNER is Associate Professor of English and Jewish Literature at the University of Denver.

DIRK RUPNOW is Professor of Contemporary History at the University of Innsbruck.

EUGENE R. SHEPPARD is Associate Professor of Modern Jewish History and Thought at Brandeis University.

KENNETH W. STEIN is the William E. Schatten Professor of Contemporary Middle Eastern History and Israeli Studies at Emory University.

JEFFREY VEIDLINGER is the Joseph Brodsky Collegiate Professor of History and Judaic Studies at the University of Michigan.

STEVEN WEITZMAN is the Abraham M. Ellis Professor of Hebrew and Semitic Languages and Literatures at the University of Pennsylvania.