Nationalism and War

Has the emergence of nationalism made warfare more brutal? Does strong nationalist identification increase efficiency in fighting? Is nationalism the cause or the consequence of the breakdown of imperialism? What is the role of victories and defeats in the formation of national identities? The relationship between nationalism and warfare is complex, and it changes depending on which historical period and geographical context is in question. In Nationalism and War, some of the world’s leading social scientists and historians explore the nature of the connection between the two. Through empirical studies from a broad range of countries, they explore the impact that imperial legacies, education, welfare regimes, bureaucracy, revolutions, popular ideologies, geopolitical change, and state breakdowns have had in the transformation of war and nationalism.

John A. Hall is the James McGill Professor of Comparative Historical Sociology at McGill University. His recent publications include Ernest Gellner (2010) and An Anatomy of Power: The Social Theory of Michael Mann (Cambridge University Press, 2006).

Siniša Malešević is Professor and Head of the School of Sociology at the University College, Dublin. His recent publications include The Sociology of War and Violence (Cambridge University Press, 2010) and Identity as Ideology (2006).
Nationalism and War

Edited by

John A. Hall and Siniša Malešević
# Contents

| List of figures                  | page vii |
| List of tables                  | viii     |
| Notes on contributors           | ix       |

Introduction: wars and nationalisms  
JOHN A. HALL AND SINIŠA MALEŠEVIĆ  

## Part 1 Fighting for the nation?  

1. Does nationalist sentiment increase fighting efficacy?
   A skeptical view from the sociology of violence  
   RANDALL COLLINS  
   31

2. Mercenary, citizen, victim: the rise and fall of conscription in the West  
   RICHARD LACHMANN  
   44

## Part 2 The varieties of nationalist experience  

3. The state-to-nation balance and war  
   BENJAMIN MILLER  
   73

4. State violence in the origins of nationalism:  
   British counterinsurgency and the rebirth of  
   Irish nationalism, 1969–1972  
   JAMES HUGHES  
   97

5. When does nationalism turn violent? A comparative analysis of Canada and Sri Lanka  
   MATTHEW LANGE  
   124
Part 3 Empires and nation-states 145

6 Empire and ethnicity 147
   JOHN DARWIN

7 The role of nationalism in the two world wars 172
   MICHAEL MANN

8 Empire, ethnicity and power: a comment 197
   DOMINIC LIEVEN

9 Is nationalism the cause or consequence of the end of empire? 212
   WESLEY HIERS AND ANDREAS WIMMER

10 Obliterating heterogeneity through peace: nationalisms, states and wars, in the Balkans 255
    SINIŠA MALEŠEVIĆ

Part 4 Empty shells, changed conditions 277

11 Internal wars and Latin American nationalism 279
   MIGUEL ANGEL CENTENO, JOSE MIGUEL CRUZ, RENE FLORES, AND GUSTAVO SILVA CANO

12 War and nationalism: the view from Central Africa 306
   RENÉ LEMARCHAND

13 Victory in defeat? National identity after civil war in Finland and Ireland 321
   BILL KISSANE

14 When nationalists disagree: who should one hate and kill? 341
   STEPHEN M. SAIDEMAN

Index 356
### Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>The causal chain between incongruence and violence</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Conflict-related deaths by year in Northern Ireland, 1969–2003</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Conflict-related deaths by month in Northern Ireland, 1969–72</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Conflict-related house searches and arrests in Northern Ireland, 1971–86</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Unemployment rate by age and education in Sri Lanka, 1969–70</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Timing of nationalism and the transition to the nation-state for 135 of today’s countries, 1816–2005</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>Attitudes towards minorities in Romania</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Tables

3.1 The effects of the extent of the state-to-nation congruence and of state strength on state and regional war-proneness  
9.1 Explaining the foundation of national organizations, 1816–2005 (logit analysis)  
9.2 The transition from empire to nation-state, 1816–2005 (logit analysis)  
14.1 Dimensions of nationalism and irredentist inclinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The effects of the extent of the state-to-nation congruence and of state strength on state and regional war-proneness</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Explaining the foundation of national organizations, 1816–2005 (logit analysis)</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 The transition from empire to nation-state, 1816–2005 (logit analysis)</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.1 Dimensions of nationalism and irredentist inclinations</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes on contributors


RANDALL COLLINS is Dorothy Swaine Thomas Professor of Sociology at the University of Pennsylvania. He was President of the American Sociological Association, 2010–11. Previously he has taught at the University of Virginia, University of California Riverside, University of Chicago, Harvard, and Cambridge University where he was Pitt Professor of American History and Institutions. Among his books are Macro-History: Essays in Sociology of the Long Run (1999), The Sociology of Philosophies: a Global Theory of Intellectual Change (1998), Interaction Ritual Chains (2004), and Violence: a Micro-Sociological Theory (2008). His blog, The Sociological Eye, is at http://sociological-eye.blogspot.com/

JOSE MIGUEL CRUZ is a visiting assistant professor at Florida International University. He was the director of the University Institute of Public Opinion (IUDOP) at the University of Central America (UCA) in San Salvador from 1994 to 2006. His last edited book, Street Gangs in Central America (2007), summarizes an eight-year research project on gangs in Central America.

JOHN DARWIN teaches imperial and global history at Oxford University where he is a Fellow of Nuffield College. His recent publications include After Tamerlane: the Global History of Empire since 1405 (2007), which won the Wolfson History Prize, and The Empire Project:
rene flores is a graduate student in the Princeton Department of Sociology. He received his undergraduate degree in Interdisciplinary Studies from the University of California-Berkeley in 2007. He was a research assistant at El Colegio de México in Mexico City.

john a. hall is the James McGill Professor of Comparative Historical Sociology at McGill University in Montreal. His books include Powers and Liberties (1985), Liberalism (1987), Coercion and Consent (1994), and, most recently, Ernest Gellner (2010). The Importance of Being Civil is in the press, and he is at work on a monograph dealing with the interactions between nations, states, and empires.

wesley hiers recently received his Ph.D. from UCLA’s Department of Sociology, where he wrote a comparative-historical dissertation on the relationship between political institutions and racial exclusion in the United States and other former European settlement colonies. He is currently working on a project with Andreas Wimmer that examines the historical roots of right-wing populism in Europe.

james hughes is Professor of Comparative Politics at the London School of Economics. His research spans the study of political violence and terrorism, and national and ethnic conflict, with a focus on the relationship between communities and movements engaged in ideologically motivated violence. He graduated with a B.Sc. in Political Science and Ancient History from Queen’s University Belfast in 1982, and then took his Ph.D. in Soviet history at the LSE (1982–87). He is the author, co-author, or editor of seven books, and his recent works include The Myth of Conditionality (2004), Chechnya: From Nationalism to Jihad (2007), and EU Conflict Management (2010). He is head of the international advisory board of the European Centre for Minority Issues based in Flensburg.

bill kissane was born in the Republic of Ireland and educated at Trinity College Dublin (BA, MA) and the London School of Economics (M.Sc., Ph.D.). He is currently Reader in Politics at the LSE and teaches courses on civil wars, and on democratization. He has published Explaining Irish Democracy (2002), The Politics of the Irish Civil War (2005), and New Beginnings: Constitutionalism and Democracy in Modern Ireland (2011). His edited collection Reconstructing National Identity after Europe’s Internal Wars and his Civil War: the Contemporary Challenge are scheduled for publication in 2014.
Notes on contributors

RICHLANDLACHMANN (Ph.D. Harvard 1983) is Professor of Sociology at the University at Albany, State University of New York. His book Capitalists in Spite of Themselves: Elite Conflict and Economic Transitions in Early Modern Europe (2000) received the 2003 American Sociological Association’s Distinguished Scholarly Publication Award. He is the author of States and Power (2010). He is currently writing a book examining the decline of dominant economic and military powers in early modern Europe and the contemporary United States. He is also researching media coverage of war deaths in the United States and Israel from the 1960s to the present.

MATTHEWLANGE is Associate Professor of Sociology at McGill University. His research explores the developmental legacies of colonialism and the causes of ethnic violence and uses comparative-historical methods. He is the author of Educations in Ethnic Violence (Cambridge University Press, 2012), Comparative-Historical Methods (2012), and Lineages of Despotism and Development: British Colonialism and State Power (2009). He is the co-editor of The Oxford Handbook of the Transformations of States (in press) and States and Development: Historical Antecedents of Stagnation and Advance (2005).

RENE LEMARCHAND is Emeritus Professor of Political Science at the University of Florida. He has written extensively on the Great Lakes region of Central Africa. He is the author of Rwanda and Burundi (1970), which received the Herskovits Award of the African Studies Association. His latest books include The Dynamics of Violence in Central Africa (2009) and an edited volume, Forgotten Genocides (2011). He served as a regional advisor on governance and democracy with USAID from 1992 to 1998 in Abidjan and Accra, and has been a visiting lecturer at the University of California at Berkeley, Brown University, Concordia (Montreal), as well as at the universities of Bordeaux, Antwerp, Copenhagen, and Helsinki. He is currently working on a short history of violence in the Congo, Rwanda, and Burundi.

DOMINICLIEVEN is Senior Research Fellow at Trinity College, Cambridge (from 2011) and a Fellow of the British Academy (from 2001). Previously he was a professor at LSE. He graduated from Christ’s College, Cambridge in 1973, was a Kennedy Scholar at Harvard, served in the British Foreign Office and did his doctorate at the School of Slavonic and East European Studies under the supervision of Professor Hugh Seton-Watson in 1975–78. His main publications are Russia and the Origins of the First World War (1983), Russia’s Rulers under the Old
Notes on contributors


Benjamin Miller is Professor of International Relations at the School of Political Sciences, University of Haifa, where he is Head of the International MA Program in Peace and Conflict Management. He is also the President of the Israeli Association for International Studies. Among his publications are: When Opponents Cooperate: Great Power Conflict and Collaboration in World Politics (2nd edn., 2002) and States, Nations and Great Powers: The Sources of Regional War and Peace (Cambridge University Press, 2007). He has also published numerous articles on international relations theory and international and regional security. Miller’s current project focuses on explaining changes in US grand strategy since World War II. Miller received a Ph.D. from the University of California at Berkeley and he was a research fellow at Harvard University, MIT, Princeton University and McGill University.
He has taught at Duke University, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and the University of Colorado, Boulder.

**STEPHEN M. SAIDEMAN** holds the Paterson Chair in International Affairs at Carleton University’s Norman Paterson School of International Affairs. In addition to his books, *The Ties That Divide: Ethnic Politics, Foreign Policy and International Conflict* and *For Kin or Country: Xenophobia, Nationalism and War* (with R. William Ayres) and *Intra-State Conflict, Governments and Security* (with Marie-Joelle Zahar), he has published articles and book chapters on the international relations and comparative politics of nationalism, ethnic conflict, and civil war. Professor Saideman spent 2001–2 on the US Joint Staff working in the Strategic Planning and Policy Directorate in the Central and East European Division as part of a Council on Foreign Relations International Affairs Fellowship. Saideman is now completing a book on NATO’s experience in Afghanistan while continuing his work on the international relations of ethnic conflict by focusing on the dynamics of diasporas.

**GUSTAVO SILVA CANO** is a Juris Doctor candidate at the University of Pennsylvania Law School. He holds a BA from the Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs, Princeton University.

**ANDREAS WIMMER** is Hughes-Rogers Professor of Sociology and Faculty Associate in Politics at Princeton University. His research aims to understand the dynamics of nation-state formation, ethnic boundary making and political conflict from a comparative perspective. He has pursued these themes across the disciplinary fields of sociology, political science, and social anthropology and amateured in various methodological and analytical strategies, from fieldwork to quantitative cross-national analysis. His latest books are *Waves of War: Nationalism, State-Formation and Ethnic Exclusion in the Modern World* (Cambridge University Press, 2012) and *Ethnic Boundary Making: Institutions, Power, Networks* (2012).