THE ETHICS OF ARMED HUMANITARIAN INTERVENTION

The question of military intervention for humanitarian purposes is a major focus for international law, the United Nations, regional organizations such as NATO, and the foreign policies of nations. Against this background, the 2011 bombing in Libya by Western nations has occasioned renewed interest and concern about armed humanitarian intervention (AHI) and the doctrine of responsibility to protect (RtoP). This volume brings together new essays by leading international, philosophical, and political thinkers on the moral and legal issues involved in AHI, and contains both critical and positive views of AHI. Topics include the problem of abuse and needed limitations, the future viability of RtoP and some of its problematic implications, the possibility of AHI providing space for peaceful political protest, and how AHI might be integrated with post-war justice. It is an important collection for those studying political philosophy, international relations, and humanitarian law.

DON E. SCHEID is Professor of Philosophy, Emeritus, at Winona State University. He is co-editor (with Deen K. Chatterjee) of the anthology Ethics and Foreign Intervention (Cambridge, 2003).
CONTENTS

Notes on contributors page vii
Preface and acknowledgments xi
List of abbreviations and acronyms xii

PART I  Intervention and debate  1

1  Introduction to armed humanitarian intervention  3
  DON E. SCHEID

2  Revisiting armed humanitarian intervention: a 25-year retrospective  26
  GEORGE R. LUCAS, JR.

3  The responsibility to protect and the war in Libya  46
  TZVETAN TODOROV, TRANSLATED BY KATHLEEN A. JOHNSON

PART II  Moral perspectives  59

4  The moral basis of armed humanitarian intervention revisited  61
  FERNANDO R. TESÓN

5  All or nothing: are there any “merely permissible” armed humanitarian interventions?  78
  NED DOBOS AND C.A.J. COADY

6  Judging armed humanitarian intervention  95
  HELEN FROWE

7  Bombing the beneficiaries: the distribution of the costs of the responsibility to protect and humanitarian intervention  113
  JAMES PATTISON

PART III  Ideas and reconsiderations  131

8  The costs of war: justice, liability, and the Pottery Barn rule  133
  MICHAEL BLAKE
CONTENTS

9 Armed humanitarian intervention and the problem of abuse after Libya 148
LUKE GLANVILLE

10 The responsibility to protect and the problem of regime change 166
ALEX J. BELLAMY

11 Law, ethics, and the responsibility to protect 187
MICHAEL W. DOYLE

12 Responsibility to protect and the language of crimes: collective action and individual culpability 209
JENNIFER M. WELSH

13 Post-intervention: permissions and prohibitions 224
BRIAN ORENDA

14 Rethinking responsibility to protect: the case for human sovereignty 243
DAVID RODIN

Select bibliography 261
Index 274
CONTRIBUTORS

ALEX J. BELLAMY is Professor of International Security at the Griffith Asia Institute/Centre for Governance and Public Policy, Griffith University, Queensland, Australia. He is also Non-Resident Senior Adviser at the International Peace Institute, New York, United States. He is co-editor of the journal Global Responsibility to Protect, and he serves on the editorial board of the journal Ethics & International Affairs. His recent books include: Massacres and Morality: Mass Killing in an Age of Civilian Immunity (2012); Global Politics and the Responsibility to Protect: From Words to Deeds (2011); Understanding Peacekeeping, 2nd edn., with Paul D. Williams and Stuart Griffin (2010).

MICHAEL BLAKE is Professor of Philosophy and Public Affairs at the University of Washington, in Seattle, Washington, United States. He is Director of the Program on Values in Society. Recent publications include: Justice and Foreign Policy (2013); “We Are All Cosmopolitans Now,” in Gillian Brock (ed.), Cosmopolitanism versus Non-cosmopolitanism: Critiques, Defenses, Reconceptualizations (2013); and “Does International Law Make a Moral Difference? The Case of Preventive War,” in Deen K. Chatterjee (ed.), The Ethics of Preventive War (2013).

C.A.J. (TONY) COADY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Melbourne, Victoria, Australia. Professor Coady's books include: Morality and Political Violence (2008); Messy Morality: The Challenge of Politics (2008); Terrorism and Justice, co-editor with Michael O'Keefe (2003); and Testimony: A Philosophical Study (1992).

NED DOBOS is Lecturer in Applied Ethics at the University of New South Wales, Canberra, Australia. He is also an Adjunct Fellow at the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics at Charles Sturt University. He is the author of Insurrection and Intervention: The Two Faces of Sovereignty (2012). Other publications include: "International Rescue and Mediated Consequences,” Ethics & International Affairs (2012); and “On Altruistic War and National Responsibility: Justifying Humanitarian Intervention to Soldiers and Taxpayers,” Ethical Theory and Moral Practice (2010).
MICHAEL W. DOYLE is the Harold Brown Professor of International Affairs, Law, and Political Science at Columbia University, New York, United States, and the Chair of the UN Democracy Fund. Professor Doyle's major works include: *Liberal Peace: Selected Essays* (2012); *Striking First: Preemption and Prevention in International Conflict*, with commentaries (2008); *Making War and Building Peace: United Nations Peace Operations*, with Nicholas Sambanis (2006); and *Ways of War and Peace* (1997).

HELEN FROWE is Director at the Stockholm Centre for the Ethics of War and Peace and a Wallenberg Academy Fellow, Department of Philosophy, Stockholm, Sweden. Previously, she was a Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Kent, UK. Her publications include: *The Ethics of War and Peace: An Introduction* (2011); "Self-defence and the Principle of Non-Combatant Immunity," *Journal of Moral Philosophy* (2011); "The Justified Infliction of Unjust Harm," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* (2009); and "A Practical Account of Self-Defence," *Law and Philosophy* (2009).


KATHLEEN A. JOHNSON is a freelance translator and editor for translation agencies in the United States, United Kingdom, Austria, France, Germany, and Portugal. She has done extensive translation work in a number of fields, including: legal and commercial documents, construction reports and specification documents, World Health Organization reports and environmental studies, newspaper and magazine articles. Her translations of a more literary nature include: Francine Muel-Dreyfus, *Vichy and the Eternal Feminine* (2001); Philippe de la Genardière, "Lesson of the Incipits," *Review of Contemporary Fiction* (Summer 1988); and Philippe Boyer, "Topographies," *Review of Contemporary Fiction* (Summer 1988).

GEORGE R. LUCAS, JR. holds the “Distinguished Chair in Ethics” in the Vice Admiral James B. Stockdale Center for Ethical Leadership at the US Naval Academy (Annapolis, MD). He is also Professor of Ethics and Public Policy at the Graduate School of Public Policy at the Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, California. His most recent book is *Anthropologists in Arms: The Ethics of Military Anthropology* (2009), and he has a commissioned work on military ethics in preparation. Other publications include: “Industrial Challenges of Military Robotics,” *Journal of Military Ethics* (December 2011); and “The Strategy of Graceful Decline,” *Ethics & International Affairs* (Summer 2011).
BRIAN ORENĐ is Director of International Studies and Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo in Canada. He has been Distinguished Visiting Professor of Human Rights at the University of Lund, Sweden. He is best known for his book, _The Morality of War_ (2006; revised 2nd edn. 2013) and its emphasis on post-war justice. His other books include: _Introduction to International Studies_ (2012); _On War: A Dialogue_ (2009); and _Human Rights: Concept and Context_ (2002).


DAVID RODIN is Senior Research Fellow at the University of Oxford in the UK where he directs the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict. He is also Senior Fellow at the Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs in New York, United States. He is a regular lecturer at the UK Joint Services Command and Staff College where he provides ethics training for senior officers. He is co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict. His first book was _War and Self-Defense_ (2005), and his other publications include: "Terrorism and Torture," in John Skorupski (ed.), _The Routledge Companion to Ethics_ (2010); _Just and Unjust Warriors: The Moral and Legal Status of Soldiers_, co-editor with Henry Shue (2008); and _Preemption: Military Action and Moral Justification_, co-editor with Henry Shue (2007).

DON E. SCHEID is Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at Winona State University in Minnesota, United States. Recent publications include: "Replies to Commentaries" (Exchange: Don Scheid on Indefinite Detention of Mega-Terrorists), _Criminal Justice Ethics_ (April 2011); "Indefinite Detention of Mega-Terrorists in the War on Terror," _Criminal Justice Ethics_ (April 2010); and _Ethics and Foreign Intervention_, co-editor with Deen Chatterjee (2003).

FERNANDO R. TESÓN is the Tobias Simon Eminent Scholar at Florida State University College of Law in Florida, United States. He is a permanent visiting professor at Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, Buenos Aires, Argentina. His publications include: _Rational Choice and Democratic Deliberation_, with Guido Pincione (2006); _Humanitarian Intervention: An Inquiry into Law and Morality_, 3rd edn. (revised) (2005); and _A Philosophy of International Law_ (1998).
NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

TZVETAN TODOROV is Honorary Director of Research at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris, France. He is the author of 30 or more books, translated into many languages. Among his many publications translated into English are: *The Totalitarian Experience* (2011); *The Fear of Barbarians* (2010); *Torture and the War on Terror* (2009); *The New World Disorder: Reflections of a European* (2005); *Hope and Memory: Lessons from the Twentieth Century* (2003); and *Imperfect Garden: The Legacy of Humanism* (2002).

JENNIFER M. WELSH is Professor and Chair in International Relations at the European University Institute in Florence, and co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict. She is an editorial board member for the journals *Ethics & International Affairs* and *Global Responsibility to Protect*, and for the Cambridge University Press BISA series on International Relations. Professor Welsh is the author, co-author, and editor of several works on international relations, the evolution of the Responsibility to Protect, and the ethics of military force. Among recent publications are: *Just and Unjust Military Interventions: European Thinkers from Vitoria to Mill*, co-editor with Stefano Recchia (2013); “Who Should Act? Collective Responsibility and the Responsibility to Protect,” in Andy Knight and Frazer Egerton (eds.), *The Routledge Handbook on the Responsibility to Protect* (2012); and “Implementing the ‘Responsibility to Protect’: Where Expectations Meet Reality,” *Ethics & International Affairs* (Winter 2010).
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The 2011 bombing in Libya by Western nations occasioned renewed debate and concern about armed humanitarian intervention and the doctrine of “Responsibility to Protect” (RtoP). This book is a collection of chapters on many of the important moral and legal issues involved. All the chapters are original contributions, written specifically for this volume. The chapters are by leading international thinkers from Australia, Canada, France, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

The question of military intervention for humanitarian purposes has become a major focus for international law, the United Nations, regional organizations such as NATO, and the foreign policies of nations. The chapters reflect the latest ideas of the authors on this timely international issue – one that continues to evolve in the quest for reasonable global governance.

A number of the chapters present perspectives on the moral rationale for armed humanitarian intervention (AHI). Others focus on normative aspects of the practice – including critical views of AHI, the problem of abuse and needed limitations, the future viability of RtoP and some of its problematic implications, the possibility of AHI providing space for peaceful political protest, and how AHI might be integrated with post-war justice.

I wish to thank all the authors for their contributions to this volume and, in some cases, their work on revisions. Special thanks go to Hilary Gaskin of Cambridge University Press and to her assistant, Anna Lowe, for their advice, patience, and valuable help in the preparation of this volume. I am especially grateful to my wife, Dr. Mary Ann Scheid, for her support – and quiet tolerance during episodes of absentmindedness or grouchiness.
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AHI      armed humanitarian intervention
AU       African Union
BRICS countries   Brazil, Russia, India, China, South Africa
CDF      Canadian Defence Force
CIA      Central Intelligence Agency (US)
DDE      doctrine of double effect
ECOWAS   Economic Community of West African States
EU       European Union
GA       General Assembly (UN)
G-8      Group of Eight (governments of eight countries: Canada, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, Russia, UK, United States; also represented is the European Union)
G-77     Group of 77 (at the UN, a loose coalition of developing countries)
ICC      International Criminal Court
ICISS    International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty
ICJ      International Court of Justice
ICTY     International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ISAF     International Security Assistance Force (Afghanistan)
KFOR     Kosovo Force (NATO-led international peacekeeping force responsible for establishing a secure environment in Kosovo, beginning in June 1999)
KLA      Kosovo Liberation Army
LTTE     Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam
MOOTW    military operations other than war
NATO     North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO      non-governmental organization
NTC      National Transition Council (of Libya)
ROE      rules of engagement
RPF      Rwandan Patriotic Front
RtoP or R2P Responsibility to Protect
SC       Security Council (UN)
UAE      United Arab Emirates
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

UK       United Kingdom
UN       United Nations
UNAMIR   United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda
UNDUTCHBAT United Nations Dutch battalion
UNOCI    United Nations Operation in Côte d'Ivoire
UNPROFOR United Nations Protection Force
UNSC     United Nations' Security Council
USSR     Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (Soviet Union)