

State and Nation Making in Latin America and Spain

State building as the development of institutional capacity has become a central topic of discussion in twenty-first-century social science. Many studies have shown that public institutions are an important (some would argue the most important) determinant of long-term rates of economic growth. In order to understand the difficulties and pitfalls of state building in the contemporary world, it is necessary to analyze previous efforts to consolidate institutional capacity in conflictive contexts. The present book provides a comprehensive analysis of the process of state and nation building in Latin America and Spain from independence to the 1930s. The book examines how Latin American countries and Spain tried to build modern and efficient state institutions for more than a century – without much success.

The chapters discuss key processes and challenges of state building. To what extent do historical legacies determine the capacity and reach of states? What are the obstacles to and paths toward the effective consolidation of public authority? How can states best design and create the institutions meant to provide the basic services now associated with citizenship? How can we put together notions of community that include diverse groups and cultures within a single identity, while also respecting the integrity of particular traditions? The Spanish and Latin American experience of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was arguably the first regional stage on which those organizational and political dilemmas that still haunt contemporary societies were faced. This book provides an unprecedented perspective on historical developments by closely following their connection to contemporary outcomes of state- and nation-building projects.

Miguel A. Centeno is Chair of the Sociology Department and professor of sociology and international affairs at Princeton University.

Agustin E. Ferraro is Professor of political science and public administration at the University of Salamanca, Spain.

CAMBRIDGE



State and Nation Making in Latin America and Spain

Republics of the Possible

Edited by
MIGUEL A. CENTENO
Princeton University

AGUSTIN E. FERRARO University of Salamanca



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02986-6 - State and Nation Making in Latin America and Spain: Republics of the Possible Edited by Miguel A. Centeno and Agustin E. Ferraro

Frontmatter

More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107029866

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

State and nation making in Latin America and Spain: republics of the possible / [edited by] Miguel A. Centeno, Princeton University, Agustin E. Ferraro, University of Salamanca.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02986-6

Nation-building – Latin America.
 Nation-building – Spain. I. Centeno,
 Miguel Angel, 1957 – editor of compilation. II. Ferraro, Agustin, editor of compilation.
 JL966.8727 2013

320.9809'034-dc23 2012031600

ISBN 978-1-107-02986-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Guillermo O'Donnell (1936-2011)

CAMBRIDGE



Contents

List of Contributors		page ix
Prej	face	xi
PAR	T I: INTRODUCTION	
Ι.	Republics of the Possible: State Building in Latin America and Spain by Miguel A. Centeno and Agustin E. Ferraro	3
2.	The Construction of National States in Latin America, 1820–1890 by Frank Safford	25
3.	State Building in Western Europe and the Americas in the Long Nineteenth Century: Some Preliminary Considerations by Wolfgang Knöbl	56
PAR	T II: TERRITORIAL AND ECONOMIC POWER	
4.	The State and Development under the Brazilian Monarchy, 1822–1889 by Jeffrey D. Needell	79
5.	The Brazilian Federal State in the Old Republic (1889–1930): Did Regime Change Make a Difference? by Joseph L. Love	100
6.	The Mexican State, Porfirian and Revolutionary, 1876–1930 by Alan Knight	116
7.	Nicaragua: The Difficult Creation of a Sovereign State by Salvador Martí Puig	139
8.	Friends' Tax: Patronage, Fiscality, and State Building in Argentina and Spain by Claudia E. Herrera and Agustin E. Ferrara	0 157
PAR	T III: INFRASTRUCTURAL POWER	
9.	Ideological Pragmatism and Nonpartisan Expertise in Nineteenth-Century Chile: Andrés Bello's Contribution to State and Nation Building <i>by Iván Jaksić</i>	183

vii



viii		Contents
10.	Militarization without Bureaucratization in Central America by James Mahoney	203
II.	Between Empleomanía and the Common Good: Expert Bureaucracies in Argentina (1870–1930) by Ricardo D. Salvatore	225
12.	Elite Preferences, Administrative Institutions, and Educational Development during Peru's Aristocratic Republic (1895–1919) by Hillel D. Soifer	247
PAR	T IV: SYMBOLIC POWER AND LEGITIMACY	
13.	Liberalism in the Spanish American World, 1808–1825 by Roberto Breña	271
14.	Visions of the National: Natural Endowments, Futures, and the Evils of Men <i>by Fernando López-Alves</i>	282
15.	Spanish National Identity in the Age of Nationalisms by José Álvarez Junco	307
16.	Census Taking and Nation Making in Nineteenth-Century Latin America by Mara Loveman	329
17.	Citizens before the Law: The Role of Courts in Postindependence State Building in Spanish America	
	by Sarah C. Chambers	356
18.	Envisioning the Nation: The Mid-Nineteenth-Century Colombian Chorographic Commission by Nancy P. Appelbaum	375
PAR	T V: CONCLUSION	
19.	Paper Leviathans: Historical Legacies and State Strength in Contemporary Latin America and Spain by Miguel A. Centeno	
	and Agustin E. Ferraro	399
Bibliography		417
Index		455



Contributors

Nancy P. Appelbaum, State University of New York Roberto Breña, Colegio de México Miguel A. Centeno, Princeton University Sarah C. Chambers, University of Minnesota Agustin E. Ferraro, University of Salamanca Claudia E. Herrera, National University of Tucumán Iván Jaksić, Stanford University José Álvarez Junco, Complutense University of Madrid Alan Knight, University of Oxford Wolfgang Knöbl, University of Göttingen Fernando López-Alves, University of California Joseph L. Love, University of Illinois Mara Loveman, University of Wisconsin-Madison James Mahoney, Northwestern University Jeffrey D. Needell, University of Florida Salvador Martí Puig, University of Salamanca Frank Safford, Northwestern University Ricardo D. Salvatore, Torcuato Di Tella University Hillel D. Soifer, Temple University

ix

CAMBRIDGE



Preface

This book has been five years in the making. It originated with a sabbatical visit of Miguel A. Centeno to the University of Salamanca, where a years-long conversation with Agustin E. Ferraro began. From the first moment, we wondered why it was that the Latin American and Spanish states received such relatively small amounts of attention in the academic literature. Obviously, the experiences with authoritarian regimes and the transitions to democracy had been exhaustively discussed, but what about the more protean faces of democratic states: post offices, schools, police stations, census campaigns, and others? We came to the conclusion that the field needed an account of how the "state physiology" of these countries was formed, and we saw that many parallels in their historical paths made a comparative project between Spain and the Latin American countries viable and useful.

Whatever one's opinion regarding the depth and breadth of state involvement in daily life, there is no denying that the alternative to the state – the absence of an institutional organization of public life – will be rarely (if ever) a Rousseauian paradise. The Republic can be unjust and even despicable at times, but there seems to be no better alternative to having one. As we make clear in the following pages, we believe that in general, Latin America needs more state rather than less, and that Spain's experience shows that without strong, stable, and efficient public institutions, peace, justice, and the possibility of plenty become unattainable. We need to debate what states can and should do and how they should do it. Philosophical arguments over the issue of whether we need institutionalized political authority at all, however, are a luxury no one in the region can afford.

Our inspiration came essentially from two authors for whom we have great admiration and respect. The first is Eugen Weber. It says something about Weber that he could cover all the topics broached in his book *Peasants into Frenchmen* without the aid of twenty contributors, and that he could do so in much better prose than we could ever aspire to. Guillermo O'Donnell was invited to give the keynote to our first conference, and his work was a constant and fundamental source of inspiration for the whole project. Health problems

хi



xii Preface

made it impossible for him to come and then led to his death as the book was being reviewed. All we can hope is that Guillermo would have liked the result, but we also know that he would have made it better.

We were very lucky to find such an outstanding group of collaborators. Anyone who has ever planned a series of conferences knows how difficult it can be to identify attendees and then count on them to produce solid scholarship and generous discussion. We received some no's to our initial queries, but mostly yeses and were delighted when practically everyone showed up at Princeton in the fall of 2009. By this time, the papers were already well developed and the meeting began to progress as much more of a bottom-up enterprise than we had hoped. The result was a much better conference than we could have imagined and much enthusiasm for a second meeting in Salamanca in 2011. Once again, we were very fortunate in the fact that most authors were able to attend the second conference, and in the quality of the conversations in one of the world's most beautiful cities. The contributors once again demonstrated great patience as we asked for further and further revisions and additions to the chapters and tried to find a publisher for a book that was quite long by today's standards.

It was again our extraordinary good luck to find Lew Bateman at Cambridge University Press. He has been a wonderful editor: supportive and insightful, firm and clear about the work that had to be done. The staff at Cambridge University Press and the associated indexing and copyediting teams have been outstanding, and we could not have asked for more. Many, many thanks to the Biblioteca Nacional de Colombia for permission to reproduce several of the watercolors created by the Chorographic Commission for its fascinating survey of Colombia in the nineteenth century. In preparing the conference at Princeton we had the very able and kind support of Jayne Bialkowski and also lots of help from Rosalia Rivera and Jillian Lenihan Halbe. For the conference in Salamanca we could count on the invaluable assistance of our young colleagues Inés Amézaga and María del Mar Rosón. Rachael Ferguson and Jessica Yiu helped us with the final preparation of the manuscript, and they allowed us to send the manuscript out in a reasonable time and manner and with very few mistakes, typos, and missing references.

Our home institutions have served as wonderful and generous hosts and deserve our heartfelt thanks. Financial support for the project came from Princeton University's Program in Latin American Studies and from the Princeton Institute for International and Regional Studies. We particularly wish to thank the director of the program in Latin American Studies, Rubén Gallo, for being always very helpful and very supportive of the project. The Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation provided very generous funding for the meeting in Salamanca.

As always, our families deserve our ever-larger thanks for allowing us the luxury of spending so much time on an era so long ago and a place so far away. Deborah Kaple, Maya Centeno, and Alex Centeno have certainly heard too much about the state and the nineteenth century over the past few years and



Preface xiii

have been patient with too many absences and distractions. The connection of Rachel Straus to some of the times and places where the project was carried out made it still more memorable and particularly dear to one of the editors. Sarah Ferraro and Ana Ferraro were extremely patient and supportive while having to bear still more absences from their father.