The Promise of Power

Under what conditions are some developing countries able to create stable democracies while others have slid into instability and authoritarianism? To address this classic question at the centre of policy and academic debates, The Promise of Power investigates a striking puzzle: why, upon the 1947 Partition of British India, was India able to establish a stable democracy while Pakistan created an unstable autocracy?

Drawing on interviews, colonial correspondence, and early government records to document the genesis of two of the twentieth century's most celebrated independence movements, Maya Tudor refutes the prevailing notion that a country's democratization prospects can be directly attributed to its levels of economic development or inequality. Instead, she demonstrates that the differential strengths of India's and Pakistan's independence movements directly accounts for their divergent democratization trajectories. She also establishes that these movements were initially constructed to pursue historically conditioned class interests. By illuminating the source of this enduring contrast, The Promise of Power offers a broad theory of democracy's origins that will interest scholars and students of comparative politics, democratization, state-building, and South Asian political history.

Maya Tudor is a Fellow in Politics at St John's College, Oxford University. Her dissertation, upon which this book is based, won the American Political Science Association's Gabriel Almond Award for the Best Dissertation in Comparative Politics.
The Promise of Power
The Origins of Democracy in India and Autocracy in Pakistan

MAYA TUDOR
University of Oxford
For

Loren
Contents

List of table, figures and maps  ix
Acknowledgments  x
Maps  xiv

1 How India institutionalized democracy and Pakistan promoted autocracy  1
   I. The argument  3
   II. Theoretical contribution  15
   III. Existing explanations and their limitations  22
   IV. Claiming causality and the organization of the book  36

2 The social origins of pro- and anti-democratic movements (1885–1919)  44
   I. Imagined Indians embrace democratic reform  45
   II. Muslim landed aristocrats react to democratic reform  56
   III. Conclusion  65

3 Imagining and institutionalizing new nations (1919–1947)  67
   I. Congress popularizes a programmatic, pro-democratic nationalism  69
   II. League adopts vague religious nationalism  86
   III. Conclusion  98

4 Organizing alliances (1919–1947)  100
   I. Congress organizes a coherent distributive coalition  100
   II. Muslim League cobbles together coalitions of convenience  123
   III. Conclusion  150
viii

Contents

5 Freedom at midnight and divergent democracies (1947–1958) 153
   I. Freedom and fratricide 154
   II. Power-sharing and language conflicts in federal constitutions 160
   III. Forging an accountable chief executive 190
   IV. Conclusion 203

6 The institutionalization of alliances in India, Pakistan, and beyond 205
   I. The puzzle … and the class coalition and political party answer 205
   II. Revisiting broader questions 212
   III. Extensions beyond South Asia 218

References 224
Index 235
Table, figures and maps

**Table**

1.1 India and Pakistan compared \hspace{1cm} page 27

**Figures**

1.1 Divergent regime trajectories in India and Pakistan \hspace{1cm} 2
1.2 The argument of the book \hspace{1cm} 7
1.3 Defining political party strength \hspace{1cm} 13
1.4 Cross-national correlation of economic and political development \hspace{1cm} 40
2.1 Argument of the chapter \hspace{1cm} 45
2.2 Composition of judicial and executive services in United Provinces \hspace{1cm} 59
3.1 Argument of the chapter \hspace{1cm} 68
4.1 Argument of the chapter \hspace{1cm} 101
5.1 Argument of the chapter \hspace{1cm} 154

**Maps**

1 Muslims in British India \hspace{1cm} xiv
2 British colonial India, 1935 \hspace{1cm} xv
3 India and Pakistan \hspace{1cm} xvi
How did two of the world’s most populous countries emerge from a shared colonial legacy with radically divergent and historically enduring political regimes? Investigating that question has been my professional preoccupation for the last decade. That I have finally crafted an answer in the form of this book is a testament to the extraordinary support of a great many individuals and institutions. As such, I would be remiss not to acknowledge some of the hands that have steadied my progress and encouraged my spirits along the gratifying path to the book’s completion.

The earliest seed of this project formed over a decade ago when I spent six months working in Dhaka for a microfinance organization. At the time, I was struck by the considerable political differences between Bangladesh and India, despite their common colonial legacy. The idea of systematically exploring the origins of these differences germinated during my enrollment in Atul Kohli’s graduate course the Comparative Political Economy of Development, at Princeton. This engaging and provocative course, which asked ambitious questions about the origins of worldwide patterns of economic development, charted the kind of bold intellectual terrain that inspired my enrollment in a political science doctoral program and that directly led to the writing of this book.

The argument advanced within these pages was most critically formed during 13 months I spent immersed in archival research and interviewing in Pakistan, India and England. To the many dozens of academics, civil servants, journalists, military officers, and other experts who so generously gave of their time and expertise, I am deeply grateful. The hospitable warmth of dozens of Pakistanis brightened my visits to Lahore and
Islamabad, but I would particularly like to thank Ejaz Haider, Hasan Askari-Rizvi, and Mohammed Waseem for informative conversations, the staff at the National Documentation Centre in Islamabad for graciously assisting me in my scouring of early government records, Sara Sebhai for her marvelous hosting in Islamabad, and Omer and Sheryar Salamaat for introducing me to competitive kite flying on Lahore’s rooftops. My greatest debt of gratitude in Pakistan goes to Mehvesh and Naeem Ahmed and their family. Their gracious kindness and protectiveness literally created a home away from home. In India, I would like to thank Mridula and Aditya Mukherjee as well as Bipin Chandra for guiding my archival research, Pratap Bhanu Mehta at the Centre for Policy Research for providing me with office space, the staff at the Nehru Memorial Museum and Library for tolerating my seemingly endless requests for archived papers, and Prerna Singh for much-needed laughter and even timely medical assistance.

Upon my return from field research, I found myself ensconced in the unequalled scholarly community at Princeton, both in the Woodrow Wilson School and in the Politics department. I owe a profound debt of gratitude to my dissertation committee for its unstinting support of the earliest form of this book. Atul Kohli’s steadfast encouragement and incisive questioning always sharpened my thinking and roused my spirits, especially after the birth of my daughter when writing at all seemed a distant priority. Deborah Yashar’s support came in manifold forms, perhaps most clearly in the countless pearls of wisdom she shared from the crafting of her own comparative historical investigation into democratization in *Demanding Democracy* and in the tough, ever-brilliant role model she so ably continues to be. Stephen Cohen encouraged this project from an early stage, critically appraising my interpretation of historical events in ways that have immeasurably improved the final result, and Carles Boix enthusiastically read and commented upon each chapter.

A heartfelt thank you is also extended to the fantastic writing group that first formed at Princeton: Sarah Chartock, Ludmila Krytynskaia, Rachel Beatty Riedl, and Prerna Singh. First as fellow graduate students, and now as friends and colleagues, these women have painstakingly read through repeated iterations of this book, balancing thoughtful critiques with unbridled laughter. For insightful comments at various stages of writing at Princeton, I would also like to thank Gary Bass, Jason Brownlee, Arudra Burra, Wolfgang Danspeckgruber, Tyler Dickovick, Joanne Gowa, Stan Katz, Evan Lieberman, Zia Mian, Ilan Nam, Anne Sartori, and Kathryn Stoner-Weiss.
Acknowledgments

This book has also been molded and improved by a broader scholarly community. Eva Bellin, Nancy Bermeo, Malfrid Braut-Heggehammer, Rachel Gisselquist, Patrick Heller, Steve Levitsky, Steve Miller, Vipin Narang, Robert Rotberg, Alexandra Scacco, Lee Seymour, Dan Slater, Hillel Soifer, Paul Staniland, Ashutosh Varshney, Steve Walt, Jeremy Weinstein, Steve Wilkinson, Adam Zeigfeld, and Daniel Ziblatt are all to be thanked for giving generously of their time at various stages of the writing and the presenting of this manuscript. A special note of thanks is extended to my friend Pavan Ahluwalia, who read through every single page of the book as I endeavored to cut its unwieldy size, often commenting in detail on footnotes that I doubt few scholarly experts will even read.

No less importantly, I am indebted to a wide array of institutions for their support. At Princeton, this included the Woodrow Wilson School, the Princeton Institute for International and Regional Studies, and the Fellowship of Woodrow Wilson Scholars. During field research, this included the Center for Democracy, Development and Rule of Law at Stanford University, the David L. Boren Fellowship, the Lahore University of Management Sciences, and the Centre for Policy Research. And as I wrote up the research, this included the vibrant scholarly community at the Belfer Center in the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, the Centre for the Study of Inequality and Democracy at Oxford University, and St John’s College, Oxford University.

Marigold Acland, Sarika Narula, Lucy Rhymer, and Elizabeth Spicer at Cambridge University Press and Rob Wilkinson at Out of House Publishing were all unfailingly competent and encouraging as they ushered this manuscript to its final completion. I also wish to thank the two anonymous reviewers of this manuscript for their valuable comments and suggestions.

My soulful tribe of friends, all in their own ways, supported the writing of this book by repeatedly reminding me that there was life beyond it. Thank you to Ollie Babson, Casey Budeslich, MacGregor Duncan, Caroline Flintoft, Katherine Greig, Anu Gupta, Jessica Hartman Jacobs, Peter Jewett, Jessa Lewis, Steve Murphy, Ritesh Shah, Susie Smith, Marie Soller, and Rachel Tobey.

I owe the love of different cultures and of animated political debate that ignited my interest in the topic of this book to my far-flung but close-knit family: Jan Tudor, Naomi Tudor, Kim Tudor, Ana Gonzales-Trigas, Patrick Mullen, Harpal Singh, Tom Tudor, Eunim Tudor, Hanna Tudor, Rajeshwar Dayal, Indira Dayal, Aarti Dayal, Harsh Vardhan, Barbara
Acknowledgments

Griffith, and a missed Harry Griffith. My dear sister, fellow graduate student, friend, confidante, and colleague Rani Mullen deserves a special note of gratitude for always believing in me and for remembering and cheering me on at every important milestone of my life. The support of my mother, Marlies Kurtz-Singh, has made it possible for me to write this book in ways both ordinary and extraordinary. Her unwavering optimism, her high-minded idealism, and her thoughtful dedication to her children and grandchildren continues to inspire me.

Coming to life as they did during the years that this book was in the making, my beloved daughter Amelia and son Theo have, through their beautiful laughter and love, supported the writing of this book by reminding me every morning and evening of what really matters.

Finally, mere words hardly suffice to express my gratitude to my partner, Loren Griffith. He has accompanied me intellectually in the writing of this book by asking thought-provoking questions on late nights, by providing insight on every iteration of this manuscript, and by drawing detailed flow charts of my argument. He has accompanied me physically in the writing of this book, grinning through our Old Delhi rickshaw rides and falling in love with the incomparable beauty of the Indian subcontinent. And he has accompanied me emotionally in the writing of this book with his ever-ready laugh, with his steadfast and unrivalled parenting, and with his unconditional love. I dedicate this book to him.
Map 1. Muslims in British India.
MAP 2. British colonial India, 1935.
MAP 3. India and Pakistan.