

The Use of Force and International Law

The Use of Force and International Law offers an authoritative overview of international law governing the resort to force. Looking through the prism of the contemporary challenges that this area of international law faces, including technology, sovereignty, actors, compliance and enforcement, this book addresses key aspects of international law in this area:

- the general breadth and scope of the prohibition of force
- what is meant by ‘force’
- the use of force through the UN and regional organisations
- the use of force in peacekeeping operations
- the right of self-defence and the customary limitations upon this right
- forcible intervention in civil conflicts
- the controversial doctrine of humanitarian intervention.

Suitable for advanced undergraduate and postgraduate students, academics and practitioners, *The Use of Force and International Law* offers a contemporary, comprehensive and accessible treatment of the subject.

Christian Henderson is Professor of International Law at the University of Sussex. He is co-editor-in-chief of the *Journal on the Use of Force and International Law* and is a member of the International Law Association’s Committee on the Use of Force.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03634-5 — The Use of Force and International Law
Christian Henderson
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Use of Force and International Law

Christian Henderson
University of Sussex



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107036345

DOI: 10.1017/9781139567565

© Christian Henderson 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall, April 2018

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Henderson, Christian, author.

Title: The use of force and international law / Christian Henderson.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017055941 | ISBN 9781107036345 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781107692008 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Aggression (International law) | Intervention (International law) | Self-defense (International law)

Classification: LCC KZ6396 .H465 2018 | DDC 341.6/2–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017055941>

ISBN 978-1-107-03634-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-69200-8 Paperback

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/henderson

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

Introduction	<i>page</i> 1
PART I The Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force	7
1 The General Breadth and Scope of the Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force	9
Introduction	9
1 Historical Attempts at Regulating the Use of Force in International Affairs	10
2 The Sources of the Contemporary Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force	17
2.1 The Text of Article 2(4)	18
2.1.1 Lack of Express Mention of Exceptions to the Prohibition	19
2.1.2 'against the territorial integrity or political independence of any state'	19
2.1.3 'or in any other manner inconsistent with the purposes of the United Nations'	21
2.1.4 The Subjects of the Prohibition: 'International Relations'	22
2.2 The Peremptory Status of the Prohibition	24
2.2.1 The Prospects for Normative Change	25
3 The 'Threat' of Force	26
4 Accountability, State Responsibility and Responses to a Threat or Use of Force	31
4.1 Reparations	32
4.2 Countermeasures	33
4.3 Self-Defence	35
4.4 Institutional Involvement: The UN Security Council and Regional Organisations	35
4.5 Courts and Tribunals	36
4.5.1 The Actions of States	36
4.5.2 The Actions of Individuals: The Crime of Aggression	37

vi	Table of Contents	
4.6	Commissions of Inquiry	39
5	Questioning the Continued Relevance and Effectiveness of the Prohibition	40
	Conclusion	48
	Suggested Further Reading	49
2	The Meaning of 'Force'	50
	Introduction	50
1	The Principle of Non-Intervention	51
2	The Type of 'Force' Envisaged in Article 2(4)	52
3	What Is 'Armed Force'?	55
3.1	Is the Actual Use of a Weapon Required?	57
3.1.1	Conventional Weapons	57
3.1.2	Non-Conventional Weapons	59
3.2	The Indirect Use of Armed Force	60
4	The 'Gravity' Element of a Use of Force	62
4.1	Distinguishing 'Use of Force', 'Armed Attack' and 'Aggression'	63
4.1.1	'Armed Attack'	63
4.1.2	'Aggression'	64
4.2	'Minimal' Uses of Force and the Possible Existence of a <i>De Minimis</i> Threshold	65
4.2.1	Distinguishing 'Law Enforcement' and the 'Use of Force': The Relevance of 'International Relations'	68
4.2.1.1	Foreign Individuals or Groups	69
4.2.1.2	Foreign Marine Vessels	71
4.2.1.3	Foreign Civil Aircraft	72
4.2.2	Targeting Individuals, Vessels and Aircraft as a Proxy for Another State	73
4.2.3	Conclusion	74
5	The <i>Mens Rea</i> Element of the Use of Force	75
5.1	Distinguishing General Motives for Action and Intention	76
5.2	Mistake	77
5.3	Discerning Hostile Intent	78
	Conclusion	79
	Suggested Further Reading	81
PART II	The Use of Force in the Context of Collective Security	83
3	The Use of Force under the Auspices of the United Nations	85
	Introduction	85
1	The Maintenance of International Peace and Security: The Division of Competence within the United Nations	87
1.1	The Security Council	87
1.2	The General Assembly	90

vii	Table of Contents	
1.3	The Secretariat	92
2	The Forcible Powers of the Security Council in the UN Charter	93
2.1	Article 39: The ‘Gateway’ Provision to Chapter VII	93
2.1.1	Threats to the Peace	94
2.1.2	Breaches of the Peace and Acts of Aggression	96
2.2	Envisaged Measures under Chapter VII	97
2.3	Limits to the Forcible Powers of the Security Council	98
3	The Chapter VII Powers of the Security Council to Use Force in Practice	102
3.1	The Cold War Era (1945–89)	103
3.2	The Post-Cold War Era (1989–)	105
3.2.1	The Development of the ‘Authorisation’ Method	105
3.2.2	Subsequent Practice in the Use of the Authorisation Method	107
3.2.3	Concerns Regarding the Authorisation Method	110
3.2.4	The General Assembly and the Use of Force	114
4	Chapter VIII and the Authorisation of ‘Regional Organisations’	116
4.1	The African Union	117
4.2	The North Atlantic Treaty Organization	119
	Conclusion	121
	Suggested Further Reading	122
4	Issues in Relation to Authorisation by the United Nations Security Council	123
	Introduction	123
1	Striking the Balance between Unilateralism and Multilateralism	124
2	The Revival of Past Authorisations	127
2.1	The Mandate Contained within Resolution 678 (1990)	129
2.2	The Concept of ‘Material Breach’ in the Practice of the Security Council	131
2.3	The Authority to Determine a ‘Material Breach’ and the Consequences	133
2.4	The Legacy of the Revival Argument	134
3	Determining the Breadth and Scope of an Authorisation	136
3.1	Libya (2011)	137
3.1.1	Assistance to Opposition Forces	139
3.1.2	Regime Change	141
3.2	Côte d’Ivoire (2011)	142
4	The Doctrine of ‘Implied’ Authorisation	144
4.1	Unilateral Enforcement of the ‘Collective Will’ of the UN Security Council	144
4.1.1	Iraq (1991–2002)	144
4.1.2	Kosovo (1999)	146
4.1.3	Assessing Claims to Unilaterally Enforce the ‘Collective Will’	148
4.2	Retrospective Authorisation or Approval	149
4.2.1	Liberia (1990–7)	150
4.2.2	Sierra Leone (1996–9)	151

viii	Table of Contents	
4.2.3	Assessing Claims of Retrospective Authorisation or Approval	153
5	Implementing the ‘Responsibility to Protect’	154
5.1	Enforcement of the Secondary Responsibility to Protect	155
5.2	R2P: Old Wine in New Bottles?	158
5.2.1	Darfur (Sudan) (2003–)	159
5.2.2	Libya (2011)	160
5.2.3	Syria (2011–)	163
	Conclusion	164
	Suggested Further Reading	166
5	United Nations Peacekeeping and the Use of Force	167
	Introduction	167
1	Attempting to Define UN Peacekeeping	169
2	The Legal Basis for UN Peacekeeping Operations	170
3	The Basic Principles of UN Peacekeeping	173
3.1	Consent of the Parties	173
3.2	Impartiality	174
3.3	Non-Use of Force Except in Self-Defence	174
4	Peacekeeping Operations: 1945–89	176
4.1	UNEF I (1956–67)	176
4.2	ONUC (1960–4)	178
4.3	Other Notable Cold War Peacekeeping Operations	179
5	Peacekeeping Operations: 1990–2017	180
5.1	UNPROFOR (1992–5)	181
5.2	UNOSOM II (1993–5)	182
5.3	UNAMSIL (1999–2005)	184
5.4	UNAMID (2007–)	185
5.5	MONUC (2000–10) and MONUSCO (2010–)	185
5.6	MINUSMA (2013–)	187
6	The Evolution in the Use of Force by UN Peacekeeping Operations	189
6.1	The Evolution in the Legal Basis for the Use of Force	190
6.1.1	Personal Self-Defence	190
6.1.2	(Self-)Defence of the Mandate	190
6.1.3	Authorisation by the UN Security Council	192
6.2	Reconciling the Provision of ‘Robust’ Security Council Mandates with the ‘Trinity’ of Peacekeeping Principles	193
6.2.1	Non-Use of Force, Except in Self-Defence and Defence of the Mandate	193
6.2.2	Consent	195
6.2.3	Impartiality	196
6.3	Peace Observation, Peacekeeping, Peace Enforcement, or <i>War Fighting</i> ?	197
	Conclusion	199
	Suggested Further Reading	201

PART III	The Use of Force in Self-Defence	203
6	General Aspects of the Right of Self-Defence	205
	Introduction	205
1	The Concept of an ‘Armed Attack’	207
1.1	The Perpetrators of an Armed Attack	208
1.2	The Targets of an Armed Attack	211
1.3	Issues of Proof	213
1.4	The <i>Mens Rea</i> Element: Does an Armed Attack Need to Be Intended?	214
1.5	A Gravity Threshold Distinguishing ‘Armed Attacks’ from ‘Uses of Force’	216
1.5.1	Problems with a Gravity Threshold	219
1.5.1.1	Fixing the Threshold	220
1.5.1.2	The Threshold in the Practice of States	222
1.5.1.3	The ICJ’s Concept of ‘Proportionate Forcible Countermeasures’	223
1.5.2	Gravity and the ‘Accumulation of Events’ Theory	224
2	The Customary Requirements of Necessity and Proportionality	226
2.1	Necessity	229
2.2	Proportionality	234
2.2.1	Proportionality and the ‘Accumulation of Events’ Theory	239
3	Armed Reprisals	240
4	The Protection of Nationals Abroad	247
4.1	Attacks on Nationals as an Armed Attack	248
4.2	The Protection of Nationals and the Requirement of Necessity	249
4.2.1	Attacks or Threats to Nationals by the Government	249
4.2.2	Attacks or Threats to Nationals that the Government Is Either Unwilling or Unable to Prevent	252
4.2.3	Operations to Extract Nationals	254
4.3	The Protection of Nationals and the Requirement of Proportionality	254
5	The Right of Collective Self-Defence	256
5.1	The Nature of Collective Self-Defence	257
5.2	The Regulation of the Right of Collective Self-Defence	259
6	The Role of the UN Security Council	262
6.1	The Reporting Requirement	263
6.2	The ‘Until Clause’	266
Conclusion		271
Suggested Further Reading		273
7	Preventative Self-Defence	274
	Introduction	274
1	Intercepting an Armed Attack	276
2	Anticipating an Armed Attack: The Concept of ‘Imminence’	277
2.1	The Academic Debate: ‘Expansionists’ v. ‘Restrictionists’	277

x	Table of Contents	
2.2	International Jurisprudence	279
2.3	Cold War State Practice on the Right of Anticipatory Self-Defence: The 1967 Six-Day War	280
3	Pre-Emptying the Development of a Threat of an Armed Attack: Moving Beyond ‘Imminence’?	281
3.1	Cold War State Practice on the Right of Pre-Emptive Self-Defence	282
3.1.1	The 1962 Cuban Missile Crisis	282
3.1.2	The 1981 Israeli Strike on the Osiraq Nuclear Reactor (Iraq)	283
3.2	Attempts to ‘Adapt the Concept of Imminent Threat’ in the Aftermath of 9/11: The ‘Bush Doctrine’	285
3.2.1	Test Cases for the Bush Doctrine of Pre-Emptive Self-Defence?	288
3.2.1.1	Iraq (2003)	288
3.2.1.2	Syria (2007)	290
3.2.2	General Reaction to the Bush Doctrine of Pre-Emptive Self-Defence	291
3.2.3	Pre-Emptive Self-Defence and the International Court of Justice	295
3.3	The Obama Doctrine of ‘Necessary Force’	295
4	Reassessing ‘Imminence’ in the Light of Contemporary Threats: The ‘Bethlehem Principles’ and Beyond	297
4.1	The Continued Relevance of ‘Imminence’: From ‘Temporal’ to ‘Contextual’ Imminence	299
4.2	‘Contextual’ Imminence in Practice	300
4.2.1	Mode of Delivery	301
4.2.2	Gravity of the Threatened Attack	301
4.2.3	Intent of the Potential Attacker	302
4.3	The Distinction between Imminence and Necessity	305
4.4	‘Contextual’ Imminence as <i>Lex Lata</i>	306
	Conclusion	306
	Suggested Further Reading	307
8	The Use of Force against Non-State Actors	308
	Introduction	308
1	General Considerations of the Right of Self-Defence against Non-State Actors	309
2	Self-Defence against Non-State Actors <i>and</i> their Host State	312
2.1	The ‘Effective Control’ Standard of Attribution	312
2.2	The ‘Harbouring’ Standard of Attribution	314
3	Military Action Restricted to the Non-State Actors	316
3.1	Lowering the Standard of Attribution	320
3.2	The ‘Unable or Unwilling’ Doctrine	322
3.2.1	Theoretical and Practical Problems of the Doctrine	326
4	Targeted Killings	333
4.1	International Law on the Use of Force	336
4.2	International Humanitarian Law	338

xi	Table of Contents	
4.3	International Human Rights Law	342
	Conclusion	344
	Suggested Further Reading	346
PART IV	Forcible Intervention in Situations of Civil Unrest	347
9	Consent to Intervention and Intervention in Civil Wars	349
	Introduction	349
1	Identifying Authority to Consent	351
1.1	The General Framework: Governments and Non-State Actors	351
1.2	Effective Control	355
1.3	Recognition	356
1.4	The Principle of Self-Determination	360
2	Intervention in Civil Wars	361
2.1	The ‘Negative Equality’ Principle	362
2.2	The Purpose-Based Approach	365
2.3	Counter-Intervention	368
3	The Form of the Consent or Invitation to Intervene	371
4	The Limits of the Provided Consent or Invitation to Intervene	374
	Conclusion	377
	Suggested Further Reading	378
10	The Doctrine of Humanitarian Intervention	379
	Introduction	379
1	The UN Charter and Humanitarian Intervention	380
2	Humanitarian Intervention as a Circumstance Precluding Wrongfulness	385
3	Humanitarian Intervention in the Practice of States	386
3.1	Cold War	387
3.2	Post-Cold War: From Iraq to Kosovo	389
3.2.1	Iraq (1991-2002)	389
3.2.2	ECOWAS Intervention in Liberia (1990)	391
3.2.3	ECOWAS Intervention in Sierra Leone (1997–8)	392
3.2.4	Kosovo (1999)	393
3.2.4.1	Humanitarian Intervention in the Aftermath of Operation Allied Force	396
4	Humanitarian Intervention and the Responsibility to Protect	401
5	The Civil War in Syria and Humanitarian Intervention	402
	Conclusion	406
	Suggested Further Reading	407
	Concluding Remarks	408
	Index	412