The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands

Using a plethora of hitherto unused and underutilized sources from the Ottoman, British, and Iranian archives, *The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands* traces seven decades of intermittent work by Russian, British, Ottoman, and Iranian technical and diplomatic teams to turn an ill-defined and highly porous area into an internationally recognized boundary. By examining the process of boundary negotiation by the international commissioners and their interactions with the borderland peoples they encountered, the book tells the story of how the Muslim world’s oldest borderland was transformed into a bordered land. It details how the borderland peoples, whose habitat straddled the frontier, responded to those processes as well as to the ideas and institutions that accompanied their implementation. It shows that the making of the boundary played a significant role in shaping Ottoman-Iranian relations and in the identity and citizenship choices of the borderland peoples.

Sabri Ateş is an assistant professor of history at Southern Methodist University in Dallas, Texas. He has published a book in Turkish entitled *Tunah Hilmi Bey: An Intellectual from the Ottoman Empire to Modern Turkey* (2009), as well as several articles in *Comparative Studies of Asia, Africa and the Middle East* and *Iranian Studies*. 
The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands

Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

SABRİ ATEŞ

Southern Methodist University
For Elizabeth
Contents

List of Illustrations  page x
Acknowledgments  xiii
Note on Transliteration and Usage  xvii
List of Abbreviations  xix

Introduction  1
   The Nature of the Ottoman-Iranian Frontier  1
   A Note on Terminology  8
   Dividing the Umma, Defining Its Frontiers  10
   Islamic Concepts of Frontier  13
   Ottoman-Iranian Treaties and Frontiers  20
   A Note on Sources and Methodology  26
   Structure of the Book  28

1. The Kurdish Frontier and Ottoman-Qajar Relations  31
   The End of the Ancien Régime and the Rising Capacity of States at the Borderland  34
   The Administrative Organization of Ottoman Kurdistan  37
   Babans between the Ottomans and Qajars  42
   Tribes and Empires: The Case of Haydaran and Sipki  49
   The Last Ottoman-Iranian War, 1821–1822  52
   The Erzurum Treaty of 1823  54
   Developments Leading to the Making of the Frontier  57
   Great Power Intervention and the Making of the Boundary  64
   Pacification of the Borderland: The First Phase  66
   Khan Abdal and the City of Van  68
   The Babans, for the Last Time  71
   The Case of the City of Van and the Mir of Bohtan  75
   Taxes, Conscription, Retribalization: The State Is Here to Stay  81
viii

Contents

2. Laying the Ground: The Concert of Zagros 86
   The Commissioners and Their Work 88
   There Was a Treaty of 1639, but Where Is It? 96
   Geopolitics and Boundary Making: The Case of Zohab/Qasr-i Shirin 100
   Shatt al-Arab, Muhammarah, and the Ka'b Tribe 108
   Imperial Decision Making 110
   Pasture Politics: Frontiers and Tribes 112
   Other Issues at the Conference 116
   The Erzurum Treaty of 1847 129

3. The Long Journey of the First Survey Commission 139
   The Commissioners and Their Duties 142
   Creating Facts on the Ground, or Dervish Pasha’s Long Detour at Kotur 146
   Finally at Work: Surveyors on the Go 149
   Locating the Boundary of Muhammarah and Shatt al-Arab 151
   Locating the Boundary of Zohab-Qasr-i Shirin 151
   Commissioners and Borderlanders: Inscribing Subjecthood on the People of the Frontier 164
   The Case of the Failis of Posht-e Kuh 166
   Using the State to Advance Local Claims: The Case of Banu Lam 171
   Sunnis for the Caliph: Claiming the Lands in the Name of Defunct Kurdish Dynasts 173
   To Which Pasture the Nomads Belong, and to Which Country the Pasture? 177
   Limits of Sectarianism: Ottoman Efforts to Lure the Sunnis 180
   The End of the Survey 183

4. The Borderland between the Crimean War and the Berlin Congress 186
   The Crimean War and the Northern Borderland 187
   The Crimean War and Ottoman-Iranian Relations 189
   The Locals and the Localities: How to Control, Whom to Stop 197
   Forming a New Commission, Teaching the Borderlanders a Lesson 202
   Bringing the State into Local Disputes 206
   New Actors and Notions: Migration as Asylum 209
   The Commission of 1874 211
   The Russo-Ottoman War of 1877–1878 and the Transformation of Borderland Identities 213
   The End of the War: Kotur and Minor Moving into Major 221

5. Sunnis for the Sultan: The Ottoman Occupation of Northwestern Iran, 1905–1912 229
   Justifying the Integration 232
   The Case of the Bilbas and the Beginning of the Ottoman Occupation 235
Contents

A Kurdish Tribe, an American Missionary, and the Dekhalet Petitions 246
Responses to the Occupation 255
Commissions and Claims: The 1908 Frontier Commission 260
The End of Abdulhamid II’s Reign, the CUP, and the Borderland 262
Sunni Appeals to the CUP and the Impending End of the Annexation 269
The “Independent” 1911 Commission 271
Ottoman Policies in the Nevahi-i Şarkiyye 273
The End of the Occupation 281

6. Boundary at Last 284
   Changing Power Dynamics and the Northern Borderland Communities 292
   Exclusion of Iran from Negotiations 296
   The Final Commission, 1913–1914 300
   Conclusion 316

Select Bibliography 323
Index 337
List of Illustrations

MAPS
1. Ottoman-Iranian Borderland page xxii
2. Frontier Places of Turkey and Persia 89
3. Carte de la Frontière Turco-Persane 93
4. Ancient and Modern Frontiers of Suleymanieh 101
5. The Province of Zohab 103
6. Shatt al-Arab/Muhammarah Region Map Based on Differing Claims 109
7. An Ottoman Map of the Shatt al-Arab Region 112
8. Reproduction of Turkish Map of the Turco Persian Frontier Showing Different Claims 125
9. Map of the Posht-e Kuh District 164
10. Map of Lahijan Area and the Disputed Territories 236
11. The Bilbas Country 239
12. Map of Areas Occupied by the Ottoman Forces from 1905 to 1912 274

FIGURES
1. An Ottoman frontier fort. 23
2. The town of Qasr-i Shirin. 99
3. Baiz and Hamza Aghas. 240
4. Group of children at Savojbulagh, 1914. 257
5. British commission members 1913–14. 301
6. British commission members 1913–14. 301
7. Russian Commissioner Vladimir Minorksy with Russian officers and Iranian commission members. 302
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Vladimir Minorsky, Iranian commissioner Ittila al-Mulk, and members of their retinue.</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Vladimir Minorsky and Mrs. Minorsky with a group of Cossacks.</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Ottoman and Iranian commission members.</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Iranian commission members, 1913–14.</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Sheikh Khaz’al’s feast for commission members, January 1914.</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Last frontier commission camp.</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From its birth as an idea at a small café in Greenwich Village to today, this project has been through many incarnations and, with the help of generous individuals and institutions, has dwelled in many climes. I am concerned that I will not be able to mention them all, and the list of those who rightfully deserve credit will be only partial.

During my years at New York University, I had the privilege to study with many supportive professors and friends, including Peter Chelkowski, Khaled Fahmy, Michael Gilsenan, Mohammad Mehdi Khorrami, Zachary Lockman, Robert McChesney, Molly Nolan, and Ariel Salzmann. I am deeply indebted to them, for their criticisms and suggestions at different stages have significantly improved my work. Thanks are also due to all my friends in the dissertation-writing group that over a long period benefited from the gracious hospitality and guidance of ever-supportive Michael Gilsenan. It has also been a great pleasure to work in the Clements Department of History at Southern Methodist University, where I have found great support from my colleagues; the administrative staff; and the previous and present chairs, Jim Hopkins and Kathleen Wellman. I could not imagine a better working environment.

To my friends, I owe a special debt of gratitude. In Istanbul, Seda Altuğ, Ilke Şanlıer, Yüksel Taşkın, Murat Yüksel, and Nurı Akgül opened their homes and provided me with more support than I could have hoped for. In Iran, Farshad Fazlollahi showed the best of Iranian hospitality and made my stays pleasant and most comfortable. I also thank Chista Crouther and Noushin Faghihi-Nejad for their friendship and for introducing me to Farshad and his cohort. Dr. Shervin Ziabaksh-Tabari, Bahar Bazgerd, their son Parham, and the Bazgerd family’s warm hospitality will be long
Acknowledgments

remembered. A summer at Felor Alemohammad’s was most pleasant. In Iran, I also had the good fortune of meeting Kaveh Bayat, who provided me with friendship, support, and various materials I have yet to use. Dr. Nasrollah Salehi has also gone beyond the call of duty in his continuing support and friendship and contributions to this project.

In England, Kate Fleet was most helpful during my short stay at Cambridge. In London, Faruk Haciharfoğlu and Zafer Yörük provided me with warm friendship and lodging. I would also like to acknowledge my deepest gratitude to Ayşe Aslan.

Tasha Darbes deserves heartfelt appreciation for the time she spent on this project in its dissertation stage, as do Edward Countryman and Rudi Matthee for their comments and suggestions on more recent iterations of the manuscript. Over the years, I have incurred many debts of gratitude to librarians and archivists, including those of the Başbakanlık Arşivi in Istanbul; the Majlis Library in Iran; the Public Records Office (Kew) and British Library–India Office in London; the libraries at NYU; and, last but not least, the libraries of SMU, specifically Billie Stowal and the ILL staff. For maps, I thank Norman Belza of SMU and Boundary Cartography. I also thank Saqi Books and John Tchalenko for letting me reproduce two maps from Images from the Endgame, and the Finnish Museum of Photography for its permission to reproduce some images I first saw in John Tchalenko’s book. Thanks are also due Chris Seaton for allowing me to use a photograph from the Albert Wratislaw Collection.

This long adventure would have not been possible without financial support from New York University’s Department of Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies, the Kevorkian Center for Near Eastern Studies, and the Graduate School of Arts and Science. My work in Turkey during the dissertation- and book-writing stages was made possible by two generous grants from the American Research Institute in Turkey. Koç University’s RCAC and its staff made our stay in Istanbul an unforgettable time filled with good friends and a great work environment. I also thank SMU’s Department of History and University Research Council for providing summer research support and Cambridge University’s Skilleter Center for making my time in Cambridge and London possible. I also thank the reviewers of my manuscript, my editor at Cambridge Marigold Acland, and assistant editor Sarika Narula, together with Cherline Daniel of Integra-PYD, who through a very long process have been most accommodating and helpful.

My academic life would not have been possible without my mentor Ariel Salzmann, who took me under her wing and has continued to be a great source of support and inspiration. Similarly Zachary Lockman, a
most insightful and generous scholar, has for many years provided immense support and mentorship. It is from him and Ariel Salzmann that I learned what a daunting task it is to be an ustad. I only hope that I will be able to follow their examples.

Finally, my family – my parents, Suveyla and Ibrahim; my in-laws, Kathy and Dan; and the brothers, sisters, brothers- and sisters-in-law, nephews, and nieces whose care I was away from but whose warm support has always been with me. Their unconditional love, acceptance, confidence, pride, and support have given me strength to go through the daunting task of writing this book.

This book is dedicated to my love and wife, Elizabeth, who selflessly spent countless hours editing, “cut-editing,” and learning about the geographies, peoples, and histories of the Zagros and Mesopotamia while nurturing me and our daughter, Suheyla.
Note on Transliteration and Usage

For reasons of simplicity and consistency, except for ayn and hamza, I have eliminated diacritical marks except when quoting from a published or secondary work or providing the title of a published book. For example, I render dâr al-Islâm and thughur as dar al-Islam and thughur. Names and places that are rendered differently in Ottoman, Persian, and English sources present special difficulties. The goal has been to make them accessible to English speakers while following the most common international usage. In these cases, such as for the word pasha or Dervish, I have used the standard English spelling or Anglicized form. When this is not possible, I have followed the New Redhouse Turkish-English Dictionary or Encyclopædia Iranica sans diacritical marks. For place names, I have tried to use the most modern version, which a reader could find on contemporary maps. However, in some instances, my usage does not follow a convention but rather reflects an arbitrary selection. The present-day town of Mahabad is a good example. It is referred to as Sawj Bulaq/Savojboulagh/Savejboulagh/Saujbulagh/Soujbulakh/Sablax/Savucbulak/Savuçbulak/Savojbulagh, from which list I adapted the last one. Dates are given in the Common Era calendar, but I have also included the catalog dates of documents from the Ottoman archives. Place names on maps follow the map makers’s original spellings.
## Abbreviations

### Abbreviations for the Ottoman Archives (BOA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Sadaret</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.AMD</td>
<td>Amedi Kalemi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.DVN</td>
<td>Divan-i Hümayun Kalemi Kataloğu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.DVN.MHM</td>
<td>Divan-i Hümayun Muhimme Kalemi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.DVN.NMH</td>
<td>Namî-ı Hümayun Kataloğu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.DVNS.MHM</td>
<td>Sadaret Mektubi Muhimme Kalemi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.MKT</td>
<td>Mektubi Kalemi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.MKT.MHM</td>
<td>Mektubi Muhimme Kalemi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.MKT.UM</td>
<td>Umum Vilâyat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEO</td>
<td>Bab-ı Ali Evrak Odası</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOA</td>
<td>Başbakanlık (Prime Ministry) Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEVDET HR</td>
<td>Cevdet Hariciye</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAT or HH</td>
<td>Hatt-ı Hümayun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR.SYS</td>
<td>Hariciye Siyasi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDH</td>
<td>İrade Dahiliye</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMM</td>
<td>İrade Meclis-i Mahsus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.MSM</td>
<td>İrade Mesâili Muhimme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.MVL</td>
<td>İrade Meclis-i Vala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MVL</td>
<td>Meclis-i Vâla Evrakı Hülasa Kayıt Defterleri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.</td>
<td>Yıldız</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.A.HUS</td>
<td>Sadaret Hüsusi Maruzat Evrakı</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.PRK</td>
<td>Perakende Evrakı</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.PRK.EŞA</td>
<td>Elçilik Şehbenderlik Maruzatı</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.PRK.KOM</td>
<td>Perakende Komisyonlar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Y.PRK.SRN</td>
<td>Serkurenalık Evrakı</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.PRK.UM</td>
<td>Umum Vilayetler Tahriratı</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Other Abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHR</td>
<td><em>American Historical Review</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL-IOR</td>
<td>British Library, Oriental and India Office Records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJMES</td>
<td><em>International Journal of Middle East Studies</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMFA</td>
<td>Iranian Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMoFA</td>
<td>Iranian Minister of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JRGs</td>
<td><em>Journal of Royal Geographical Society of London</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KE</td>
<td>Kânun-u Evvel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KS</td>
<td>Kânun-u Sani</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L/P&amp;S</td>
<td>India/Political/Secret (BL-IOR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MES</td>
<td><em>Middle East Studies</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMD</td>
<td>Ottoman Ministry of Defense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMFA</td>
<td>Ottoman Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMoFA</td>
<td>Ottoman Minister of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMW</td>
<td>Ottoman Ministry of War</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRO FO</td>
<td>Public Records Office, Foreign Office, Kew Gardens</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MAP 1. Ottoman-Iranian Borderland
Made by Boundary Cartography.