

Inside African Anthropology

Inside African Anthropology offers an incisive biography of the life and work of South Africa's foremost social anthropologist, Monica Hunter Wilson. By exploring her main fieldwork and intellectual projects in southern Africa between the 1920s and 1960s through a massive personal archive, the book offers insights into the personal and intellectual life of a leading African anthropologist. Beginning with her origins in the remote Eastern Cape, the authors follow Wilson to Cambridge University and back into the field among the Pondo of South Africa, where her studies resulted in her 1936 book Reaction to Conquest. Her fieldwork focus then shifted to Tanzania, where she teamed up with her husband, Godfrey Wilson. She later returned to South Africa to begin her teaching career at Fort Hare University and record her Tanzanian research. In the 1960s, Wilson embarked on a new urban ethnography with a young South African anthropologist, Archie Mafeje, one of the many black scholars she trained. This study also provides a meticulously researched exploration of the indispensable contributions of African research assistants and co-researchers to the production of this famous woman scholar's cultural knowledge about mid-twentiethcentury Africa.

Andrew Bank is Associate Professor and head of the History Department at the University of the Western Cape, South Africa. He has been commissioning editor of the journal *Kronos: Southern African Histories* since 2001 and is a member of the editorial board for the *South African Historical Journal*.

Leslie J. Bank is Professor of Social Anthropology and Director of the Institute of Social and Economic Research at the University of Fort Hare, South Africa. He is the author of *Home Spaces, Street Styles: Contesting Power and Identity in a South African City* (2011). He is a member of the editorial board of the International Africa Institute's journal, *Africa*.





Praise for Inside African Anthropology

'In this provocative engagement with the legacy of Monica Wilson, one of anthropology's most innovative pioneers, the contributors make a strong case for the enduring relevance of her scholarly vision – her insistence on the discipline's relation to history, its unique understanding of ritual and symbolism, its potential for intimate collaborations across the lines of race, culture, status. In reflecting on why it is that subsequent generations have not fully appreciated Wilson's genius, whether in Africa or beyond, the authors provide sharp insight into what her story tells us about how anthropology evaluates its own past, about how it often fails to recognise the many "unofficial" contributors – be they anthropologists or their various "assistants" – who have enriched its intellectual bounty.'

- Jean Comaroff, Harvard University

'This book is highly informative on Monica Hunter Wilson, one of the most significant figures in African anthropology, who at great personal and intellectual costs opted to work from within as apartheid unfolded in South Africa and as some of her contemporaries relocated to universities in the UK and the United States. The book makes a compelling case for Monica Wilson's achievements and stature as a distinguished and highly regarded ethnographer of social change in Africa; one who recognised and invested significantly in ethnography as co-production and co-implication through the close creative relationships she forged and maintained with her *fellow* African assistants in the course of her career as researcher and teacher. It is a major and welcome contribution to African anthropology increasingly in need of new approaches to its intellectual history, ones that show sensitivity towards processes of inter-dependence, intersubjectivity and reflexivity in knowledge production.'

- Francis B. Nyamnjoh, University of Cape Town

'This book is among the best written volumes I have read. It uncovers an "unofficial" history of anthropology from South Africa. Each of the authors shows how anthropology emerges not just as an expression of theory or the genealogy of its leading figures, but through the unfolding of diverse lives. The most important relationships are between Monica and Godfrey Wilson and the black South Africans, Zambians, and Tanganyikans who engaged with them as informants, interpreters and clerks, but also as culture brokers, patrons and intellectuals. Monica's liberalism and the context of segregation were always powerful influences, but as a study of lived relationships, *Inside African Anthropology* reveals the heterogeneity and negotiation in intellectual work.'

- Nancy Jacobs, Brown University

'Combining critical intellectual history with biography, the chapters that make up this fascinating book remind us again that social anthropological scholarship has always been a "co-production", no more so than in South Africa during the period of apartheid. Unusually, among her peers, Monica Wilson always acknowledged this fact – it was intrinsic to her life's work as a scholar and dedicated teacher.'

- Megan Vaughan, Cambridge University





Inside African Anthropology

Monica Wilson and Her Interpreters

Edited by

Andrew Bank

University of the Western Cape, South Africa

Leslie J. Bank

University of Fort Hare, South Africa

International African Institute, London and





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107029385

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Inside African anthropology : Monica Wilson and her interpreters \slash Andrew Bank, Leslie J. Bank.

p. cm. – (The international African library)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-02938-5 (hardback: alk. paper)
1. Wilson, Monica, 1908–1982. 2. Ethnologists – South Africa –
Biography. 3. Women ethnologists – South Africa – Biography. I. Bank,
Andrew. II. Bank, Leslie John. III. Series: International African library.
GN21.W49157 2013
306.092–dc23 [B] 2012051626

ISBN 978-1-107-02938-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	Figures	page ix
	Contributors	xi
	Acknowledgements	xiii
	Introduction	1
	Andrew Bank	
Part 1	Pondoland and the Eastern Cape	
1	Family, Friends and Mentors: Monica Hunter at Lovedale and Cambridge, 1908–1930 Andrew Bank	37
2	The 'Intimate Politics' of Fieldwork: Monica Hunter and Her African Assistants, Pondoland and the Eastern Cape, 1931–1932 Andrew Bank	67
3	City Dreams, Country Magic: Re-Reading Monica Hunter's East London Fieldnotes Leslie J. Bank	95
Part 2	Bunyakyusa	
4	Pondo Pins and Nyakyusa Hammers: Monica and Godfrey in Bunyakyusa Rebecca Marsland	129
5	Working with the Wilsons: The Brief Career of a 'Nyakyusa Clerk' (1910–1938) Sekibakiba Peter Lekgoathi, Timothy Mwakasekele and Andrew Bank	162

vii



viii	Contents	
Part 3	Fort Hare and the University of Cape Town	
6	'Your Intellectual Son': Monica Wilson and Her Students at Fort Hare, 1944–1946 Seán Morrow	193
7	Witchcraft and the Academy: Livingstone Mqotsi, Monica Wilson and the Middledrift Healers, 1945–1957 Leslie J. Bank	224
8	'Speaking from Inside': Archie Mafeje, Monica Wilson and the Co-Production of Langa: A Study of Social Groups in an African Township Andrew Bank with Vuyiswa Swana	253
Part 4	Legacy	
9	'Part of One Whole': Anthropology and History in the Work of Monica Wilson Seán Morrow and Christopher Saunders	283
10	Gleanings and Leavings: Encounters in Hindsight Pamela Reynolds	308
	Bibliography Index	321 347



P.1 The making of a woman anthropologist: the studious

Figures

	young Monica Hunter at work in the Stanley Library,	
	Girton College, c. 1929.	page 35
1.1	A family wedding photograph taken on the front porch	
	of the Hunter home at Lovedale in 1911.	42
1.2	Monica Wilson aged five. The photograph was taken	
	during the family visit to England and Scotland in 1913	,
	a year after the death of her brother.	43
1.3	Monica sent this postcard of Girton to her father with	
	the comment: 'This rather jolly view of "Emily Davis	
	Court" where we play tennis in summer.'	50
1.4	Portrait of Monica dating from her Girton College years	. 51
1.5	Monica's closest friend at Girton College, the Egyptian	
	nationalist Munira Sadek.	53
1.6	Monica's long-standing friend, the Communist Party of	
	South Africa member Eddie Roux in his young days.	54
2.1	The map of Pondoland that featured inside the cover of	
	the first edition of Reaction to Conquest (1936).	74
2.2	One of only two surviving photos of Monica Hunter in	
	the field in Pondoland. Given the vegetation the likely	
	setting is Mbotji and the photographer was therefore	
	probably Michael Geza, her research assistant in Eastern	1
	Pondoland.	76
2.3	This is a recording of one of the many iintsomi (Xhosa	
	traditional stories) written for Monica by Michael Geza.	. 87
2.4	The first of the page-spread features published in the	
	Illustrated London News of 22 August 1936 in	
	'appreciation' of Reaction to Conquest.	89
3.1	East Bank at the outbreak of the Second World War.	103
3.2	Walter Benson Rubusana around the time he worked	
	with Monica Hunter in East Bank.	104
3.3	A selection from the hundreds of fieldnotes that Monica	!
	recorded in East London.	109

ix



X	Figures

P.2	A gifted young fieldworker: Monica's future husband Godfrey during his first five months of fieldwork in	
4.1	Bunyakyusa, September 1934 to January 1935. Settlement of a dispute. The anthropologist (Godfrey	127
7.1	Wilson) is sitting with the court.	131
4.2	Monica Wilson taking notes during an interview in Bunyakyusa, 1955.	132
4.3	Map of the Rungwe District in Bunyakyusa showing the	
4.4	three main fieldwork sites of the Wilsons.	135
4.4	Inside the small house at Isumba that was their	146
4.5	'principal headquarters'. Monica observing Nyakyusa girls washing clothes at the	146
4.5	river.	153
5.1	Leonard Mwaisumo with his mother and two sisters,	133
J.1	1934.	171
P.3	Monica's first graduate student in anthropology, the late	
	Livingstone Mqotsi (1921–2009) in June 2007.	191
6.1	Godfrey Wilson during the war.	196
6.2	Monica and the House Committee of the women's	
	residence Elukhanyisweni (Place of Enlightenment) at	
	Fort Hare Native College, 1946.	205
6.3	Godfrey Pitje in his later years as a lawyer.	215
7.1	African Studies Department faculty and senior students,	222
7.0	Fort Hare, 1946.	233
7.2	A gathering of Eastern Cape healers, East London, 1940.	238
8.1	Archie Mafeje (left) during his years at Healdtown	
	Missionary College where he matriculated in 1954.	260
8.2	Monica (centre) and her colleagues at a	
	Rhodes-Livingstone Institute (RLI) Conference in 1951.	261
8.3	Archie Mafeje (right) in Adderley Street, Cape Town,	
	with fellow UCT student and anti-apartheid political	265
D 4	activist Welsh Makanda, August 1961.	265
P.4	Traces in the landscape: the trading store in Ntibane, Western Pondoland, then and now, the only remaining	
	traces of Monica Wilson's presence in the landscapes of	
	Pondoland and Bunyakyusa.	281
9.1	Monica Wilson with Leonard and Betty Thompson,	201
, · ·	Lake Arrowhead, 1963.	293
10.1	Monica Wilson at Hunterstoun in the years of her	
	retirement.	316
10.2	Monica Wilson on a hike during her retirement, with the	
	Hogsback in the background	310



Contributors

Andrew Bank is an Associate Professor and head of the History Department at the University of the Western Cape. His main publications are The Decline of Urban Slavery at the Cape, 1806 to 1834 (1991); Bushmen in a Victorian World: The Remarkable Story of the Bleek–Lloyd Collection of Bushman Folklore (2006) and (with Keith Dietrich) An Eloquent Picture Gallery: The South African Portrait Photographs of Gustav Theodor Fritsch, 1863–1865 (2008). He is also the commissioning editor of Kronos: Southern African Histories.

Leslie J. Bank is Professor and Director of the Fort Hare Institute of Social and Economic Research at the University of Fort Hare in South Africa. He is the current president of the Anthropology Southern Africa Association and has published widely in the field of anthropology and development in southern Africa. His recent publications include *Home Spaces, Street Styles: Contesting Power and Identity in a South African City* (2011), a major restudy of a classic trilogy in the urban anthropology in South Africa.

Sekibakiba Peter Lekgoathi is an Associate Professor in the Department of History at Wits University. He teaches African, American and African American history. His research interests include Ndebele ethnicity, the history of radio in South Africa (mainly African-language radio stations of the South African Broadcasting Corporation and the African National Congress's Radio Freedom) and the history of African research assistants and fieldwork in southern Africa.

Rebecca Marsland is a lecturer in social anthropology at the University of Edinburgh. She worked in Kyela District, Tanzania, for almost three years between 2000 and 2009; is currently working on a book called *The Words of the People* about tradition, mourning and moral debates among the Nyakyusa; and is writing further articles about the Wilsons' fieldwork. She has also co-edited two volumes on medical anthropology with Ruth Prince: *What Is Life Worth*? (special issue of the *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, 2012) and *Making Public Health in Africa: Ethnographic and Historical Perspectives* (Ohio University Press, 2013).

xi



xii Contributors

Seán Morrow is Adjunct Professor of History at the University of Fort Hare and a partner in Ngomso Research, Writing and Editing Service. Originally a high school teacher, he worked at universities and research institutions in Ireland, Zambia, Malawi, Lesotho and South Africa. He has published on aspects of the educational, religious, liberation and cultural history of Central and southern Africa. He is currently completing a biography of Monica and Godfrey Wilson.

Timothy Mwakasekele is a project worker in Mental Health and a Masters student in Public Health at Glasgow Caledonia University in Edinburgh. He was born in the region where Monica and Godfrey Wilson did fieldwork in south-west Tanganyika. His interest in the history of social anthropology developed during a period of five years when he worked as a translator and research assistant for a social anthropologist doing fieldwork in this area.

Pamela Reynolds is Professor Emeritus, Johns Hopkins University, and Honorary Professor, University of Cape Town. She is an anthropologist and has written five books on the ethnography of childhood and youth in southern Africa. Her most recent book, *War in Worcester: Youth and the Apartheid State*, was published in 2013 by Fordham University Press. She is collaborating with the Department of Social Anthropology at the University of Cape Town on a project on 'The Figure of the Child in Africa'.

Christopher Saunders is Professor Emeritus in the Department of Historical Studies at the University of Cape Town. Educated at the universities of Cape Town and Oxford, he worked as a research assistant for Monica Wilson when she was preparing chapters for the first volume of *The Oxford History of South Africa*. His main interests have included southern African twentieth-century political history and historiography. He is now a research associate of the Centre for Conflict Resolution in Cape Town.

Vuyiswa Swana is the younger sister of the late Archie Mafeje. She worked as a nurse at Baragwanath Hospital in Johannesburg until the late 1960s before serving as a health worker on the Johannesburg City Council. She and her husband Marshall have three sons and now live in retirement in Mthatha, Eastern Cape. She maintained close contact with her brother from shared childhood years in rural Thembuland through his years in exile and after he had returned to southern Africa in the early 1990s.



Acknowledgements

The essays in this volume are based on many years of collective, and often collaborative, research on one substantial archival collection, the Monica and Godfrey Wilson Papers (Wilson Collection). This Collection was donated by Monica Wilson's two sons, Francis and Tim, to the Manuscripts and Archives Department of University of Cape Town Libraries from 1994. This is when the deposits became available to researchers for the first time. We are grateful to Francis and Tim Wilson for making these records accessible and for supporting our scholarly project from the outset. They played an active part in the Monica Wilson Centenary Conference held between 24 and 26 June 2008 at Hunterstoun in the Hogsback Mountains of the Eastern Cape, the place of retirement of Monica Wilson and of their family holiday home which was given over at this event to the University of Fort Hare as a Creative Writing Centre. They have kindly given us permission to reproduce the photographic materials from the Wilson Collection that feature here.

The transfer of the Wilson Collection to UCT Libraries coincided with the appointment of Lesley Hart as head of the Manuscripts and Archives Department. Her deep and ongoing sense of commitment to the Collection has been evident from the time that she journeyed to the Hogsback in 2000 to collect a large body of documents to add to the substantial collection that had been transferred to UCT a few years earlier. She then began the long process of sorting these additional papers which Monica had archived in sundry cupboards, bookcases, shelving cabinets and trunks in the stone building that served as her library. Lesley delivered these papers by hand to the shelves of the metal sliding cabinets in the Manuscripts and Archives Department on the ground floor of UCT's Oppenheimer Institute Building. She had already spent more than a year of intensive work compiling the 26-page index to the Collection which all of the authors in this volume have used as their point of access to the documents. More than fifteen years later she is still involved in indexing uncatalogued documents and has overseen the process of digitising the hundreds of negatives of fieldwork photographs contained in the Wilson Collection. We owe her a debt of gratitude for these years of labour.

xiii



xiv Acknowledgements

Isaac Ntabankulu has been the most generous of co-hosts at Manuscripts and Archives, taking an active interest in the research materials of Monica Wilson and effectively acting (for one of the editors at least) as an informal research assistant over a period of five years. He has fetched, delivered (and at times uncovered) documents for all the authors. He has photocopied materials for distribution to authors in more distant locations; translated sections of Xhosa text recorded by one of Monica Wilson's primary research assistants in Western Pondoland; established contacts with friends of Archie Mafeje, her most celebrated anthropological collaborator; and willingly sourced new reviews of Wilson's publications. He read the Eastern Cape chapters to check our Xhosa terms. Janine Dunlop has been another committed and engaging hostess at the Manuscripts and Archives Department over many years. She has kindly facilitated the process of scanning the visual images from the Wilson Collection that feature here. Andre Landman and Marjorie 'Bobby' Eldridge have also warmly facilitated our research in the Manuscripts and Archives Department. Thanks to all of them for making this research so pleasurable on a daily basis.

In the latter stages of the project, we have benefited from readers' comments and editorial interventions on successive versions of our draft manuscript. Deborah James made detailed and incisive comments and offered enthusiastic support. Two anonymous in-house reviewers, Nancy, Jacobs and Lyn Schumaker, provided constructive and creative engagement with the draft manuscript. Stephanie Kitchen of the International African Institute shepherded the manuscript through to publication with a combination of creative energy and common sense. She has also kindly made extensive last-minute edits to the book's Bibliography.

Priscilla Hall deserves special mention for cleaning up a messy document and re-energising the project at a flagging stage. She frog-marched each of the authors through two rigorous rounds of copyediting conducted under severe time pressure. She has touched up our text at points too numerous to mention, drafted fine summary paragraphs and kindly compiled the book's Bibliography. Mike Kirkwood brought an enthusiasm for the manuscript, an engaging humour and a light touch to our final round of editing. Gerda Martin takes credit for compiling the Index. Thanks too to Shana Meyer for her endless patience and skillful work on layout and design.

Andrew Bank gratefully acknowledges funding from the University of the Western Cape's Arts Research Committee and South Africa's National Research Foundation for field trips to the Eastern Cape and south-west Tanzania, and visits to the archives of women anthropologists. These organisations are not of course responsible for the ideas and arguments presented in his chapters.



Acknowledgements

ΧV

It would be remiss of us not to acknowledge the authors who have remained committed to the project, despite lengthy delays and ever fresh rounds of editorial demands. Seán Morrow, who is himself working on a biography of Monica and Godfrey Wilson, deserves special mention. He has been a highly supportive travelling companion into the past. Photographer Rui Assubuji accompanied one of us (Andrew) on field trips in Pondoland and Bunyakyusa. We are grateful to feature two of his photographs here. It is, ultimately, because of the generous participation of these authors, and their willingness to engage and re-engage with their essays, that the book has taken on what we feel is a collective spirit, a sense of joint endeavour appropriate to its central theme: the co-production of social scientific knowledge.

Andrew Bank and Leslie J. Bank January 2013