

The Politics of Social Welfare in America

The Politics of Social Welfare in America examines how politicians, theorists, and citizens discuss need, welfare, and disability, with respect to theoretical and political projects. Glenn David Mackin argues that participants in these discussions often miss the way their perceptions of those in need shape their discourse. Professor Mackin also explores disability rights groups and welfare rights activism in the 1960s and 1970s, examining the ways in which those designated as needy or incompetent often challenge these designations. Such challenges recast the issue of welfare as an ongoing conflict over who counts as competent, generating new ways of understanding democracy and equality.

Glenn David Mackin is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Rochester. Professor Mackin has had articles published in *Studies in Law, Politics, and Society*; *Contemporary Political Theory*; and the *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*. He also serves as a book reviewer in political theory for *Choice*.

The Politics of Social Welfare in America

GLENN DAVID MACKIN

University of Rochester



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-02902-6 — The Politics of Social Welfare in America
 Glenn David Mackin
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107029026

© Glenn David Mackin 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2013

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Mackin, Glenn, author.

The politics of social welfare in America / Glenn David Mackin,
 University of Rochester.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02902-6 (hardback)

1. Public welfare – United States. 2. United States – Social policy.

3. Poor – Government policy – United States. 4. People with disabilities – United States. 5. People with disabilities – Government policy – United States. 1. Title.

HV95.M254 2013

361.60973-dc23 2012037779

ISBN 978-1-107-02902-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vii</i>
Introduction	I
1 The Aporia of Practical Reason: From Ethics to Politics	22
<i>Introduction: Rebecca’s Story</i>	22
<i>Habermas’s Known and Unknown Others</i>	27
<i>The Aporia of Practical Reason, or a Critique of the</i> <i>“Ethical Other”</i>	39
<i>The Political Other</i>	51
2 The Aporia of Social Rights	63
<i>Introduction: A Democratic Indigestion?</i>	63
<i>“Please Don’t Feed the Alligators”</i>	67
<i>“A Stew of Paradox”</i>	73
<i>(At) the Limits of Reflexivity</i>	82
<i>“Welfarizing” Politics</i>	93
3 Welfare Discourse as a Narrative of Political Founding	100
<i>Introduction: “I Can’t Believe I’m Losing to This Guy”</i>	100
<i>The Welfare System as a Gift</i>	105
<i>The Welfare System as a Threat</i>	115
<i>Aporia, Imposition, and Democracy’s Generative Powers</i>	122
4 Otherwise than Need	130
<i>Introduction: The Tragedy of Welfare</i>	130
<i>From Need to Solidarity, or Rethinking the Role of Damage</i> <i>Imagery in Liberal Thought</i>	134
<i>Political and Ethical Disagreement, or the Problem with</i> <i>Consensus</i>	144
	v

vi		<i>Contents</i>
	<i>The Welfare Rights Movement and the Staging of Political Conflict</i>	156
5	Needing Rights	165
	<i>Introduction: The Excessive Yes</i>	165
	<i>Bringing the Constitution to the Poor?</i>	170
	<i>Demanding Rights, Declaring Wrongs</i>	179
	<i>Sovereignty as Invitation and Response, or Rereading Brennan’s “Tailoring Principle”</i>	188
	<i>Attentiveness and the Conditions of Political Action</i>	195
	Conclusion: Politics, Not Ontology	201
	<i>Works Cited</i>	209
	<i>Index</i>	223

Acknowledgments

I started writing about the ways Americans tend to talk about poverty and social welfare approximately ten years ago, in Michael McCann's seminar on rights at the University of Washington. Since then, the project has taken a number of unpredictable twists and turns. From the broadly Habermasian framework that informed my dissertation, the project moved into an engagement with Levinas-inspired ethics that guided some of the earliest articles I published on this subject, and then finally into its current form. Throughout, I have always understood the different approaches to the project as "essays" in the etymological sense of the term. The various versions of the project ought to be understood as experimental efforts to see what happens when one explores a problem from this or that perspective. As such, I have always depended on help and insight from an enormous number of friends, colleagues, and critics.

I first wish to thank a number of people whose comments and insights helped shape the final version of this manuscript. My ongoing conversations with Claire Rasmussen have always helped clarify the value and limits of the different theoretical perspectives I adopt; I could not ask for a better intellectual companion or friend. My advisers at the University of Washington also deserve thanks for encouraging my more fruitful experiments and for warning me when I was going down a blind alley. Christine Di Stefano has been an encouraging and thoughtful reader of my work, with the unique talent of identifying the core problem or issue with the work. Michael McCann's classes and

work provided the initial spur and impetus for this project. His feedback helped me realize that my main interest in questions of poverty and social welfare revolved around questions of democracy. Finally, I could not ask for a better mentor than Mika Lavaque-Manty, who has also been a fantastic reader and critic. I also wish to thank staff associated with Cambridge University Press, Robert Dreesen and Abigail Zorbaugh, as well as Ken Karpinski at Aptara for managing production. I also thank Linda George of PETT Fox, Inc., for her assistance with copyediting. Special thanks go to the anonymous reviewers at Cambridge, whose feedback helped clarify my argument. In my view, their feedback exemplifies what an encouraging but also incisive critique should look like.

The support of my friends and colleagues at the Eastman School of Music and the University of Rochester was also essential to completing this project. In particular, I would like to thank the members of the Humanities Department, whose commitment to excellence in teaching and scholarship is a constant inspiration. Reinhild Steingrover, Jon Baldo, Tim Scheie, Jean Pedersen, Ernestine Piskáčková, Rachel Remmel, Elena Bellina, Caterina Falli, and Christina Curren all demonstrate the core virtues of interdisciplinary work. They also offered tremendous support during periods of time when my argument was not terribly well developed. I would also like to thank Holly Watkins, Melina Esse, and Lisa Jakelski; my conversations with them about music and the arts are always inspiring. Jean Barr and Bill Marvin played a vital role in helping me become more acclimated to Eastman. A special note of thanks goes to Jamal Rossi, Donna Brink Fox, and Abra Bush for cultivating a supportive atmosphere in which to pursue my interests. Yvette Singletary also has my gratitude for her camaraderie and for her assistance in navigating Eastman. I would also like to thank Jim Johnson and Randy Curren. Their help in mentoring me into the publishing world and their assistance shepherding my project into something workable have been essential. Finally, I also thank my students at Eastman, particularly the participants in my courses on Democratic Theory and the Politics of Poverty. Their talent is inspiring.

I must also thank a number of other friends and colleagues who helped shape the early versions of this project. Michael Ferguson offered incredibly generous advice and support, particularly with regard to the writing process. Special thanks must also go to Julie

Acknowledgments

ix

White, Jamie Mayerfeld, Lenny Feldman, Elizabeth Ben-Ishai, Kathleen Tipler, Marek Steedman, and Gregg Miller, all of whom provided important comments at crucial stages of the development of this project. I also wish to express gratitude to Brian Mello and Jen Smith for their friendship. My fellow graduate students also deserve thanks, including Jay Sellers, Rob Farley, Scott Lemieux, David Watkins, Mary Dudas, Jeff Dudas, Talal Hattar, Lisa Glidden, John Acuff, Carrie Doan, Mike Strausz, Kate Marshall, Christie Siver, Adrian Sinkler, Peter Hovde, Jessica Beyer, Sophia Williams, Darcy Noricks, Ki-Young Shin, Rose Ernst, Misti Williams, Duong Thanh, Mike Xenos, Jason Lambacher, Turan Kayoaglu, Andrew Shinn, and Jason Scheideman. I also wish to thank the members of the political theory reading group at the University of Washington, who offered early and important criticisms of what became Chapter 1 of this book: Heather Pool, Deepa Bhandaru, Larry Cushnie, Tim Deak, Annie Menzel, Sooenn Park, Barry Pump, Todd Tavares, and Matt Walton.

This project also would have been impossible without the extraordinary opportunity to take Bonnie Honig's seminar at Cornell's School of Criticism and Theory in the summer of 2011. I therefore thank the participants in this school, particularly Bonnie Honig. My conversations with her proved invaluable in helping shape the final version of this project, and her rigorous but sympathetic engagements with different theoretical traditions continue to be an inspiration. I would also like to thank Pat Maley, Kaibin Yang, Dean Allbritton, Andrés Fabián Henao, Nolan Bennett, Jonah Rubin, Ali McGhee, Shota Ogawa, Frederica Frediani, Elva Orozco, Spencer Hawkins, Mike Ristich, Jacob Chilton, and Austin Riede. I also offer special thanks to Anna Rosensweig and Stephanie Youngblood for their intellectual stimulation and for their friendship.

Finally, I must also offer thanks to my parents, my sister Libby, my brother Jamie, and my Grandma Maxwell. It is not going too far to say that the earliest experiments in writing this project began with the political conversations at our kitchen table. My parents always required me not only to understand what is happening in politics but also to develop a critical eye, to understand that it is possible to engage in a different and better form of politics. My brother Jamie also deserves special mention for our long conversations about teaching, politics, literature, and intellectual life in general. I must also thank

Katya, who kept my lap warm throughout the entire writing process, and Rosie and Lucy, who always were there to remind me that going for a walk or playing fetch is sometimes a better use of my time than trying to figure out some theoretical puzzle.

Most importantly, I must express the inexpressible – the thanks I owe to Amy Metzendorf. To be sure, I can thank her for her input on this manuscript. She has been present at every step of the way and has borne witness to every twist and turn in the process. But the gratitude I owe her is not for this or that feedback but for a whole life, for the fabric of the world we inhabit. On this level, perhaps the only thing I can say is that the world is a far better place because of her presence in it.

Chapters 1 and 2 are significantly revised versions of earlier articles. Chapter 1 appeared as “The aporia of practical reason: Some reflections on what it means to pay due respect to others,” in *Contemporary Political Theory* (10) 1, (2011), 58–77. Chapter 2 appeared as “Aporia, attentiveness, and the politics of social welfare,” in *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* (13) 4, (2010), 517–539. I thank the publishers for allowing portions of these earlier articles to be reprinted here.