

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

MARCION AND THE MAKING OF A HERETIC

A comprehensive and authoritative account of the 'heretic' Marcion, this volume traces the development of the concept and language of heresy in the setting of an exploration of second-century Christian intellectual debate. Judith M. Lieu analyses accounts of Marcion by the major early Christian polemicists who shaped the idea of heresy, including Justin Martyr, Irenaeus, Tertullian, Epiphanius of Salamis, Clement of Alexandria, Origen, and Ephraem Syrus. She examines Marcion's 'Gospel', 'Apostolikon', and 'Antitheses' in detail and compares his principles with those of contemporary Christian and non-Christian thinkers, covering a wide range of controversial issues: the nature of God, the relation of the divine to creation, the person of Jesus, the interpretation of Scripture, the nature of salvation, and the appropriate lifestyle of adherents. In this innovative study, Marcion emerges as a distinctive, creative figure who addressed widespread concerns within second-century Christian diversity.

JUDITH M. LIEU is Lady Margaret's Professor of Divinity at the University of Cambridge. She has written numerous books, including *I, II, & III John: A Commentary* (2008); *Christian Identity in the Jewish and Graeco-Roman World* (2004); and *Neither Jew Nor Greek?: Constructing Early Christianity* (2002).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Marcion and the Making of a Heretic

God and Scripture in the Second Century

JUDITH M. LIEU

University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107029040

© Judith M. Lieu 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Lieu, Judith.

Marcion and the making of a heretic : God and scripture in the second century /

Judith M. Lieu, University of Cambridge.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02904-0 (Hardback)

1. Marcion, of Sinope, active 2nd century.
2. Church history--Primitive and early church, ca. 30--600.
3. Theology, Doctrinal--History--Early church, ca. 30--600.

4. Theology, Doctrinal. I. Title.

BT1415.L54 2014

273'.1--dc23 2014028074

ISBN 978-1-107-02904-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
Marcion in recent imagination	1
Whose Marcion?	7
Marcion in history	9
Marcion at the crossroads of the second century	10
PART I: THE POLEMICAL MAKING OF MARCION THE HERETIC	
2 The beginnings of the construction of a heretic: Justin Martyr	15
The man	15
‘All heresies’	17
Teaching another God	23
Justin’s Marcion	25
3 Irenaeus and the shaping of a heretic	26
Irenaeus and the battle ‘against heresies’	28
Marcion and Irenaeus	31
Cerdo	33
Marcion’s teaching	35
Irenaeus’ Marcion	46
4 Marcion through Tertullian’s eyes	50
Writing <i>Against Marcion</i>	50
Techniques of persuasion	55
Marcion the man: vilification and association	56
Reason and logic	60

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

CONTENTS

Basic principles	63
The principle and indeed therefore the entire matter of discussion is one of number, whether it is permissible to introduce two Gods	63
If God is good and prescient of the future and capable of turning aside evil, why ... ?	66
The separation of Law and Gospel is the characteristic and chief task of Marcion	71
We admit this separation by reformation, by expansion, by progress	75
The Christ had come who had never previously been announced	77
He was not what he seemed, and what he was he falsified, flesh and not flesh, man and not man	81
We do not repudiate marriage but demote it; we do not demand chastity but encourage it	83
Tertullian's Marcion	84
5 The heresiological tradition	86
<i>The Refutation of All Heresies</i>	87
Marcion and Empedocles	90
Marcion without Empedocles	92
Marcion in the Epitome	94
Epiphanius, <i>Panarion</i>	96
Sources and heirs	98
Sect 42: The Marcionites	100
Marcion's biography	101
Marcionite practice	108
Marcion's teaching	110
<i>The Dialogue of Adamantius</i>	115
Marcionite identity and sources	117
Marcionite beliefs	121
The continuing tradition	124
6 Theology and exegesis against Marcion	126
Clement of Alexandria	126
Origen	135
7 Marcion in Syriac dress	143
Setting the context	144
Ephraem against Marcion	151
Defining opponents	155
The unity of God	160
The paradox of the divine	163
The unity of Scripture	167
The redemption	170
The unity of body and soul	174

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

vii

After Ephraem	176
Ezrik of Kolb	176
The later tradition	178
Theodoret of Cyrrihus	179
PART II: MARCION THROUGH HIS SCRIPTURES	
8 Marcion as editor and interpreter I: Marcion's 'Gospel'	183
Texts, interpretation, and polemic	183
Recovering and expounding Marcion's 'Gospel'	187
Tertullian and Marcion's 'Gospel'	188
Epiphanius and Marcion's 'Gospel'	193
Marcion and his 'Gospel': behind his opponents	196
Text and interpretation	209
Title	212
Beginning	213
Death and resurrection	216
Jesus	221
The Father and the Creator	224
The Law of the Creator	227
Key passages	230
Marcion's 'Gospel' strategy	233
9 Marcion as editor and interpreter II: Marcion's 'Apostolikon'	234
Recovering and expounding Marcion's 'Apostolikon'	234
Marcion and his 'Apostolikon'	242
Apostle extraordinary	242
Galatians 4.22–6	248
Law, sin, grace, and faith	253
The Creator	257
Christ the revealer	261
Resurrection body	264
Bodily discipline	267
Marcion's reading of Paul	269
10 Marcion's other writings	270
Echoes and allusions	270
The 'Antitheses' in Tertullian	272
Contradiction and polemic	276
The antithesis of 'morals, laws, and powers'	277
A preface to the 'Gospel'	283
The 'exempla of the Creator'	285
The growth of 'Antitheses'	288

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

CONTENTS

PART III: THE SECOND-CENTURY SHAPING OF MARCION

11	Marcion in his second-century context	293
	Time and place	295
	A parallel life	298
	Justin's social context	303
	Justin's literary context	306
	Justin's philosophical context	311
	Justin's Jewish context	315
	Marcion in Justin's context	317
12	The principles of Marcion's thought and their context I: God	323
	Another God	324
	God and space	331
	God, Creator, and creation	332
	The character of the Demiurge	337
	Goodness and justice	343
	The created order	349
	Creation and the Law	355
	Scripture and exegesis	357
13	The principles of Marcion's thought and their context II:	
	The Gospel	367
	The descent of Christ	367
	The flesh of the redeemer	372
	The work of salvation	380
14	The principles of Marcion's thought and their context III:	
	Life and practice	387
	Asceticism	388
	Community structures	395
15	The principles of Marcion's thought and their context IV: The	
	contradictions of the Gospel	398
	Law and Gospel	398
	Old and new	406
	Judaism and Christianity	408
	Scriptures and authority	410
	Law observance and prophetic fulfilment	410
	Tradition and corruption	414
	Paul and Gospel ...	417
	... Gospel and Paul	428
16	Afterword: Marcion and the making of the heretic	433

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

ix

<i>Bibliography</i>	441
<i>Index of ancient authors and sources</i>	471
<i>Index of subjects</i>	496

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Preface

My fascination with Marcion dates back over more than two decades to my previous work on the emergence of Christianity out of its Jewish heritage and on the development of a distinctive 'Christian' self-definition. However, it was the award of a Leverhulme Major Research Fellowship for 2007–9 that enabled me to undertake sustained research; I am deeply grateful to the Leverhulme Trust for its generous support and for its continued recognition of the needs of those scholars whose primary requirement is uninterrupted time and access to the best research resources available. The award of the Fellowship coincided with my appointment to the Lady Margaret Professorship in Divinity at the University of Cambridge, and I am grateful to the university and to colleagues in the Faculty of Divinity for permitting me to take up the Fellowship. The unrivalled library resources at Cambridge have enriched my work on Marcion immeasurably.

Completing the research and manuscript has taken longer than I may have wished, in part owing to subsequent administrative duties as Chair of the Faculty Board. Yet this has also provided opportunity for me to read papers related to Marcion in a variety of contexts – academic and more popular – and to publish some initial articles. I am grateful to audiences for their interest and questions, to colleagues for invitations and encouragement, and particularly to colleagues at Cambridge and members of the New Testament Senior Seminar, who have had (quite properly) to include the second century in their remit. Professor C. Kingsley Barrett was a mentor ever since I undertook an MA under his supervision, and it was a particular joy on my occasional visits to Durham before his death in 2011, when he was working on the Pauline heritage, to spend time with him, discussing Marcion and his Paulinism; I join with the many students of the New Testament who acknowledge the debt they owe him.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Abbreviations

Abbreviations of ancient sources can be traced in the index of ancient authors and sources.

AARAS	American Academy of Religion Academy Series
ABRL	Anchor Bible Reference Library
AGLB	Aus der Geschichte der lateinischen Bibel (cf. VL)
AJBI	<i>Annual of the Japanese Biblical Institute</i>
ANRW	<i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt</i>
ANTF	Arbeiten zur neutestamentlichen Textforschung
AThR	<i>Anglican Theological Review</i>
BETL	Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologiarum lovaniensium
BFChTh	Beiträge zur Förderung christlicher Theologie
BHT	Beiträge zur historischen Theologie
BJRL	<i>Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester</i>
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
BSS	Black Sea Studies
BZAW	Beiheft zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
BZNW	Beiheft zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
CBET	Contributions to Biblical Exegesis and Theology
CB.OT	Coniectanea biblica: Old Testament Series
CBQ	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CC.SA	Corpus Christianorum Series Apocrypha
CC.SL	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina
ChHist	<i>Church History</i>
Class.Phil.	<i>Classical Philology</i>
CQ	<i>The Classical Quarterly</i>
CSCO	Corpus scriptorum christianorum orientalium
CSCO Script.Arm.	CSCO Scriptores Armeniaci
CSCO Script.Syr.	CSCO Scriptores Syriaci
EAA	Collection des Études augustinienes. Série Antiquité
EC	<i>Early Christianity</i>

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<i>EPHE</i>	<i>École pratique des hautes études</i>
EPROER	Études préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'empire romain
Ét.Bib.	Études Bibliques
<i>ETL</i>	<i>Ephemerides theologicae lovanienses</i>
ETSE	Estonian Theological Society in Exile
FC	Fontes Christiani
FKD	Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte
FoC	Fathers of the Church
GO	Göttinger Orientforschungen
<i>HTR</i>	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
JbAC	Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum
<i>JBL</i>	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
<i>JECS</i>	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
<i>JMEMS</i>	<i>Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies</i>
<i>JQR</i>	<i>Jewish Quarterly Review</i>
<i>JSJ</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of Judaism</i>
JSNTSup.	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
<i>JSQ</i>	<i>Jewish Studies Quarterly</i>
<i>JTS</i>	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
LHB	Library of the Hebrew Bible
LS	Lewis, Charlton T. and Charles Short, <i>A Latin Dictionary</i> (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966)
LSJ	Liddell, H. G. R., R. Scott, and H. S. Jones, <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> (9th ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1940)
Mnem.Sup.	Mnemosyne, Bibliotheca Classica Batava, Supplementum
NA27	Novum Testamentum Graece, post Eberhard and Edwin Nestle, 27th revised edition, ed. Barbara and Kurt Aland, Johannes Karavidopoulos, Carlo M. Martini, and Bruce M. Metzger (Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1898/ 1993)
NAPSPMS	North American Patristics Society Patristic Monograph Series
NGWGPh	Nachrichten von der Gesellschaft der Wissenschaft zu Göttingen. Philologisch-historische Klasse
NHMS	Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies
NHS	Nag Hammadi Studies
<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup.	Novum Testamentum Supplements
NTOA	Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus
<i>NTS</i>	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
<i>NTT</i>	<i>Nederlands Theologisch Tijdschrift</i>
NTTS	New Testament Tools and Studies
OCA	Orientalia Christiana Analecta
<i>OCP</i>	<i>Orientalia Christiana Periodica</i>
OECS	Oxford Early Christian Studies
OECT	Oxford Early Christian Texts
OGIS	<i>Orientalis graeci inscriptiones selectae</i> , ed. W. Dittenberger

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xv

OLA	Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta
<i>OrChr</i>	<i>Oriens christianus</i>
OTS	Old Testament Studies
PG	Patrologia Graeca, ed. J.-P. Migne
PGL	Lampe, G. W. H., ed., <i>A Patristic Greek Lexicon</i> (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1961)
Ph.Ant.	Philosophia Antiqua
PIRSB	Publications de l'Institut romand des sciences bibliques
PMS	Patristic Monograph Studies
PO	Patrologia Orientalis
PTS	Patristische Texte und Studien
PW	Pauly, A. F., <i>Paulys Realencyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft</i> , new edn; G. Wissowa (Stuttgart: Metzler, 1890–)
RAC	<i>Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum</i> , ed. T. Klauser et. al. (Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1950–)
<i>REAug</i>	<i>Revue des études augustinienes</i>
<i>Rech.Aug.</i>	<i>Recherches augustinienes</i>
<i>Rev.Bib.</i>	<i>Revue Biblique</i>
<i>RHPhR</i>	<i>Revue d'Histoire et de Philosophie Religieuse</i>
RS	Religion and Society
RSR	<i>Recherches de science religieuse</i>
<i>RThPh</i>	<i>Revue de Théologie et Philosophie</i>
SAIS	Studies in the Aramaic Interpretation of Scripture
SBL	Society of Biblical Literature
SC	Sources Chrétiennes
SHCT	Studies in the History of Christian Traditions
SJLA	Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity
SJSR	Studien zu den Jüdischen Schriften aus Hellenistisch-Römischer Zeit
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
STAC	Studien und Texte zu Antike Christentum
<i>Stud.Phil. Ann.</i>	<i>Studia Philonica Annual</i>
SVTP	Studia in Veteris Testamenti Pseudepigrapha
TBN	Themes in Biblical Narratives
TENTS	Texts and Editions for New Testament Study
<i>ThR</i>	<i>Theologische Rundschau</i>
<i>TRE</i>	<i>Theologische Realenzyklopädie</i>
TSAJ	Textes and Studies in Ancient Judaism
TU	Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur
VC	<i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
VCSup.	Supplements to <i>Vigiliae Christianae</i>
VL	Vetus Latina: Die Reste der altlateinischen Bibel
VTSup.	Supplements to Vetus Testamentum
WF	Wege der Forschung

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02904-0 - Marcion and the Making of a Heretic: God and Scripture in the
Second Century

Judith M. Lieu

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZAC	<i>Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum</i>
ZKG	<i>Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte</i>
ZKT	<i>Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie</i>
ZNW	<i>Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche</i>
ZThK	<i>Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche</i>