

NATIONALITY AND STATELESSNESS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW

Written by leading experts, Nationality and Statelessness under International Law introduces the study and practice of 'international statelessness law' and explains the complex relationship between the international law on nationality and the phenomenon of statelessness. It also identifies the rights of stateless people, outlines the major legal obstacles preventing the eradication of statelessness and charts a course for this new and rapidly changing field of study.

ALICE EDWARDS is Senior Legal Coordinator and Chief of the Protection Policy and Legal Advice Section at the UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), Geneva.

LAURA VAN WAAS is the founder and manager of the Statelessness Programme at Tilburg Law School, the Netherlands.





NATIONALITY AND STATELESSNESS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW

Edited by
ALICE EDWARDS AND LAURA VAN WAAS





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

 $www. cambridge. org \\ Information on this title: www. cambridge. org/9781107032446$

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Nationality and statelessness under international law / edited by
Alice Edwards and Laura van Waas.

pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03244-6 (hardback)

Stateless persons-Legal status, laws, etc.
 Citizenship.
 Statelessness.
 I. Edwards, Alice, editor.
 II. Waas, Laura van, 1981- editor.

K7128.S7N38 2014 342.08'3-dc23 2014022527

ISBN 978-1-107-03244-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of contributors page vii Acknowledgements xiii Abbreviations and acronyms xv

Introduction 1

ALICE EDWARDS AND LAURA VAN WAAS

1 The meaning of nationality in international law in an era of human rights: procedural and substantive aspects 11

ALICE EDWARDS

2 Statelessness and citizenship in ethical and political perspective 44

MATTHEW J. GIBNEY

3 The UN statelessness conventions 64

LAURA VAN WAAS

4 UNHCR's mandate and activities to address statelessness 88

MARK MANLY

5 The determination of statelessness and the establishment of a statelessness-specific protection regime 116

GÁBOR GYULAI

6 Children, their right to a nationality and child statelessness 144

GERARD-RENÉ DE GROOT



vi CONTENTS

7 Women, nationality and statelessness: the problem of unequal rights 169

RADHA GOVIL AND ALICE EDWARDS

- 8 Deprivation of nationality: limitations on rendering persons stateless under international law 194

 JORUNN BRANDVOLL
- 9 State succession and issues of nationality and statelessness 217
 INETA ZIEMELE
- 10 The nexus between statelessness and migration 247 SOPHIE NONNENMACHER AND RYSZARD CHOLEWINSKI
- 11 More or less secure? Nationality questions, deportation and dual nationality 264

KIM RUBENSTEIN AND NIAMH LENAGH-MAGUIRE

Index 292



CONTRIBUTORS

JORUNN BRANDVOLL currently works as a Protection Officer with UNHCR as part of the Syrian refugee response in Qobayat, Lebanon. Prior to her current position, she worked for more than six years for the UNHCR Division of International Protection in Geneva, Switzerland, specializing in issues related to nationality and statelessness, most recently as a Legal Officer in the Statelessness Unit from 2009 to 2013. She has been employed by UNHCR since 2003. During this period she has also been based in Azerbaijan and Darfur. She holds an M.Sc. in Russian and Post-Soviet Studies from the London School of Economics and Political Science, a Master's degree in Political Science from the University of Oslo and a Master of Studies in International Human Rights Law from the University of Oxford.

RYSZARD CHOLEWINSKI works for the International Migration Programme of the International Labour Organization (ILO) in Geneva. Prior to joining ILO in 2010, he was Senior Migration Policy and Research Specialist in the Migration Policy and Research Department of the International Organization for Migration (IOM) in Geneva (2005-2010). Prior to this, he was Reader in Law at the University of Leicester (1992-2005). He has served in a consultative capacity to other international organizations such as the Council of Europe, the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights and UNESCO as well as to a number of non-governmental organizations. Ryszard has published widely on international and European migration law and policy, including Migrant Workers in International Human Rights Law: Their Protection in Countries of Employment (1997); Borders and Discrimination in the European Union (2002); The Legal Status of Migrants Admitted for Employment: A Comparative Study of Law and Practice in Selected European States (2004); and Study on Obstacles to Effective Access of Irregular Migrants to Minimum Social Rights (2005). More recently, he co-edited International Migration Law: Developing Paradigms and



viii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Key Challenges (Asser Press, 2007) and co-authored the Handbook on Establishing Effective Labour Migration Policies in Countries of Origin and Destination (2006), a joint publication of the IOM, Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) and ILO. He was also Co-Editor-in-Chief of IOM's World Migration 2008: Managing Labour Mobility in the Evolving Global Economy. Ryszard holds a doctoral degree (LL.D.) from the University of Ottawa, a Master in Laws degree (LL.M.) from the University of Saskatchewan and a Bachelor of Laws degree (LL.B.) from the University of Leicester.

GERARD-RENÉ DE GROOT is Professor of Comparative Law and Private International Law in Maastricht, Aruba and Hasselt. He studied Law at the Rijksuniversiteit Groningen (Netherlands) and at the Westfälische Wilhelmsuniversität Münster (Germany). Since 1982, he has taught Private Law, Comparative Law and Private International Law at Maastricht University, where he obtained the degree of Doctor iuris and was appointed as Professor. He has published extensively on comparative law, private international law, legal education, problems of legal translation, the law of property and nationality law. He is a consortium member of the European Union Democracy Observatory on Citizenship, contributing a number of comparative studies of nationality legislation, including on birthright citizenship. He has worked closely with the Council of Europe in the development of regional standards relating to the regulation of nationality, including in the role of Scientific Expert of the Council of Europe's Group of Specialists on Nationality. He recently prepared a paper on 'Preventing Statelessness among Children: Interpreting Articles 1-4 of the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness and Relevant International Human Rights Norms' for UNHCR, helping to guide an Expert Meeting on the same question in

ALICE EDWARDS is the Senior Legal Coordinator and Chief of the Protection Policy and Legal Advice Section at UNHCR in Geneva, where she is responsible *inter alia* for shaping UNHCR's doctrinal positions, as well as standard-setting, litigation, research, and human rights liaison. She was previously on the law faculties of the universities of Oxford and Nottingham (2006–10); was the expert adviser to the CEDAW Committee on questions of displacement and statelessness; and the lead amicus in a brief to the US Supreme Court on statelessness (*Flores-Villar v. United States of America*, 2010). She has taught statelessness courses at masters level and has delivered short courses on the subject for



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

ix

practitioners. In 2010, she was awarded a British Academy Small Grant to pursue research into statelessness questions. Her other publications include *Human Security and Non-Citizens: Law, Policy and International Affairs* (Cambridge University Press, 2010) and *Violence against Women under International Human Rights Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2011), work related to which she was awarded the Audre Rapoport Prize for Scholarship on the Human Rights of Women. She currently enjoys the privileges of being Research Associate at the University of Oxford's Refugee Studies Centre, Research Fellow of St Anne's College, Oxford and Fellow of Nottingham's Human Rights Law Centre. She holds a B.A, LL.B (Hons) from the University of Tasmania, an LL.M (Distinction) in Public International Law from the University of Nottingham, and Ph.D. from the Australian National University, studying under an Australian Postgraduate Award.

MATTHEW J. GIBNEY is University Reader in Politics and Forced Migration and Fellow of Linacre College, Oxford. He is a political scientist who has written widely on issues relating to refugees, migration control, citizenship and deportation from the perspectives of normative political theory and comparative politics. He is a graduate of Monash University in Melbourne, Australia and completed an M.Phil. and a Ph.D. at Cambridge University, where he was a Commonwealth Scholar. He has taught politics at the universities of Monash, Cambridge, Toronto and Harvard. His work has been published in the *American Political Science Review*, the *Georgetown Immigration Law Journal*, *Government and Opposition* and a range of other journals.

RADHA GOVIL works as a Legal Officer in UNHCR's Division of International Protection, focusing on issues relating to nationality and statelessness. She holds an LL.B. and a BA from the University of Melbourne and a Master's in Public International Law from the London School of Economics and Political Science. Radha has led the work of the Statelessness Unit on addressing gender discrimination in nationality laws. She has conducted participatory discussions with women and their families affected by such discrimination and has helped coordinate the efforts of UN Agencies and NGOs to launch an International Campaign to End Gender Discrimination in Nationality Laws in 2014.

GABOR GYULAI works as Refugee Programme Coordinator and trainer at the Hungarian Helsinki Committee, in Budapest. He has in recent years done extensive research and published studies on protection mechanisms



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-03244-6 - Nationality and Statelessness Under International Law Edited by Alice Edwards and Laura Van Waas Frontmatter More information

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

available for stateless persons and the dimensions of populations affected by statelessness in several European countries and the USA. He is a regular lecturer and trainer on statelessness at various international and national courses on refugee law or international protection. He participates in a global expert consultation process on statelessness under the auspices of the UNHCR and collaborates with the Open Society Justice Initiative as a consultant on statelessness-related issues.

NIAMH LENAGH-MAGUIRE (BA, LL.B. (Hons) (ANU)) is Counsel in the Office of General Counsel at the Australian Government Solicitor. She is an SJD candidate at the Australian National University College of Law, where her research focuses on federalism, citizenship and constitutions.

MARK MANLY is Head of the Statelessness Unit within the Division of International Protection at UNHCR in Geneva. He previously worked as a legal officer in the same unit. Upon joining UNHCR, he served as a training officer with the Costa Rica-based Regional Legal Unit from 2001 to 2003 and then as a UNHCR Protection Officer in Colombia until 2006. Mark has also worked as a human rights observer with the UN Human Rights Verification Mission in Guatemala from 1995 to 1998 and in 2000 served as human rights officer in the OSCE Mission in Kosovo. Mark holds an LL.M. in International Human Rights Law from Essex University.

SOPHIE NONNENMACHER is a migration policy specialist. She has been working for the IOM since 2000 on labour migration issues at its headquarters in Geneva, Switzerland. At the end of 2009, she moved to the IOM Bangkok Regional Office to take up the position of Head of the Regional Counter-trafficking Unit for South East Asia. In 2011, Ms. Nonnenmacher assumed the position of Senior Regional Policy & Liaison Officer for Asia and Pacific. She specializes in various aspects of international migration, developing additional expertise on workers' mobility as manifested in GATSMode 4 and other regional free trade arrangements, on the nexus between migration and development as well as on irregular migration, human trafficking and smuggling issues. In her present capacity, she is developing regional strategies and supporting the development of migration policy in the region. Ms. Nonnenmacher holds Masters' degrees in International Cooperation and Development from the Department of Political Science, University of Paris 1 (Sorbonne) and in Social Anthropology from the School of Higher Studies in Social Sciences, Paris.



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

хi

KIM RUBENSTEIN is Professor and Director of the Centre for International and Public Law (CIPL) in the ANU College of Law, Australian National University. Kim's current research projects are at the cutting edge of the intersection between public and international law as the co-series editor of the Cambridge University Press five-volume series Connecting International with Public Law. Her public law work spans constitutional and administrative law, and also includes her expertise in citizenship law and her international law work concentrates on the status of nationality. Kim is a graduate of the University of Melbourne and Harvard Law School where the Sir Robert Menzies Scholarship to Harvard, a Fulbright postgraduate award, and a Queen Elizabeth Jubilee Trust award supported her. In addition to her scholarly work, Kim has contributed to the greater community through media work and public community education. She was a member of the Independent Committee appointed by the Minister for Immigration and Citizenship to review the Australian Citizenship Test in 2008 and she has appeared three times in the High Court of Australia on citizenship matters, with her work cited in various judgments of the court.

LAURA VAN WAAS is Senior Researcher and Manager of the Statelessness Programme, an initiative of Tilburg Law School in the Netherlands, which is dedicated to research, training and outreach on statelessness and related issues. Among the Statelessness Programme's current work is a detailed study of statelessness in the Middle East, in collaboration with the Open Society Justice Initiative and a research project aiming to map the link between statelessness and human trafficking, funded by the US Department of State Bureau for Population, Refugees and Migration. Laura's doctoral thesis, entitled Nationality Matters - Statelessness under International Law (Intersentia, 2008), is an in-depth analysis of the international normative framework relating to statelessness. After gaining her Ph.D., Laura was employed as an expert by UNHCR to work on several successive statelessness projects. She has drafted public information materials, developed training programmes and delivered training on statelessness. She has undertaken comparative research of statelessness situations in the Middle East and North Africa as well as South East Asia. While based in UNHCR's Beirut and Bangkok offices respectively for these projects, Laura helped the agency to build capacity to address statelessness by providing further training and directly advising on strategy development. In 2011, she developed a module on Statelessness for the University of Oxford's Refugee Studies Centre's International Summer



xii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

School in Forced Migration. She has also conducted research on behalf of Plan International on the link between irregular migration, birth registration and statelessness.

INETA ZIEMELE has been Judge at the European Court of Human Rights since 2005 and Professor of International Law and Human Rights at the Riga Graduate School of Law, Latvia. She holds a Ph.D. from the University of Cambridge, an M.I.L. degree from the University of Lund and a law degree from the University of Latvia. She is a member of the Executive Board of the European Society of International Law and an expert on the Constitutional Law Committee created by the President of the Republic of Latvia. She is the founding editor of the Baltic Yearbook of International Law and was Editor-in-Chief from 2001 to 2005. She has worked for the Parliament of Latvia, the Prime Minister's Office and the Council of Europe. Her publications include *State Continuity and Nationality: The Baltic States and Russia* (Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 2005).



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project started when I was at the University of Oxford, as Lecturer in International Human Rights and Refugee Law at the Refugee Studies Centre. I would like to thank the British Academy for a small grant which prompted the exploration of some of the issues in this publication, and to the Oppenheimer Fund for some seed funding into research assistance. Thank you to Marina Sharpe for being my research assistant in the early stages of this project and for her immaculate collection and filing of materials on nationality and statelessness. I need to thank Laura, my co-editor, for coming to the rescue of this project when I moved to take up my current position at UNHCR in Geneva as Senior Legal Coordinator and Chief of the Protection Policy and Legal Advice section. The project has been an immensely enjoyable one, and it would not have happened without her. A great deal of debt is owed to the excellent contributions and the amazing patience of our many contributors. Thanks also to Finola O'Sullivan, Elizabeth Spicer and the rest of the team at Cambridge University Press for their positive support of this project and its evolution; as well as the Statelessness Unit at UNHCR, in particular Mark Manly for his openness to new arguments in the statelessness area and keen eye for errors(!). I am also particularly pleased that all of our royalties from this book will help support statelessness projects around the world.

A.E

From first hearing of Alice's plans for this edited collection, I was impatient to see and use the finished product, since it would engage prominent international experts to jointly fill a significant gap in the literature on statelessness. My own contribution was initially to be limited to a chapter on the UN statelessness conventions, which I studied closely in the context of my doctoral research. To my delight, however, I had the opportunity to become more closely involved in the project and join Alice as co-editor. I have learned a great deal from her over the course of this collaboration and have also cherished the opportunity to delve into detailed

xiii



xiv

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

nitty-gritty and enthusiastic discussions with her on the state of statelessness law today. It has been a great pleasure to work together and I hope this will not be the last chance to do so. I would also like to thank Monica Neal for willingly giving up so much of her time alongside her studies to assist with editing the contributions in this volume. A big thank you is also due to my colleagues at the Statelessness Programme at Tilburg Law School, whose enthusiasm for exploring and understanding statelessness knows no bounds and whose sense of humour is unmatchable. And to Mark and Dylan – thank you for never letting a day pass without a good dose of grinning and giggles, and for being such great motivational coaches for the whole Statelessness Programme team.

Laura



ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

1930 Hague Convention League of Nations Convention on

Certain Questions Relating to the Conflict of Nationality Laws 1930

1951 Convention or 1951 Refugee Convention relating to the Status of

Convention Refugees 1951

1954 Convention or 1954 Convention relating to the Status of

Statelessness Convention Stateless Persons 1954

1961 Convention or 1961 Convention on the Reduction of

Statelessness Convention Statelessness 1961

1967 Protocol Protocol relating to the Status of

Refugees 1967

ACHPR or African Charter African Charter on Human and

Peoples' Rights 1981

ACHR American Convention on

Human Rights

ACRWC or African Child Rights African Charter on the Rights and

Charter Welfare of the Child 1990

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of

All Forms of Discrimination against

Women 1979

CEDAW Committee Committee on the Elimination of

Discrimination against Women

Children's Committee Committee on the Rights of the Child

CHR Commission on Human Rights

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union

CRC Convention on the Rights of the

Child 1989

CRPD Committee on the Rights of Persons

with Disabilities

ECHR European Convention on the

Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 1950

XV



More information

XVI ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ECmHR European Commission on Human Rights
ECN European Convention on Nationality 1997

ECOSOC Economic and Social Council
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
ExCom Executive Committee of the High
Commissioner for Refugees Program

Commissioner for Kerugees I I

HRC Human Rights Committee

I-ACmHR Inter-American Commission of Human

Rights

I-ACtHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and

Political Rights 1966

ICCS International Commission on Civil Status

ICERD International Convention on the

Elimination of All Forms of Racial

Discrimination 1965

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic,

Social and Cultural Rights 1966

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICRMW International Convention on the Protection

of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and

Members of their Families 1990

ICRPD International Convention on the Rights of

Persons with Disabilities 2006

 ILC
 International Law Commission

 ILO
 International Labour Organization

 IOM
 International Organization for Migration

 MWC
 Committee on the Rights of Migrant

Workers and Members of their Families

NGO Non-governmental organization
OHCHR Office of the United Nations High
Commissioner for Human Rights

OSCE Organization for Security and

Co-operation in Europe

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice
PRWA or Protocol on the Rights of Protocol to the African Charter on Human

Women in Africa and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of

Women 2000

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human

Rights 1948

UNCAT United Nations Convention against Torture

and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading

Treatment or Punishment 1984



ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS XVII

UNGA United Nations General Assembly

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNRWA United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the

Near East

UPR Universal Periodic Review