Ibn Gabirol’s Theology of Desire

Drawing on Arabic passages from Ibn Gabirol’s original Fons Vitae text and highlighting philosophical insights from his Hebrew poetry, Sarah Pessin develops a Theology of Desire at the heart of Ibn Gabirol’s eleventh-century cosmo-ontology.

She challenges centuries of received scholarship on his work, including his so-called Doctrine of Divine Will. Pessin rejects voluntarist readings of the Fons Vitae as opposing divine emanation. She also emphasizes Pseudo-Empedoclean notions of Divine Desire and Grounding Element alongside Ibn Gabirol’s use of a particularly Neoplatonic method with apophatic (and what she terms “doubly apophatic”) implications. In this way, Pessin reads claims about matter as insights about love, desire, the human relation to goodness, wisdom and God, and the receptive, dependent, and fragile nature of human being. Pessin reenvisions the entire spirit of Ibn Gabirol’s philosophy, moving us from a set of doctrines to a fluid inquiry into the nature of God and human being – and the bond between God and human being in desire.

Sarah Pessin is Associate Professor of Philosophy and the Emil and Eva Hecht Chair in Judaic Studies at the University of Denver. She works on Neoplatonisms (Greek, Jewish, Islamic, and Christian), medieval philosophy, modern Jewish philosophy, and comparative philosophies of religion. She has presented and published widely, including contributions to The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Jewish Philosophy, the Routledge Companion to Islamic Philosophy, The Cambridge History of Medieval Philosophy, the Blackwell History of Philosophy in the Middle Ages, the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, and the Journal of the History of Philosophy. Her research interests include the phenomenology of receptivity, the nature of apophatic discourse, methodologies for the study of intercultural texts, and Jewish theologies of exile.
Ibn Gabirol’s Theology of Desire

*Matter and Method in Jewish Medieval Neoplatonism*

SARAH PESSION
University of Denver
This book is dedicated to my father (למרותי) and grandfather (למרותי).
Contents

List of Figures  page xiii

1. Introduction  1
   1.1 Discovering Ibn Gabirol: The Aims and Goals of This Project  1
   1.2 Chapter Guide  4

2. Text in Context  9
   2.1 First Unfoldings  9
   2.2 Background  11
   2.3 Desire and Love: Terminological Preamble I  15
      2.3.1 Desire as God-Born and God-Directed  16
      2.3.2 Desire as Love  16
   2.4 From Divine Will to Divine-Îrâda-as-Desire: Terminological
      Preamble II  20
   2.5 From Prime Matter to Grounding Element: Terminological
      Preamble III  22
      2.5.1 Matter Terminology in Ibn Gabirol’s Milieu  22
      2.5.2 Ibn Gabirol’s al-‘unṣur al-awwal  23

3. From Human Being to Discourse on Matter? The Threefold
   Quest for Wisdom, Goodness, and God – and the Root of Life in
   Desire  28
   3.1 The Epistemological, Ethical, and Theological Context  28
      3.1.1 The Epistemological Call  29
      3.1.2 The Ethico-Theological Call  31
   3.2 Metaphysics of Matter and Desire at the Core of All  32
   3.3 Positive Valuations of Matter: A Reversal of Intuitions  36

4. Root Desire and the Pseudo-Empedoclean Grounding Element as
   Love  41
   4.1 Desire at the Core of Being  42
CONTENTS

4.2 Love Makes the World Go Round: Some Greek and Arabic Sources
   4.2.1 Aristotle 43
   4.2.2 The *Theology of Aristotle* 43
   4.2.3 Avicenna’s "Risālah fiʾl-ʾishq" 44
   4.2.4 Islamic and Jewish Neoplatonized Aristotelianism 45

4.3 A Pseudo-Empedoclean Love Story: Unspecified Being, Matter over Form, and the Kernel of Desire 46

4.4 In the Illuminating Shadow: Ibn Gabirol’s Pseudo-Empedoclean Revision of the Neoplatonic Return 51

5. From Divine Will to Divine Irāḍa: On the Mistaken Scholarly Rejection of Ibn Gabirol’s Emanationism
   5.0 “Divine Will” and the Mistaken Scholarly Rejection of Ibn Gabirol’s Emanationism 53
   5.1 Trying to Make Sense of Scholarship on Ibn Gabirol’s So-Called Anti-Emanation Voluntarism: The Rejection of Divine Emanation in a Limited Emanation Framework? 54
   5.2 Problems with the Limited Emanation Framework Reading: Free Choice, Mediated versus Unmediated Will, and Three Varieties of Voluntarism 56
   5.3 Divine Will versus Divine Emanation? Casting More Doubt on the Canonical Voluntarist Reading of Ibn Gabirol 58
   5.4 Rethinking Will and Emanation 59
   5.4.1 Emanation and Will I: Since When Does “Divine Will” Mean “No Divine Emanation” in a Neoplatonic Context? (Considering Divine Will in Plotinus and the *Theology of Aristotle*) 60
   5.4.2 Emanation and Will II: Is the Term “Will” Leading Some to Mistaken Conclusions? (Considering the Possibility of Augustinian Overtones) 60
   5.5 Rethinking “Intermediating between the Extremes”: Two Competing Views 61
   5.5.1 Intermediation I: Brunner’s Horizontal Intuitions, Divine Will in Opposition to Divine Emanation, and an Occasionalist God? 62
   5.5.2 Intermediation II: On the Vertical Image of Intermediation in Ibn Gabirol – Toward a New Reading of Divine Irāḍa as Divine Emanation 64

6. Irāḍic Unfoldings: Ibn Gabirol’s Hylomorphic Emanationism and the Neoplatonic Tripart Analysis
   6.0 Rereading Ibn Gabirol: Divine Irāḍa as Emanation and the Theology of Desire 66
CONTENTS

6.1 The Vertical Imagery of Matter and Form in the Theology of Desire: On the Correct Interpretation of the Divine Irāda’s “Connecting” Intermediation 67

6.2 “Intermediary between the Extremes” as Joining, and Joining as the Vertical Emanation Counterpart of Neoplatonic Return 69

6.3 Rethinking “Matter+Form Composition” and the Intermediation of Divine Irāda as the Downward Procession of Emanation 72

6.4 “Matter,” “Matter+Form,” and “Form”: Ibn Gabirol’s Tripart Hylomorphic Method and Neoplatonic Tripart Analysis 74

6.5 The Theology of Desire Revisited: Ibn Gabirol’s Revised Great Chain of Being and Neoplatonic Tripart Analysis 77

6.6 The Irādic/Erotic Unfolding: Love at the Root of Being 87

6.7 Ibn Gabirol’s Cosmo-Ontology (Initial Conclusions): Great Chain of Being + Pseudo-Empedocles + Neoplatonic Tripart Analysis 87

7. Matter Revisited 91

7.1 Matter as River 91

7.2 Matter as Born of God’s Essence 92

7.3 Matter as Foundation and Divine Throne 93

7.4 Matter as Essence and Unifier: Layers of Matter, Genus Generalissimum, Sustainer of Diversity, and Giver of Name 94

7.4.1 Layers of Matter 95

7.4.2 Essence 97

7.4.3 Genus, Genus Generalissimum, and Name-Giver 98

7.4.4 Unifier 99

7.5 Matter as the Preexistent Per Se Existens: Contra Gundissalinus, Contra Schlanger 100

7.5.1 Gundissalinus’ Erasure of “Matter Per Se”: Obscuring Matter as Per Se Existens from the Arabic Text to the Latin Translation 102

7.5.2 Schlanger’s Erasure of “Matter Per Se”: Losing Pseudo-Empedocles to Philo? 104

7.6 Revisiting “Universal Hylomorphism” and a Call to Charitable Reading: On the Limiting Lenses of Augustine and Aquinas 106

7.7 Creation as the Splitting of the Nothing 113

7.8 Call to Selfhood 116

8. Neoplatonic Cosmo-Ontology as Apophatic Response and as Prescription for Human Living (Methodological Reappraisal I) 118

8.0 Moving to Questions of Method: An Overview 118
CONTENTS

8.1 Emanation Reconsidered: From “Doctrine” to Apophatic Response (on the Paradox of Divine Unity and the Neoplatonic Tripart Analysis) 119
8.2 Ibn Gabirol’s Neoplatonic Tripart Analysis: Making Sense of the “Triune” Theology of Divine Essence, Divine Irāda, and Divine Wisdom 123
  8.2.1 Divine Essence: God as Apophatically Seen from the Perspective of Remaining 125
  8.2.2 Divine Irāda: God as Apophatically Seen from the Perspective of Procession 125
  8.2.3 Divine Wisdom (or Word): God as Apophatically Seen from the Perspective of Reversion 128
  8.2.4 From Confusion to Tripart Apophasis: Conclusions 130
8.3 On the “Doubly Apophatic”: Neoplatonic Cosmo-Ontology as Dual Discourse on God and Human Being 131
8.4 From Apophasis to Human Prescription 133
8.5 Dependence, Receptivity, and Fragility: Orientations for Human Being (from Descriptions of Matter to Prescriptions for Living, and Experiencing the Self Qua Matter) 135
  8.5.1 From Layers of Matter to Human Dependence 136
  8.5.2 From Matter to Human Receptivity and Fragility 136

9. Transcendental Grounding, Mythopoetic and Symbolic Transformation, and the Creation of New Worlds with Words (Methodological Reappraisal II) 140
  9.1 On What Not to Do: Failures in Methodological Approaches to Neoplatonic Cosmo-Ontology (or, Finding Invisible Kansas) 141
  9.2 Map Is Not Territory: A Double Insight for Interpreting Neoplatonic Cosmo-Ontology (or, There Is No Invisible Kansas) 147
  9.3 On Human Being: Neoplatonic Cosmo-Ontology as Transcendental Grounding 149
  9.4 Human Being, Human Transformation: Perspectives on Imagination, Myth, Exegesis, Sound-Meaning, Meditation, and Beyond 150
  9.5 Writing as Creation: Cosmo-Ontology as Creating Worlds with Words 156

10. Embroidering the Hidden 160
  10.1 Embroidering the Hidden I: Rethinking Creation 162
  10.2 Embroidering the Hidden II: Rethinking Metaphysics (Creation of Worlds with Words): A Closing Word on Cosmo-Ontology 162
## CONTENTS

*Appendix. Matter as God-Born Cradle of Life: A Sampling of Matter Imagery in Ibn Gabirol’s Milieu*  
165

A1 Ibn Gabirol’s Neoplatonic Hylomorphism: Plato’s Participation Revised  
165
A2 Plato and Pythagoreanism: From Timaean Receptacle as Chaos to Nicomachus’ Receptacle as Divine Ground and Source  
166
A3 Ibn Gabirol’s Neoplatonic Hylomorphism: Aristotelian Substance Revised (and the Possibility of a Pseudo-Empedocles–Aristotle link)  
168
A4 Matter in Aristotle  
170
A5 Plotinus and Intelligible Matter  
172
A6 Proclus’ *Elements of Theology*, the *Kalām fī maḥḍ al-ḥa’ir*, and the *Liber De Causis*  
173
A7 First Matter: “Ibn Ḥasday’s Neoplatonist,” Isaac Israeli, and the *Longer Theology of Aristotle*  
175
A8 The Ismā’īlī Context: Ḵūnī and Qadar  
178
A9 Matter in the *Ikhwān* Tradition  
180
A10 Mu’tazilites: al-Ma’dūm as a Something  
182
A11 Subtle Material Prophetic Intermediaries: Sa’adya’s “2nd Air,” Judah HaLevi’s *anr ilāhī*  
182
A12 Islamic and Jewish Pseudo-Empedoclean Trends  
183
A13 Suhrawardi: Love versus Dominance, Love as Humility  
185
A14 Kernels and Shells  
185
A15 “From One Must Come Two” as “From One Must Come One” (Considering Ibn Gabirol in the Context of Greek Limit/Limitlessness Philosophies)  
186

### Notes

189

### Bibliography

1. Ibn Gabirol Texts  
233
2. *Fons Vitae* Twelfth-Century Latin Translation (and Translations of the Latin Translation)  
233
3. *Fons Vitae* Thirteenth-Century Hebrew Translation (and Translations of the Hebrew Translation)  
234
4. *The Choice of Pearls (Mivḥar ha-Penīnīm)*  
234
5. *Book of the Improvement of the Moral Qualities of the Soul*  
235
6. Hebrew Poetry Editions  
235
II. Ancient and Medieval Texts (other than Ibn Gabirol)  
235
III. Main Bibliography (contains materials from Bibliography Section I, selected materials from Bibliography Section II, as well as Secondary Sources)  
241
CONTENTS

Index 263
1. Index of Concepts (Partial List) 263
2. Index of Source References (Partial List) 265
3. References to Ibn Gabirol’s Poetry, Liturgy, and Aphorisms 266
4. Index of Names, Ancient-Medieval (Partial List) 266
5. Index of Names, Modern-Contemporary (Partial List) 267
6. Index of Figures 269
List of Figures

3.1 Plotinus’ Cosmo-Ontology  
3.2 Jewish Neoplatonic Modification of Plotinian Cosmo-Ontology  
3.3 Ibn Gabirol’s Revised Neoplatonic Cosmo-Ontology  
3.4 Reversing Intuitions: Matter’s Purity, Form’s Divisions  
3.5 Matter over Form: Desire Precedes Existence  
3.6 On the “Divine Essence–Matter” Link  
4.1 Comparing the Hierarchies of Plotinus and Ibn Gabirol  
4.2 Ps. Empedoclean Love as Kernel and Strife as Shell  
5.1 Brunner’s “Horizontal Joining” of Matter to Form in the *Fons Vitae*  
6.1 Ibn Gabirol’s Hylomorphic Great Chain of Being  
9.1 Ibn Gabirol’s “Cosmic Map”