Volumes published under the title:

ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES

Vol. 1 (1919-22) Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, KC, and H. Lauterpacht, LLD
Vol. 2 (1923-24)
Vol. 3 (1925-26) Edited by Arnold D. McNair, CBE, LLD, and H. Lauterpacht, LLD
Vol. 4 (1927-28)
Vol. 5 (1929-30)
Vol. 6 (1931-32)
Vol. 7 (1933-34)
Vol. 8 (1935-37)
Vol. 9 (1938-40)
Vol. 10 (1941-42) Edited by H. Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA
Vol. 11 (1941-42)
Vol. 12 (1943-45)
Vol. 13 (1946)
Vol. 14 (1947)
Vol. 15 (1948)
Vol. 16 (1949)

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

Vol. 17 (1950) Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA
Vol. 18 (1951)
Vol. 19 (1952)
Vol. 20 (1953)
Vol. 21 (1954)
Vol. 22 (1955)
Vol. 23 (1956)
Vol. 24 (1957) Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, QC, LLD, FBA, and E. Lauterpacht
Vol. 25 (1958-I) Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC
Vol. 26 (1958-II)

Vols. 27-68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1-35 and 36-45 Edited by E. Lauterpacht, QC
Vols. 69-150 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties to Vols. 1-80, Vols. 81-100 and Vols. 1-125 Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, and Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC
Vol. 151 Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, CBE, QC, LLD, Sir Christopher Greenwood, CMG, QC, and K. L. Lee
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial Note</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases (alphabetical)</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases (according to courts and countries)</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digest (main headings)</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 151</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Treaties</td>
<td>xxvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of Cases</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>707</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PREFACE

The present volume is devoted to judgments of the International Court of Justice in territorial and boundary disputes. These judgments concern disputes between Botswana and Namibia on the legal status of Kasikili/Sedudu Island and the river boundary between them, between Indonesia and Malaysia concerning sovereignty over the islands of Ligitan and Sipadan, together with the application by the Philippines for permission to intervene, between Benin and Niger concerning the frontier between them and the ownership of islands, in particular Létè Island, between Malaysia and Singapore concerning sovereignty over the island of Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh and two maritime features, as well as between Costa Rica and Nicaragua regarding navigational and related rights on the San Juan River.

There are many people, to all of whom the Editors are most grateful, whose work has made this volume possible. Ms Karen Lee wrote the summaries of the judgments in Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia), Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) and Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger), prepared the Tables of Cases and Digest and saw the volume through the press. In recognition of her tireless work on the International Law Reports, which has extended over many volumes, we are delighted to welcome her as a co-editor and look forward to working with her in this capacity for many years to come.

In addition we would like to extend our thanks to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, who compiled the Table of Treaties and the Index, Mrs Diane Ilott, who checked the copy, and Mrs Jenny Macgregor, who read the proofs, as well as our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, Aptara, and their staff.

E. LAUTERPACHT

Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

C. J. GREENWOOD

The Peace Palace, The Hague

July 2012
EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of “political offences” or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

**Decisions of International Tribunals**

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Union). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

**Human rights cases.** The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as “views” of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international
lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

*International arbitrations.* The *Reports* of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see *Yearbook Commercial Arbitration* (ed. Albert Jan van den Berg, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, *force majeure*) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

**Decisions of National Tribunals**
A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

**Editorial Treatment of Materials**
The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.
EDITORIAL NOTE

Presentation of Materials
The material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the “Report” in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text in non-English cases indicate the pagination of the original report.

Notes
Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

Digest of Cases
With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the Reports are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

Consolidated Index and Tables
A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004. Volume 150 contains Consolidated Tables of Cases for volumes 126-150.
# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word “note” in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dispute regarding Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua)</td>
<td>615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger)</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ligitan and Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia)</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua)</td>
<td>615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedra Branca (Malaysia/Singapore)</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia)</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (Malaysia/Singapore)</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene)</td>
<td>197, 212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Merits)</td>
<td>197, 290</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word "note" in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

## I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>International Court of Justice</th>
<th>2005</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia) 1999</td>
<td>Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger) 370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) 2001</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>197, 212</td>
<td>Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (Malaysia/Singapore) 453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Merits) 2002</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>197, 290</td>
<td>Dispute regarding Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua) 615</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DIGEST OF CASES
List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics. For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air
Aliens
Arbitration
Canals
Claims
Comity
Conciliation
Consular Relations
Damages
Diplomatic Relations
Economics, Trade and Finance
Environment
Expropriation
Extradition
Governments
Human Rights
International Court of Justice
International Criminal Law
International Organizations

International Tribunals
Jurisdiction
Lakes and Landlocked Seas
Nationality
Recognition
Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law
Reprisals and Countermeasures
Rivers
Sea
Sources of International Law
Space
State Immunity
State Responsibility
State Succession
States
Territory
Terrorism
Treaties
War and Armed Conflict
DIGEST OF CASES
REPORTED IN VOLUME 151

International Court of Justice

Chamber — Frontier dispute between Benin and Niger — Parties jointly submitting dispute to Chamber of Court by Special Agreement — Parties seeking definitive delimitation of whole boundary — Parties requesting Court to specify ownership of islands, in particular Létè Island — Boundary divided into two sectors — Determination of course of boundary in River Niger sector — Ownership of islands in River Niger, in particular Létè Island — Determination of course of boundary in River Mekrou sector — Article 2(a), (b) and (c) of Special Agreement — Applicable law — Rules and principles of international law — Article 38(1) of Statute of International Court of Justice — Principle of uti possidetis juris — Article 6 of Special Agreement — International Court of Justice

Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger) 370

Intervention — Procedure — Application by the Philippines for permission to intervene — Whether filed out of time — Whether containing formal defect — Whether absence of jurisdictional link barring intervention — Whether Philippines establishing interest of a legal nature — Whether limited to dispositif under Article 62 of Statute of Court — Nature of interest necessary — Whether needing to have same subject-matter as case — Whether claim of sovereignty in North Borneo could be affected by Court’s reasoning or interpretation of treaties in case concerning Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan — 1878 grant claimed as primary source of title — Other instruments — Whether Philippines discharging burden under Article 62 of Statute of Court — Whether object of intervention inappropriate — Article 81 of Rules of Court — International Court of Justice

Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) (Merits) 197

Merits — Boundary dispute — Dispute between Botswana and Namibia submitted to Court by Special Agreement for final and binding determination — Determination of boundary around Kasikili/Sedudu Island — Determination of legal status of Kasikili/
Digest of Cases

International Court of Justice (cont.)

Sedudu Island — Applicable law — Anglo-German Treaty, 1890 — Rules and principles of international law — United Nations Charter — Charter and resolution of Organization of African Unity — Principle of *uti possidetis* — Respect for frontiers existing upon national independence — Anglo-German Treaty, 1890, Article III — Delimitation of spheres of influence in south-west Africa — Boundary line following centre or thalweg of main channel of Chobe River — Whether northern and western channel constituting main channel as asserted by Botswana — Whether southern channel constituting main channel as asserted by Namibia — Boundary between Botswana and Namibia around Island — Whether Island part of territory of Botswana or Namibia — Whether Namibia having prescriptive title to Island — International Court of Justice

Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia) 1

Remedies — Presumption that State will comply with judgment of the Court — Whether appropriate to order future compliance — International Court of Justice

Dispute regarding Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua) 615

Rivers

Boundary rivers — Navigation — San Juan River forming boundary between Costa Rica and Nicaragua — 1858 Treaty between Costa Rica and Nicaragua — International border fixed on the Costa Rican bank of the river — Entire territory of the river within the sovereignty of Nicaragua — Right of navigation “con objetos de comercio” granted to Costa Rican vessels — Interpretation of treaty — Whether extending to carriage of passengers, including tourists — Navigation by members of Costa Rican riparian communities for purpose of everyday needs — Use of river by Costa Rican official vessels — Regulatory powers of Nicaragua — International Court of Justice

Dispute regarding Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua) 615

Chobe River — Kasane communiqué — Undertaking between Parties — Nationals of and vessels flying flags of Botswana and Namibia to enjoy equal national treatment in two channels of Chobe River around Island — Navigation and environmental protection — International Court of Justice

Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia) 1
Riverain boundary — Chobe River — Main channel of Chobe River — Boundary between Botswana and Namibia around Kasikili/Sedudu Island following main channel of Chobe River — Anglo-German Treaty, 1890, Article III — Location of main channel being main dispute between Parties — Whether northern and western channel constituting main channel as asserted by Botswana — Whether southern channel constituting main channel as asserted by Namibia — Boundary between Botswana and Namibia around Island — International Court of Justice

Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia) 1

Sea
Maritime features — Low-tide elevation — Whether capable of separate acquisition — Whether appertaining to State on basis of location in territorial waters — International Court of Justice

Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (Malaysia/Singapore) 453

Sources of International Law
Customary international law — Customary practices by riparian communities along border river — Whether capable of giving rise to customary law rights regarding navigation and subsistence fishing — International Court of Justice

Dispute regarding Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua) 615

State Succession
Colonies — States in western Africa — Benin and Niger formerly part of French West Africa — Benin formerly colony of Dahomey — Governor-General of French West Africa having power to determine boundaries of colonies — Benin becoming independent on 1 August 1960 — Niger becoming independent on 3 August 1960 — Critical date — States succeeding to frontiers inherited from colonialism — Intangibility of frontiers — Principle of uti possidetis juris — Boundary between Benin and Niger on dates of independence — International Court of Justice

Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger) 370

European colonial powers partitioning Africa — Great Britain and Germany signing treaty delimiting respective spheres of influence in south-west Africa — Botswana gaining independence in 1966 — Namibia gaining independence in
State Succession (cont.)


Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia) 1

Independence of colonial territories — Indonesia and Malaysia — Successor States of Netherlands and Great Britain — Whether obtaining title to Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan by succession — Contracts between the Netherlands and Sultanate of Bulungan — Whether Ligitan and Sipadan belonging to possessions of Sultan of Bulungan — Whether Malaysia having treaty-based title to Ligitan and Sipadan — Whether belonging to Sultan of Sulu — Whether uninterrupted series of transfers of title from Sultan of Sulu to Spain, United States, Great Britain on behalf of State of North Borneo, United Kingdom and Malaysia — International Court of Justice

Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) (Merits) 197

Independence of colonial territories — Singapore and Malaysia — Relations between colonial authorities in Singapore and Government of Johor during colonial period — Relations at time of independence — Secession of Singapore from Malaysia — Title to territory — International Court of Justice

Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (Malaysia/Singapore) 453

States

Statehood in seventeenth century — Sultanate of Johor — Recognition as sovereign State — Title to islands — Relations with colonial powers during nineteenth and twentieth centuries — International Court of Justice

Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (Malaysia/Singapore) 453
Territory

Sovereignty — Boundary between Benin and Niger — Bridges — River Niger sector — Niger requesting determination of boundary on two bridges between Gaya and Malanville — Whether Chamber having jurisdiction to determine boundary on bridges — Whether any finding prejudicing joint ownership of bridges — Whether prejudicing arrangements regarding use and maintenance — Article 2(a) of Special Agreement — International Court of Justice

*Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger)*

Sovereignty — Boundary between Benin and Niger — River Mekrou sector — Delimitation on basis of *uti possidetis juris* principle — Benin and Niger former colonies of French West Africa — Benin and Niger becoming independent on 1 and 3 August 1960 respectively — Critical date — Determination of boundary inherited from French administration on 1 and 3 August 1960 — Examination of legal titles — French colonial law — Cartographic and other evidence — Relevance — Interpretation and application of legal titles by colonial administrative authorities — *Effectivités* — Relevance — Exact location of boundary — Whether boundary following course of thalweg or median line of River Mekrou — Article 2(c) of Special Agreement — International Court of Justice

*Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger)*

Sovereignty — Boundary between Benin and Niger — River Niger sector — Delimitation on basis of *uti possidetis juris* principle — Benin and Niger former colonies of French West Africa — Benin and Niger becoming independent on 1 and 3 August 1960 respectively — Determination of boundary inherited from French administration on 1 and 3 August 1960 — Critical date — French colonial law — Cartographic and other evidence — Relevance — Main navigable channel of River Niger at dates of independence — Colonial boundaries becoming international frontiers upon independence — Whether evidence of title on basis of colonial regulatory or administrative acts — Legal relationship between *effectivités* and title — *Effectivités* — Determination of precise location of boundary line in main navigable channel of River Niger at dates of independence — Article 2(a) of Special Agreement — International Court of Justice

*Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger)*
Territory (cont.)

Sovereignty — Islands in River Niger sector — Island of Lété — Determination of boundary in River Niger — Consequent title to islands — Appearance or disappearance of islands — Whether determination of ownership of islands prejudicing private law rights — Article 2(b) of Special Agreement — International Court of Justice

*Frontier Dispute (Benin/Niger)*

370

Sovereignty — Kasikili/Sedudu Island — Determination of legal status of Island — Whether Namibia and predecessors having prescriptive title to Island — Whether Special Agreement precluding examination of prescriptive claim — Whether acts of State authority by Namibia on Island — International Court of Justice

*Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia)*

1

Sovereignty — Original title — Prescription — Conduct — Acquisition — Islands — Small island near the coasts of Malaysia, Singapore and Indonesia — Whether originally part of the territory of the Sultanate of Johor — Whether Johor losing title by virtue of prescription — Difference between prescription and estoppel — Construction by Singapore of lighthouse on island — Acts manifesting intention to act à titre de souverain — Correspondence between Johor and Singapore prior to independence — Whether involving recognition of Singapore’s title — Rocks located close to the island — Whether also acquired by Singapore — Low-tide elevation — Whether capable of separate acquisition — Whether sovereignty residing with State in whose territorial waters feature located — International Court of Justice

*Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (Malaysia/Singapore)*

453

Sovereignty — Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan — Effectivités — Whether Indonesia or Malaysia having title on basis of effectivités — Circumstances to be taken into account — Very small islands uninhabited or not permanently inhabited — Character of activities relied on by Indonesia — Whether constituting acts à titre de souverain — Character of activities relied on by Malaysia in own name and as successor State of Great Britain — Measures to regulate turtle egg collection and establish bird reserve — Legal relevance of lighthouse construction — Title on basis of effectivités — International Court of Justice

*Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) (Merits)*

197
Sovereignty — Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan — Whether islands belonging to Indonesia or Malaysia — Indonesia claiming title based on 1891 Convention — Interpretation of Article IV of 1891 Convention — Articles 31 and 32 of Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969 — Whether supplementary means confirming interpretation of text — Cartographic evidence — Whether Indonesia or Malaysia obtaining title to Ligitan and Sipadan by succession — Whether Indonesia having title as successor to the Netherlands and Sultan of Bulungan — Whether Malaysia having title on basis of series of transfers of title from Sultan of Sulu — Whether Indonesia or Malaysia having title to Ligitan and Sipadan on basis of effectiveness — Judgment on Merits — International Court of Justice

Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) (Merits)

197

Treaties

Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) (Merits)

197


Sovereignty over Pulau Ligitan and Pulau Sipadan (Indonesia/Malaysia) (Application by the Philippines for Permission to Intervene) (Merits)

197

Interpretation — Application — Anglo-German Treaty, 1890 — Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Article 31 — Article 31 reflecting customary international law — Anglo-German Treaty, 1890, Article III — Delimitation of spheres of influence in south-west Africa — Boundary line following centre or thalweg of main channel of Chobe River — Whether centre and thalweg synonyms — Determination of location of main channel — Real dispute between Parties — Whether northern and western channel constituting main channel as asserted by Botswana — Whether southern channel constituting main channel as asserted by Namibia — Ordinary meaning of words “main channel” — Criteria for determination — Relevance and applicability — Depth — Flow — Bed profile configuration — Navigability — Object and purpose of 1890 Treaty — Travaux préparatoires
DIGEST OF CASES

Treaties (cont.)

to 1890 Treaty — Subsequent practice of parties to 1890 Treaty — Map evidence — International Court of Justice

*Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia)*

Interpretation — Principles of interpretation — Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969 — Whether terms in treaty of long duration to be given an evolving meaning — Treaty imposing restriction on sovereignty of State within its own territory — Whether justifying restrictive interpretation — 1858 Treaty between Costa Rica and Nicaragua regarding sovereignty over, and navigation on, the San Juan River — International Court of Justice

*Dispute regarding Navigational and Related Rights (Costa Rica v. Nicaragua)*
### TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order and references to the texts of treaties have been supplied, including wherever possible at least one reference to a text in the English language unless these are known to be included in the Flare Index to Treaties available at [http://ials.sas.ac.uk/treatyindex.htm](http://ials.sas.ac.uk/treatyindex.htm). Multilateral treaties, all included in the Flare Index, are referred to by the name by which they are believed commonly to be known. The full titles of the abbreviated references will be found in the list of Abbreviations and Sources printed in the volume containing the Consolidated Table of Treaties to Volumes 1-125.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Party 1</th>
<th>Treaty Description</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1780</td>
<td>June 20</td>
<td>France–Prince Bishop of Basel</td>
<td>(47 CTS 331)</td>
<td>695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1814</td>
<td>Aug. 13</td>
<td>Great Britain–Netherlands</td>
<td>Convention Relative to the Dutch Colonies; Trade with East and West Indies etc.</td>
<td>298, 300, 466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Convention of London)</td>
<td>(63 CTS 321)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1816</td>
<td>Mar. 16</td>
<td>Sardinia–Switzerland</td>
<td>Treaty of Turin (Treaty to Settle the Delimitation of Territory ceded to the Canton of Geneva, the Neutrality of Certain Parts of Savoy, etc.)</td>
<td>695</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1824</td>
<td>Mar. 17</td>
<td>Great Britain–Netherlands</td>
<td>Treaty for the Settlement of Differences in Malay Peninsula (Treaty of London)</td>
<td>300, 469, 478, 484-9, 491-4, 549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Preamble</td>
<td>487-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Arts. 8-12</td>
<td>487-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Art. 12</td>
<td>492-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1836</td>
<td>Sept. 23</td>
<td>Spain–Sultan of Sulu</td>
<td>Capitulations of Peace, Protection and Commerce</td>
<td>295, 333-4, 338-9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xxvii
TABLE OF TREATIES

1847
May 31  Iran–Ottoman Empire, Second Treaty of Erzeroum for Determination of Boundaries .................................. 695

1851
Apr. 19  Spain–Sultan of Sulu, Act of Resubmission ................. 298

1857
Dec. 8  Costa Rica–Nicaragua, Treaty of Peace .......................... 632

1858
Apr. 15  Costa Rica–Nicaragua, Treaty of Limits (Jerez–Cañas Treaty)
(5 Moore, International Arbitrations 4706) ............... 623–706
Preamble
Art. II .............................................. 637, 650–1
Art. IV .................................................. 637
Art. VI .................................. 635–67, 677–82, 686–9, 690–3, 694–706
Art. VIII ........................................... 637, 638, 642, 643, 655

1865
May 31  USA, Austria, Belgium, France, Great Britain, Italy, Netherlands, Portugal, Spain, Sweden–Sultan of Morocco (14 Stat. 679; 18 Stat. (2) 525; USTS 245)
Art. 1 ................................................... 503

1868

1877
Mar. 11  Great Britain, Spain, Germany, Protocol Establishing Free Commerce and Navigation in the Archipelago of Sulu (Joló) .. 300

1878

1885
Mar. 7  Germany, Great Britain, Spain, Protocol recognizing the sovereignty of Spain over the Archipelago of Sulu (Joló) (151 ILR 628 (extracts)) ....................... 235, 301, 333–4, 338–9
Art. 4 ................................................... 339
TABLE OF TREATIES

1890
July 1    Anglo-German Treaty (Heligoland–Zanzibar Treaty) . . . . 11-196
          Art. I. .............................................. 146
          Arts. I-IV ........................................... 159-60
          Art. II ............................................ 37-8
          Art. III ........................................... 23-36, 146
          Art. III(2) ......... 37, 38, 40-64, 74-7, 79-81, 88-93, 94-104,
                              114-15, 116-38, 156-64, 167-96
          Art. IV .............................................. 146
          Art. VI .............................................. 169, 178
          Art. VII ............................................ 36-7, 159-60, 169, 190

1891
June 10   France–Switzerland Boundary Convention (175 CTS 169) . . . 695
June 20   Great Britain–Netherlands, Boundary Convention (Borneo)
          (175 CTS 197) . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 235-6, 302, 304, 305-7
          Art. I . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 306-7
          Art. II . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 306-7, 309, 322
          Art. III ............................................. 309
          Art. IV ............................................. 236, 307, 308-32, 360-5
          Art. V ............................................. 236, 302, 303, 306-7, 322
          Art. VI ............................................. 236, 302, 303, 306-7
          Art. VII ............................................ 306-7, 312
          Art. VIII ............................................. 310, 363

1898
Dec. 10   Spain–USA, Treaty of Peace (187 CTS 100; 32 Martens NRG,
          2nd ser. 74; USTS 343; 2 US Treaties 1690; 90 BFSP 382;
          11 Bevans 623; 6 RGDIP 598; 31 Stat 1942) (Treaty of
          Paris) ............................................... 13, 302, 334
          Art. 3 ............................................... 302

1899
Aug. 20   USA–Sultan of Sulu, Agreement recognizing US Sovereignty
          over Sulu Archipelago and Dependencies (Bates Agreement)
          (187 CTS 481) ........................................ 13, 334

1900
Nov. 7    Spain–USA, Treaty for the Cession of Outlying Islands in the
          Philippine Archipelago (Treaty of Washington) ........... 302, 340

1904/1906
Mar. 18   France–Great Britain, Exchange of Notes relative to the
          boundary between the Gold Coast and French Sudan
          July 19 (25 Hertslet 267 at 271; Brownlie, African Boundaries)
          (1906) .................................................. 152
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Country 1</th>
<th>Country 2</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Article(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1905</td>
<td>Mar. 3</td>
<td>Great Britain</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>Exchange of Letters relating to Interpretation of 1891 Boundary Convention</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1907</td>
<td>July 3/10</td>
<td>Great Britain</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Exchange of Notes relating to Islands on the East Coast of Borneo</td>
<td>236, 331, 335, 336, 340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1914</td>
<td>Aug. 5</td>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Treaty for the Construction and Maintenance of an Inter-Oceanic Canal (Chamorro–Bryan Treaty)</td>
<td>633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1915</td>
<td>Sept. 28</td>
<td>Great Britain</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>Agreement relating to the Boundary between the State of North Borneo and the Netherland Possessions in Borneo</td>
<td>302, 320-5, 364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1919</td>
<td>June 28</td>
<td>Treaty of Versailles (Treaty of Peace between the Allied and Associated Powers and Germany)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>Dec. 16</td>
<td>Statute of the Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Art. 36(5)</td>
<td>621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>Apr. 20</td>
<td>Barcelona Convention and Statute on Navigable Waterways of International Concern (Oder)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>Nov. 22</td>
<td>Afghanistan–Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
<td>Treaty relating to the Kabul and Kolosai Rivers</td>
<td>696</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>