THE ALEXIAD OF ANNA KOMNENE

This is the first full-scale study of the literary art of Anna Komnene's *Alexiad.* Her history of her father's reign is well known and much used by Byzantinists and historians of the First Crusade, but the art with which it shapes its central character has not been fully examined or understood. This book argues that the work is both history and tragedy; the characterization of Alexios I Komnenos is cumulative; it develops; the models for his idealization change; much of the action takes place in his mind, and the narrative relays and amplifies his thought while building a dense picture of the world in which he acts. Engaging critically and responsively with other texts, Komnene uses the full range of current literary genres to portray the ideal culture of his rule. She matches her art of literary control to his of government over the adverse forces of his time.

PENELOPE BUCKLEY is a Fellow of the Melbourne University School of Historical and Philosophical Studies.

THE *ALEXIAD* OF ANNA KOMNENE

Artistic Strategy in the Making of a Myth

PENELOPE BUCKLEY



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107037229

© Penelope Buckley 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Buckley, Penelope, 1942-

The Alexiad of Anna Komnene : artistic strategy in the making of a myth / Penelope Buckley.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-107-03722-9 (hardback) 1. Comnena, Anna, 1083– Alexiad – Criticism, Textual. 2. Comnena, Anna, 1083–

Literary art. 3. Alexius I Comnenus, Emperor of the East, 1048–1118 – In

literature. 4. Emperors – Byzantine Empire – Biography – History and

criticism. 5. Byzantine Empire – Biography – History and criticism. I. Title.

DF605.C63B83 2014

949.5′03092–dc23

2013036993

ISBN 978-1-107-03722-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Roger Scott, teacher, mentor, friend.

Cambridge University Press
78-1-107-03722-9 - The Alexiad of Anna Komnene: Artistic Strategy in the Making of a Myth
Penelope Buckley
Frontmatter
Aore information

Contents

Preface	<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgements	xii
List of abbreviations	xiv
Introduction	I
Continuity and change	II
Hellenism	15
Theocracy	19
Some bad weather	23
The outsider	32
The will	34
The Prologue	37
I The Emperor Alexios, my father	44
Imperial destiny and task	45
Alexios the rebel	73
Alexios invested	83
2 The soldier-emperor	107
The soldier	107
The great warrior	I47
3 The second story begins	168
The debt to Psellos	176
Rebuilding	189
4 West into East	195
The first appearance of the Crusade	198
Bohemond	208
5 The second Norman war and the Crusade	215
The emperor for peace	228
Playing God	232

Cambridge University Press	
78-1-107-03722-9 - The Alexiad of Anna Komnene: Artistic Strategy in the Making of a Myth	ı
enelope Buckley	
rontmatter	
Aore information	

viii	Contents	
Mil	itary stagecraft and paralysis	235
The	e Treaty of Devol	236
6 The	second Constantine and the last	245
The	e second Constantine	245
The	e last act	270
The	e end of everything	277
Cone	clusions	285
Appendi:	x: The Alexiad as pre-Renaissance text	290
Bibliogra	uphy -	298
Index		308

Preface

This book aims to examine the *Alexiad* as a great literary work. Since it is in classicizing Byzantine Greek, and I am writing in English, I have needed a great literary translation. E. R. A. Sewter has provided one and that is the default translation I will use. It has long been available in Penguin Classics and more recently Peter Frankopan has edited and revised it, again for Penguin. Both versions are excellent and any reader of the *Alexiad* not fluent in Greek would do well to consult both. I will cite both throughout. Where there are slight but negligible differences (on the spectrum between a comma or hyphen and a synonym that makes no difference to the meaning or closeness to the Greek), I have quoted the Sewter version. Frankopan edits in more paragraphing than Sewter does and where I use Frankopan's version, especially to quote only parts of a passage, I do not always observe his paragraph breaks.

To avoid unsightliness and readerly discomfort, I have taken editorial advice to unify the spellings of names. Sewter uses mostly Latin name-spellings and Frankopan uses mostly Greek. During the forty-odd years between translation and revision there has been a gradual move towards Greek names. The change is not complete but seems set to continue. Frankopan has kept the Latin names of familiar historical figures and of certain given names well-known in English - Constantine for all the Constantines, John, Isaac, Adrian, though not Eirene. With one exception, I have adopted virtually his whole system for the spelling of names in both Alexiad translations, in quotations from Sewter's translation of Psellos' Chronographia in the main text and in presenting my own case. The exception is Frankopan's hybrid spelling, following Sewter, of 'Kelts'. I have changed this in all the above cases to 'Keltoi' on the grounds that 'Kelts' represents a temporary compromise in the ongoing shift. I feel more comfortable in doing this because the name is to some degree Komnene's literary fiction, like her 'Persians' and perhaps 'Scyths'. Replacing the familiar English 'Celts' with the Greek 'Keltoi' calls attention to the element of artifice or deeming.

X

Preface

'Doux' has been used for the Byzantine title but I have retained Frankopan's 'Duke' for western leaders.

The spelling of names in other primary-source translations and in secondary commentaries has been left intact.

Where the difference between Sewter and Frankopan is worth marking, I have italicized the chosen translator's initial in bold. Generally, where I have preferred Sewter's version, it is for the sake of his style and turn of phrase, or for his ear for an English parallel to a Greek cadence. Sewter's translation is peculiarly responsive to Komnene's turn of mind. He has a rare gift as a translator and some of his apparent freedoms do, when scrutinized, represent every aspect of the meaning while allowing him to give a true English equivalent to the Greek. Similarly, where I have preferred Frankopan's, it is most often on grounds of accuracy. Now and then Sewter is simply wrong: the chief case for the revision. Sometimes Sewter has introduced a name to help the reader or taken some other small liberty that Frankopan shows was not needed. In all these instances, I have not given my reasons in footnotes but refer the reader to this guideline. Where I have made a choice on other grounds I have said so, as when Frankopan is stylistically better or Sewter seems to me to render the Greek more exactly. Of course, both translators have themselves been balancing the claims of accuracy and style throughout. Now and then they both introduce a name to help the reader. Where they differ, there is often in each a mix of good decision-making with a slight non-fit.

Generally, Frankopan has respected Sewter's greatness in the greatest passages, and in these he has allowed the relative formality of Sewter's diction to stand. Elsewhere he has modernized the idiom somewhat, with mixed results. Some of his corrections are insignificant and can seem wordy beside the Greek. For my purposes, Sewter's deftness and ability to represent the pith of the original often remain more attractive. At other times, Frankopan's more literal approach is also truer to the text. One of his valuable restorations is worth singling out: quite often, where Komnene has referred to her father as the emperor or as 'the emperor and my father', Sewter has substituted Alexios' name or some other term. Frankopan has rightly restored what is there. Komnene's theme throughout has been the emperor and my father, and sometimes Sewter overlooks this in the interest of style. Both occasionally use Alexios' name where the original has 'himself' - a usage that would be perfectly understood in Ireland and gives another view of Alexios' centrality to all that takes place.

Preface

Given Komnene's¹ classicizing style, where Sewter habitually translates *polis* as 'city' and Frankopan renders it as 'town', I have mostly preferred Sewter: whatever the historic status of the settlement in question, 'city' represents Komnene's mode of thought.

My brief comments interspersed through the footnotes offer a critique of the translations. Each version gives a full experience of the original, however, in so far as a translation can.

Where I use my own translations from the *Alexiad*, I say so. The translations from the *Hyle* are mine except where I am quoting Neville.²

Where the name 'Constantine' occurs without specification, it refers to Constantine the Great.

xi

¹ The conventions of Byzantine history as well as of Byzantine studies make it normal and respectful to refer to her as 'Anna'. I need to explain that, since my background is in English literary criticism, where 'dear Janeism' is a well-known mode of degrading or at least domesticating female writers, I can no more refer to her as 'Anna' than cross a picket line. Where she reconstructs a past self, I sometimes make an exception.

² Neville 2012.

Acknowledgements

My first and last debt is to Roger Scott, to whom this book is dedicated. Without him it would have no beginning, middle or end. He was my inspiring teacher in Byzantine Studies as well as Greek, became my supervisor, reading the first drafts in manuscript, and then spent years as my patient unpaid supervisor and adviser. He has supported this project in every way at every stage and I cannot thank him enough. Now that Byzantine Studies have gone from the University of Melbourne's curriculum, he actively keeps them alive. His encouragement and help to former students know no end.

I am also especially grateful to John Burke. He has given me excellent editorial advice, several citations and long-sustained, time-consuming help with technology, often amounting to a rescue. He too has been an expert adviser and a very kind friend.

James Simpson generously read several sections in draft and made detailed suggestions as well as encouraging my small incursion into Renaissance territory. I am heartily grateful to these three very busy and productive friends.

My warm thanks go to Michael Sharp, the always courteous and helpful editor of Byzantine Studies for Cambridge University Press, and to his assistant editor, Elizabeth Hanlon. They have been consistently constructive and a pleasure to work with. My thanks as well to the production team, especially the production editor, Vania Cunha, and the wonderful copyeditor, Anne Marriott. Leonora Neville and Stratis Papaioannou generously allowed me to read their exciting new books before publication: *Heroes and Romans in Twelfth-Century Byzantium: The Material for History of Nikephoros Bryennios* and *Michael Psellos: Rhetoric and Authorship in Byzantium.* I am most grateful to them and to Dr Sharp for asking their permission for this. His two publisher's readers also gave me much help with their criticisms and suggestions. Theirs is high-powered, altruistic work and I thank them for their trouble.

Acknowledgements

I am warmly grateful to Margaret Riddle for suggesting the cover illustration, to Abby Robinson for helping me format the bibliography, to Patsy Segall, Grania Buckley and Felicity Renowden for their translations from the German, to Susannah Buckley for wise editorial advice, to her and David Segall for long-term support and encouragement and to Jean Liggett for several kinds of help. I am grateful too to Kathleen Hay and Joanne Lee Dow for their support at crucial moments, to the Melbourne Byzantine reading group for its warm encouragement and to Kate Morris, whose Alexander technique and good counsel helped me stay in one piece. I thank its School of Philosophy and Historical Studies for reconnecting me with the University of Melbourne. I look back with gratitude to my first Greek teachers, Elaine Brumley and George Gellie, and to my father, who lent me all his books on Byzantium and would have been so interested in this.

The book's defects are my own contribution.

xiii

Abbreviations

Fuller details for the primary sources listed here may be found in the Bibliography.

AABS	Australian Association for Byzantine Studies (Byzantina
	Australiensia)
Alexiad	Komnene, Anna, The Alexiad
BMGS	Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies
BS	Byzantinoslavica
Byzantion	Byzantion. Revue Internationale des Études Byzantines
ΒZ	Byzantinische Zeitschrift
CFHB	Corpus fontium historiae Byzantinae
Chon., Hist.	Choniates, Niketas, Niketas Choniatae Historia
CSHB	Corpus scriptorium historiae Byzantinae
Deeds	William of Tyre, A History of Deeds Done Beyond the Sea
F	Komnene, Anna, The Alexiad of Anna Comnene (tr.
	E. R. A. Sewter; rev. Peter Frankopan)
Fulcher	Fulcher of Chartres, 'Deeds of the Franks on their Pilgrimage
	to Jerusalem'
Gesta	Gesta Francorum et Aliorum Hierosolimitanorum
GRBS	Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies
Hyle	Bryennios, Nikephoros, Hyle historias
Psellos, Chron.	Psellos, Michael, Chronographia
R-K	Komnene, Anna, Alexiad in Annae Comnenae Alexias (ed.
	D. R. Reinsch and A. Kambylis)
S	Komnene, Anna, The Alexiad of Anna Comnena (tr.
	E. R. A. Sewter)
Skyl.	Skylites, John, Ioannis Scylitzae Synopsis Historiarum
SPBS	Society for the Promotion of Byzantine Studies

List of abbreviations

xv

Thesaurus Linguae Graecae (The Regents of the University
of California), www.tlg.uci.edu/
Vita Basilii Imperatoris
Eusebius, De vita Constantini
Zonaras, John, <i>Ioannis Zonarae Epitomae Historiarum</i>